THE

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

FOURTEENTH SESSION.

1924.

VOLUME XIV—No. 3.

(26th to 29th February, 1924.)

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE LIBRARY.

CALCUTTA :
Bengal Secretariat Book Depot.
1924.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

GOVERNOR OF BENGAL.

His Excellency the Right Hon'ble VICTOR ALEXANDER GEORGE ROBERT BULWER-LYTTON, Earl of Lytton, P.C., G.C.I.E.

MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL.

The Hon'ble Sir BIJAY CHAND MAHTAB, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.O.M., Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, Vice-President, in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Land Revenue
2. Land Acquisition
3. Forests.
4. Irrigation.
5. Excluded Areas
6. European Education

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM, Kt., in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Judicial.
2. Emigration.
3. Immigration.
4. Jurisdiction
5. Legislative.
6. Haj Pilgrimage.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON, K.C.I.E., C.S.I., I.C.S., in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Appointment.
2. Political (excluding Haj Pilgrimage).
3. Police.
4. Jails.
5. Ecclesiastical.

The Hon'ble Mr. JAMES DONALD, C.S.I., C.I.E., I.C.S., in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Finance.
2. Separate Revenue.
3. Commerce and Reserved Industrial Subjects.
4. Marine.

MINISTERS.

The Hon'ble Maulvi ABUL KASIM FAZL-UL HUQ, in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Education.
2. Medical.

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. ABDUL KARIM ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI in charge of the following portfolios:—

1. Agriculture and Public Works.
2. Local Self-Government and Public Health.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

PRINCIPAL OFFICERS OF THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

PRESIDENT.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. E. A. COTTON, C.I.E.

DEPUTY PRESIDENT.

Major HASSAN SUHRAWARDY, M.D., F.R.C.S.

PANEL OF CHAIRMEN FOR THE FOURTEENTH SESSION.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY.

Sir WILLOUGHBY CAREY.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ.

Secretary to the Council—C. TINDALL, C.I.E., I.C.S.

Assistant Secretaries to the Council—J. BARTLEY, I.C.S., A. M. HUTCHISON, and K. N. MAJUMDAR.

Registrar to the Council—J. W. McKAY.

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS.

A

Ahamad, Maulvi Asimuddin. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin. [Jessore North (Muhammadan).]
Ahmed, Maulvi Tayebuddin. [Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]
Ahmed, Maulvi Zannoor. [Burdwan Division South (Muhammadan).]
Aley, Mr. S. Mahboob. [Calcutta North (Muhammadan).]
Ali, Maulvi Sayyed Sultan. [Khulna (Muhammadan).]
Ali, Mr. Altaf. [Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]

B

Bagchi, Babu Romes Chandra. [Malda (Non-Muhammadan).]
Baksh, Maulvi Kader, B.L. [Dinajpur (Muhammadan).]
Banerjea, Dr. Pramathanath. [Calcutta East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Banerjee, Babu Satya Kishore. [Burdwan Landholders.]
Banerjee, Mr. Ashiny Coomar. [Calcutta South Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra. (Nominated Non-official.)
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan, M.B.E. [Rangpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Barton, Mr. H. (Anglo-Indian.)
Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath. [Calcutta North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Basu, Babu Sarat Chandra. [Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).]
Bose, Babu Bejoy Krishna. (Calcutta University.)

C

Carey, Sir Willoughby, Kt. (Indian Mining Association.)
Chakravarti, Mr. Byomkes. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)
Chakravorti, Babu Jogindra Chandra. [Dinajpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chakravorty, Babu Sudarsan. [Rajshahi (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chatterjee, Babu Umes Chandra. [Bankura East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E. [Dacca West Rural (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath. [24-Parganas Rural North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhury, Maulvi Md. Nurul Huq. [Chittagong (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhury, Maulvi Saiyed Abdur Rob. [Faridpur South (Muhammadan).]
Choinuddin, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Md. [Rajshahi North (Muhammadan).]

Chowdhury, Maulvi Fazlal Karim. [Bakarganj North (Muhammadan).]
Chunder, Mr. Nirmal Chandra. [Calcutta North Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Cochran, Mr. A., C.B.E. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Cohen, Mr. D. J. (Nominated Non-official.)
Cooper, Mr. C. G. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Cottle, Mr. J. (Calcutta Trades Association.)
Crawford, Mr. T. C. (Indian Tea Association.)

D

Das, Babu Charu Chandra. (Nominated Non-official.)
Das, Dr. Mohini Mohon. [Faridpur South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Das, Mr. C. R. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Das Gupta, Dr. J. M. [Bogra *cum* Pabna (Non-Muhammadan).]
Datta, Babu Akhil Chandra. [Tippera (Non-Muhammadan).]
Daud, Mr. M. (Nominated Non-official.)
DeLisle, Mr. J. A. [Dacca and Chittagong (European).]
Dey, Babu Boroda Prosad. [Hooghly Municipal (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dey, Mr. G. G. (Nominated Official.)
Donald, the Hon'ble Mr. J., C.S.I., C.I.E. (Member, Executive Council.)
Donovan, Mr. J. T. (Nominated Official.)
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal, M.B.E. [Dacca City (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutt, Mr. G. S. (Nomnated Official.)
Duval, Mr. H. P., C.I.E. (Nominated Official.)

E

Emerson, Mr. T., C.I.E. (Nominated Official.)

F

Faroqui, Mr. K. G. M. (Nominated Non-official.)
Forrester, Mr. J. Campbell. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

G

Gafur, Maulvi Abdul, B.L. [Pabna (Muhammadan).]
Ganguly, Babu Khagendra Nath. [Howrah Muncipal (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ghuznavi, the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan. [Minister, Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).]
Godfrey, Sir George, Kt. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Goenka, Babu Badridas. (Bengal Marwari Association.)
Guha Mr. P. N. (Nominated Non-official.)

Halder, Mr. S. N. [Calcutta South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Haq, Khan Bahadur Kazi Zahirul. [Dacca East Rural (Muhammadan).]
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Hoque, Maulvi Sayedal. [Noakhali (Muhammadan).]
Hossain, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Musharruf. [Malda *cum* Jalpaiguri (Muhammadan).]
Hossain, Maulvi Wahed. [Barrackpore Municipal (Muhammadan).]
Huntingford, Mr. G. T. (Nominated Official.)
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul. [Murshidabad (Muhammadan).]
Huq, Maulvi Mahbubul. [24-Parganas Municipal (Muhammadan).]
Huq, the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul. [Minister, Bakarganj West (Muhammadan).]

J

Joardar, Maulvi Aftab Hossain. [Nadia (Muhammadan).]
Jones, Mr. J. A., C.I.E. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

K

Khaitan, Babu Debi Prosad. (Nominated Non-official.)
Khan, Babu Debendra Lal. [Midnapore North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Abdur Rashid. [Noakhali (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Amanat, B.A. [Chittagong (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Mahi Uddin. [Rangpur East (Muhammadan).]

L

Lal Mahammed, Haji. [Rajshahi South (Muhammadan).]
Law, Raja Reshee Case, C.I.E. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)
Lees, Mr. D. H. (Nominated Official.)

M

Mahammad, Maulvi Basar. [Rangpur West (Muhammadan).]
Mahtab, the Hon'ble Sir Bijay Chand, G.C.I.E., K.C.S.I., I.O.M., Maharajadhiraja Bahádur of Burdwan. (Member, Executive Council.)
Maity, Babu Mahendra Nath. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Marr, Mr. A., C.I.E. (Nominated Official.)
Masih, Mr. Syed M. [Faridpur North (Muhammadan).]
McAlpin, Mr. M. C., C.I.E. (Nominated Official.)
Mitra, Babu Satyendra Chandra. [Noakhali (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mitra, Babu Jogendra Nath. [Jessore South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mitter, Mr. Provash Chunder, C.I.E. (Presidency Landholders.)

Moberly, Mr. A. N. (Nominated Official.)
Moreno, Dr. H. W. B. (Anglo-Indian.)
Morgan, Mr. G. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Mukerjea, Babu Taraknath. [Hooghly Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mukerji, Mr. S. C. (Nominated Non-official.)

N

Nandy, Maharaj Kumar Sris Chandra. [Murshidabad (Non-Muhammadan).]
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra. [24-Parganas Rural Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Nazimuddin, Khaje, M.A., (Cantab.), Bar-at-Law. [Bakarganj South (Muhammadan).]
Neogi, Babu Manmohon. [Mymensingh West (Non-Muhammadan).]

O

Oaten, Mr. E. F. (Nominated Official.)

P

Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar. [Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).]
Philip, Mr. J. Y. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Q

Quader, Maulvi Abdul. [Jessore South (Muhammadan).]

R

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur., Kt. (Member, Executive Council.)
Rahman, Mr. A. F. (Dacca University.)
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb. [Jalpaiguri (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Abanish Chandra. [Birbhum (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Anilbaran. [Bankura West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Nagendra Narayan. [Rangpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath. [24-Parganas Municipal South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Dr. Kumud Sankar. [Faridpur North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar. (Rajshahi Landholders.)
Rose, Mr. G. F. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Roy, Babu Manmatha Nath. [Howrah Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Dr. Bidhan Chandra. [24-Parganas Municipal North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. D. N., Bar.-at-Law. [Jessore North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. Kiran Sankar. [Dacca Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. Satcowripati. [Calcutta North-West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan. (Bengal Mahajan Sabha.)
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh, C.I.E. [Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).]

Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath. [Khulna (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy Chaudhuri, Mr. K. C. (Nominated Non-official.)
Roy Chaudhuri, Rai Bahadur Satyendra Nath. [Bakarganj South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy Chaudhury, Babu Brajendra Kishore. (Dacca Landholders.)

S

Sarkar, Babu Hemanta Kumar. [Nadia (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Babu Naliniranjan. [Mymensingh East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Maulvi Allah Buksh. [Dacca City (Muhammadan).]
Sasmal, Mr. Birendra Nath. [24-Parganas Rural South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sen, Mr. Nisith Chandra. [Bakarganj North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sen Gupta, Mr. J. M. [Chittagong (Non-Muhammadan).]
Singha, Mr. Arun Chandra. (Chittagong Landholders.)
Stephenson, the Hon'ble Sir Hugh, K.C.I.E., C.S.I. (Member, Executive Council.)
Stuart-Williams, Mr. S. C. (Nominated Official.)
Suhrawardy, Dr. A. [24-Parganas Rural (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Major Hassan. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed. [Calcutta South (Muhammadan).]
Swan, Mr. J. A. L. (Nominated Official.)

T

Tarafdar, Maulvi Rajb Uddin. [Bogra (Muhammadan).]
Travers, Mr. W. L., O.B.E. [Rajshahi (European).]

V

Villiers, Mr. Edward. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

W

Willis, Mr. Arthur d'Anyers. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Wilson, Mr. R. B., C.I.E. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Y

Yasin, Maulvi Muhammad. [Burdwan Division North (Muhammadan).]

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL
PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report of the Fourteenth Session.)

VOLUME XIV—No. 3.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 26th February, 1924, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President in the Chair, the four Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq, the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. Abdul Karim Abu Ahmed Khan Ghuznavi, and 109 nominated and elected members.

Oath.

The following member made an oath of his allegiance to the Crown:—

Mr. E. F. OATEN.

The Death of Dr. T. O. D. Dunn.

Mr. PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Mr. H. E. A. Cotton): GENTLEMEN OF THE COUNCIL,—Since we last met the Council has been deprived in the most tragic circumstances of the services of one of its members. It was only last Wednesday that Dr. Dunn was with us in the best of health and spirits, and on the following day, as we all know, he was accidentally drowned when crossing the river from Chinsurah to Naihati, in a country boat. Dr. Dunn was appointed a member of the Council a very short time ago, but I know he had innumerable friends among the members of the Council, both Indian and European. I cannot add, so far as the Indian members are concerned, anything to the tribute that was paid to his memory in another place by Sir Asutosh Mukherjee, but members, whether Indian or English, will, I am sure, all share with me in the deep regret we feel at the untimely death of Dr. Dunn. It is barely a month since he was appointed to

the post of Director of Public Instruction, and we were all looking forward to a long and successful career in the appointment, from one who was not only able and capable, but also full of enthusiasm for his work, and had rendered long and valuable service to the cause of education in Bengal. I will ask you, Gentlemen, to show your respect to the memory of the late member by rising in your places.

(The members all rose in their seats as a mark of respect.)

An expression of the Council's sympathy will be sent to the widow of Dr. Dunn.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Interview with State prisoners.

*XL. **Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether he is aware that a State prisoner and the person interviewing him are required to remain standing during an interview while a C. I. D. officer remains seated between the two during the interview?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay a copy of the rule or order governing this on the table?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [JAILS] (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): (*a*) Government have ascertained that this has occurred though it is not the general practice.

(*b*) There is no rule on the subject, but Government are issuing instructions for the provision of chairs.

Discontinuance of certain trains on Katihar-Godagari line.

*XLI. **Babu ROMES CHANDRA BACCHI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) be pleased to state the reason for discontinuing the running of the 17 Up and 18 Down trains in the Katihar-Godagari Railway line?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the inconvenience caused thereby to the people of Malda?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to move the proper authorities to resume the running of the same trains?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS [RAILWAYS] (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) The trains were discontinued owing to the reduction in the Fuel Grant in the Budget of the Eastern Bengal Railway for the year 1923-24.

(*b*) No representation on the subject has been received.

(*c*) The attention of the authorities of the Eastern Bengal Railway will be drawn to the subject-matter of the question.

Failure of paddy crop in Bogra.

*XLII. **Dr. J. M. DAS GUPTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue aware that this year in the district of Bogra—

(*i*) the outturn of paddy is considerably below the average, and

(*ii*) wide areas of land in the thanas of Adamdighi, Dhupchanchia and Shirpur are remaining fallow as paddy transplantations could not be carried out for want of rain?

(*b*) Has the Hon'ble the Member ascertained whether any special relief measures are likely to be necessary in these places in the near future?

(*c*) If the answer to clause (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement containing the approximate figures under the following heads—

(*i*) area affected,

(*ii*) population,

(*iii*) outturn of paddy in the district this year, and

(*iv*) previous stock of paddy or rice in the district?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the amount of money realised by Government out of the loan given to the people of the district after the last flood?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) (*b*) The latest return shows that the percentage of the normal yield expected is only 49 per cent.

(*ii*) In certain Unions in thanas Kahaloo, Dupchanchia, Adamdighi and Khetlal the aman paddy is reported to have failed completely on account of continued drought.

(*b*) The relief measures expected to be required are:—

(1) The grant of agricultural loans now and more particularly when the cultivation season commences—the Collector has the amount he requires for the current financial year; the amount required by him, viz., Rs. 35,000, during the ensuing year will be allotted when the Council votes the necessary grant in the budget.

(2) The suspension of the realisation of loans advanced in previous years in the affected area—this has already been given effect to.

(3) The provision of employment for those who have to supplement their income from agriculture by labour.

(4) Gratuitous relief.

As regards (3) and (4) the Collector is making the necessary arrangements; he has aready ordered the organisation of a Local Committee and he hopes to find the money required from local subscriptions.

(*c*) and (*d*) No further statistical information is available.

Naisances caused from the use of earth for metalling Grand Trunk Road.

*XLIII. **Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the practice of the frequent use of earth for road-metalling purposes causes a nuisance by the raising of dust which affects the people living on both sides of the urban portion of the Grand Trunk Road, and to pedestrians, and that articles of food in the shops on both sides are also affected?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking necessary steps to remove or mitigate this nuisance?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) Yes. The earth is used for topping the surface of water-bound macadam roads. The object of its use is that the passage of traffic shall work it into the interstices of stone on the surface of the road, to form a binding material between individual pieces of stone and prevent them working loose.

(*b*) Moorum topping will be used within the Municipal area; so far as funds will permit, and the grievance will be brought to the notice of the Municipalities concerned with a view to getting the roads watered.

Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to issue instructions to the department that this work may be done in proper season and in a proper way?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: As far as I am aware this is usually done in the proper time.

Posting of a Superintendent of Agriculture to Suri.

*XLIV. **Babu SATYENDRA CHANDRA MITRA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a Superintendent

of Agriculture has been posted to Suri to work out a scheme of agricultural irrigation in the Birbhum district?

(*b*) What are the qualifications of the officer for the work?

(*c*) How long has he been employed on it?

(*d*) What is the programme of work of the officer for carrying out the scheme?

(*e*) How far has the programme been carried out?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the officer was posted to Suri at the instance of a gentleman of the district?

(*g*) If so, has the gentleman made any representation to Government about the officer's work?

(*h*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay the correspondence on the subject on the table?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) The Superintendent of Agriculture posted to Suri has been posted there in charge of the Burdwan Division instead of, as hitherto, at Howrah. The reason of his being posted to Suri was not to work out a scheme of agricultural irrigation but to pursue his ordinary duties in addition to which it was hoped that, as he had certain engineering qualifications, he would be able to assist in the promotion of irrigation in the Birbhum district.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

(*c*) The officer was posted to Suri in July, 1923.

(*d*) The question does not arise.

(*e*) The question does not arise.

(*f*) The Chairman of the District Board of Birbhum pointed out to Government the desirability of posting an agricultural officer in that district in March, 1923. As a result of this the case was examined and it was considered more desirable to have the headquarters of the Superintendent of the Burdwan Division at Suri rather than at Howrah.

(*g*) The answer is in the negative.

(*h*) The answer is in the negative.

Accommodation of State prisoners in Alipore Central Jail.

*XLV. **Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the female ward of the Alipore Central Jail has been allotted to the prisoners under restraint under Bengal Regulation III of 1818?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that on a former occasion Mr. C. K. Das and others, while prisoners in the Alipore Central Jail,

were removed from this Ward which was then considered unhealthy from the point of view of sanitation and accommodation?

(c) If so, what steps have been taken to improve the sanitary conditions of this Ward which have led the Government to put these prisoners in that Ward?

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: (a) Yes.

(b) Mr. C. R. Das was removed from this Ward as he was getting irregular low fever. Other non-co-operation prisoners continued to remain in that Ward and it was not considered unhealthy from the point of view of sanitation and accommodation.

(c) This question does not arise.

Mr. KIRAN SANKAR ROY: Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge aware that there were other prisoners in the same ward as Mr. C. R. Das, like myself, Mr. Sarkar, and Mr. Sasmal, and is it not a fact that they were removed on account of the insanitary condition of the ward?

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: My information is that it is not a fact. It was not on account of the insanitary condition of the ward; however I will make further inquiries.

Mr. J. M. SEN GUPTA: May I ask the Hon'ble the Member whether any provision is made for the physical exercise of prisoners in that ward?

Mr. PRESIDENT: That is really material for a separate question. It does not arise out of the fact that prisoners were kept in the female ward; it is quite a different matter.

Mr. J. M. SEN GUPTA: May I point out that I want to put another question later with regard to the want of space in that ward?

Mr. PRESIDENT: If you put that question, it will be in order.

Mr. J. M. SEN GUPTA: Do the prisoners take their exercise in that yard?

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: Yes, they do.

Mr. J. M. SEN GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble the Member be able to tell us whether the yard is not a very small one; besides the building standing there is hardly any room for persons to have more than a 5 or 6 yard-run.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: The Superintendent of the Jail has reported that there is sufficient room for them to exercise,

and to the best of my recollection, I think there is a badminton court there.

Mr. PRESIDENT: I cannot allow any more supplementary questions on this particular point.

Alleged preference in publicity.

*XLVI. **Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Police in Calcutta supply information for publication to certain Anglo-Indian papers, and that the same is not supplied to purely Indian papers?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for this differential treatment?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): No such preference is shown. A scheme was drawn up some time ago for supplying information to the Press, and Press Books were maintained in the offices of the Assistant Commissioner, North Town and South Town, which were open to the accredited representatives of any newspapers, but as no use was made of this facility it was discontinued.

Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR: Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that when Gopi Nath Saha was brought before the Chief Presidency Magistrate at a late hour in the evening, information was given by the Police only to the Anglo-Indian press and not to the Indian press?

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: I am not aware of that.

Water Hyacinth.

*XLVII. **Babu HALINIRANJAN SARKAR:** (*a*) With reference to the resolution of the Government on the report of the Water Hyacinth Committee will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether any negotiations have been made with Mr. Griffiths about his spray?

(*b*) If so, what has been the result and what are the terms, if any, settled with him, or under negotiations?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that an Indian chemist offered to demonstrate a secret preparation which he claimed as effective in destroying water hyacinth?

(*d*) If so, was the offer accepted and an experiment made?

(*e*) If the answer to (*d*) is in the affirmative will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the results of the experiment and the names of the gentlemen who judged the experimental test?

(*f*) Has Sir J. C. Bose or any other Indian scientist been consulted in the matter? If not, why not?

(*g*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the desirability of publishing the correspondence on the subject or of making a statement on the matter?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) Mr. Griffiths has offered the use of his spray to the Government of Bengal for a period of 3 years for a payment of £1,500 with the option to purchase all rights in his spray in Bengal for a further payment of £6,000 at the end of 3 years if the Government of Bengal are fully satisfied with their experiments with the spray.

(*c*) Yes, on condition that he got a fee of Rs. 10,000 for one small demonstration in a tank near Calcutta, whether the demonstration was successful or not.

(*d*) The cost of the spray was estimated by its inventor at Rs. 5 per acre, compared to an estimate of Rs. 2 and possibly Re. 1 per acre for the Griffiths spray. The cost of a small preliminary demonstration was Rs. 19,000 in contrast to the extensive demonstration of the Griffiths spray which had been given free. The substances used in the spray were not guaranteed free from poison, in contrast to the Griffiths spray which had been administered to animals in large doses without any harmful effect on them. The amount demanded as a final payment was about three times the amount demanded as a final payment for the Griffiths spray. The inventor further imposed stipulations of a confidential nature which Government could not possibly accept. For these reasons, and particularly the last, negotiations were broken off.

(*e*) The question does not arise.

(*f*) The question does not arise.

(*g*) Government has nothing further to add to the reply to (*d*) of this question and Government does not consider it desirable to publish the correspondence.

Babu NALINIRANJAN SARKAR: Is it a fact that Government decided subsequently to purchase the formula from Mr. Griffiths and that a cheque for Rs. 40,000 was sent to him.

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: The answer is in the affirmative.

Mr. KIRAN SANKAR ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Mr. Griffiths is a native of South Africa, and a member of the Kenya Colony.

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: The answer is in the negative.

Deputation of Mr. J. M. Mitra to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at British Empire Exhibition.

***XLVIII. Babu NALINIRANJAN SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Mr. J. M. Mitra, Registrar of Co-operative Societies, has been selected to proceed to England in charge of the Bengal Exhibits at the British Empire Exhibition?

(*b*) If so—

(*i*) when will he proceed to England;

(*ii*) how long will he stay there; and

(*iii*) what remuneration will be paid to him during his deputation?

(*c*) Is it a fact that Mr. Mitra will take a certain staff with him?

(*d*) If so, what are the duties of the staff and what is their number?

(*e*) Are the members of the staff Government servants?

(*f*) What will be their remuneration?

(*g*) How has the staff been selected?

(*h*) What are the qualifications of the staff selected for Exhibition work?

(*i*) Had they any previous experience?

(*j*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to name the persons selected, if any, and to say who have selected them?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) (*i*) He left for England on 10th January, 1924.

(*ii*) During the continuance of the British Empire Exhibition.

(*iii*) His ordinary pay plus a subsistence allowance of £1 per diem.

(*c*) and (*d*) No staff has accompanied Mr. Mitra, but it is proposed to employ five assistants to help him to look after the Bengal Court in the Exhibition and eleven operatives to demonstrate the working processes of some of the cottage industries in Bengal.

(*e*) The staff of assistants has not yet been finally selected, but it is proposed to send three Government servants in the first instance and to try to recruit the remaining two assistants from among Bengali residents in London, including both Government officers on leave, if available, and outsiders.

(*f*) The Government servants selected here will proceed to England on leave and they will get no remuneration beyond a subsistence allowance of ten shillings per diem. It is proposed to give the recruits in England a remuneration of £3 a week. The operatives will get a monthly remuneration varying from Rs. 50 to Rs. 150 while employed in connection with the Exhibition. They will also get an outfit allowance of £6 each.

(*g*) Mr. Mitra has suggested certain Government servants, but final selection will be made in consultation with the Organising Committee for the Bengal Section of the British Empire Exhibition.

(*h*) Acquaintance with the conditions of Bengal industries.

(*i*) If by experience is meant experience of large exhibitions the answer is in the negative; if experience of the industries and conditions of Bengal the answer is in the affirmative.

(*j*) The member is referred to the answers given to parts (*e*) and (*g*) of the question.

Alleged watch by police of premises No 9, Russa Road North.

***XLIX. Mr. J. M. SEN GUPTA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state—

(i) whether any police officers have been deputed to watch the premises No. 9, Russa Road North, Calcutta, without a break day and night, or for any period; and

(ii) whether he is aware that the premises are used by the members of the Bengal Legislative Council belonging to the Swarajya Party?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for the watching of the premises by the police officers?

(*c*) What amount of money is being spent for the salary or wages for the police officers for the watching of the said premises?

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: (*a*) (i) No.

(ii) Yes

(*b*) Does not arise.

(*c*) Does not arise.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Residential quarters of District Judge, Midnapore.

76. Babu SATYA KISHORE BANERJEE: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state—

(i) whether the District Judge of Midnapore is provided with free quarters; or

(ii) whether he occupies a rented house as a monthly tenant?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (i) No.

(ii) He occupies a private house for which at present no rent is being realised.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state if it is not a fact that the District Judges have generally tried to evade payment of house rent?

Mr. PRESIDENT: I do not like the question in that form, it imputes motives, and has nothing to do with any matter of public interest.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: It is not a fact

Mohankhali Circle Embankment.

77. Babu KHAGENDRA NATH GANGULY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state what action, if any, has been taken by the Government on the petition submitted by the inhabitants of village Sreebara in the district of Midnapore to the Secretary, Irrigation Department, dated the 5th of October, 1923, regarding the urgency of repairs in the embankment at 0·32 miles Mohankhali Circle, Ajoora Section, under Godghat subdivision (P.W.D.)?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the breaches which were caused by the Ghatal flood of 1922 have not been repaired since?

(*c*) Is it a fact that as a result of this there has been failure of local crops for the last two consecutive years?

(*d*) If the answer to (*b*) above is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what were the reasons for the delay in carrying out the repairs?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that owing to the failure of crops there is a likelihood of famine breaking out in the locality and that, unless the breaches are repaired immediately, a large area will be affected?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) It has been decided to protect the Mohankhali Circuit partially by raising small protective bunds at the sites of the breaches. The work has been put in hand.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) There has been a partial failure of crops on 14 square miles.

(*d*) Financial stringency and the impossibility of making good the breaches till those in the Circuit to the north were stopped.

(*e*) No. Government does not anticipate a famine even with a total failure of crops in so small an area.

It is improbable that a large area will be affected.

Chief Judge, Calcutta Small Causes Court.

78. Mr. P. N. CUHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether any arrangement has been made to fill up the vacancy caused in the Calcutta Small Causes Court by the appointment of Dr. Thornhill in the Bench of the High Court?

(*b*) If so, what is the nature of the arrangement?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of giving gradual promotion to the judges and appointing a member of the Provincial Judicial Service at the bottom?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Mr. J. C. Gupta, the 2nd Judge, Small Causes Court, has been appointed to officiate as Chief Judge.

(*c*) There is no question of gradual promotion as all the Judges are now on a time-scale. There is already one member of the Provincial Judicial Service on the Bench and Government does not contemplate appointing a second member of the Bench from that Service.

A silted-up route from Chittagong to Calcutta.

79. Maulvi SAYYED SULTAN ALI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation aware that a route from Chittagong to Calcutta has been closed down owing to the silting up of the Alaipur Khal, Bamarta Khal and the Damodar River?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the route that has been closed down was considered to be the shortest and safest route from Chittagong to Calcutta?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of keeping the route open?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) An equally good route, *viâ* the Lower Kumar and Madaripur Bhil, is being maintained.

(*c*) The possibility of keeping the Alaipur Khal open is being investigated.

Proposed Satkhira-Navaran Railway line.

80. Maulvi SAYYED SULTAN ALI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) be pleased to state what steps have been or are being taken to construct a railway line from Satkhira to Navaran *viâ* Kalarua?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: The matter is pending with the Railway Board and this Government have no information yet when the Railway Board propose to sanction the construction of the line.

Waterways on Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway.

81. Babu SATYA KISHORE BANERJEE: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Public Works Department (Railways) be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of making an inquiry as to the sufficiency of the waterways on the Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway, under normal conditions of rainfall, and also in the case of flood?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: The attention of the member is drawn to the reply given to a similar question No. 201, part (*d*), in the September, 1921, session of the Council. A further inquiry is however being made by Government.

District Board dispensary in Barrackpore rural area.

82. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Mr. D. N. Mullick has offered to the 24-Parganas District Board to contribute Rs. 1,800 per year for the establishment of three dispensaries in the 24-Parganas and that the said offer has been accepted by the said district board?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that there is no dispensary in the rural area of the Barrackpore subdivision?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware of the comparative unhealthiness of the said area?

(*d*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of asking the said district board to establish a dispensary in the Barrackpore rural area?

SECRETARY to GOVERNMENT, DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (Mr. C. S. Dutt): (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) The member is referred to the reply given to clause (*a*) of his unstarred question No. 135 asked at the meeting of the 1st December, 1921. Besides the municipal dispensaries, there are two railway dispensaries in the area, and nearly every one of the numerous mills maintains a dispensary. In fact the subdivision of Barrackpore is probably better supplied with dispensaries than any other part of Bengal.

(*c*) Barrackpore appears to be one of the healthiest subdivisions, judging by the continued increase of population that has occurred during the past 20 years. In the decade 1901-11 population increased by 41·7 per cent., and the census of 1921 recorded a further increase of 18·5 per cent. against an 8 per cent. increase for the whole of the 24-Parganas. The average density of population is 2,181 per square mile. The mean mortality rate is high, but this is largely owing to the large floating population, many of whom are immigrants.

(*d*) No.

Alleged differential treatment in the matter of house allowances to officers.

83. Mr. J. CAMPBELL FORRESTER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether it is a fact that officers eligible for presidency house-rent are entitled to draw house allowance although they live at Serampore or at Barrackpore?

(*b*) Is it a fact that officers living in places nearer Calcutta, such as Konnagore, Uttarpara, Lillooah, Panihati, North Barānagore, if otherwise eligible, are not entitled to draw the allowance?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for this differential treatment?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of removing this anomaly?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. J. Donald): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The rules have never been altered, because, as far as Government are aware, no case of an officer living in any of the places mentioned in (*b*) and otherwise eligible for the allowance has come to notice.

(*d*) No.

Grand Trunk Canal project.

84. Babu BADRIDAS COENKA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of tht Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of the Government to take up the Grand Trunk Canal project at an early date?

(*b*) If so, when is it likely to be introduced in the Council?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the services of a Chief Engineer are still being retained in connection with the Grand Trunk Canal project?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state—

(*i*) the nature of the work done by the officer; and

(*ii*) the reasons why his services are being retained?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) and (*b*) This question is under the consideration of Government.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) (*i*) The Chief Engineer has been placed on special duty in addition to his own duties to deal with the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee, he has also been engaged in working out major projects in connection with the Bidyadhari and Kumar rivers.

(*ii*) This question does not arise.

Dredging Bidyadhari River.

85. Babu BADRIDAS COENKA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the dredging operation of the Bidyadhari River has proved unsuccessful?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the bed of the river out by the dredger is being rapidly re-silted?

(*c*) If so, is the Hon'ble the Member considering the desirability of taking any other measure to solve the drainage problem of Calcutta?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) and (*b*) The dredged portion of the river has silted up behind the dredger to a large extent, but the river below the dredged portion has maintained its previous section.

(*c*) Yes. A proposal to construct a reservoir at the head of the river for the purpose of flushing the silt deposits is under the consideration of the Corporation of Calcutta who have submitted the project to Government for approval.

Registrar, Co-operative Societies.

86. Mr. P. N. GUHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it was the intention of the Government to keep the post of the Registrar of the Co-operative Societies reserved for the members of the Provincial Executive Service?

(*b*) If the answer is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state why the appointment has recently been given to a member of the Indian Civil Service?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to make a statement regarding the policy of the Government by which the future appointment of the Registrar will generally be governed?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

(*c*) Subject to the proviso that it is open to Government to appoint to the post of Registrar a member of the Indian Civil Service or the holder of a listed post, should it be found desirable in the interests of the public service at any time to do so, the appointment is ordinarily open to officers selected from the staff of the Co-operative Department in Bengal, but the policy of Government is in all cases to select the officer best suited for the post.

Serampore Weaving Institute.

87. Maulvi ABDUR RASHID KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Weaving Institute of Serampore is going to be transferred to Bankura?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: The answer is in the negative.

Waiting room at Noakhali Railway station.

88. Maulvi ABDUR RASHID KHAN: Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) aware that there is no waiting room of any kind at the Noakhali Railway Station either for males or females?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: The local Government have no information on the subject but an inquiry will be made from the Railway Company.

Maulvi ABDUR RASHID KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge be pleased to state whether any recommendation will go from Government to provide a waiting room there?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: At present no such recommendation can be made.

Fumes from a factory in Konnagar.

89. Babu TARAKNATH MUKERJEA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware of the existence of a Sulphur Factory in the midst of the residential quarter of the Konnagar municipality in the district of Hooghly?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the residents there have complained about the same?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking any steps in the matter?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: (*a*) There is no Sulphur Factory at Konnagar. The member is possibly referring to the Chemical Works of Messrs. D. Waldie and Company.

(*b*) Complaints have been received by the Director of Public Health in regard to fumes from the workshop.

(*c*) Officers of the Public Health Department have frequently inspected the factory in company with the Chief Inspector of Factories and it is understood that the recommendations made with a view to preventing the nuisance have been duly carried out. It is also understood that the Company will shortly instal two additional Gay Lussac towers which will greatly reduce, if not entirely prevent, the escape of gas from the workshop.

Kala-azar in certain thanas of the 24-Parganas.

90. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that black fever is prevailing in the Bhangar, Baruipur and Jaynagar thanas of the 24-Parganas district?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of opening centres for free treatment at these places?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: (*a*) The Director of Public Health has no special report of Black fever (Kala-azar) being prevalent in the Bhangar, Barhipur and Jaynagar thanas of the 24-Parganas. The number of deaths reported from Kala-azar in these thanas during the past three years is as follows:—

	1921.	1922.	1923.
Bhangar thana ..	—	—	1
Baruipur ..	—	1	1
Jaynagar ..	—	—	—
Total ..	..	1	2

These figures do not suggest any great prevalence of the disease, but it appears that during the year some 1,300 cases of Kala-azar have been treated at a relief centre established by the Bistoopur Co-operative Anti-malarial Society; and it is possible that some of these cases came from parts of Bhangar thana. There is an Anti-malarial Co-operative Society at Harinavi also not far from Baruipur, at which 8 cases of Kala-azar have been treated. The 24-Parganas District Board and the municipalities of Baruipur and Jaynagar have been requested to submit a report on the prevalence of Kala-azar in the thanas in question but their reply has not yet been received.

(*b*) Responsibility for the prevention of disease and the provision of medical relief is primarily a duty of local authorities, e.g., municipalities and district boards. There are municipal dispensaries at Baruipur and Jaynagar and a considerable number of district board dispensaries situated in the thanas in question, viz., two in Baruipur thana, two in Jaynagar thana, and one in Bhangar thana.

It is understood that the district board of the 24-Parganas has arranged to subsidise the Central Co-operative Anti-malarial Society with a view to the establishment of about 50 branch societies for dealing with malaria and Kala-azar. Government have also made a grant of Rs. 10,000 to this society, half of which is earmarked for Kala-azar work, and a grant of Rs. 5,000 to the Bengal Health Association which has also been carrying out Kala-azar relief work in the 24-Parganas. In fact more relief work is now being undertaken against Kala-azar in the 24-Parganas than in any other part of the province. Government have no intention of themselves opening relief centres for Kala-azar. The policy of Government with regard to anti-Kala-azar measures is stated in detail in their Resolution No. 2671 P.H., of the 6th November, 1923, published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 7th *idem*.

Want of platform at Jhikergacha Ghat station.

91. Maulvi ABDUL QUADER: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) aware that passengers, especially the female passengers, suffer much trouble and inconvenience at the Jhikergacha Ghat Bridge Railway Station (Eastern Bengal Railway, Central Section) for want of a platform?

(*b*) If the answer is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of asking the railway authorities to remedy this grievance of the public as early as possible?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: (*a*) Government have no information.

(*b*) The attention of the Railway authorities will be drawn to the subject-matter of this question.

Research work in cotton.

92. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of the Government to continue the work on cotton in Bengal in the Department of Agriculture?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: Government decided in May, 1923, to continue for another year the research work in cotton which had at that time been going on for 2½ years as it was hoped that by the expiry of one year's time conclusive results would be obtained and the inquiry would be completed.

Durbar grant.

93. Maulvi ALLAH BUKSH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether the whole of the Durbar grant allotted to Bengal has been distributed? If not, why not?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the rapid progress of primary education in this province?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware that the Durbar grant already sanctioned to the District Boards is inadequate?

(*d*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of increasing the said grant for this province?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq): (*a*) The whole of the Durbar

grant has been distributed. This grant amounted to Rs. 9,25,000 out of which six lakhs were allotted for primary education.

(*b*) During the last quinquennium ending 1921-22 the number of primary schools and students attending them was 35,615 and 1,164,597, respectively, as against 32,588 and 1,159,786 of the previous quinquennium ending 1916-17. The increase therefore is 3,027 schools and 4,811 students.

(*c*) Besides the Durbar grant other recurring grants were made by the Government of India from time to time for the expansion of primary education; but with the introduction of the Reforms in the year 1921 these recurring grants came to an end under the special financial settlements made with the provinces. Since then the expenditure on primary education has been met from Provincial Revenues and the total expenditure during the year 1922-23 amounted to Rs. 19,86,316. It is admitted that this sum falls short of the amount needed for the expansion of primary education in this Province but as the Member is no doubt aware, the activities of Government are unfortunately hampered by reason of financial stringency.

(*d*) Government hope, with the co-operation of the members of this Council, to extend primary education when funds become available.

Election of members of Standing Committee.

Mr. PRESIDENT: I desire to remind members of the Council that the ballot will be taken for the election of members to the Standing Committees to-morrow the 27th between the hours of 1-30 and 2-55 P.M.

The House will now proceed with the general discussion of the budget of the Government of Bengal for the year 1924-25.

Discussion of the Budget of the Government of Bengal for 1924-25.

Babu SUDARSAN CHAKRAVORTY: Sir, I would like to say a few words on the budget presented to the Council on the 18th last by the Hon'ble Member in charge of Finance. The Hon'ble Member, tired of *deficit budgets* since the reforms, has managed this year to present what he could call a surplus budget. Now what is the amount of this surplus? Only about a lakh of rupees. But the Hon'ble Member tells us that he could have shown a larger surplus had he not provided 36 lakhs for nation-building purposes. The argument is plausible, but examined closely has not much substance. For stripped of this provision the budget will not have even the appearance of a prosperous budget. What we want is not a surplus budget technically so called, but a prosperous budget.

It appears from the budget estimates presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Member that we have three principal sources of income, viz.—(1) Land Revenue; (2) Excise; (3) Stamp; and on all the three heads the estimates are greater than the revised estimates of 1923-24, the excess coming to about 20 lakhs. The explanation is unconvincing.

As regards Excise, the Hon'ble the Finance Member says, "we anticipate a further increase of 6 lakhs under the head of Excise."

In another place he says, "the growth of the Excise revenue has further been accelerated by the collapse of the non-co-operation movement. This feature, namely, that Excise revenue is one of the three principal sources of income makes the budget of the Government of Bengal a budget of despair, not of hope, as one of the three legs rests on a slippery base."

The Hon'ble Finance Member may think that with the collapse of non-co-operation we may anticipate a further increase of 6 lakhs. But non-co-operation has already done its work and unless its work is undone by missionary labour under the auspices of Government in the opposite direction, its effect, God willing, will continue to be felt in the progressive decrease of the Excise revenue. It pains me and makes me almost unable to suppress tears to think that a nation, so advanced in civilisation, should not resent the idea of exploiting a vice of such magnitude for the sake of revenue. It may of course be necessary to tax and sometimes to over-tax a vice in order to discourage it and without giving any facility for its commission. The tax thus derived is not objectionable. But to give facilities for the use of liquor and other excisable articles for the sake of revenue, is to my mind and according to all social and religious codes, a vice. Temperance is a well known subject of British Missionary work throughout the world and their efforts have borne ample fruit in the creation of a "dry America."

If, thanks to the social and religious regeneration of India, Excise revenue should altogether cease, as it may cease at no distant date, the finances of Bengal will be in a hopeless muddle. The only ways out of the difficulty would be (1) retrenchment in expenditure, (2) fresh Bills of taxation.

India is too poor to bear the burden of further taxation. The three Bills of taxation of 1921-22 were introduced under peculiar circumstances. The reforms had been introduced but there was no money to work them. On the contrary, while Bombay began the reforms with a surplus of 2 crores 42 lakhs, Madras 2 crores 41 lakhs, the United Provinces 2 crores 17 lakhs, the Punjab 1 crore 90 lakhs, Burma 2 crores 26 lakhs, Bengal began the reforms with a deficit of over 2 crores. Retrenchment alone was thought insufficient to cope with the situation. Taxation, under the circumstances, was thought to be the only way

out of the difficulty and that was resorted to and the 3 Bills of taxation became law—

(1) The Stamp Act.
(2) The Court-fees Act.
(3) The Amusement Taxation Act.

The circumstances calling for taxation were of a non-recurring nature and have ceased to exist but the taxes remain and are realised. Is there any justification for the continuance of these taxes? I think none. Retrenchment was the only other, and circumstanced as Bengal was, the only remedy. "Cut your coat according to your cloth" is an adage as applicable to political as to domestic economy. On the contrary if we further tax an already over-taxed people except for some unavoidable contingency affecting their own existence, we shall only be spreading discontent, poverty and starvation with all the evils which go in their train.

The current year is, according to the Hon'ble Finance Member, a year of prosperity, justifying, in view of large balances, the inclusion in the ensuing year's budget, of works of real development. I congratulate the Hon'ble Member upon this. At the same time it must be remembered that if the enhancement of Stamp and Court-fees duties be deducted from the duties realised on those heads, the budget will lose its charm and become an ordinary deficit budget. The real criterion of credit is the benefit conferred on the people without adding to their burden of taxation.

This brings us to the question of retrenchment.

I would give the Hon'ble Member credit for what retrenchment he has effected on the recommendation of the Retrenchment Committee and before the appointment of that committee at the instance of Government and invite him to see if further retrenchments are possible. Let us first take up general administration.

The administration is run in the transferred departments by 3 Ministers and in the reserved departments by 4 Members. Each of these 7 draws a yearly pay of Rs. 64,000. Formerly the whole work used to be done by a Lieutenant-Governor. Owing to such extravagant numbers and salaries the administration has become a top-heavy administration which should be substantially lightened at the top before its stability can be secured.

As regards the Legislative Council, there is a larger provision for travelling expenses to the extent of Rs. 23,000.

Already there is a general complaint that more is paid for members' travelling expenses than is necessary and there should be no increase. Turning, then, to education we find that the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College is foreshadowed in the ensuing year. The establishment of a purely Muhammadan Arts College in these days of increasing consolidation and assimilation of the two communities

does not appear to be urgent and might well have been postponed. There is a provision in the budget for Rs. 1,00,000 in 1924-25 on this head. It is for my Muhammadan fellow-country men to say whether there is any pressing need. If there is not, why accentuate a difference between the two communities by calling it a Muhammadan College?

Police.—The cry against the police is an old cry in the wilderness. Advantage is often taken of disturbed times to increase the expenditure, but allowances are seldom made for times of peace and quiet to substantially reduce them. Thus in 1921-22 there was a rise of 35 lakhs but in 1922-23 there was a fall of only 5 lakhs and the state of things in 1920-21 has never been restored.

In reviewing the whole budget the Council will not forget the outstanding fact that the taxes of 1922 were imposed to meet a non-recurring deficit and after they had done their part they ought to have been repealed to relieve the starving millions of this additional burden. If you impose a tax every time you want it Government will never be in want but the people will always be. I am not unmindful that the award of the Meston Committee has created a burden which if pressed would require to be discharged. But it would be a dangerous precedent if taxes imposed under extraordinary circumstances presumably for a particular purpose were allowed to continue after that especial purpose was served, to swell the ordinary revenues of the country. The Council will, in this connection, remember that there are large balances in view of which it is proposed to undertake public works to the extent of 88 lakhs of rupees. The Council will consider if they can retain the taxes and boast of a prosperous budget. What I mean is that these new public works are done by practically imposing taxes; and when I congratulate the Hon'ble Finance Member on the value and usefulness of the works, I cannot conceal from myself the genuine fear that any addition to the burden of taxation might lead to disastrous results. Equally important and urgent with, if not more important and urgent than, the public works referred to above is the work of removing silt from near the mouth of the Boral river where it issues out of the Padma near Sarda Police Training College in Rajshahi. In answer to questions put by me in this Council Government has admitted that the silting up of the Boral near its mouth has prejudicially affected the sanitation and navigation of a large portion of the districts of Rajshahi and Pabna and that the attention of Government has been directed to these facts. In a budget which provides for so many public works of the same nature the omission of the Boral is unfortunate and I request the Hon'ble the Finance Member to be so good as to include it.

Rai SATYENDRA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI Bahadur: I deem it my duty to take part in the budget discussion however humble it may be. I congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member for his presenting a surplus budget as he has been pleased to describe it. Though not a

deficit budget I cannot call it a prosperity budget on which the people can rejoice. I thank the Hon'ble Member as he has relieved us from an anxiety that he has not again asked us to sanction fresh taxation. I would have joined in a chorus of praise if he could only even partially relieve the taxpayers from the new taxes imposed only two years ago. The increase in the stamp duty has affected the poor and the needy vitally. If by further economy and retrenchment he could make further savings in the expenditure he could shower his benefaction to those affected people.

In answer to a question put by my friend Babu Naliniranjan Sarkar the Hon'ble Member told us the other day that the total savings up to date is Rs. 4,40,470 as recommended by the special officer deputed for the purpose. This is certainly very disappointing in comparison with the total figures recommended by the Retrenchment Committee. The Retrenchment Committee was composed of men of vast experience and sober judgment and it is difficult to understand how their recommendations were so lightely passed over I am glad to note the robust optimism of the Hon'ble Finance Member without its qualifying words of caution. I only wish that his visions are materialised and we find a substantial saving towards the end of the year to be utilised in useful works of nation-building departments.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member has given us a comparative statement of last three years together with the ensuing year and he has shown that from a deficit of Rs. 2,48,21,000 he has brought the budget to a small surplus. This is an improvement which no one can deny and for which the Hon'ble the Finance Member is to be complimented. But the question is whether there is further room for retrenchment in all departments and consequently of much more savings. The people still believe, though rightly or wrongly, that there is still enough scope for retrenchment and savings.

I am glad to find Rs. 1,44,000 provided for colonisation scheme in the Sundarbans of Backerganj and the 24-Parganas. They will prove not only fruitful but useful also. They will not only augment Government revenue but provide lands and bread to people who are really in need of it. From the Government point of view larger allotment for settlement operations may be sound, for they increase Government revenue by enhancement in temporarily settled estates and also by the sale of court-fee stamps required for the civil litigations that generally follow such operations. But such settlement operations are sometimes looked upon as harrassing by the people and they are positively hard to the poor who cannot bear the legitimate and illegitimate expenses that entail them.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member on page 15 of his report has admitted that there has been a fall in litigation in the current year, but I do not find a corresponding reduction in the expenditure of the Judicial Department.

I notice with regret that no real effect has been given to the very wise and salutary recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee contained in paragraphs 19, 22, and 23 of their report and no substantial reduction has been made in the expenditure of the Excise Department.

I do not propose to cut down the normal expenditure of an earning department like the Forest, but at the same time I cannot refrain from observing that instead of providing Rs. 80,000 for the improvement of communications, etc., in a year it could have been provided in two years and the balance should have been devoted to the immediate relief of rural water-supply.

The most effective cut recommended by the Retrenchment Committee under the head General Administration in paragraph 90 of the report has not yet been given effect to, had the Government seen its way to accept this recommendation the net savings of Rs. 5,20,000 could have been easily placed in the hands of the Hon'ble Ministers to develop education and sanitation.

Personally I do not belong to that school of thought (politicians) who would ruthlessly cut down the expenditure of the Police Department even to the detriment of efficiency, but at the same time I would like to see all reasonable retrenchment to be carried out to feed the starving departments.

Many of the most reasonable recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee in this department have been overlooked and I do not understand why the post offices of this department should not be closed and those unnecessary highly paid offices should not be abolished to make provision for qualified officers with detective abilities in every district. It is a matter of ordinary knowledge that the District Police administration constituted as it is now is more for prevention than for detection of crimes. In cases of crimes with premeditation and conspiracy they are absolutely helpless unless specially talented officers are deputed for the purpose. I venture to suggest that more Indianisation of the District Administration by officers of exceptional administrative and detective abilities will not only result in economy but will increase its real efficiency.

I cannot approve the wisdom of providing a lakh of rupees for the supply of iron cots and mosquito curtains to the force. I presume they are intended for the constables who live in barracks. One who is acquainted with the internal life of the constables living in barracks will at once agree with me that these are quite unnecessary for them as at least 75 per cent. of them live in a much more lavish style.

In the matter of building accommodation I am sorry to note that the claims of Bengal Police have been neglected in comparison with their fortunate brethren of the Calcutta Police though the mufassal people live and work under more arduous and inconvenient situations.

The real defect of the present administration is that it is top-heavy. So long as you do not rectify it and apply the savings to free primary education, anti-malarial operations and rural water-supply the people of Bengal will not be satisfied.

I am glad to find that a provision of one lakh of rupees has been made for the extension of medical relief in rural areas and Rs. 20,000 for payment of grant in emergent cases. Though these sums are quite inadequate for the purpose, it is surely a move in the right direction. I would like to see further expansion in medical education and like Mymensingh Medical School other medical schools should be started as early as practicable. This will not only extend medical help to rural areas but will provide a living for a good number of our young men.

The grant for improvement of rural water-supply, quinine grants to local bodies and specially grant for anti-malarial measures are very inadequate and should have received much better consideration.

Last of all I come to Education. I deplore the action of the Government in not repeating the non-recurring grant of three lakhs of rupees to the Calcutta University and raise my emphatic protest against the action. If it is the outcome of a long-standing controversy between the Government and the University about the merit and demerit of which I do not propose to say anything at present, I strongly deprecate the course. If the Government desires that the Calcutta University, which is the *alma mater* of many of us here, should close its doors we cannot shut our eyes and allow such action. I am sure no argument and reasonings are necessary in such a case. The higher education of the Province must be maintained and the Government I hope will reconsider its action.

I think, Sir, the time now has come when the Government can safely deprovincialise the Government High Schools for boys and retrench considerably the highly paid inspecting staff and then devote this saving to the development of medical and vocational studies.

I am sorely disappointed to find that the promises which Mr. P. C. Mitter, the former Minister of Education, made in his budget speech of March 1, 1922, has not been fulfilled or his policy with regard to special educational grant for the depressed classes who are very backward in education has not been followed. The depressed classes of Bengal form a substantial portion of the population and they contribute their fair and due share of the taxes. It would be cruel if they do not get fair facilities for their educational advancement. I hope in the supplementary budget the Hon'ble the Minister will ear-mark a substantial sum for educational facilities for the depressed classes.

In conclusion I thank the Government for providing Rs. 60,000 for the construction of a quadruple Munsifi at Pirojpore in the district of Backerganj, thus working out a long-pending scheme and meeting a long-felt crying want of the place.

Mr. W. L. TRAVERS: In my speech upon the budget discussion last year, Sir, I felt it my duty to criticise and to attack certain proposals of the Bengal Retrenchment Committee. Although I am now able to congratulate the Hon'ble Member upon what I then described as the "sweep up" of the administration, I am still of the opinion that there has been undue economy in several directions, notably in regard to the nation-buildng departments of Agriculture, Public Health and Medical and in regard to the Police. The reason for my attitude is the same as it was then. It is because I believe that undue economy in these directions most seriously affects, either directly or indirectly, the poor of the Province, those who have the difficulty to obtain their livelihood.

Again, Sir, I said last year, and I have said many times in this House, that the development of agriculture provides the only means of obtaining that increased wealth which must be secured to enable the poor men of this Province to obtain some comfort and happiness. It is satisfactory, therefore, to see in this budget that there is to be a forward movement by the establishment of two more farms, and it is specially satisfactory to me to find that both these farms are in my own division of Rajshahi—at Jalpaiguri and Dinajpur. Now, Sir, I am an agriculturist who lives upon and by the soil, and I have studied the matter of these farms for a good many years. I am convinced that these farms are of great use to the raiyats. Although perhaps the raiyats has little education, he is nevertheless a very shrewd and practical person. If he sees with his own eyes that better crops can be secured by improved methods, he adopts those methods. There is, therefore, radiating from the centre a circle of improved method and improved culture. That circle increases in size slowly, it is true, but nevertheless steadily. I venture, Sir, however to give one word of warning to the Hon'ble the Minister in regard to these farms. It is obvious to anyone who has studied the reports of the Department that the soils of some of the farms already in existence are very poor—they are so poor that it must be difficult or even impossible to grow suitable crops either for demonstration or for experiment. I would advise a careful survey in that direction. The soil of every farm should represent one of the main types of soil in common use in the district. It should neither be better nor worse than a type soil of the district. I do not believe myself that it is possible to make any farm pay until it has been in use for at least 15 years. Some revenue may indeed be obtained but demonstration, experiment and research—these are the things which make a farm valuable to the raiyat. But those farms may be made very much more useful to the raiyat if only non-officials would help in their progress. I venture to appeal to the members of this House to form agricultural associations to advertise these farms in order to bring the raiyat more in touch with them. I ask the members of the Rajshahi Division particularly to vote for the grants

for these farms. I also ask all the members of the House to vote for these grants. In the north of Bengal we are backward far behind the south of Bengal in many essentials, and I ask, therefore, for more money to bring them to the standard of the latter.

Now, Sir, while I rejoice to see the establishment of a Medical School at Mymensingh, I urge the Hon'ble the Minister and the Council to remember the report of the Advisory Committee appointed by Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea. That Committee—I am speaking from recollection but I believe I am correct—recommended that after Mymensingh the next Medical School should be established in the far east at Chittagong and in the far north at Jalpaiguri. I have no time to detail the weighty arguments for the establishment of a Medical School at Jalpaiguri in the neighbourhood of tea-gardens where there is a large field of employment for the students. But I would venture to remind Government and the members of this House that we at Jalpaiguri are doing our best to deserve the school. We have already collected Rs. 40,000 for the enlargement and improvement of the hospital. By the generosity of the share-holders of tea-gardens, both British and Indian, and of the general public we hope to complete the sum of Rs. 75,000 which is needed for the enlargement and expansion of the hospital. After that we intend to appeal to the other District Boards of the division for help in regard to the recurring charges. That being so, I trust that Government and this House will, should the financial position improve, help us later in the year with a supplementary grant, or in the next year by providing funds for the establishment of a Medical School at Jalpaiguri.

My next subject is that of police efficiency. It is related so much to the well-being of the people of the Province that I trust that the hon'ble members of this House will look at it from that point of view. I myself visited the Sardah Police School last year and carefully inspected the whole of the training. I was astonished to see the efficiency of the work that was done at that school. The work is hard but it must be of the greatest value to every recruit at the school whether Assistant Superintendent, sub-inspector or constable. One item of training I may bring to the notice of the House is this continual insistence day after day is placed upon the duty of the policemen to help the general public. He is taught that his duty does not lie in the prevention and detection of crime only but he has to help any individual who desires it, so that they might become in time like the policeman in Great Britain. I urge Government to restore the Sardah School to what it used to be before the days of economy. I am certain that it will pay the Province to do so.

There are two others directions for which funds are urgently required. The travelling allowances of officers in the various classes have been cut to such an extent that it interferes very seriously not only with the prevention of crimes but with inspection also. I am

glad to see that there is to be some correction in that direction by means of an allotment. Secondly, the provision of decent quarters for constables is an urgent matter. Constable cannot keep decent health if they live in some of the houses with which they are provided. I can assure the House that we tea-planters would be ashamed to put our coolies in houses like some of the quarters provided by Government for the constables. I ask the Bengal Government to do something in this direction.

Finally, Sir, I ask this House to support the allotment in the budget for the building of the Lower Jalducca bridge in the Jalpaiguri districts. That bridge does not only provide the means for the importation of foodstuffs to a large tea district—a district in which there is a large number of Indian gardens—but it is also of very great advantage to the raiyat. That bridge and the roads permit the raiyat to take his paddy to the tea-garden bazars and there to sell it direct to the tea-garden labourers. The elimination of the middleman provides the raiyat with a much higher price for his produce and the result has been a very considerable increase in wealth to the small *jotdars* and tenants in the south of Jalpaiguri.

Baby BORODA PROSAD DEY: It is a fortunate circumstance that the Hon'ble the Finance Member has been able to present in the new Council a budget of no deficit, after three successive years of deficit budgets, and the Council may congratulate itself upon the same. A closer scrutiny will, however, show that despite the ingenuity of the Finance Member it is nothing but a deficit budget. Much expectation has been built upon increased revenue from Stamp, Land Revenue, and Excise. It is a matter of very great regret that Bengal Finance should rest upon the expected increase from Stamp and Excise, one indicating demoralisation, and the other decay of the people. In Land Revenue there is always an uncertainty on account of floods and cyclones as hinted by the Finance Member. Speaking of Excise one feels ashamed in having recourse to this revenue to keep our head above water. Sir, it is well said that the Government policy is not to encourage consumption of excisable articles, but in practice we find just the reverse. The so-called Advisory Committees brought into existence with a flourish of trumpets are generally ignored by the authorities, even if they unanimously recommend the closing of any liquor or *tari* shop, without giving any reason to the contrary. Again a new experiment about marking the date trees and the receptacles of juice has been the cause of lesser production of molasses and the consequent increase in the price of this necessary article of food, and a larger import of foreign sugar. Sir, looking at the hand of the clock I now go to the expenditure side of the budget, and the police first attracts our attention. Reduction of expenditure under this head had always been a cry in the wilderness, and I would not repeat the same. But it is undeniable that here as everywhere the

evil is in its top-heavy administration. An examination of the details past and present will show how many fat berths have been created at or near the top, and how many have been added to the rank and file of the police force since the report of the Police Commission. I need hardly say that we badly need more of adequately paid police force in the lower rung for the protection of our person and property, than richly paid officers for works so called supervision. Coming to general administration Rs. 2 lakhs has been provided to acquire land for new Civil Court buildings at Serampore and other works elsewhere. I must say this land acquisition is a wrong move, for such acquisition raises a fictitious value of land and further the proposed land is not at all suitable for the purpose. It would be better and cheaper to purchase the present rented house with all its out-offices, and to execute all necessary repairs to the same. Or if a new house is to be built, it should be done within the extensive compound of the Criminal Courts. The pretty big tank therein may conveniently be filled up to have more land for other purposes. A big amount ought not to be spent in buying land for Civil Courts. Under the head General Administration the sorry plight of ill-paid clerks and poor menials should receive the attention of the Government. Coming now to the unfortunate half of the Administration, I mean the transferred subjects, we find the usual miserly disposition of grants, and it is a matter of surprise and regret that the grant to the Calcutta University has not been repeated, knowing as we all do that this University stands in need of such grants. Then comes the question of secondary schools scattered all over the Province, which have got to struggle for their very existence from year's end to year's end, and whose teaching staff have been fortunate enough to attract the sympathetic attention of the Hon'ble the Minister of Education. It is expected that the grants-in-aid system will be worked more liberally than at present. The question of Primary Education has not made any progress during the past years, and is not likely to do so unless the handicap of the imposition of education tax is removed from it. It is well known that the local bodies are not financially able to take up this question without substantial help from Government. The question of taxation cannot arise. Sir, in this Province of abnormally high death-rate due in most cases to preventable causes, the questions of health and medical aid come uppermost in the minds of all people. Good water-supply in mufassal towns and rural villages is at present a question of questions, and should receive serious consideration, and the Government should find the requisite money by curtailing expenditure under all other heads. Closely allied with this is the question of opening of dead and dying rivers whose number is legion in at least West Bengal. In this connection the Damodar project and the dredging of the Saraswati need special mention. As for medical aid in the villages, the less said the better for it is a sad commentary upon the solicitude of Government for the lives of their subjects. The Ministry of Local Self-Government thinks that their part of this duty

is done by giving advices to local bodies who are expected to make bricks without straw. The Government should come with liberal help to local bodies, small grants here and there would not advance matters. Coming to Agriculture and Industry the same slow and sorry advance is noticeable. Even at times matters are set back, as for instance the Agricultural Schools established only a couple of years ago at the Chinsurah Agricultural Farm is proposed to be abolished or removed from there. It should be given a fair trial at the place before any other course is decided upon. It is a truism that no serious attempts are made to extend the usefulness of the two most useful departments of agriculture and industry beyond creating a few posts at headquarters of divisions or districts, and convening a few formal meetings at such headquarters to fill up the pages of Government official reports. Sir, speaking on the budget one hardly can omit a reference to the report of the Bengal Retrenchment Committee, whose unanimous report, though not quite up to the expectation, was received with some welcome, and it was expected that a large saving will be found by giving effect to its recommendations involving heavy expenditure, but as far as the public could learn nothing had been done beyond the dispensing with the services of some moderately salaried employees, leaving the top-heavy administration as it is. Sir, it is as patent as anything can be that the tendency of the present administration is not only to increase the number of high salaried posts at or near the top, but to raise the pay or the allowance of the high salaried officials to make their lots of working in this unfortunate land bearable to them. But, Sir, we as the elected representatives of the people say in unmistakable voice that the people do not want them or their services, if their entertainment means continued poverty and final extinction of the people of the land.

Mr. J. CAMPBELL FORRESTER: I regret that the Hon'ble Member in charge of Finance has not mentioned anything in his speech with reference to the Midnapore Leper Asylum. It will probably be known to many members of this House that in February, 1922, I moved a resolution in this Council, which reads as follows:—"This Council recommends to the Government that a sum of Rs. 50,000 be provided in the ensuing budget so that an immediate start may be made with the construction of the Bengal Leper Settlement, the land having been procured for the Government by private gifts."

That resolution was accepted by the Council, but nothing so far has been done. It will perhaps be advisable for me to relate shortly the statement I made at that time.

The facts briefly put are that a draft scheme for a Leper Settlement for 1,000 lepers was drawn up at the request of the Government by the Mission to Lepers Secretary for India and tentatively approved by the Government. The scheme will cost Rs. 4,00,000, but if the amount of Rs. 50,000 is not provided for in the ensuing budget then the scheme will be held up for another year. The scheme would cost Rs. 4,00,000 but

the amount would be spread over a number of years. This was agreed to, but three years have passed and still nothing has been done. I have had the utmost sympathy with the Government in its chronic hardupness and its want of finance and did not press this matter, but another year has come round and still I see no mention of this in the budget. I brought this to the notice of Government in the hope that something would be done, but I find no effort is being made. I always anticipated that something would be done, but nothing further has been done. Colonel Deare informed me that he had inspected the place and that a scheme had been drawn up. There ought to have been some mention of it and a sum money provided for that purpose. The matter is one of vital importance. There are other subjects I notice in the budget which are really in my opinion not so seriously claiming the attention of the public as this, but still I see they have money allotted to them. I ask the Hon'ble Member in charge of Finance to take this into consideration and I am quite sure that if there is a method by which he can assist this scheme that is so imperative for the good of the health of Bengal he will do so. I need not remind him that according to the Police Census of 1919 the leper beggars in Calcutta is over 1,100. Surely something must be done to stop this. It is a well-known fact that in no country in the world lepers are allowed to mingle freely with the populace. This is a disgrace to India and its rulers and a stigma on them and I hope this Council will immediately make a start to remove it. It is undoubtedly the first duty of the Government to protect and better the health of their people. It is useless for me to elaborate on this, as it is apparent to all right-thinking men, and I hope the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Finance Department will provide a suit for this purpose.

Babu MANMOHON NEOGI: The Indian National Congress in its Special Session at Bombay in August, 1918, unanimously held that the proposed reforms were altogether inadequate and insufficient and not acceptable unless some other reforms were made in the Local and Central Government. In that session the proposed reforms should have been rejected altogether, but, Sir, few amongst us, whose vision was dazzled by the outward grandeur of the reforms structure made up their mind to work out the reforms which they thought to be substantial steps in the realisation of responsible Government. Now, Sir, the gentlemen have now been disillusioned and the most moderate of moderates now admit that the reforms, as it is is unworkable and immediate steps should be taken to have the Indian Government Act revised by popular representatives. If further proof be required to demonstrate the utter worthlessness of the blessed Dyarchy one has only to take a cursory view of the present budget estimate and he will be fully satisfied about the truth and popular verdict on the reforms.

The most vital problems on the satisfactory solution of which peace and happiness of the public depend, are that of health, education and

pure water-supply. Now, Sir, let us see in a general way how these vital problems have been tackled, with the help and advice of our new popular Ministers.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member, with certain amount of feeling of warmth and a little sense of pride says :—

"In spite of the period of financial stringency through which the Presidency is passing and the consequent postponement of all developments and improvements in the various activities of Government, the expenditure under the head "Education" has increased steadily, though slowly, having risen from 1 crore 7 lakhs 59 thousands in 1920-21 to 1 crore 24 lakhs 21 thousands estimated revised expenditure of current year."

The Hon'ble Member has gone 3 years back to demonstrate this progressive increment—but, Sir, let us see how this progressive increment has been kept up for "future" and let us see what the estimate of next year shows? It is 1 crore 22 lakhs 36 thousands about 2 lakhs less than that of current year's revised estimate and about 5 lakhs less than last year's sanctioned estimate. Then, Sir, figures under head "Education" have been so ingenuously manipulated that one may be easily misled as to the real estimate of next year. I draw, Sir, particular attention of this House to page 59 of the Blue Book. The Hon'ble Finance Member, in paragraph 5 under head "Industries transferred" states "against the current year's grant of 2 lakhs 35 thousands the revised estimate has been placed at 1 lakh 19 thousands. The saving is mainly due to the transfer of the provision for the Government Art School and the Commercial Institute to the Education Department. Now, Sir, if we look into page 124 of the detailed expenditure, we find 1 lakh 20 thousands provided for the expenditure of these two institutions. Had this expenditure been shown under Industries, as was being done formerly and if this be deducted from the expenditure estimate of "Education" the figure comes to 1 crore 21 lakhs 16 thousands; the net result is estimate of expenditure under major head Education for next year is really less than the estimate of the current year by 6 lakhs 19 thousands. Is this, Sir, anything like steady increase in the expenditure? Progress indeed, though downwards. Now, Sir, let us see what the Hon'ble the Member says in justification of this. It is apologistically said—"This is somewhat less than that of the current year and the decrease is the result of two factors—one, non-repetition of the grant of 3 lakhs to Calcutta University; the other, retrenchment in Government secondary and primary schools." May I ask the Hon'ble Finance Member, why no provision has been made for Calcutta University for next year? Does he not know, Sir, that the financial position of Calcutta University is extremely bad and unsatisfactory, that University lecturers and professors are working on starving allowances, that they do not get their monthly pay regularly and the best of them have been compelled to leave this university to seek their livelihood in other provinces? Is it not known

to the Government that Sir P. C. Roy cannot take in students and carry out necessary improvements in the Science College for want of necessary funds? Has the Government's duty towards the Calcutta University come to an end by making an extra grant of 3 lakhs in the year 1923-24? But, Sir, this extra grant seems to have been made at a moment of indiscretion for it appears Government is determined to recoup this extra grant by a process of progressive deduction from its recurring grants to Calcutta University. In 1922-23, the actual grant to Calcutta University on head "recurring" was about 1 lakh 38 thousands, but in the revised estimate it has been brought down to 1 lakh 15 thousands. The estimate on the same head for next year is 1 lakh 15 thousands but, God knows, what the figure will come to, when the estimate will be revised next year. Sir, without giving an extra *couri* to Calcutta University one lakh has been provided for establishment of one Muhammadan Arts College. One can easily understand the need of a Muhammadan Hostel or providing for extra Muhammadan scholarships but is there any real necessity of establishment of a separate Muhammadan Arts College? We know, Sir, as a matter of fact that seats in Colleges usually kept reserved for Muhammadan students in Government and Government Aided Colleges often remain vacant for want of Muhammadan students. The most urgent need in my humble opinion of the people, specially of the Muhammadans amongst whom 96 per cent. are illiterate, is primary education. Let us examine how this has been provided. The revised estimate of current year is 23 lakhs 19 thousands whereas the budget estimate for the next year is 23 lakhs 4 thousands, i.e., 15 thousands less than what is going to be spent this year. The same solicitude for educational welfare of the country is seen in the provisions made for the secondary education in the transferred department. The budget estimate for current year was 19 lakhs 76 thousands, but revised estimate is 19 lakhs 55 thousands; so Rs. 21 thousands could not be appropriated in the current year while still a lesser sum has been provided for the next year, viz., only 19 lakhs 32 thousands all these have been done with the approval and our Minister. The utter disregard shown by the Government towards popular demands on these matters will be clearly seen if you only consider and compare a few items in the reserved department; while 1 lakh has been provided for Muhammadan Arts College, 1 lakh 50 thousands is going to be spent next year for construction of Bhawanipore Section House, 1 lakh for Kalighat Section House and 1 lakh 21 thousands plus 2 lakhs 3 thousands for conversion of premises of Fenwick Bazar Thana, electric installation there, and for Motor Vehicles Department, Ballygunj. May I ask the Hon'ble Education Minister whether he made any attempt to secure increased grant in this matter and whether he made any attempt to utilize the sanctioned estimate for the current year and why he has failed in his attempt, if any? Then, Sir, the health of the Province is even more important than that of education and we wish to live first than be educated. Let us see how in this most vital matter the

budget has made its provisions. Sanctioned budget for 1923-24 was, under heading "Medical" and "Public Health" Rs. 54·08 plus 25·98, i.e., 80·06 (80 lakhs 6 thousands), but in the revised estimate it has been shown to be 51 lakhs 55 thousands, plus 24 lakhs 20 thousand in these two transferred departments, i.e., nearly 4½ lakhs less than the sanctioned estimate. I admit about 8 lakhs over the budgeted estimate of last year has been provided for the next year but out of this about 1 lakh 68 thousands is provided for Lunatic Asylum and a big amount will go for temporary establishments and for contingencies and 1 lakh has been provided for the construction of nurses' quarters in the Presidency General Hospital.

The Hon'ble Mr. J. DONALD: No. It is provided under "Civil Works" and not under "Medical."

Babu MANMOHON NEOGI: And, Sir, the wonder of wonders is that the magnificent sum of Rs. 50 thousand has been provided for improvement of rural water-supply. Sir, those who live in the mufassal know what this scarcity of water means. Go to any village you like and you will find that our women-folk are seen carrying water under the burning sun from a distance of 5 or 6 miles. In some places villagers engage a regular cart service to get water from a distance of 12 to 15 miles. In last October I found some villagers near Kedarpore in Nagarpore police-station digging earth to get water, which is really muddy fluid substance. You can easily imagine the state of things in the dry season. In a Province where for want of pure drinking water people have to live on such substance, is it any wonder that our people die like flies from cholera and other epidemics? Now, Sir, to provide against such dire need our benevolent Government has allotted 50 thousand rupees for improving the mufassal water-supply for whole of Bengal. Then, Sir, it is well known that the most flourishing villages in our Province are now desolate and deserted, village after village is being depopulated by malaria, and what is the provision made in the budget to save our villages from this scourge? Why, 1 lakh 20 thousands has been provided for quinine grants to local bodies and 1 lakh for anti-malarial and anti-kala-azar campaigns (whatever it means). It is well known that quinine is the only medicine for malaria (which is a transferred subject), but cinchona plantation, the yearly income from which is estimated to be 5 lakhs 59 thousands is a "reserved" subject. Sir, I ask in all seriousness can't these proceeds of the chincona plantations be earmarked for the sole purpose of utilizing the same for taking anti-malarial measures and making some free distributions of quinine amongst the poverty-stricken people? I know, Sir, the apologist of the Government will say that local bodies are to look to primary education and water-supply questions; but, Sir, the means and resources of our local bodies are too insignificant to tackle these urgent needs and our people are too poor to augment the resources of the local

bodies. Then, Sir, let us see how the transferred subjects "Agriculture" and "Industries," of which our popular Minister the Hon'ble Mr. Ghuznavi seems to be almost enamoured, have been provided. Why; the budget estimate for current year was 21 lakhs 51 thousands, and 10 lakhs 66 thousands, respectively, but next year's estimate is 19 lakhs 14 thousands and 10 lakhs 26 thousands, i.e., less by 2 lakhs 77 thousands. Then in the revised estimate for the current year it appears that 3 lakhs 1 thousand could not be appropriated in the current year; we wait, and Sir, we wait with curiosity to know how the Hon'ble Minister has availed of the "chance," so providentially obtained by him since the first week of January. The undeniable fact is our benevolent Government is quite apathetic towards the real needs of the people and in framing their budget they conveniently forget that the masses in the country are proverbially poor.

The only remedy for getting over our difficulties is to overhaul the system of Government existing at the moment, this top-heavy administration must be remodelled and the dyarchy must be knocked down. Now, Sir, that is what the people are determined to do and our popular Ministers instead of standing in the way of the people ought to come to their help to achieve that much desired end.

Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER: The administration of finance is a reserved subject and I am afraid, Sir, I cannot congratulate either the Finance Member or more so those to whom he is responsible, namely, the Government of India and the Secretary of State for this budget. After all he can frame a budget on the basis of the resources available to him and if sufficient resources are not available to him because of provincial adjustment of revenue the responsibility is primarily of the Government of India and the Secretary of State, but the Finance Member cannot, as the local agent of these authorities, altogether escape criticism. In this matter they have acted with the utmost irresponsibility. I propose to prove the irresponsibility of the Secretary of State, the Government of India and of their local agent, the Finance Member, by figures given by a Governor of this Presidency and by responsible members of the Finance Department. Sir, it seems to me that this irresponsibility runs not merely in the budget which has been presented to the Council this year but in the budget of the last two years as well, and it is time, Sir, that this irresponsibility should cease. The Finance Member of the Government should take a wider view than the view of merely rupees, annas and pies. (Hear, hear.) There must be statesmanship behind finance, and if there be no statesmanship behind finance, there is no doubt that the Finance Member and those to whom he is responsible cannot but expect exasperation from all sections of the community in the Province; seeing that according to his own figures during the last three years this Province has increased its resources by over Rs. 2½ crores and yet what is the position?

Not a rupee to spend on any of the necessities of the Province, be such necessities of the transferred department or of the reserved department. To my mind, Sir, there is not much real difference between the transferred department and the reserved department. The test for expansion to my mind is public good. An irrigation project though in a reserved department is as much worthy of our attention as an educational project in the transferred department. On calculation made on my friend's own figures, I find the resources of the Province have been increased by Rs. 253 lakhs, but I propose to give the House the heads of these figures. If hon'ble members would turn to page 2 of my friend's speech, they would find that in the year 1922-23 savings to the extent of Rs. 49 lakhs were made. In the following paragraph the Finance Member says that there were further savings to the extent of Rs. 10 lakhs; so that makes Rs. 59 lakhs. In September, 1922, the old Government retrenched to the extent of Rs. 89½ lakhs and Lord Ronaldshay in a speech in the old Council announced the fact that out of this Rs. 89½ lakhs, Rs. 83 lakhs were retrenched from the reserved side and Rs. 6½ lakhs from the transferred side. The sum total of these retrenchment amounted to Rs. 171½ lakhs. Three new taxes were imposed. I am not aware of the exact amount realised from these taxes, but I find from the statements in the budget that the estimate from the two stamp duties amount to Rs. 330 lakhs. The actuals of 1920-21 were Rs. 280 lakhs, so there was an increase of Rs. 50 lakhs from the two stamp duties. Scheduled taxes, that is to say, the new amusement taxes amounted to Rs. 32 lakhs. The total amount brought in by new taxes amount to Rs. 82 lakhs. This with Rs. 171 lakhs due to retrenchments, would give us Rs. 253½ lakhs or just over Rs. 2½ crores as the total increase of our resources and yet we are threatened with the reimposition of Rs. 63 lakhs. Well, if the Rs. 63 lakhs be reimposed, the irresponsibility—I cannot use a milder expression—will be the irresponsibility of the Secretary of State to Government of India and to some extent of their local agent, the Finance Member over there. (Hear, hear.) If he wants to run the Province smoothly, it is his duty to protest against this reimposition and not merely against the reimposition of Rs. 63 lakhs, but against the unreasonable provincial settlement. He has no doubt protested inside the Government, although I am not much aware of any such protest during the last few months or perhaps for about a year. But it will not do to protest inside the Government. It was necessary for him to take the Council and the public into his confidence. In the early days of the reformed Government, this Council passed a resolution and a deputation went to Simla headed by the then Finance Member. Since then, however, the Council and the public have no tangible evidence of any protest against this iniquity. Merely saying that we cannot carry on if this Rs. 63 lakhs be reimposed and if this iniquitous settlement be continued will not do. My friend opposite is no doubt the local agent

of the Secretary of State and as such responsible to him and through him to the British Parliament, but he is also a member of the Executive Government of Bengal and as such although he may not be responsible to this Council, yet he has not only a duty to the Council but also to the public of Bengal. How can he possibly discharge that duty, when he finds that after increasing the resources by over 2½ crore by taxing and retrenching he has to admit that there is no money for expansion? And what, Sir, is the position? Take one of the most vital subjects in which all sections of the community are united—the subject of education—whatever the politics of my friends behind—the Europeans—may be, whatever the politics of my friends opposite—the Swarajists— may be, whatever the politics of the Muhammadans may be—there is no doubt that on the question of education all sections of the community, whatever their race, their creed, their political views may be—whether they are co-operators or non-co-operators—all demand that there should be more expenditure on education. (Several voices: "Yes, yes.") There may be difference of opinion as to how the money is to be utilised—perhaps I and my friends opposite may not agree as to the method, but as regards the object there cannot be and there will not be any difference; and of all branches of education—the question of primary education is all-important. The present state of primary education in this Province is a crying shame. (Hear, hear.) When I was a member of the Government I raised my voice of protest but my protest was a cry in the wilderness because of the iniquitous Meston Settlement. (Hear, hear.) Beyond that I cannot say. I cannot betray any of the secrets of my office; but this much I can say that on the question of primary education, on the question of secondary education and for better pay of poorly paid teachers in the private and high schools I tried my level best. But the irresponsibility of the Secretary of State, whose local agent, my friend opposite is, stood in the way.

Take the question of primary education. The Government expenditure per head in Bengal is only Re. 1-4-11. This was the expenditure when the Secretary of State was wholly responsible, viz., in 1920 and in that year the Government expenditure per head was Rs. 10-1-8 in Bombay. Did the Government of Bengal or rather did the reserved side of the Government try to do away with that crying shame by protesting against the iniquitous provincial Settlement? What can the poor Ministers do without money What could my hon'ble friend, Mr. Huq, do without money? I have said that the expenditure per head on primary education in Bengal was Rs. 1-4-11. In Bombay it was Rs. 10, in the Punjab which is a province of much lesser wealth than that of Bengal it was Rs. 5-10-0.

Now take the question of secondary education and there is no province in India—I may say there is no country in the world—where in the question of secondary education people have shown more self-help than

in Bengal. We have about 900 high schools mostly managed from fees and by endowments of the public; and what is the Government contribution? The Government contribution per head is only a paltry sum of Rs. 4-12-0 per head whereas the contribution from private sources is Rs. 22-13-0. Compare the Government contribution with that of Bombay. The Government contribution of Bombay—I am quoting figures of pre-reformed days—was Rs. 21 and odd, in the United Provinces it was Rs. 20 and odd, whereas in our province with Government contribution of Rs. 4 and odd and with a private contribution of Rs. 22 and odd, we have been carrying on as miserably as possible. In the Punjab the Government contribution per pupil is Rs. 10 and odd and private contribution is Rs. 17 and odd. What is the position of our secondary schools? The salary of the bulk of the teachers of our secondary schools, barring headmasters and assistant headmasters, is only the magnificent sum of Rs. 22 or Rs. 24. You cannot keep a decent chaprasi on that salary. How could the problem of secondary education of a province be solved if sometimes even graduate teachers are actually paid at the rate of Rs. 24 or Rs. 25 a month? My friend will say—there is no money, there is the Meston Award there is the Secretary of State and there are the Parliamentary rules. But so long as you are responsible to that Parliament your duty is to convince that Parliament that this kind of thing will never do. I sound a note of warning. My friends opposite have come in such large numbers and if you, the local agent of the Secretary of State, go on in this way, there will hardly be any co-operators left. Speaking for myself I will go on co-operating because I consider from the point of view of the self-interest of my country it is of the utmost importance to be on good terms with Great Britain because I believe in the Dominion form of Self-Government as a part of the British Empire as our ideal and Dominion Self-Government as a part of the British Empire requires goodwill between England and India. But at the same time I will go on criticising those who act irresponsibly however high their position may be as earnestly as possible. In the very interest of co-operation I must protest as strongly as I can and I repeat that this irresponsibility of the Secretary of State can lead to only one result viz., obstruction followed by revolution. If there be obstruction followed by revolution, the responsibility will be the responsibility of the Secretary of State. (A voice: "Come over to our side.") No, that I won't, and can't in view of my political conviction. You have promised your faith to obstruction, you ignore the logical consequences of obstruction, namely, revolution and I cannot possibly join you.

Now about expenditure on collegiate education. The expenditure per head in Bengal is Rs. 48 and odd, from private sources it is Rs. 78 and odd. In Bombay it is Rs. 90 and odd in the United Provinces it is Rs. 117 and odd, we all know the numerical strength of our college students. I know what reply my friend will give—we have no money

because the Secretary of State has given us no money. Therefore, my attack against my hon'ble friend is that as an agent it was his duty to protest. He has not protested sufficiently.

My second criticism against the budget is that, although I find that there is a very laudable attempt at retrenchment and a good deal of retrenchment has been effected, yet that retrenchment has been effected—my friend will pardon me for this personal touch—more from the point of view of a Scotch householder anxious to save money by starving his family.

[At this stage the member reached the time-limit.]

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: Sir, we the Members of the Swaraj Party, have heard with rapt attention the remarks that have fallen from the lips of an ex-administrator of this country—I mean the late Minister of Education. Sir, he criticised the Government and he said that the Department over which he presided for three years has been allowed to be starved. Sir, the Report of the Retrenchment Committee is in the hands of many of the members and in that Report we find that the cut that has been made in that Department is larger than in any other departments. But may I ask the hon'ble member whether he protested against such cuts and what effect did he give to the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee? The House is entitled to know from my hon'ble friend as to whether he has been a party to that retrenchment. Now, Sir, he cannot come before this House and complain to what he himself was a party.

Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER: On a point of personal explanation, Sir. If I may be permitted to explain I am quite willing to explain but I should like to explain when my hon'ble friend has made his criticisms.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: We have been told that, as he was a Member of the Government, he was not able to divulge the secrets of the higher hierarchy, that is, the Executive Councillors and the Ministers. We find that a sum of rupees one crore and odd lakhs have been provided for education, and out of that sum, Rs. 13,00,000 has been provided for Reserved Subjects. What is the number of pupils in the reserved side I mean the Anglo-Indians and Europeans? Sir, the population of Bengal is over 45 millions and for that we are going to spend a sum of one crore and eight lakhs; but for a smaller number, that is to say for about 1,000 or 2,000 students, we are going to spend over Rs. 13,00,000. Is this fair—is this honest? I should say that it is pure dishonesty.

Mr. PRESIDENT: That is altogether an unparliamentary expression. You must use another expression, say "unjustifiable."

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: I say this is most inequitable. We, the children of the soil are being starved—are being slowly and gradually put to death by malaria and kala-azar and other preventable diseases and for whom no money can be found—for whose treatment no doctors can be had—for whom last year there was a Budget provision of Rs. 1,50,000 for the establishment of village dispensaries but a paltry sum of Rs. 15,000 was spent and then to expend a sum of Rs. 13,00,000 for the reserved side of education on 2,000 students is most inequitable. Sir, a bait has been given to the Muhammadans of this Council; and what is the bait? The bait is this: that a sum of Rs. 1,00,000 has been provided for a Muhammadan College of Arts in Calcutta.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President left the Chamber and the Deputy-President took the Chair.]

Sir, a plot of land was acquired in Wellesley Street, I think, so far back as in 1917—I am subject to correction—and although 7 years have elapsed and during this time the late Hon'ble Minister did not think it fit to grant a single farthing for the Muhammadan education. May we know—and this Council is entitled to know—why such a lack of sympathy is shown to the Muhammadan side of education? Now when we have got a Muhammadan Minister for the transferred side of our education, he gets Rs. 1,00,000 for the establishment of a Muhammadan College; and what is this for? The majority of the elected Muhammadan Members of this Council are pledged to the Swaraj Party and a sum of Rs. 1,00,000 which has been set apart for the Muhammadan College used as a bait to draw away the Muhammadan Swaraj Members to the side of Government so that they may support the Government and that Dyarchy may get a lease of fresh life.

Dr. H. W. B. MORENO: On a point of order, Sir. Is the hon'ble member entitled to draw such an inference?

Mr. DEPUTY-PRESIDENT: This is a debatable point. You may refer to it in your reply.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: I do not know how far that would be effective. About two years ago I met Mr. Taylor, the then Assistant Director for Muhammadan Education, and I asked him the reason why no grant was made for the establishment of a Muhammadan College. He told me that the Hon'ble Minister would not grant a farthing for the Muhammadan College and the Members—the Muhammadan Members who were on the Education Committee, opposed any grant being given for any Muhammadan College; and, Sir, I think they did it rightly, because if a Muhammadan Arts College be established in Calcutta, what will happen to my community? We will turn out some more graduates—some more undergraduates who can find no employment. The

services that the Government can give are limited. The outturn or the output would exceed at least 100 times the number of service at the disposal of the Government. I would have welcomed it if the Hon'ble Minister, instead of making a provision for Rs. 1,00,000 for a Muhammadan College, could have given that sum for technical education for the Muhammadans or if the Hon'ble Minister would have set apart that amount for the purpose of a technical college. We could have welcomed it and we would have thanked him saying that you had at least been able to do something for my community. But what did he do? He only provided money for a Muhammadan Arts College and that money would not be enough for a Muhammadan College and it may not be expended in one year—may be in two or three years and still the College would not come about before 5 years from hence. At the same time the Muhammadan community as a whole does not want an Arts College. The Hon'ble Minister can pass orders to his subordinates or rather to the colleges which are provincial colleges—I mean the four colleges, the Chittagong, the Presidency, the Rajshahi and the Hughli colleges—that at least 50 per cent. of the seats should be reserved for Muhammadans, and if the Hon'ble Minister would ask those aided colleges that would ask for grant from the Government that they should at least reserve 50 per cent. of the seats for the Muhammadan students, I believe that would meet—far more adequately meet—the requirements of the Muhammadans of Bengal. If the Hon'ble Minister can, then let him increase the amount for Muhammadan scholarship. I think, that will advance the cause of my community much more than the founding or the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts college in Calcutta.

I now come to the question of the Paper Book Department of the Calcutta High Court. A sum of Rs. 35,940 has been budgeted for the Paper Book Department and the temporary establishment of the Calcutta High Court. I asked Mr. Duval, who I believe, is in charge of the Department, to give me an abstract of what the temporary establishment means and also how much money would be necessary for the Paper Book Department. He showed me a statement of it and I asked him to give me a copy. In that I find that a sum of Rs. 24,000 and odd is necessary for the Paper Book Department. I say that this sum should not be provided for the Paper Book Department. The reason is this: The Vakils' Association of the Calcutta High Court strongly protested that the preparation of the Paper Books should not be taken away from the vakils and I believe my hon'ble friend opposite (Mr. Mitter) would also say the same thing, that the vakils resented it, that the Paper Book Department gave some of the junior members of the Bar a decent living but that living has now been taken away. And, Sir, what is the result? There is no improvement at all in the preparation of the Paper Books. Rather the cost has increased immensely. The poor litigants who have to fight the people like the great Maharajas, the people like the great big landed aristocracy and zamindars, they cannot fight them now because the cost of the preparation of

Paper Books is so great that it has put a premium to justice. Sir, the amount that has been budgeted for the Paper Book Department ought not be granted at least by this Council.

I next come to the Police Department. My hon'ble friend, the Finance Member, has told us that a sum of Rs. 12,00,000 was cut down from the Police Budget and it had retarded efficiency and progress. Everyone knows what a good idea we have about the Police Department. At the same time we know how the Police of Calcutta is treating the citizens of Calcutta. I have read many communications in the *Forward*, the organ of the Swaraj party, that how many of its printers and officers were taken to the thana, locked up for several hours and then discharged afterwards. I have no kind word for the Police because I live in a district and we all know the high-handedness of the Police and the Police *zulum*. If I happen to oppose a Police official in the district, he in revenge sets all the preventive sections of the Criminal Procedure Code in motion and one fine morning I find that I am either arrested under sections 107, 108, 109 or 110 or some such cognate sections. We do not live in peace but we live in terrorism. At the same time we find a sum of Rs. 75,000 is being earmarked for secret service. I do not understand what is the meaning of it? Why a sum of Rs. 75,000 should be provided by this Council for secret service? I believe it is meant for bribing persons to give evidence or to turn up approvers in some cases in which the Police can have no influence at all or could not procure evidence to convict an innocent man. Otherwise I cannot understand what is meant by secret service money.

(At this stage the Hon'ble the President returned to the Chamber.)

Sir, I now come to the Excise Department. The income in relation to expenditure is very great and we are having this blood money by making people more immoral. You ask the people to become immoral indirectly and give us money to run the administration. Is not the Government morally bound to suppress this immoral duty? Does not the country want that administration should be pure and vice discouraged and that there should not be any income from excise?

Mr. PRESIDENT: You have reached your time-limit and must finish your sentence.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: There is an excise shop before the Taylor Hostel in Calcutta and the residents as well as the students sent in a petition to the Excise Department and Authorities for the removal of the Excise Shop from that place. But, alas, the cry was in the wilderness.

Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER: I have obtained the permission to rise to a point of personal explanation. I desire to explain two matters to which my hon'ble friend, Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhuri, referred

relating to my administration. One was his query as to what I did in respect of retrenchment. I may mention that, although the Retrenchment Committee recommended a cut of Rs. 35 lakhs in the Education, I managed to do with a cut of about a lakh of rupees. This I could do after very hard work for about 6 months.

The second point relates to Muhammadan Education. I gave Muhammadans special scholarships and offered facilities to them in various other ways. But may I point out that it is not my administration which is under discussion at present. I shall claim the right of rising to points of personal explanation, if I happen to be here and if my administration is allowed to be criticised.

Dr. H. W. B. MORENO: Sir, on behalf of the Anglo-Indian community I rise to defend my community against some of the unjustifiable attacks made in this House, namely, that princely grants are made to my community and that these grants are being raised year by year. It is very patent that, so far as my community is concerned, minorities have to be protected and their interests have to be preserved. I understand from the party opposite that one of the main planks in their platform is the protection of minorities and their interests. To speak then against a community that is doing its best to work its way to the front and which is largely dependent upon private and public charities, which is trying as much as it can to realise its responsibilities and is seeking some aid from Government in order to bring about some advance in India—to attack such a community, I say, is on any ground unjustifiable; and what is more it is against the common dictates of humanity and good taste. I certainly expected better from my worthy friends opposite. I did not expect that they would grudge a small grant of thirteen lakhs of rupees being given to the Anglo-Indian community in order that they may better shoulder their responsibilities and become an integral factor along with the other sister communities in India. I trust the House will resist any opposition to the grant and appreciate the spirit in which it has been given.

Speaking on the budget itself I note that, although there is a surplus, I cannot see my way to agree to the way in which the surplus has been handed out in the form of expenditure. Primarily I note that out of 88 lakhs which have to be spent in the next and the following years 36 lakhs represent the first instalment of this expenditure, but along with this expenditure I notice that we have a provision of one lakh of rupees for the supply of iron cots and mosquito nets to the police. Before I give my approval to a grant of this kind I should like to know whether policemen require any special protection—more than others do—against malaria as against other evils. I would not have grudged the expenditure if it were found really necessary. In view, however, of the other necessities of Bengal one should be very careful before one lays out expenditure of this kind unless one is satisfied that more pressing needs have been satisfactorily met.

Then again taking Anglo-Indian education I note with great satisfaction that several Anglo-Indian schools are being financially helped by the Government and I can assure the House that they need every piece of what they receive either from the Government or from the European and Anglo-Indian community. I note specially that La Martiniere College, the Dow Hill Boys' School, the Darjeeling High School and the Dow Hill Girls' School at Kurseong are being subsidised in a special way by Government. These schools are doing efficient and abiding work for the community and when education has spread more and more among the members of the community, the community will rise to a sense of its importance along with the other communities in India. I regret, however, that along with these grants no provision is made for an Anglo-Indian Hostel attached to Calcutta University, though I must express my satisfaction here that in Dacca University there is an Anglo-Indian Hostel with a provision for 12 students——

Maulvi Mr. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURI: But nobody has yet taken advantage of it.

Dr. H. W. B. MORENO: The community will in due season.

There is no such provision for a Hostel in Calcutta University. I hold that if my community is to rise some of its members will have to receive facilities for higher education in order that they may enter into the more lucrative professions and other higher vocations in life and I plead for a recognition of the rights of my community in this direction. Our students are now beginning to realise that if they take more and more to the local University course they will have better facilities for entering the higher services and the more paying professions. I am sure it would be best for the community to have a hostel of their own in Calcutta such as other communities have so as to enable students of the community here in Bengal, especially those in Calcutta, to be trained for the higher degrees. Calcutta offers already many facilities for Arts training as also for technical education in the local colleges and the Hostel would go very largely to encourage these young people to go on in their careers after they have gone through the usual course of study in their schools. This would save the community from the inordinate expense of maintaining a college of their own. I would, therefore, like to bring this to the notice of the Government and I am sure it will receive the support of every right-thinking individual who is sympathetically inclined.

I also congratulate Government on the efforts that have been made to establish a Muhammadan College here in Calcutta. I disassociate myself from the previous remarks that have been made on this subject, namely, that this grant is a kind of sop to Cerberus. It has been given to the Muhammadans so that it may meet a long felt need.

Not long ago the Calcutta University Commission came to the conclusion that a very pressing necessity was the foundation of a Muhammadan College in India and in spite of the adverse criticisms of my friends beyond I congratulate the two Muhammadan Ministers that they have been able to secure this Muhammadan College for the highest educational interests of the Muhammadan students of Bengal.

I also note that there is very little provision in the Budget in the way of primary and secondary education. Mr. P. C. Mitter gave vent to a good deal of feeling in his speech when he cast diatribe upon diatribe the Hon'ble the Finance Member and expressed his views in a rather irresponsible fashion. I am sure, I do not share these views. The best criticism that I can offer in reply is that if he as ex-Minister turns round now after three years of office and condemns Government as irresponsible and the Hon'ble the Finance Member as the most irresponsible person, then all I can say is that he stands self-condemned as the most irresponsible man here in Bengal. I cannot refrain, however, from saying that there is great need for improving primary and secondary education. The whole problem is very acute and at the same time very complex, I know, Sir, from my experience as a teacher in Bengal, holding posts in all positions both in the local University and the University under which Anglo-Indian education is placed, I know how miserably paid are the teachers in these colleges. I therefore, put it once more to Government that some real effort should be made in the way of improving education both primary and secondary especially by enhancing the pay of teachers. It has been well said that there is one panacea for all India's evils and that is education, education, education. I therefore hope that in the future the question of education, both primary and secondary, will loom larger and larger in all the considerations of the Finance Member in providing for schemes for the advancement of Bengal

I should also like to speak a word or two with regard to Public Health. The late Hon'ble Minister for Local Self-Government, Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea speaking in this Council last year said: "I desire to drive malaria from the bounds of Bengal, casting it out as an evil, altogether." Sir, malaria is still stalking the length and breadth of the land but the Hon'ble Minister who made these big remarks is no longer with us now. Such is the irony of fate. Malaria still exists and it is our duty still to fight it; but what do we find Government doing in that direction? I notice that provision for a miserly sum of half a lakh of rupees only has been included under anti-malarial measures and a similar sum for a kala-azar campaign. Sir, does this sum meet the needs of the case? The people of Bengal are dying in large numbers—by hundreds of thousands—and it is the first duty of the Government to save these people, many of them dying from preventable diseases. I venture to ask, Sir, just as the Hon'ble the Maharadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan asked in one of his previous speeches: "If preventable, why not prevented?" I say,

Sir, it is the solemn duty on the part of the Government to see that these diseases are prevented, and as long as these scourges stalk through the length and breadth of this fair Province of ours it is our duty to protest in season and out of season, till we have these things put upon a sound and satisfactory basis.

Next, I turn to the question of agricultural farms. I find that only two districts farms, one at Mainaguri and the other at Jalpaiguri are being constructed. I hold, Sir, that there should be more of such model farms, which should be farms of which the people could be able to say that they are paying farms. We want to teach the people more and more of the better ways of agriculture, and I would, therefore, welcome anything further along this line.

I welcome the construction of a Veterinary Hospital in Dacca although it be the only one, provided for in the Budget. I will welcome anything that is for the welfare of the cattle of India. India largely depends on her cattle. All her ploughing is done, all her goods are borne in the country by her cattle. Her people are largely used to a vegetable diet and therefore they have to make up for their diet with the supply of milk and milk products; and any attempt which has for its end of welfare and benefit of the cattle of India should receive unstinted support from every one of us in this House. It is on the cattle of India that the welfare of India depends. That great lover of India, not with us now in Bengal, Sir John Woodroffe said: "I am not surprised at the poverty of India when I look at the meagre state of the cattle in India." They are two interdependent things. I trust, then, that the Government will consider the value of such remarks and will try to improve the condition of cattle in India, upon which so much depends.

Coming to that part of the budget with which the Industries Department is concerned, I find that a small demonstration factory is going to be erected at the Serampore Weaving Institute, and the construction of permanent quarters is to be proceeded with for the Survey School at Mainamati in the Tippera district. I would urge upon the Government here the necessity of improving the industries of India. Sir, there are two great factors to the prosperity of this country—agriculture and industry. I should like then that the industries of India be more and more developed; above all that technical schools—schools which teach people how to start small cottage industries—should be adequately subsidised by Government and not left, as they now are, to individual or private enterprise. I heartily approve of the contention of the Hon'ble Finance Member when he says that he will fight against the reimposition of the 63 lakhs of rupees by the Central Government upon the Government of Bengal. He has well said that "this position is wholly unacceptable to us and we should fight to the utmost of our power to have it withdrawn." I am of opinion that in this contention he should have our whole-hearted support for the remission of the contribution to

the Central Government which will help us a great deal on the way to achieve our object, provincial autonomy.

Sir, only this one word more in conclusion. As the Hon'ble the Finance Member has said that he is prepared to fight to the utmost regarding the remission of Bengal's contribution to the Central Government, so also will we, if I may be allowed to use the Hon'ble Member's own words, fight to the utmost, till we find that by means of retrenchment we have made the top-heavy administration of this Province more acceptable to the people of Bengal.

Babu UMES CHANDRA CHATTERJEE: I have given notice of a motion for rejecting the demand for saloons for His Excellency. It was no doubt a very daring act on my part and why I have been driven to commit this daring act I will submit to the House at the commencement of the general discussion of the budget to-day. I know that my motion will not be taken up to-day but I want to say why I gave notice of that motion. I simply mean to give opportunities to the members of this House, especially the members belonging to the Nationalist Party and others, to go into the principles involved in the budget at the time of the general discussion. I am sorry I will not be able to make an impromptu speech in English, therefore, I have my reasons recorded in a written speech and I beg leave to read that out to the House. That will clear my position why I have given notice of that motion and why similar notices have been given by other members.

Mr. PRESIDENT: One moment, Umes Babu. Do I understand that you are speaking to the motion of which you have given notice, namely, that the demand for Rs. 10,000 for the construction of two broad guage saloons for His Excellency be refused?

Babu UMES CHANDRA CHATTERJEE: I have not been able to understand what you say about my motion, but I would like to take part in the general discussion.

Mr. PRESIDENT: Yes. But I have to point out that the time for giving your reasons will come when your motion is taken up. You will not be deprived of the opportunity of giving your views in full on that occasion. We are now having a general discussion on the budget.

Babu UMES CHANDRA CHATTERJEE: At the outset, Sir, I ask the Council to reject the whole budget.

We, the Indians, cut our coat according to our cloth, while our rulers plan the coat first and are then out to secure the means for the cloth. It is for this reason that I see dangers in the budgets of the Governments. These budgets assume that the capacity of the Indian taxpayers is, as elastic as it is in the free countries of the world. The Government have created numerous departments and numerous

posts and have fixed handsome pays for these posts and to meet the expenditure have been taxing people as high as necessity demands without any consideration for the capacity of the taxpayer. In the free countries people have the means to wax their income and so they can bear the strain of heavy taxation. In free countries, the wealth grows. In India the wealth has been yearly diminishing. The Indian people sell raw materials and purchase manufactured goods imported from the free countries. This was not the state of things when the Hindus were the rulers of the land. This was not the state of things even when the Muhammadans ruled this land. This has been the state of things under the rule of the British people. The British people rule not for the sake of revenue or for the sake of pious duty of ruling but for the sake of trade. They rule us for compelling us to buy their goods. They do not stop here. To keep comradeship with other free nations, they allow the latter to bring and sell their manufactured goods as well. In this way the present rulers of the land have robbed us of our capacity for making goods for our consumption and have thus deprived us of the means of gaining and increasing our wealth.

I am a villager by birth and I am still a villager. I am now 69 years old. During my infancy the villages were in a prosperous condition; they are now the scenes of desolation. Upon their ruins have grown the towns. The towns are the properties of the foreigners and the unwary dwellers therein, do not realise that. The electric fans, the electric lights, the pipe water, the motor car, the tram car, the railways are the tight bondages of slavery which the town-dwellers will never be able to sever. And what are the town-dwellers? They are the brokers of foreign goods, foreign civilisation, and foreign languages. I am afraid the town-dwellers shall die, and with them the villagers, who receive inspiration from them. The city civilisation has spread into the villages and the famished villagers are buying the fascinating finished foreign goods at the sacrifice of their only wealth, the raw materials. The finished goods, the villagers can well avoid, but the contagion is there and they are caught in the net set up for all the Indian people by the shrewd foreign producers of these goods. The town-dwellers make some money by negotiating the sale of foreign goods and helping the spread of foreign civilisation. But the money that the villagers make by the sale of raw materials is all absorbed in the puchases of unnecessary and avoidable foreign goods. Now the contingency, is that the villagers shall die and with their death, will come the death of the town-dwellers.

In this view, Sir, I warn all the members of the House, be they dwellers of towns or dwellers of villages, to refrain from taking any part in the budget discussion and to refuse all the demands for grant made by the Government.

We want cheap food, cheap raiment, cheap medicine, cheap education, cheap Government, cheap administration, everything cheap, and

as a means to an end, we want to stop all imports. If the Government will accommodate us here, we in turn will accommodate the Government in its budget. Otherwise let there be certification and let there be immediate death for all the Indians.

Government says, the salaries must be waxed. Otherwise the employees will fail to live comfortably. But who will pay the expenditure. Certainly Government will not bring money from England. Is it not the duty of the Government to see that the taxpayers live as comfortably as the employees? The taxpayers are suffering untold miseries, day and night, and the employees have no right to live better.

What do we care, Sir, for army, navy and air-force. Have we any wealth? All the wealth, that there is in India, belongs to the foreigners. Village-dwellers have nothing to fear the loot of. If the town-dwellers have any money, it is paper money, which no foreign invader will care to take possession of. So, Sir, army, navy and air-force are all necessary for the maintenance of British trade in this land and British trade means death to the Indian people. For the maintenance of British trade in India, complex Government and highly paid officials have been necessary at the cost of the life-blood of the village people. The House therefore ought to refuse the budget.

The police, the army, the navy have immensely waxed in these days and why? Because there has been an awakening in the country and to stifle this awakening, waxing of police, army and navy has been necessary. If the Government will stop import and restore indigenous civilisation, the necessaries of life will be cheap and a miniature police, a miniature army, a miniature navy with a miniature Government will suffice, and in that case there will be no fear of foreign invasion. The civilised nations loot the money of the unwary conquered and each vie with the other in that respect and therefore each of them has the fear of invasion by the other. If good sense prevails with the Indians and if they cease to buy foreign goods and learn to live upon what they produce themselves, and never cherish the idea of producing fascinating goods to sell in others' countries, there will be no fear of foreign invasion for the Indians.

My blood boils in my veins to see the grandeur of Calcutta, and why? I place this grandeur by the side of the heart-rending desolation of the villages in my mind and pray to God, He may so open the eyes of the dwellers of the towns that they resolve to give up everything foreign as soon as these words of mine reach them.

I have adverted to desolation of the villages and what is that desolation? That desolation is bad spleen, bad liver, short life, pale face, wretched hut, bad water, want of food, want of raiment, want of protection against shivering cold, want of protection against mosquito bites, want of every thing necessary to make life comfortable.

Removal of Indian poverty, Sir, does not lie in teaching weaving and carpentry to the Indian youths. These occupations will not fetch more than Rs. 15 a month to an average weaver or carpenter and what do Rs. 15 a month mean to an individual? It means maintenance for his own self. Is he not to look after his father, his mother, his brother, his sister, if they want his help? Is he not to marry? Is he not to develop his brain? Is he to live a carpenter or weaver and to die as such? Will not the caste propensities intervene in the choice of occupation?

And what will the establishment of medical schools do? They will help selling quinine and other foreign medicines, and will bring money into the pockets of the foreigners. Where will the village people get money to pay the fees of doctors and the price of the foreign medicines?

Then what is the remedy? The remedy, in a nutshell, is the stopping of all imports and compelling the country to produce every thing that she needs and that is possible in India. For India never had to rely upon other countries for her existence before the advent of British rule.

But the rulers will not do that unless compelled. I therefore pray, the House will reject the whole budget.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MUSHARRUF HOSSAIN: Before entering into the details of the budget presented to the House, I would congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member for his continued efforts for the increase of revenue and decrease of expenditure for the last three years, and succeeding in presenting a well-balanced budget on both sides this year. From the budget presented to us I am sorry I cannot find out what amount is being spent for the salary of the establishment in different departments and the amounts that are being spent for their travelling allowances and other contingent expenditure. Nor does it clearly show what amounts have been saved on these three heads as a result of the report of the Retrenchment Committee and that of the special officers appointed to investigate into the present expenditure under miscellaneous heads. If the Hon'ble the Finance Member had kindly given us details in the form I now suggest and in the form in which every business man would like to prepare his budget, a lot of inquiries that are now being made by different members would have been useless, and the budget would have been criticised in a proper way.

Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR: May I call your attention, Sir, to the fact that there is no quorum at present? I move that the House be counted.

Mr. PRESIDENT: (After a count had been taken.) I do not see the member who raised the question of a quorum, but the requisite number of members is present.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MUSHARRUF HOSSAIN: And the members could have suggested in what way retrenchments could have been more appropriately made. As it stands, Sir, the budget is vague, and no criticism can be offered on the merits of the budget.

Government have been spending steadily for the last few years a considerable sum of public money on survey and settlement operations which means nothing but bringing the record into line with the provisions of the present incomplete, objectionable, unjust and inequitable Bengal Tenancy Act. The settlement operation has succeeded simply in unsettling the state of the country, creating differences between class and class, and bringing chaos into the villages instead of doing any good to the people there. Wherever it has gone the good relations existing between the landlord and his tenants disappeared, internal quarrel between members of the same family has grown up, and the quarrel that would have taken a century to arise, arises at the advent of these undesirable officers. In short, the public money that is wasted for this can with advantage be spent for suppression of kala-azar which has broken out, I learn, in a virulent form in the southern part of the Tippera district and which has been taking away 75 persons or more from every thousand from Tarai, a track of country lying to the south of Darjeeling Hill. To come to the Public Works Department new works, I am sorry I am unable to accept the idea of the department to make a concrete bridge across Balasong river at a cost, I believe, of Rs. 7 or 8 lakhs, where a bridge is already in existence and which can be kept in very good repair with half the interest the Government pays for that capital amount. In these days of retrenchment, I am not in favour of making bridges at a very high cost where an ordinary sal wood bridge can be made at practically one-sixth of the cost.

The money thus saved may be spent more usefully for improving the roads from Bagdogra to Adhikari, a scheme which I understand was approved by His Excellency Lord Ronaldshay a few years ago.

As for the expenditure on Education I cannot understand why the grant of Rs. 3 lakhs to the Calcutta University has been discontinued in the current year. I would ask the Hon'ble Minister—but I see he is absent now and in his absence I hope the Secretary will kindly explain to us—the exact reason why this has been done.

I see a provision of Rs. 2 lakhs has been made for the settlement operation in the Chittagong district. I do not know what sort of rights these people are enjoying there and I would respectfully ask the Hon'ble Member in charge of settlement operations, to respect the vested interests of that place.

I would now like to refer to one or two remarks that have been made by my hon'ble—I beg your pardon, not hon'ble any more—my friend Mr. Travers. He has spoken of the Jalpaiguri Medical School. I feel that I would be failing in my duty to my constituency if I did

not repeat the demand which he has made before this House. We are all aware that the Rajshahi division has 8 districts with Jalpaiguri as its headquarters, and unfortunately there is not a single medical school in the whole of that division. Now that the other divisions are getting their share, it is just and proper that Rajshahi should have a school within the division and Jalpaiguri is the best place for it. This site has been approved so far as I know by two successive Governors and hopes have been held out to us that this medical school will get support from the responsible Government here. I would therefore add my request to the request made by my friend Mr. Travers that the Jalpaiguri Medical School should get a sufficient sum this year, even in this year's budget.

Next he referred to the Jalpaiguri Agricultural Farm. I would fail in my duty if I did not support him in asking the House to support the establishment of an agricultural farm in the district of Jalpaiguri, although I differ with him as to the site of the farm. While I believe that this petty difference can be settled, I will be glad to have the farm at Mainaguri, and I am glad provision has been made in this year's budget for the establishment of a farm there.

I would also add my support to his proposal for a grant for the Lower Jalducca bridge, and I may tell this House that this bridge is wanted not only by the European people there, but that it is wanted by the Indians as well, both agriculturists and planters. I hope this year sufficient money will be given to the Executive Engineer there to begin the work of construction of the bridge, and I hope by next year this bridge will be completed.

There is another subject to which other gentlemen have also referred, and that is as regards drinking water. The question of drinking water in the rural areas is a very acute one. So far as I know, in certain places, the people drink water which, I believe, should not be taken even by cattle, and if any responsible Government is eager for the health of the people of Bengal, I believe that provision should be made for a sufficient grant for giving to the district boards and other responsible bodies, provision for good drinking water in their respective areas. Of course I know that part of the public works cess was given up by the Government to the district boards, and they undertook to look to sufficient money being spent for drinking water, but I would like to point out that this money is quite inadequate, and unless more money is provided for making better provision for drinking water in rural areas, the prevalence of malaria and other diseases will be greater.

I want to say just a word about the Veterinary Hospital at Dacca which is now being established there. From my own experience of a Veterinary Hospital at Jalpaiguri I want to inform the House that the people do not appreciate the utility of it. The hospital established at Jalpaiguri has practically got no patients now; so it will

be a waste of good money establishing a new veterinary hospital at Dacca. I would ask the House to refuse this grant and to utilise it for the supply of pure drinking water in the rural areas. That money would be much better spent in this direction.

As regards the police budget, lots has been said. I would point out one thing. So far as police buildings are concerned, the types of the buildings may be changed and made less expensive. I know palaces have been built in villages at enormous cost, and I know some of these buildings will be deserted on account of retrenchment——

[The member at this stage having reached the time-limit, had to resume his seat.]

Babu BADRIDAS GOENKA: When I listened to the budget speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Member, my first impression was one of immense relief, not unmingled with gratitude, at the drastic retrenchments which enabled him to present a surplus estimate, the first of its kind in the reforms era, and the prospects of a return of the good old days loomed large before me. I wish I could retain that first impression after a perusal of the detained statements supplied to us. I find, however, that the budgets of the first years under the reforms have been balanced more by increased taxation than by actual retrenchments. The revised estimate for the current year shows that we have increased our revenue by about 1 crore 27 lakhs of rupees since 1921-22 by new and enhanced taxes, while the expenditure, after leaving aside the irrigation figures as the Hon'ble Member asks us to do, although there is no justification for omitting items 14 and 15, indicates a reduction of only Rs. 13 lakhs from the actuals of 1922-23 and Rs. 44 lakhs from the budgeted estimate of that year; if to these be added a sum of say Rs. 10 lakhs, the approximate normal growth of expenditure, the total amount retrenched comes to Rs. 23 lakhs on the actuals or Rs. 54 lakhs on the budgeted amount, although the Retrenchment Committee, including, as it did, men of all shades of opinion, suggested a total cut of about 1 crore 66 lakhs of rupees on the budget figures of 1922-23. I cannot even surmise at this stage what the findings of the Committee on taxation will be and also the attitude of the provincial Government on them, but I have this honest conviction that in these days of falling prices deficit budgets are to be balanced more by retrenchments than by imposing new taxes, and I firmly believe that there is still enough scope in this direction so far as our province is concerned. As yet the reductions have been effected mainly in contingencies and allowances, while the establishments have been practically left intact. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has said "we have thus cut our expenditure to the minimun." With due deference I may point out that on more than one occasion the Government asserted that they had reached the

the salvation of the Province lies in the development of the nation-building departments and so money must be found for them by further retrenchments. The surplus in the present estimate is more illusory than real. Though I cannot conceive that the Central Government can, with any semblance of justice, again demand the contribution from us, I believe that our financial position is far from satisfactory. With no immediate prospects of any increase in revenue, the surplus will be used up by the normal increase in charges due to the introduction of the time-scale of pay before the equilibrium is established and then our condition will be as precarious as ever.

Coming to the actual estimates for the next year I find that the transferred side shows no improvement. In the revised estimate for the current year the percentages of expenditure for transferred and reserved groups are 34 and 66, but in the next year's budget these have changed a little to the disadvantage of the former; yet the Hon'ble the Finance Member seems to have taken great pains to show that he has very liberally treated the transferred group. This distribution is all the more striking when we remember that one of the main considerations for appointing the Retrenchment Committee was to find adequate funds to meet the popular demands for larger expenditure on education, sanitation, agriculture and other similar purposes. The percentages of the voted and non-voted amounts have also moved adversely to the former. Thus while in the revised estimate the non-voted expenditure amounted to Rs. 1,28,44,000 out of a total of Rs. 9,86,78,000, in the next year's budget these come to Rs. 1,36,39,000 in a total estimate of Rs. 10,31,79,000. This certainly does not accord with the avowed policy of the authorities to grant more power to this House over the control of the finances of the Province. Another very important fact, which strikes even a casual reader of the estimate, is that while all principal items of expenditure show increases, in several cases substantial, over the revised estimate for the current year, education gets less. One could have scarcely conceived this state of affairs when he heard the Hon'ble the Finance Member speak on the steady growth of expenditure on this head.

The main sources of our revenue are certainly inelastic, but I believe that some minor sources like forests, industries, etc., if properly exploited, can give us better returns. I have not the latest figures in my hand but a comparison of the 1922-23 figures for the net revenue from forests in the major provinces will show that our income from this source is the lowest. I do not know what this unfortunate circumstance is due to, whether to any fundamental defect or to a lack of initiative, but I may say that this is one of our best potential sources and its development on the lines of the United Provinces and Bombay is sure to give us better returns, and so I welcome the proposed increase in grants in this direction. Similarly "industries," specially the cinchona plantations with proper attention could also help us substantially; it is a pity that in spite of the unique position of our Government as practically the sole producer of this very

important drug in this part of the country, the revenue from this head is steadily decreasing. These are minor matters, but I want to point out the lines in which energy and attention of the Government might profitably be directed and which might enable them to be independent of the vagaries of fluctuating and precarious sources like excise, etc.

The expenditure side of our budget has always been subject to criticism frequently bitter and uncharitable. I also cannot help making a few observations on it. We certainly spend proportionately more on Police, General Administration (except United Provinces) and Administration of Justice than any other major province while our educational expenses are much less. Thus while on the average Bombay spends about 12 per cent. of her expenditure on police, Madras 11·5 per cent., Punjab 10 per cent., in Bengal the percentage is about 18. If the expenditure on other items be compared in the same way the adverse position of Bengal will at once be apparent.

The items which show substantial increments in expenditure are Land Revenue, Police, Medical and Public Health. The increased expenditure on Land Revenue has been justified on several grounds and we can accept it as unavoidable. In Police also, the retrenchments which were effected mainly in allowances and contingencies have been made good this year on the plea of maintaining the efficiency. The increase in Medical appears to me to be more apparent than real and is mainly due to large grants to the various institutions for nurses, and larger provisions under lunatic asylums, specially that at Ranchi. I may incidentally mention here that the authorities should have treated with more consideration the non-Government medical institutions like the Carmichael Medical College, which are doing such excellent and useful work. Sir, the only refreshing thing in the whole budget is the expenditure on Public Health and I doubt not that the Hon'ble the Finance Member and also the Minister-in-charge, whom we miss to-day, will earn the gratitude of the people for their attempt to remove the most serious grievances of the mufassal. On the other hand, Sir, the estimate for Education is wholly disappointing. Apart from the fact that it is, in sad contrast to other heads, less than the revised estimate, there are so many anomalies here and there that I can hardly reconcile them with what the Hon'ble the Finance Member said on the subject. I do not grudge any increase in expenditure on the revised side of education, but I wish that the institutions on the transferred side might also get better treatment. I cannot also help making a passing remark on the glaring injustice done to the Calcutta University; while the Dacca University gets Rs. 9 lakhs of which Rs. 4 lakhs are recurring, the authorities have not found their way to grant to the Calcutta University anything to wipe off its deficit, and yet both are Universities in the same Province.

I have nearly finished, Sir. I would have been glad to make some reference to the expenditure under Irrigation and Navigation to show how the high hopes based on the efficiency and capacity of the dredgers

"*Ronaldshay*," "*Cowley*" and "*Burdwan*" have been falsified and also to some other schemes, but I refrain from doing that at this stage. I want, however, to make one suggestion as to the framing of the budget. The estimates at present emanate from one man. No doubt the Finance Member is almost always one of the ablest officials of the Government and he has before him all the facts, figures, and requirements of the various departments and also the suggestions embodied in the resolutions of the Council, but still he is alone and not always infallible. The House can reduce or refuse grants, but cannot increase them or insert new items. Indeed it is possible to introduce supplementary estimates for those requirements which have been left out, but would it not be a better arrangement that the Government shall frame the budget, as is the practice in many countries of Europe, in consultation with an advisory body, not necessarily consisting wholly of members of this House, but also of experienced financiers, businessmen and representatives of the general public? The main objections to this practice are that it is against the traditions, not only of the Governments in India but also of the British Government and that this will give publicity to Government proposals in the direction of taxes like Customs, Income-Tax, etc., which may cause financial loss to the Government. In provincial Governments like ours there is no such cause for anxiety; on the other hand we may get the benefit of the suggestions from experienced financiers as well as from the representatives of the people. I think the idea is well-worth considering, although it may, at first sight appear a bit revolutionary.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ spoke in Bengali. The translation of his speech is as follows:—

I pointed out the defects and blemishes in the budget estimates of the past years and with all the emphasis that I could command, but they were unavailing. I hail from the mufassal, and, therefore, I fully realise the deplorable condition of the villagers. They are all dying in thousands in every year for want of sufficient nourishment, and are being swept away in millions from malaria, kala-azar and other kindred diseases. But what steps are the Government taking to mitigate these evils. I moved resolutions in this Council with a view to ameliorating their miserable condition, but what has been substantially done? Nothing, I submit. In this vast tract of country only Rs. 50,000 has been allotted for water-supply and one lakh of rupees for stamping out malaria and kala-azar. For the purpose of supplying the police with cots and mosquito-nets a lakh has been allotted and for other purposes of great importance which cannot at all be neglected we notice that an infinitesimally small sum is provided as if with the utmost possible reluctance. So far as the question of education is concerned, Government have displayed a tinge of indifference. We have not allotted sufficient funds for the furtherance of free primary education and although

a resolution was passed in this Council for the dissemination of education amongst the depressed classes and the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College, the money allotted for these purposes, when carefully analysed, would conclusively prove to be insufficient.

I moved a resolution and putting several questions in this Council in the past for the establishment of a medical school at Chittagong. Although that resolution was not carried, hopes were entertained in our minds that Government would do something in that direction. It is apparent, however, that a certain sum of money has been allotted for a medical school at Mymensingh. There is a medical school at Dacca and Mymensingh is very close to Dacca whereas Chittagong is far distant. Under the circumstance, I do not think any useful purpose will be served by establishing a medical school at Mymensingh. This seems to me more in the nature of "carrying coal to Newcastle." Mymensingh has not a pressing need for a medical school, because there already exists a medical school in Dacca, which is contiguous to Mymensingh, whereas Chittagong which is far away from Dacca, urgently requires a medical school. I hope the claim of Chittagong in this respect will receive adequate consideration at the hands of the Government.

I also moved a resolution in this Council about the Fayzunnessa Girls' Schools at Comilla and it was patent that the sympathy of Government was sufficient with this school, but it is a matter of regret that no sum has been allotted for this institution. There is also another Muhammadan Girls' School in Comilla. Both of these schools and the Comilla College will require financial assistance from the Government and these institutions should not be lost sight of. To allay the distress of the typists and copyists a resolution was moved and Government also sympathised with that resolution and I hoped something would be done in this respect also.

I am always a lover of truth and it is a sin to suppress the truth. Every year increases are made in regard to new establishments whereas no improvement in the natural condition of the people is effected. Although it is not within my province to enter into a problem which is complicated and which concerns the Ministers in the main, I must say that the Ministers are not in a position to discharge their duties efficiently for want of funds, and therefore they cannot satisfy their countrymen and eventually lose their confidence. In highly civilised countries like Japan and America, the salaries of the high officials are much too low when compared with the salaries of the high officials of India. But, Sir, we have no control over these salaries. If these salaries are reduced and travelling allowances curtailed, a considerable saving can be effected and the financial position of the Government will be placed on a sound and satisfactory footing. The solvency of the Government Exchequer will be imminent, the people will be soothed to their satiety, and all these disruptions and disorders will disappear and the Government will be a peaceful Government.

Maulvi SAYYED SULTAN ALI: It is an undeniable fact that the economic condition of India, including Bengal, is getting worse day by day. We have been reduced to such abject poverty that even the small zemindars, I can daresay, lead a half-starved life. They cannot have two meals sufficient to maintain themselves. If that be the state of things in the country, we can clearly understand what the condition of the middle class and of the ordinary low class people of this country has become. Arts and industries died out long ago and the only resource upon which we are to depend is the annual agricultural produce of the land. But as we are to depend upon foreign production for the necessaries of our life, we are to spend the whole of our income every year for that and for our bare maintenance, leaving no margin for future and the natural result is that as soon as there is any flood or innundation, or for any other reason there is failure of a particular crop in the country, widespread famine breaks out and pestilence sweeps away a large number of the population of this country year after year. In this connection I may mention that some two or three years back there was a famine in the Satkhira subdivision of the Khulna district. Some special grant to redress the grievances of the people was made and the Hon'ble Member went to the place to hold an investigation, and although we are aware that husbands sold wives for 5 rupees, fathers sold sons and daughters for 2 to 5 rupees—not for making money, but for the reason that if at least they can dispose of some members of their family, they will be able to maintain themselves—even under those circumstances our benign Government would not declare famine for fear of great expenditure. Some Rs. 50,000 was granted, but that was not sufficient for the purpose. How was it then that we were able to cope with the situation? We sent men up to Bombay and the merchants of that place helped us. They contributed nearly a lakh of rupees. Contributions were also forthcoming from other parts of Bengal, including Calcutta. Sir P. C. Roy took the lead and the people were partly saved from death in this way.

[Here the Council adjourned for 15 minutes.]

On the Council reassembling, Mr. President called upon Maulvi Sayyed Sultan Ali to continue his speech.

Babu BEJOY KRISHNA BOSE: Is there a quorum, Sir.

On a count being taken it was found that there was no quorum.

Adjournment.

The Council was thereupon adjourned till 3 P.M. on Wednesday, the 27th February, 1924, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 27th February, 1924, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President in the Chair, the four Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council, two Hon'ble Ministers (the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq and the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Ghuznavi), and 106 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Telegraph Office at Nawabganj (Malda).

*L. **Babu ROMES CHANDRA BACCHI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken to remove the want of a Telegraph Office at Nawabganj, a Municipal town and the seat of a Munsif in the district of Malda?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that some residents of Nawabganj, since 1917, successively executed five guarantee bonds, for the purpose, at the direction of the Government, the last of which being accepted in February, 1922?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the cost of establishing a combined office at Nawabganj was earmarked in the budget of 1922-23?

(*d*) If so, what are the reasons for the delay in taking the necessary action in the matter?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. J. Donald): (*a*) to (*d*) The proposal to open a Telegraph Office at Nawabganj in the district of Malda was put forward by the local officers in 1913. After prolonged negotiations, the guarantee bond was executed in September, 1918, by some local residents, but the office could not be opened owing to restrictions resulting from the War. The bond had to be revised in 1920 owing to the increase in the cost of materials, but the project had again to be postponed owing to financial stringency. The financial responsibility was ultimately accepted by Government on 2nd June, 1922, on a fresh bond executed in April, 1922. Before the office could be opened, however,

the Government of India promulgated revised rules for the opening of new Telegraph Offices, under which parties requesting such offices are required to furnish the full guarantee instead of the half guarantee as before. The guarantors have been informed of the new rule, and it is now necessary for them to furnish the required guarantee to the Postal Department direct. Funds for the opening of Telegraph Offices are allotted from Imperial Revenues.

Municipal taxes on arable lands within municipalities.

*LI. **Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY:** Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that there is a trend of opinion in the mufussal municipalities that arable lands within municipal areas should not be burdened with municipal taxes on the ground that they give rise to constant disagreement between the owners of such lands and the local municipality?

SECRETARY to GOVERNMENT, DEPARTMENT OF LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (Mr. C. S. Dutt): Government have no such information.

Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY: Will the Government be pleased to make an inquiry at least from the municipality of the Howrah district?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: It is for the municipality to urge the matter if they wish to and not for the Government to make an inquiry.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Alleged dissection of Muhammadan prisoners dying in jails.

94. **Maulvi SAYYED SULTAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the bodies of Muhammadan prisoners who die in Jail are dissected?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps (if any) have been taken to put a stop to such practices?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [JAILS] (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): (*a*) No; the rule regarding *post-mortem* examination is as follows:—"In the event of the death of a prisoner in the jail, if death is suspected to have been due to causes other than natural causes or if the cause of death is not known,

he (the Medical Officer) shall make a complete *post-mortem* examination of the body. In other cases, he shall see the body and shall satisfy himself as to the cause of death; if he is also the Superintendent of the Jail, he shall then pass orders for disposing the body in accordance with the religion or custom of the community or caste to which the deceased prisoner belonged; if he is not the Superintendent he shall report the cause of death to the Superintendent, who shall then pass orders for disposing of the body."

N.B.—The Coroner of Calcutta has authority to require a *post-mortem* examination in the case of the death of every prisoner who dies in the Presidency Jail.

In all cases, whether a *post-mortem* examination is or is not made, the reason for the action taken should be explained in the monthly sick return No. 29.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

Anjana River Scheme.

95. Mr. ASHINY COOMAR BANERJEE: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether there is any scheme ready for opening out the Anjana River in the district of Nadia?

(*b*) What steps, if any, have been taken to give effect to the same?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The scheme has been sent to the Collector of Nadia for disposal under the Agricultural and Sanitary Improvement Act of 1920.

Vital statistics of Tippera.

96. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HUQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of births and deaths in the district of Tippera for the last 3 years?

(*b*) If there be an excess of deaths over births have the Government arrived at any decision as to the reason for the depopulation of the district?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that (Kala-azar) is prevalent in an epidemic form in the Tippera district?

(*d*) Are the Government aware that cholera has been ravaging the Chandpur subdivision and some parts of the Sadar subdivision of the Tippera district?

(*e*) If so, what steps have the Government taken to remedy the evils?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: (*a*) Births: 1921—62,234; 1922—51,316; 1923—60,962.

Deaths: 1921—47,457; 1922—48,292; 1923—49,397.

(*b*) There has been no excess of deaths over births in the district as a whole.

(*c*) Government are aware that Kala-azar is present in the district. The number of cases of Kala-azar admitted for the treatment at aided hospitals and dispensaries in the district during 1921 was 276 and in 1922 was 1,052. During 1923 also 1,288 cases of the disease had been treated at dispensaries and special Kala-azar centres, up to the end of July. The reported deaths from Kala-azar in Tippera during the past 3 years were 10 (1921), 61 (1922) and 677 (1923). It is probable that the increasing number of cases receiving treatment and deaths reported is mainly a result of the greater interest that has been taken in Kala-azar since the Special Government survey was carried out in 1920-21 and also owing to greater care in the diagnosis of the condition.

(*d*) Cholera occurs every year in Chandpur and the Sadar subdivision of the Tippera district. The deaths from this cause in these two divisions for the past five years are given below:—

1919	1920	1921	1922	1923
Sadar subdivision—				
2,330	1,364	846	2,095	1,517
Chandpur subdivision—				
929	859	573	1,297	650

(*e*) The relief of sickness and prevention of disease is primarily the duty of local authorities. The district board of Tippera appointed a health officer in 1922 and this officer has organized a number of special Kala-azar centres in the district. It is believed also that the district board have similarly adopted measures for checking the spread of cholera in various parts of the district. Government have recently made a special grant towards the cost of anti-kala-azar measures, and the Director of Public Health has also assisted the district board in respect of anti-cholera work. Government's policy with regard to anti-kala-azar work is stated in detail in their Resolution No. 2671-P.H., dated 6th November, 1923, published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 7th *idem*.

Erosion of Noakhali town.

97. Babu SATYENDRA CHANDRA MITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of Government to remove immediately the headquarters station of Noakhali to Maijdi?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, why are large sums of money being spent for building purposes at Maijdi during the present financial year?

(*c*) Are the Government aware of the formation of a big *char* to the south and east in continuation of the present town and the consequent recession of the river about 3 miles off to the south?

(*d*) Are the Government contemplating the immediate removal of the Jail and the Police Lines to Maijdi? Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the Khal to the north of the Jail has become shallower and that the remotest risk of erosion by the *Khal*, if any, may be removed by constructing a *bund* across the *Khal* to the east of the Railway station at a cost of about 10,000 rupees?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of not spending anything at Maijdi without considering the changed circumstances?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the assurances given by His Excellency in reply to the address of the Anjuman Ulema at Noakhali that without close observation of the course of the river no further expenditure would be incurred?

(*g*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to narrate the circumstances necessitating the expenditure of a large sum of money during the current financial year?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): (*a*) No. The situation at Noakhali is being closely watched.

(*b*) The fear of frontal attack is for the present remote, but the flank attack on the west of Noakhali is more persistent. If this continues the buildings at Noakhali may again be endangered and a move may become immediately necessary. The amount to be spent in 1923-24 is Rs. 1,04,000 for raising sites and burning bricks at Maijdi out of a budget provision of Rs. 2 lakhs.

(*c*) Yes, but the attention of the member is drawn to the reply to (*b*).

(*d*) No immediate removal of buildings is contemplated. Government is advised that the construction of a *bund* across the *Khal* should not be attempted as stated in the reply to Council question No. 345 of February, 1923.

(*e*) The work now being done is the least that will ensure a continuity of administration in the event of serious erosion again starting.

(*f*) His Excellency's reply to the Anjuman made no mention of such expenditure.

(*g*) The question does not arise.

Recruitment of officers and ineligibility of persons not having their domicile within the Province.

98. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state

whether, in recruiting officers for any service under this Government, any rule or rules, written or unwritten, are observed in shutting out persons who have not their domicile within this Presidency?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of abolishing such a rule?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the existence of any such rule or rules, written or unwritten, which are observed in any other Provinces in India, by which any person, having his domicile within this Presidency is shut out from getting any appointment in those Provinces?

(*d*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of moving the proper authorities to remove any such rule or rules?

(*e*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the negative, are the Government considering the desirability of inquiring through the proper channel and of placing the result of such an inquiry on the Library table?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): (*a*) The rules for the direct recruitment of the Bengal Civil Service (Executive), the Bengal Excise Service, the Bengal Police Service, the Subordinate Civil Service and the Upper Division of the Secretariat Clerical Service prescribe that a candidate must be a native of the province or have a permanent domicile within the province.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

(*c*) Government have no information.

(*d*) Does not arise.

(*e*) The answer is in the negative.

Chinsura Agricultural School.

99. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it has been decided to close the Chinsura Agricultural School?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of reconsidering the matter?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) It was decided to close the school.

(*b*) Representations that have been made to the Government for a reversal of this decision are now under consideration.

Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY: Will the Government be pleased to give reasons for closing up the school?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: The reasons for closing the school will be found in the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee.

Discussion of the Budget of the Government of Bengal for 1924-25.

Maulvi SAYYED SULTAN ALI: Yesterday I briefly described the condition of the famine-stricken area of Khulna, the site of it at that time was one for the gods to see. The condition of unaffected areas of the Province is not much better. The country has been reduced to such abject poverty in consequence of administration. When once the people of a place become weak for want of proper food and clothing and fall an easy prey to disease, it is no remedy to distribute freely medicines such as quinine and the like instead of rooting out the cause, I mean removing their economic distress. But to our misfortune no attempt in that direction has yet been made by the Government.

When the people want money for medical relief, education, sanitation, water-supply, irrigation, development of arts and industries and the like the Government's usual reply is that there is no money. As instances of it I can mention that the establishment of a Muhammadan College in Calcutta has been very keenly felt for a long time by the Musalmans and its necessity was also recognised by the Sadler Commission; in spite of that the Government found no money, till a Muhammadan Minister was placed in charge of Education in Bengal. In this connection, I am constrained to observe that my hon'ble friend, Maulvi Nurul Huq Chaudhuri, has failed to represent the opinions of his Moslem brethren when he said that there was no necessity for a Muhammadan College. Primary education is another thing the necessity of which has been recognized by the Government from a long time past but could not be introduced for want of funds. As the time is very short, I do not take item by item but speak of some only. For the necessity of the people the Government seldom find money but when about 70 crores of rupees were required for additional military expenditure the Government could easily meet it. Similar is the case with the expenditure of the Police Department, it is gradually increasing conferring no benefit upon the people. There is much room for savings in that department. The posts of Inspectors of Police may safely be dispensed with, as their primary duty is nothing more than the passing of investigation reports of sub-inspectors and assistant sub-inspectors which might conveniently be done by the senior sub-inspectors. The numbers of sub-inspectors may also be reduced. They are utilised more as clerks than as investigating officers. The numbers of constables may similarly be reduced. Formerly one sub-inspector in each thana with more detective abilities discharged all the duties with more efficiency, but at present although

the number has been greatly increased, expert officers with detective abilities are almost always requisitioned in important cases; unimportant thanas may also be abolished. In this respect even the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee have not yet been given effect to. What surprises one most is the item of expenditure in the budget for purchase of mosquito curtains for police officers. Do the Government altogether forget that the money spent for the purpose are nothing but the life's last drops of blood of the famished people of the country? Why such a special favour is made to the officers of a particular department in preference to others? Shall we be mistaken if we think that the Government in order to keep up the machinery of oppression to the people want to impress upon the police officers that they are the most favourite officers of Government? What is much more surprising to me is that during the famine Khulna had to approach even Bombay for relief but one year after—I mean in the last year palatial buildings could have been erected in the Khulna town for police quarters at the cost of some lakhs of rupees. At that time the Government found sufficient money for the purpose. Curious and mysterious are the ways of our Government; we fail to understand how the purse of Government becomes so short and long within such a short space of time to suit its own purpose.

I must remind you in this connection that the Khulna district was established about 40 years ago and till now we could go on without such quarters, but when the purse of the Government was the shortest, necessity for such a big unnecessary expenditure was considered to be the greatest. Such instances are not rare. It is no less surprising that large sums of money are to be allotted for secret services of the police.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member has expressed his satisfaction that as the non-co-operation movement is dying out he expects a substantially larger income from the Excise Department. Nothing is more disappointing than this. Does the Hon'ble Member entirely forget that every civilized Government ought to be ashamed of pursuing a policy of popularizing excisable articles more particularly to a helpless and famished people rathed than attempting sincerely and seriously to minimize it?

The question before the House is the adjustment and allotment of expenditure for the various departments of Government for the next financial year. It is my duty to discuss each of its items and make definite suggestions, but I refrain from doing that for the very simple reason that it will be nothing more than crying in the wilderness like the past. We, the people of this country, are utterly helpless in laying our hands on the financial administration of the country outside the Council, as representatives of the people in the Council and even our Ministers who are popular representatives share the same fate in the

Cabinet as had been clearly and sorrowfully expressed by the late Education Minister yesterday in this House. When this is the condition of the people of this country, is it not an anomaly to call upon the people to send in their representatives to take part in the deliberations on the budget in this House?

Taxation, taxation and taxation has become the burden of our song. Sir, you all know that the last straw breaks the camel's back. That straw has been placed long ago and the camel will surely die if any further straw be placed on it. If the Government think that it will for ever administer this country by the help of the military and the police, we have nothing to say. But if it think that instead of such a Government there should be a popular Government it should give us substantial control over the finance, relieve the people of the burden of taxation, and improve their economic condition, so as to bring about hormony and co-operation.

Before I finish I must say something against the suggestion of our hon'ble Shah Sahib regarding the reduction of the pay of the Munsifs and the Deputy Magistrates. Unless we are entirely oblivious of the quality and the quantity of work of those officers we can never suggest any reduction. Those who are aware of the joint family system will never make any such recommendation. Moreover unless and until we are in a position to substantially reduce the pay of civilians and other high officials it will be of no substantial benefit to us to reduce the pay of those officers. It is anomalous even to think that while the civilians will enjoy princely salaries and will demand for more and more, the pay of the poor Munsifs and the Deputy Magistrates will be reduced. If the pay of the civilians be substantially reduced, I am sure the Munsifs and the Deputy Magistrates will gladly accept a proportionate reduction of their salaries for the welfare of their country.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: This is the fourth Budget of the Reform era which we have got to consider. In going to review it, I must thank the Hon'ble Mr. Donald at the outset for having accepted a humble suggestion of mine. I think the financial statement has been more intelligible thereby. It would have been better indeed if the Hon'ble the Finance Member could have induced his colleague in charge of the Irrigation Department to take us more into his confidence. For of all persons the Finance Member will admit that it is very difficult, if not impossible, to deal with a portion of the budget with so few details and with so many undisclosed things as our Irrigation Budget is. However these formal suggestions apart, we should congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member though not certainly the Government as a whole upon the good fortune which has attended his labours this time, viz., upon his ability to present a budget this year with a decent surplus. It would have been a matter of greater felicitation indeed if this surplus were

more real than apparent—more a result of our prosperity than a reminder of our adversity. For, as we all know, it is in a large measure due to a temporary charity and a short-lived mercy of the Government of India—a charity which may or may not recur, a mercy which may or may not be renewed. To a great extent again this surplus is due to the operation of the three fresh taxes—taxes which far from developing the province have unprofitably added to the annual burden of the people by no less an amount than 1½ crores. When such is the case our Government should have thought twice before working for a surplus—at any rate should have endeavoured more to save the nation than to make a saving. For while such savings cannot protect them against the unkindness of the higher authorities, properly earmarked, such savings would have at least partially insured the life of the nation against disease and ignorance. However the position of our present Finance Member is almost the same as that of his predecessor in February, 1921, with this difference that while in February, 1921, Sir John Kerr was looking up to Delhi for help with his reserves untapped, Mr. Donald is now expecting relief with used-up reserves and spent-up resources.

Now before I pass on to the details of the estimates for 1924-25, I cannot refrain from making a few observations with regard to certain items of the revised estimates for the current year. While presenting the Budget for 1923-24, with very high hopes the Hon'ble the Finance Member estimated that receipts under Stamps—Stamps which under the present arrangement is the greatest source of our revenue—would come up to Rs. 335,00,000. In course of the Budget discussion, however, I ventured to observe—

> Trade conditions may or may not improve to some extent, but when there are reasons to think that the increased taxations have adversely and materially affected the normal growth of stamp revenue and that "the limit of taxation" has been reached, I am disposed to think that the expectation to get larger revenue under this head to the extent of Rs. 35 lakhs will not be realised. Such large anticipation at least is not justified by the rate of decrease of stamp revenue in the near past. For since the year 1919-20, the year of peace, the stamp revenue was dwindling fast at the rate of about Rs. 25 lakhs in two years and all that you have been able to do by amending the Stamps and Court-fees Acts is to arrest the downward course. And hence you cannot hope to speed up the progress to the extent you desire.

I am therefore not in the least surprised to find the Hon'ble Member naively admit in his Budget Speech now:—

> The stamp revenue has not altogether realised our expectations. . . and instead of the expected Rs. 3,35,00,000, we must be content, I am afraid, with Rs. 3,20,00,000.

That the Hon'ble Member here erred because of his undue optimism and not altogether on account of the uncertainties of trade conditions is further proved by the fact that while in connection with receipts under Stamps he observes—"Hopes have not been realised as the improvement

in trade prospects so far has been small" (page 15 of the Financial Statement), in explaining the revised estimate of better receipts under the allied department of Registration he says—"The Budget estimate under this head was fixed at Rs. 24,00,000 but as trade conditions are showing signs of improvement the revised estimate for this year has been fixed at Rs. 24,50,000" (page 17 of the Financial Statement). I venture to think the latter statement more correctly represents the actual state of things and hence the Hon'ble Member, I suppose, has again made a slight mistake the other way about and has on revision a bit underestimated the Stamp receipts. A few more observations that this part of the Financial Statement calls for are that Education, ill-health (as evidenced by hospital receipts), Industries (in the shape of quinine and cinchona febrifuge) have yielded better receipts—and that these very nation-building departments again, the transferred portion of Education as distinguished from the reserved portion, Medical, Public Health and Industries have ultimately spent less. Who deserves congratulations on this score from the uneducated, diseased, and distressed nation whether the Finance Department or the Hon'ble Ministers, it is certainly for the economic historian to enquire.

Passing on to the detailed estimates for the coming year the first thing that strikes us is that the Hon'ble Finance Member expects better receipts—better as compared with the revised estimates—all along the line. Thus he not only expects the fullest satisfaction of the demands under Land Revenue and improvement in Stamp receipts but is confident that with the collapse of the non-co-operation movement the Excise Revenue will make a big jump upwards notwithstanding the much advertised fixed fee system and probably owing to our Government's co-operation with "reasonable temperance movement." But it is not under these three principal heads only that our Government looks for better receipts. The Hon'ble Finance Member further expects that Hospitals will co-operate with ale-houses, trade with litigation, schools will co-operate with cinemas and fields (I mean Agriculture) with Forests to swell his receipts. How much of this co-operation is legitimate, how much of this profiteering commendable, if not scandalous, perhaps it will be going beyond approved canons of criticism to inquire.

But nowhere our catalogue of grievances is so full as with the estimates of expenditure for the next year. These estimates conclusively prove that there has been no change in the angle of vision—there is no sincere attempt to make the reforms a success—no real desire to solve any outstanding national problem. The estimates of expenditure really make a sorry reading. Of the total estimated expenditure of Rs. 10,31,79,000 only Rs. 3,47,72,000 *i.e.*, 33·7 per cent. represent the estimated expenditure for the transferred departments—transferred departments unduly top-heavy though they are. In presenting the budget for 1921-22, Sir John Kerr estimated that expenditure on the transferred side

represented 35 per cent. Probably our Government's anxiety to save the reforms and our Hon'ble Ministers' co-operation to make the reforms a success, our people's readiness to submit to fresh taxations so early in the reform regime account for the drop of 1½ per cent. in the total. Taking into account the details we cannot but note with regret that the Government can choose to spend extra lakhs for Survey and Settlement but not certainly for the development of Agriculture. They have budgeted lakhs and lakhs, Sir, for navigations, canals, but could not find sufficient money for anti-malarial drainage projects. They can propose to spend Rs. 6 lakhs and earmark quarter of a crore or so for police buildings but can afford to spend only a pittance of Rs. 50,000 for the improvement of rural water supply. Respect for the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee they have no doubt professed here and there, but the police budget for 1924-25 almost exactly tallies with the actuals for 1922-23 from the scale of expenditure of which year the Retrenchment Committee recommended a cut of no less than Rs. 34½ lakhs. And General Administration? Well launch, establishments apart it has received an addition of more than two lakhs upon the figures for 1922-23, the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee and the so-called reductions of their own motion notwithstanding. But ignored they have certainly not the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee when and where, say, Education is concerned. What a large saving in the right direction, Sir, has not been made by deprovincialising the 151 primary schools maintained by Government including the 46 Model Girls' Schools? Long after the Reforms Act of 1832, in the twenty years between 1875-76 to 1895-96 British Budgets could show an increased expenditure of about £13 million sterling (half the total increase of expenditure during that time) for Education and local expenditure but just after the inauguration of the reforms here the principle has been adumbrated and the fiat has gone forth that local needs must be satisfied by local resources—probably because provincial funds may be more released and suitably spent—say—for the superior services.

One word more about our financial position and I have done. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has assured us that our Government will continue to fight against the Meston arrangement. We only wish that it will not be a mock fight and our Government will be a little bit more serious in it. Lord Willingdon referred the other day "to an assurance of the Finance Member of the Government of India that Madras would be the first to receive remission of its contribution whenever the Government of India found it possible to pay something back." May we enquire what grounds have been gained by our Government by their alleged persistent fight? If no grounds have been gained I think the Government will not be justified in diverting our attention from the question of retrenchment. For although I sincerely desire, as every Bengali desires,

for the reversal of the Meston arrangement, I do not believe that merely the reversal of it will make our financial position so easy that we shall be able to do without retrenchment. For when to keep the administration going we have sacrificed the large balance mostly earmarked for nation-building purposes with which we closed the pre-reform era, when our position is this that while before the reforms our revenue was expanding at the rate of Rs. 45 lakhs a year and after the Reforms it is yielding an annual increase of Rs. 13 or Rs. 14 lakhs only, certainly we should put down all extravagance and try to run the administration as economically as possible. No shibboleth of discharging Parliament's responsibility in this land, no hackneyed plea of maintaining law and order at any cost, no jejune arguments of efficiency can absolve us in any way from the supreme duty of retrenching drastically just to make the nation live and thrive. Fight with the higher authorities with as much zeal as you can to undo the Meston wrong, but pray do not trifle with the recommendations of your own Retrenchment Committee. Cut you must more heavily the reserved departments to release more money for the transferred subjects, otherwise the nation will refuse simply to wait and see the results of what appears to be your half-hearted and indecisive fight against the Meston arrangement.

Mr. S. C. MUKERJI: In this House I have made it perfectly clear over and over again that I am dead against the policy of deadlock and complete negation. The policy of negation has never appealed to me. It is indicative of a lack of constructive statesmanship and of intellectual bankruptcy. A policy in order to command the respect and confidence of the country must be one of construction and not one of destruction. A budget consists of multitudinous facts and figures, but one should like to see behind the budget a policy which would appeal to the country at large. A responsible Government must so frame a budget as would reflect the views of the people. I have addressed this question to myself: Does this budget, which has been presented to this House, reflect the policy which commands the general confidence of the people at large? I must say I have been disappointed here. It is not the question whether so much has been allocated for the reserved departments or so much for the transferred departments, because I am perfectly sure that when Swaraj comes there will be General Administration, Administration of Justice and the Police. The question is—does this budget reflect a policy which will appeal to the reasonable section of the country—a section which is in a position to think for itself? The first thing that has greatly disappointed me in this budget is the increase in Excise revenue. In the year 1921-22 this revenue came up to 1 crore and 83 lakhs. Since then it is going up apace. The budget estimate for 1924-25 is 2 crores and 16 lakhs—an increase of 33 lakhs in course of two or three years. The department's explanation is that it is due to improved administration and especially the introduction of the fixed fee system. I am

prepared to accept the statement but I do so *cum grano salis*. I am not prepared to admit that the whole of this increase is due to an improved administration. It means also an increase in consumption. You may say, if you like, that you have reduced the number of shops but I am perfectly sure of one fact, viz., that drinking is on the increase and therefore it disappoints me. I should like to see more money going to education than to see an enriched excise revenue, because I have repeatedly said in this House that it leads to moral degradation of the people.

Looking curiously at the budget I find, taking five of the transferred departments—I mean Education, Medical, Public Health, Agriculture, and Industries—the total expenditure aggregates 2 crores, 39 lakhs and 98 thousands, whereas the aggregate expenditure in three of the reserved departments, viz., General Administration, the Administration of Justice and the Police—amounts to 4 crores 15 lakhs and 78 thousands. Now, at the outset, I said I should like to see a policy behind this budget. What the people of the country want is that the budget should be so framed gradually year after year that the digits will be invetted, viz., that we should like to see 4 crores, 15 lakhs and 78 thousands for the transferred departments and 2 crores, 39 lakhs and 98 thousands for the reserved. That would reflect the views of the country. We want to see a budget which would give more education, which would pay more for health—which would give more attention to the villagers, which would pay more attention to sanitation and less to other things. That is the policy that we should like to see behind the budget.

We do not mean to say that there must not be any general administration, nor any administration of justice, nor any police administration in the country, but what the country wants is that there should be a bigger allocation of revenue to the transferred subjects. That is the very thing the country wants. And if the budget shows that, then there will be far less of these criticisms—this discontentment which is now spreading far and wide in the country. In order to illustrate my point may I refer to page 54 of this Green Book? At a cursory glance I find at page 54 under the grant to local bodies revised estimate Rs. 2,32,480—the budget estimate of Rs. 1,20,000 for the supply of quinine. The people of the country would like to see 10 times of that amount. What will Rs. 1,20,000 do for 45 millions of people? You may say that it has been increased from Rs. 80,000 to Rs. 1,20,000. This would be a drop in the ocean. Take for example the anti-malarial measures. Not a single farthing is there in the revised estimate of 1923-24—in the budget estimate of 1924-25, there is only Rs. 50,000 out of the total revenue of 11 crores. The people naturally get discontented and dissatisfied. People are dying by hundreds and thousands and when they come to the annual budget and find that for anti-malarial measures Government has provided only Rs. 50,000 for a population of 46 millions of people, naturally there is a great deal of discontentment in the country. Take another item—

the anti-Kala-azar campaign. There was nothing in 1923-24. In the budget estimate of 1924-25 there is a sum of Rs. 50 allocated. Naturally the people consider that to be very very inadequate.

Then, Sir, I am not now connected with education but I was connected with it, for a long time and I find that instead of any increase there is a decrease in the educational grants. This is the fourth time I am going to speak on behalf of the Calcutta University. I do not know, Sir, why this University is so shabbily treated by this Government. For the Dacca University there is again a grant of Rs. 9,00,000, I do not say one word of protest. The Calcutta University is a developing body, it is a growing body, it is a body which is gradually making its name throughout the world to-day and still this University not be given sufficient facility and sufficient resources to develop and to grow. The Education Minister is bound to give a satisfactory explanation regarding the present treatment of the Calcutta University. One great relieving feature of the budget is the grant to the Muhammadan Arts College.

Mr. PRESIDENT: (the Hon'ble Mr. H. E. A. Cotton): You have reached your time-limit, Professor.

Mr. S. C. MUKERJI: And though it was long overdue it is a matter of real gratification that some justice is going to be done to our Muhammadan brethren in the matter of their higher education.

Babu BEJOY KRISHNA BOSE: The budget for the next year cannot be accepted by us for reasons which I will presently give. This is the fourth year of the "Reformed" administration. Besides increments of the salaries of the high officials, multiplication of administrative machinery, increase of patronage and the consequent demoralisation in our public life what else have we got? In 1921-22, you started with a deficit of 2 crores and 8 lakhs. In 1922-23, the deficit was 1 crore and 20 lakhs in spite of a retrenchment of nearly Rs. 90 lakhs. Three taxation Bills were passed in the teeth of universal opposition, but still in the next year, the present year 1923-24, there has been a deficit of 17 lakhs notwithstanding a retrenchment of Rs. 49 lakhs. For the next financial year the Finance Member has now presented his budget and by a jugglery of figures somehow or other balances the revenues and expenditure. If this time next year, the Central Government do not agree to remit the contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs we will have another deficit budget and the grants will be curtailed. Mr. P. C. Mitter with all the weight of inner knowledge exclaimed yesterday that no steps have so long been taken to get a reversal of the iniquitous demand of the Central Government. But Mr. Mitter should have known that India is a big firm of which the senior partner is the Government of India and the junior partners are the Local Governments and among them they divide the profits of the business. Who are we that we should be heard or our interests safeguarded?

The Central Government can only forego their exaction if by the rigid economy of their expenses they can curtail their expenditure. We do not definitely know their decisions on the Report of the Inchcape Committee. Like our police expenditure they have got their military expenditure and the huge cost of the General Administration and I can prophesy that the contribution will never be abandoned.

One could have accepted the reforms if with its advent there had been a wide and general spread of education, in all its aspects; if steps were taken to diffuse primary education and make it free and compulsory, if the resources of the State had come to the help of the struggling universities, if agriculture and industries had developed and made attractive, if anti-epidemic and anti-malarial measures were undertaken on large scale, if pure drinking water was made available in the villages, if exploitation of the resources of the country by foreigners in the name of enriching the country, had ceased, if the impoverishment of the people had stopped. Why should our countrymen take office as Ministers and Executive Councillors if the old order of things continue under different names and in different shape and form. May I inquire, Sir, how much of the money raised by the new Taxation Bills had been allowed to go to the so-called nation-building departments. Credit is taken for the provision of Rs. 35,89,000 for new schemes, but not one of the schemes relate to transferred subjects.

Let us take the "nation-building" departments. At page 108 of the Civil List Budget we find that for the reserved half of Education (i.e., for the education of European and Anglo-Indian boys and girls) though the budget grant of 1923-24 was a total of Rs. 12,36,000, the revised estimate went up to Rs. 13,22,000, and the present budget estimate for 1924-25 is Rs. 13,64,000, or a total increase of Rs. 42,000. On the transferred side of Education this year, though the estimate was Rs. 1,13,01,000 a little over 2 lakhs were not spent or rather retrenched and the provision in the present budget falls short by Rs. 2,27,000 compared with the revised estimate of 1923-24. How could a "popular" Minister agree to such cuts in his department, I fail to understand. For European and Anglo-Indian education the Government is making a grant of Rs. 3,55,000 to secondary schools and Rs. 4,41,000 to primary schools, whereas on the transferred side from the provision for the secondary education this year a sum of Rs. 21,000 has been retrenched and the provision for the next year falls short of this year's budget estimate by Rs. 44,000.

In the case of primary education the budget amounts for next year is Rs. 27,000 less than that provided for 1923-24. In the field of higher education the grants to non-Government Arts Colleges have been also reduced by Rs. 12,000 and the grant to the Calcutta University has been reduced from Rs. 4,31,000 to Rs. 1,47,000. I do not grudge the good fortune of the Dacca University; but the niggardly way in which

the Calcutta University has been treated in the budget calls for the strongest possible protest.

Let us take the Public Health figures. A lakh and 15 thousands is the only sum alloted for medical relief to rural areas all over the province! A budget which provides for lakhs for palatial houses for nurses, thousands upon electric lights and fans in obscure Government office corners, a lakh for mosquito curtains for *palaraiwallas*—provides for a magnificent sum of a lakh and 15 thousands for the medical relief of people of a Province of 45 millions of men in whose midst every hour 162 men die of preventable diseases and where out of every 100 infants 50 die before they reach the age of eight. In a country where poor people squeeze mud in order to get out a few drops of water to drink another magnificent recurring sum of Rs. 50,000 has been allotted towards rural water-supply. Those who are still of opinion that the budget as a whole ought not to be thrown out because there are provisions made towards education and relief of distress ought to study these figures and refuse to co-operate with a Government which is callous towards the weal of the people from whom revenue is extorted in various ways.

The chief sources of Revenue are three—Stamps, Land Revenue and Excise. On each of these heads Government expect increases by several lakhs. It simply means that Government expect more money by increase of litigation, by increased consumption of liquor and use of ganja and opium and by still more extracting money from the poor tillers of the soil. With regard to improvement in Excise revenue the budget declares at page 12 that "the growth has further been accelerated by the collapse of the non-co-operation movement." Here is a tardy recognition of one of the benefits of that movement that it had made people more pure by abstention from use of liquor. So long I understand that in the name of "law and order" Government wanted to crush that movement. Now I find that it affected the Excise Revenue of the Government as well and so expenditure on the Police had to be increased to bring about a revenue from Excise. We also find at page 13 that in some of the mill areas of my district the hours of closing the shops was changed from sunset to 8 P.M. What an ugly disclosure of facts. In order that the revenue of the Government from Excise might increase the poor mill hands were made to drink intoxicants and spend their day's earnings by going to shops kept open for them till 8 P.M. If such a budget is passed those who will support it will commit a sin for which there can be no expiation.

The expenditure on Police has increased from 1 crore and 65 lakhs in 1920-21 to 1 crore 84 lakhs and 68 thousands and in the present budget, the police expenditure swallows one-fifth of the total revenue. There used to be a time when five Superintendents of Police in Calcutta could manage the whole show now you have got about 18 Deputy

and Assistant Commissioners in Calcutta alone. An army of Superintendents, Deputy Superintendents, Inspectors and other gazetted officers are maintained in the name of law and order.

In the General Administration Rs. 90,000, are provided for His Excellency's Band Establishment, Rs. 1,11,000, for Body Guard Establishment. The tour expenses have increased from Rs. 1,04,000 to Rs. 2,67,000. Much of these can be curtailed.

The number of Executive Councillors and Ministers can very well be reduced with corresponding reductions in staff and allowances and contingencies.

The pay of the superior officers of the Bengal Executive Service has been increased but the Government is not perhaps aware of the extent of the discontent in the junior rank, members of which have to do as much onerous duties as the senior in the grade. In many cases confirmation of the officers of the Subordinate Executive Service are withheld since April last year and this has caused great discontent. But while on the subject I cannot but make a reference to the hard lot of munsifs—a body of men who toil and moil day and night in Court and out of Court and the nature of whose duties are no less important than those of the members of the Executive Service. Whereas we have 707 Deputy Magistrates and Sub-Deputy Magistrates the number of munsifs is only 289 and Sub-Judges 65. The most important civil suits are decided by these officers, including complicated title appeals, but what a great disparity between their pay and the pay of the Sessions Judges who, but for their skin and the "steel frame" of the constitution, ought to learn law at their hands with advantage for many years in the course of their career.

I will only refer to one of the other provision, viz., a provision of Rs. 2,40,000 for fees for pleaders in criminal cases. This sum ought to be reduced. I can tell you from first-hand knowledge that constant adjournments, short work, undue protraction of cases and great indulgence shown to police to complete their so-called investigation, extending over months all tend together to swell unnecessarily the bills of those fortunate pleaders who manage to secure Government briefs by method too well known.

I am quite sure that our criticisms will be laughed at and the budget provisions will be maintained and demands for grants will be made. Not until the budget is made the people's budget our clear duty is to refuse the grants and throw out the whole budget. A tinkering here and a tinkering there will not do. A petty advantage gained at the expense and sacrifice of the good of the nation is not worth having. The covert threats in the Maharajadhiraja's speeches and the wild and passionate outbursts of the Ministers will not move us a hair's breadth from our clear duty for the performance of which the country has given us a mandate and has sent us here.

Babu AKHIL CHANDRA DATTA: In discussing a budget we must start with the cardinal principle that the framer of the budget is only a trustee of the rate-payer's money. The rate-payer is the owner of the money and you are only his manager and servant. The budget must be so framed that every farthing must be spent for the welfare of the people. If a cowrie is diverted and appropriated for any other purpose or for any other people, then the trustees will be guilty of breach of trust before God and man. By irony of fate, however the framers of the budget are not constitutionally responsible to the people from whom the revenue comes but responsible to people at the other end of the globe. But the other responsibility cannot be diverted—I mean responsibility to the Almighty who frames the budget of the whole universe and for all mankind. That responsibility becomes all the greater, all the more solemn, when the people have not got an effective voice over the budget. I wonder if all the time the budget was being prepared, the one dominant consideration was the amelioration of the 45 millions of this province. I wonder if the unemployment problem disturbed for one moment the equanimity of the Finance Member. I wonder if the illiteracy of the masses, the rapid strides of malaria and kala-azar, the dearth of water drinking or non-drinking, all over the province, the want of medical aid in rural areas—I wonder if these life and death questions received the all-absorbing attention of those who are responsible for the budget under discussion. In framing the budget the ideal Finance Member must place himself in the position of a dutiful father who feels impelled to forego all personal comforts to give education to his son and to provide him with employment, in the position of the youthful and anxious guardian who, unmindful of his own privations, devotes all his funds to make his ward prosperous and contented; in the position of a Hindu of the old type who considered it an act of piety to dig and dedicate a tank, in the position of a loyal servant who spends every farthing for the benefit of his master.

This is the test—the acid test—and let us now see whether the Finance Member has faithfully and loyally discharged this sacred trust. After a careful study of the budget one cannot but come to the conclusion that the budget before us does not stand this test. The advancement and happiness of the people is not the dominant and underlying principle of the budget. It is dominated by political considerations.

I shall take up a few items only to substantiate my position and by way of illustration.

The Finance Member told us—

> The provision for education is less than that of the current year and it is said that the decrease is the result of two factors—one the non-repetition of Rs 3 lakhs to the Calcutta University and the other the retrenchment effected in Government secondary schools and primary schools.

This is like those penny wise and pound foolish people who, in order to make some saving, would forego their daily meal. *Pêtché utha lega*

as they say. It is astounding that expenditure should be reduced at the cost of primary education in a surplus budget.

In secondary schools it has been decided to abolish 69 posts of teachers for making a saving of Rs. 58,000. But, Sir, simultaneously with this retrenchment, provision has been made for appointment of new teachers for the Eden High School and for purchase of furniture and equipment for the dormitory at Dow Hill Girls' School. A grant of Rs. 30,000 has been made to the La Martinère Schools to enable the school authorities to pay off a debt incurred when and why we have not been told. We have another grant for the same lucky school for repairs of the school building. I do not grudge these grants if you have money enough and to spare. But allow me, Sir, to say that these grants are indecent at a time when 69 ill-paid teachers have been kicked out as a measure of retrenchment with a view to economy. There is another school equally fortunate, viz., St. Scholastica's School which has been given Rs. 28,000 for the construction of a kindergarten hall and additional class rooms. There is also a provision of Rs. 12,000 for a capital grant to the Diocesan College.

It is very difficult to understand the principle of these charitable grants. There is certainly no nepotism in these grants—the non-Indian names of the schools certainly does not account for the super-abundant and extraordinary lavishness of the grants. I do not want to suggest that blood is thicker than water. But I shall certainly say this: that the provincial revenue at the disposal of the Finance Member is *bonorum mal*, property without owner. Whoever can approach and influence, whoever is serviceable and a ready tool can snatch a slice. May I, on behalf of those 69 teachers, ask why the Government should make these charitable grants at a time when it fails to pay their niggardly pay? I want an honest answer to this question. Charity is certainly a vice when you cannot pay your servants. Justice first, and charity afterwards, charity should begin at home. But possibly the Finance Member is laughing within his sleeves and is thinking that I am a dullard not to see that charity has begun at home so far as grants are concerned.

The budget is a surplus budget for the Anglo-Indian schools and is a deficit budget for Indian secondary schools and Indian primary schools. That is the story so eloquently told by the budget.

The Finance Member has said at page 45 of the budget:—

> In spite of the period of financial stringency through which the Presidency is passing and the consequent postponement of all developments and improvements in the various activities of the Government, the expenditure under head of Education has increased steadily.

Expenditure may have increased but the question is, has it benefited the people? All that glitters is not gold.

In this connection the most outstanding fact of the surplus budget is the withholding of the grant of three lakhs to Calcutta University. Every right-minded man must protest against this decision of the Government.

You have no money for Calcutta University, but you have unlimited resources for police schemes and police buildings. Look at pages 36 and 37 of the budget and see what an amount has been granted for three purposes—

(*a*) Quarters of sub-inspectors and Deputy Superintendents and Additional Superintendents—I find over six lakhs.

(*b*) Police buildings and police lines.

(*c*) Sanitary improvements of police lines; police lines at Burdwan; reserve police lines.

These grants amount to over six lakhs, you take away three lakhs from University, only to give the double amount for the comfort of police officers and policemen.

Salvation lies in this country, Sir, in beautiful, comfortable and palatial police buildings—if not salvation, safety at all events. Contrast these six lakhs with the magnificent sum of Rs. 50,000 allotted for water supply in rural areas of the entire province—sufficient only for two or three tanks. Whereas a lakh of rupees provided for the supply of iron cots and mosquito curtains to the constables which are necessary for the maintenance of a good standard of health. The tender and scrupulous regard for a good standard of health of constables no doubt evoke the admiration and gratitude of the most unimaginative people but. Sir, what about the beggarly, niggardly, scandalously niggardly grant of Rs. 50,000 for water-supply of the rural areas of this vast province. Is this serious and sane business? I must say this is only an eyewash. I must say that this is an insult to the people.

We may turn to the Medical Department for one moment. A sum of 1 lakh provided for medical relief of rural areas of the entire province. But our rulers are sometimes chvalrous. For have they not allotted Rs. 3,10,000 for the construction of nurses' quarters in the General Hospital and propose to spend one lakh out of this grant this year. But these Calcutta nurses are a perenial drain on our resources. In the current year and next year they have been given Rs. 7½ lakhs! Add to this another Rs. 1½ lakhs consecrated for the same nurses under another name, viz., grant for medical purposes.

The most outstanding feature of the Medical Department is this: the rural population is absolutely neglected; and Calcutta enjoys the lion's share of the total grants. Surely not a very unselfish arrangement. We are also to be thankful for a grant of Rs. 50,000 for anti-malarial measures and another Rs. 50,000 for anti-kala-azar campaign, and Rs. 10,000 for anti-cholera work. Sometimes we have got to be thankful for small mercies.

The most important problem at the present moment is no doubt the industrial and technical education of the people. But how much is it proposed to spend next year? Why, the total grant is nine lakhs, i.e., no more than the nurses swallow up in two years. In this we are referred to two new schemes; the erection of a small demonstration factory in the Serampore Weaving Institute for which a small provision has been made and a building for the Mainamati Survey School for which Rs. 40,000 has been allotted. We, layman, do not very much appreciate survey school as an industrial improvement.

This is all the achievement in the Industrial Department to which the Finance Member refers to ease the conscience of those who are playing drakes and ducks with our money. The budget is no doubt a very interesting study, but we cannot admire the sense of proportion; we cannot appreciate the principle of distribution; we cannot appreciate why the nation-building departments are starved. Grants are withheld where they are most needed; they are most lavishly given where the country can go on without them. Niggardliness in some departments go on *pari passu* with the reckless and callous waste in others. Maximum of good to the minimum of people this is the story told by the budget. But I forget this is inevitable whenever a stranger plays the rôle of a guardian. The only solution of the problem is full responsible Government—the only panacea is Swaraj.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I hope I shall be excused if I do not shower praises on the Hon'ble the Finance Member for the budget he has presented before the House. What we want, what the country wants, is not an account of the receipts and expenses of money realized but an account of the mental, moral, physical and material advancement of the people as evidenced by the course taken by those who are entrusted by Providence with their care. Judged in this light, the budget cannot commend itself to this House. Let it not be understood that the people think that Government has not tried to bring about their welfare and does not try to bring them up from the mire, but there was and is enough room for greater efforts and more strenuous and honest endeavours. While thanking Government for what it has done for a fraction of the people please allow me to say that the mass of the people, the dumb millions, have practically gone uncared for and unattended. It will not do to have around you an intelligent class, an educated section, to carry on the administration of the country, it is your duty, your sacred duty to uplift the masses. On that and that alone depends your good name, and that alone when done covers Government and their advisers with a halo of undying glory. When the last Council passed the new taxes it was on the distinct understanding that the money so derived would go to make the masses contended and happy. When we find that very little has been done by the money at our disposal towards that end, we have to pause and consider, we

have to reflect and to decide if that state of affairs should be allowed to continue.

Sir, the nation lives in cottages—the nation that toils—the nation that by its labour and by the sweat of its brow makes the wealth of the country, but alas! they are the persons who are mentally starved and as for food, they must thank their stars if they can get two meals a day. Sir, they make the wealth of the country and they are entitled to the lion's share. May I ask if it is not right, if it is not just, that we introduce free primary education in the land all at once? That is the only honourable course which Government should take and the only true path which they could follow, and as for money "where there is a will, there is a way."

It is with regret that I find that instead of introducing more and more education, an attempt is made to cut down grants from maktabs, junior madrassas and model schools and the efforts of my community to educate their boys are very much hampered. In the last session of the Council I drew the attention of Government to the good work that was being done by the Junior Madrassa at Burdhanpur. It received an annual grant of Rs. 600, but thanks to the good sense of the authorities no provision was made in the budget and the most useful institution in the very backward district of Murshidabad will have to close if no money is given this year.

You keep inspecting agencies, and Government has been very kind to appoint Muhammadan Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors for Muhammadan Education. Villagers burning with the desire to educate their children run to them and in the case of the Burdhanpur Junior Madrassa, the school people did come at great expense to coax and cajole the Muhammadan Assistant Inspector and at great expense and great trouble to themselves they, after much entreaty, took him to the Madrassa, but I am ashamed to say, to absolutely no purpose. I personally know as I have personally inspected the Madrassa that it supplies a great demand and it is a most useful institution. I think the Muhammadan inspecting staff are a useless lot and instead of paying them heavily for their pay and travelling let the money go to foster education. Is it not absurd that a village school-master who is responsible for the training of our youths in Bengal should draw the pittance of perhaps Rs. 5 a month while his work is inspected and criticised by a host of inspecting officers who draw from Rs. 100 to Rs. 300 a month? I am afraid, Sir, we are spending more for criticism than for construction. This is ridiculous and I would leave it to Government to consider the question and decide as to the best course they should adopt. Sir, when talking about education I should notice the Muhammadan Arts College as it has come in for a good deal of criticism and for the further fact that the Arts College came up for discussion in the last Council. Those who want technical education should not forget that the Arts College does not exclude the imparting of technical education

to our boys. It is unfortunate that Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury should have said in this House that the Hon'ble Minister for Education has thrown the Arts College as a bait to Muhammadan members of the Swarajya party to come over to the Government side. I would only remind the House that Mr. Chaudhury's assertion militates against facts which he himself has unwittingly admitted partly in his speech. The House should be tolerant in making observations and if to Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury Islam does not teach sufficient charity, let him try some other belief by way of a change.

Next to education another thing that should have engaged the attention of Government and for which proper and adequate provision ought to have been made was the betterment of the condition of the masses. While it is absolutely necessary that better land laws should be made without delay it is equally necessary that the peasantry should get a better yield from the lands and they should be taught economy and thrift and should be freed from the sharks of the dry land. It is in this connection that the Department of Agriculture and Industries and the Co-operative Department play their part. The constitution of these departments afford us much food for reflection and the question that suggests itself to us is whether they give us their money's worth. I am afraid they do not. The Agriculture Department with heaps of money spent over them, can only boast of the *Indrasail* paddy, *Kakya bombai* jute and tana sugarcane, to justify their existence. Any farm making experiments would have long found out these precious articles and these do not justify the three or rather four sets of inspecting staff. There is No. 1, the Director of Agriculture with his paraphernalia. There is No. 2, the Deputy Directors with a host of underlings shooting with meteoric dazzle from one part of his province to the other, and then there is No. 3, the Superintendents of Agriculture inspecting the farms, and lastly, there are the Agricultural officers. What good these are to the poor peasantry? Do they each, in their travels and inspecting impart a new knowledge of any kind whatsoever to the peasantry? My answer is "No." But still they are kept; the country would very much like to know why? It is for the Hon'ble Minister to decide if it were not better to keep the Dacca farm in East Bengal and expand and enlarge the one at Berhampur in Murshidabad in West Bengal and carry on experiments under the supervision of real agricultural experts and then impart the knowledge so obtained through demonstrators to every nook and corner of villages. But, Sir, inscrutable are the ways of my countrymen and the members of the Retrenchment Committee would keep all the men at the top and finish those at the bottom who alone come in contact with the villagers. In this connection Mr. Travers has said that the agricultural farms would take at least 15 years to become independent. We cannot wait so long and let me hope that the Hon'ble Minister should see to it that if the farms do not pay their way within two years, he should ask those who

are at the helm, to pay their own way home. To my mind there is much room for improvement in the Co-operative Department. A man at the top with Rs. 800 to Rs. 1,000 and a much larger number of persons at every centre at the bottom will produce much better results and will do greater good to my countrymen. Sir, I cannot help noticing with regret that Government has granted Rs. 50,000 only for water supply, while for the supply of cots and mosquito curtains, the sum of Rs. 1,00,000 has been allotted. The cry for water supply made our worthy close-fisted Finance Member to part with Rs. 50,000 only for a population of 40 millions. Mark his generosity, mark the magnificent amount allotted! Let me tell him that he should remember that at least 999 persons in a thousand cannot have any mosquito curtains. I shall ask him to allow Rs. 50,000 instead of Rs. 1,00,000 on this head. I assure the Government that they will be doing an act of grace and mercy if they allot much more under the head "water supply". I would ask at least Rs. 10,000 for Murshidabad for water supply. In support of my claim I would refer the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the House to my budget speech last year to show them how and why the population is daily dwindling away. Let me quote a few figures:—

In 1918 births were 50,249 and deaths were 79,969, the excess of deaths over births being 21·7. In 1919 births were 39,614 and deaths were 64,898, the excess of deaths over births being 18·4.

In 1920 births were 47,868 and deaths were 51,285, the excess of deaths over births being 18·4.

In 1921 births were 49,547 and deaths were 49,878, the excess of births over deaths being one.

The last census report has shown what a large fall there is in the population. Sir, His Excellency Lord Ronaldshay also marked the scarcity of pure drinking water in the district of Murshidabad. The district board has no money to make sufficient provision for water-supply and I take leave to assure the Hon'ble the Finance Member and through him the Government that we in the district, will, with this amount, though small, make about 200 wells and remove the want of the people to some extent at least. I know the district board has been innundated with petitions for wells, and if nothing is done it will be no wonder if cattle and people die for want of water. I hope Government will avert this calamity. In conclusion, Sir, I would ask the Government to remember that they should start free primary education without delay and enact laws and adopt measures wherewith to improve the moral and material condition of the unhappy millions.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MUHAMMAD CHOINUDDIN: Mr. President, up to the day before yesterday I was under the impression that my Swarajist friends were great experts in politics of a particular kind, namely, of an obstructive kind, but since yesterday when certain remarks fell from the lips of my Swarajist friend Maulvi Nurul Huq Chaudhury about

the New Muhammadan Arts College, provision for which is made in the budget, I have begun to think that they are going to be great experts in other things also, namely, in the occult science or rather in the occult art of thought reading. My friend Maulvi Nurul Huq Chaudhury yesterday read to us the thought that was uppermost in the mind of the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-ul Huq when he provided some money for the foundation of an Arts College for Muhammadans in Calcutta. My friend very confidently told us yesterday that when the Hon'ble Minister provided money in that way he did so with a view to luring away the Muhammadan members from the Swarajya party. Whatever my friend may think of his skill in reading the thoughts of others I must say that in this particular connection he made an egregious blunder. His uncharitable remarks only betray his colossal ignorance of the history of this question.

This is, I think, Sir, not the first time that the Hon'ble Minister has made this proposal. I think he had been agitating about this for the last ten years, long before the introduction of the reforms in this province. My friend has himself admitted in his speech that as long ago as 1917 land was acquired in Calcutta for the purpose of founding a Muhammadan College here. Is it not natural therefore for the Hon'ble Minister to give effect to his long cherished desire of founding a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta when he got the opportunity and the power to do so? Should we find fault with him for doing a thing which any other men or my friend himself or any of his colleagues in the Swaraj party would have done in similar circumstances? I am afraid, Sir, our poor Ministers have fallen upon evil times and upon evil tongues. Motives and sinister motives must always be found where there are none and always some bad or wicked motives must be ascribed to their proposals. My friend seems to be so much opposed to the proposal because he thinks that the establishment of a purely Muhammadan College will have the effect of fostering communal feelings——

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: May I rise to a point of personal explanation, Sir! My friend does not seem to have heard the speech I made yesterday attentively. If he had done so——

Mr. PRESIDENT: That is not a personal explanation.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: I am coming to that, Sir, presently.

Mr. PRESIDENT: Come to the point at once please. I can allow no preface.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: What I said in my speech yesterday is that if the money that was budgeted for the foundation of a new arts college for Muhammadans was devoted to technical scholarships or scientific courses, etc., it would have been perhaps more welcome to the Muhammadan community.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MUHAMMAD CHOINUDDIN: At least there are many in the Swarajists' camp who are under the impression that measures of this kind will retard the progress of Indian nationalism and foster the spirit of communalism. Of course, Mr. Das, Mahatma Gandhi and, I think, Maulana Mahomed Ali are all well-known in holding that a pact is essentially necessary in order to bring about unity between Hindus and Muhammadans, but there are others who say that no pact is necessary. Let the Hindus and Muhammadans run together in the national cause without any pact, and everything will come afterwards. They believe that we can do without a pact. They seem to think that——

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAODHURY: On a point of order, Sir, the question of pact is not in the budget——

Mr. PRESIDENT: You may leave it to me; this is a general discussion on the budget; we have roamed over almost from China to Peru.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MUHAMMAD CHOINUDDIN: To my mind, if a pact, a Hindu and Muhammadan pact, is passed, even then it will not bring about what is called real unity between Hindus and Muhammadans, the reason being that the pact to be of any use must be between equals; unequal combinations, as we know, are always disadvantageous to the weaker side. If my friends of the Swaraj party really desire Hindu-Moslem unity, they should help the Muhammadans in becoming their equals by extending to us their help and friendship, by allowing us some special privileges and by not objecting to the foundation of a special Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta. In working for our communities, we are indirectly working for the national cause. I think it was Mazzini, the great patriot of Italy, who said that in fighting for the cause of Italy he was fighting for the cause of mankind. So if we want a special favour from Government like this, if we want to start a Muhammadan College, we should not be cried down or regarded as narrow-minded.

There is another aspect of the question. After all, these denominational schools and colleges have some purpose to serve. This proposal of the Hon'ble Minister is not the first of its kind, it is not an unique or novel proposal. I think in Calcutta we have got a Hindu College; then you have got the Hindu University at Benares. We all know that every nation, every sect have got their peculiar or special ideals and traditions, and it is desirable that the boys belonging to that sect or nation should have their education in institutions which will foster these special traditions and ideals. In Eastern Bengal we have got the Dacca University, which I think, has made special arrangements for Islamic studies; outside Bengal we have got the Aligarh College; but in Western Bengal we have got no such college. Looked at from this point of view, I think, this proposed college will remove a real want of the Muhammadan community in Bengal, and specially in West Bengal. My friend has said that if the Hon'ble the Minister has, instead of proposing to have a Muhammadan

Arts College, proposed to set apart some scholarships for Muhammadan boys, or if he had proposed to found a technical school for Muhammadan boys, then they would not have had much objection to his proposal. But this is also inconsistent on his part. In that case also the Muhammadan Minister, I think, would have been attacked for showing some special favour to his co-religionists. In that case also he would have been given a bad name and hanged. Of course, he has simply provided some money in the budget for this college; as to whether it should be purely a literary college or whether some vocational bias cannot be given to it, are questions of detail which may be considered when the demand will be made for money, for supplies, for grants. We all know that the present system of University education is no longer suitable to our country. (Hear, hear.) It is only literary education which provides a large number of clerks, but it does not equip our boys for the hard struggle for existence. The late Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University, Sir Asutosh Mookerjee, the present Vice-Chancellor, and the late Minister of Education are all of opinion that vocational education should also be combined with literary education. I am sure our present Minister of Education is aware of this fact, and I have every reason to believe that when he takes up this question of working out the curriculum for this proposed college, he will most probably make provision for teaching technical subjects in this Arts College. For the present all we have to do is to pass the amount which he wants for the starting of this college.

Next, I would like to make a few remarks upon that part of the speech of my friend Khan Bahadur Maulvi Musharruf Hossain in which he says that survey and settlement operations are an useless and dangerous thing. He says that survey and settlement and record-of-rights bring about quarrels between tenants and landlords, where there were none formerly; he would therefore oppose the grant of money for taking up survey and settlement operations in new districts. I am sorry that he has formed this bad opinion about survey and settlement operations.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President left the Chamber and the Deputy President took the Chair.]

But what does it do? It gives us a record-of-rights which we tenants possess under the Bengal Tenancy Act. In the absence of any authoritative record much litigation arises between the tenants and landlords. Without any such authoritative record, the task of the munsiffs——

[The member here having reached the time-limit, was allowed extra time to finish.]

—and the civil courts will become very difficult in deciding tenancy cases. That being so, we should rather think that the record-of-rights brings about peace where there was formerly litigation. Of course there may be areas where only for some time after these settlement operations are

finally concluded, parties may quarrel over their respective rights, but these quarrels only go to show that the survey and settlement operations open the eyes of the tenants to their rights, and they fight for them; so we should not have any objection against this record-of-rights. As regards the pace at which this survey and settlement programme should be worked out, is a thing that may be discussed and considered at the time when the Hon'ble Member in charge of the survey and settlement operations asks for grants.

Babu SARAT CHANDRA BASU: At the very outset I must confess that I am unable to deal with this budget as a whole. The subject is far too varied and far too serious to be even nibbled at within the short space of time at our disposal. It is not my intention just at present at any rate to offer general comments on this budget either by way of recommendation or by way of censure to the whole or to any part of it. I have no mind to exhibit any disloyalty or so-called disloyalty on account of my offering comments except on one or two subjects in this budget. If the making of comments is considered to be a shortcoming on my part for criticising Government measures, I am sure my deficiency will be amply made up by many of my friends in this House who are well known for their loyalty and some of them are more loyal than even the King himself. (Hear; hear.) I should therefore try to offer my remarks upon two definite subjects. I am fully aware that there are various measures such as village sanitation, medical relief and other things which are the crying needs of our country, and it is but bare justice to ask the Government to let us live first and then to enjoy the benefits of the British administration. (Hear, hear.) My friends in this House have already spoken on the subjects, and I will not take up your time over those matters; but there are two things to which I wish to draw the attention of the House, viz.—(1) the details regarding the Administration of Justice, and (2) the Criminal Investigation Department of the Police.

We find there is a remark made by the Hon'ble Finance Member that he has been able to effect a saving of Rs. 5,61,000 under the first head, viz., the Administration of Justice. Now the question is—should there be a saving? Of course to curtail an expenditure is no doubt a work of considerable merit, but here the budget has cut down expenditure upon various matters, and has knocked off items that are really needed. Now, we find by comparison of the figures, which we get from the reports, that in 1923-24 there had been District and Sessions Judges to the number of 28, but for this year the number has been reduced to 19; and under the head of subordinate judges we find that there had been 48 in number which has been reduced to 45, although there are provisions for temporary sub-judges to the extent of Rs. 77,000, which would make up to entertain only seven or eight subordinate judges. Mr. President, I know from my experience that

the number of judicial officers entertained in your Province is far, far too short of the requirement. I can tell you from my experience, especially of my district, namely, Burdwan, that if the whole cadre of the service is duplicated they will not be enough to meet the requirements, and the worst enemies of these judicial officers cannot say that these gentlemen are not overworked. To give an instance, we are in 1924 and in Burdwan we are still going on with cases that had been instituted in the year 1917; that is, cases seven years old are still pending. You know, Mr. President, that Burdwan is an industrial district, that it is a district of coal mines and miners; you know how hard things are nowadays; if suits regarding collieries and coal lands remain pending for seven years, you can very well conceive the fate of the litigants. Seven years' time is quite enough for people either to make mints of money or to go to insolvency. The last has been the result in many cases in my district, and yet we are not even within sight of these cases being judicially tried for want of officers. That is the condition not only in the Asansol subdivision where the collieries lie, but that is the condition in the town of Burdwan also. There is always a paucity of judicial officers especially of the subordinate judges and of the district judges. If we look at the figures in this year's estimate we find that income from the sale of court-fees is given at 3 crores and from the sale of non-judicial stamps at 1 crore. I am speaking roughly—that is, 4 crores altogether. Against this the expenditure on the judicial administration of the country is put down at Rs. 1,22,68,000, as I get it by adding the figures under the head 24 from 24 (*a*) to 24 (*h*). In other words, under the head of judicial administration of the country we are not spending even 50 per cent. of what we are getting by the sale of court-fees alone. I remember to have seen somewhere, although I cannot put my finger on to it just at present, that when the Stamp Law was first introduced, there was a solemn assurance given to the people of India that the money raised by the sale of stamps—by stamps I mean stamps as well as court-fees—would be spent entirely for the administration of justice in the country, and that the revenue realised from the stamp and court-fee duties would not be diverted for any other purposes of the Government. But here we see that as against 4 crores we have been given only Rs. 1,22,68,000 to spend for the administration of justice—a little above 33 per cent. and far short of 50 per cent. Now, in India, at any rate, we know from the very ancient times when there was every attempt made by the administrators of the land to make the administration of justice perfect, we had had the assurance of the administrators that the revenue derived from the court-fees would be spent for the administration of justice and for that purpose alone. We know that has been definitely stated in the early ages in the works of Manu and Vrihaspati, and that had been given effect to scrupulously up to—I may say 30 or 40 years ago after which——

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): Do I understand that the revenues from the court-fees must be spent on the court itself? Will you give me the reference?

Babu SARAT CHANDRA BASU: Not to-day, but to-morrow or the day after.

Mr. DEPUTY PRESIDENT (Major Hassan Suhrawardy): Hon'ble members should not address each other but should address the Chair.

Babu SARAT CHANDRA BASU: By court-fees I did not mean the court-fee stamps but the fees levied from the litigant public; the litigrants in those ancient times had to pay certain fees for getting justice. I hope I have satisfied the Hon'ble Member. However, I will give him the reference from Manu and Vrihaspati. In any case, even if I am a little mistaken in quoting the text and verse from Manu, that does not detract in any way from the subject which I am advocating, namely, that the Government should not make a profit out of the administration of justice, I would again refer to Manu and other ancient jurists who have specially laid down that to make a profit out of the administration of justice would not be an act of sovereignty but that would be the sale of justice which is deprecated by all sensible men. I should therefore suggest to the House that we should duplicate the cadre of the judges and sub-judges to cope with the work that they have got to do.

There is the other important matter, Mr. President, to which I should like to offer a little comment, and that is under the head "Police." Of course, the expenditure on police has been the subject-matter of discussion in the House, and I am not going to make any remark, because I feel that I have not been able to study the subject properly. I should therefore leave that matter in the hands of those who have made it a special study on their part. Of course, police is a very odious thing in this country, although it is a very necessary one. On account of their conduct they have acquired the odium which in many instances they richly deserve, but no administration of the country can possibly go on without the maintenance and help of the police. But at the same time we ought to see that the police that is entertained is entertained for the purpose of the protection of the people and not for their harassment. We find in the report under the "Police" a remark made by the Hon'ble the Finance Member that there has been a saving of one lakh by the abolition of the "Special Dacoity Section" from the Criminal Investigation Department. Now, Mr. President, if the Criminal Investigation Department had been doing anything like good work anywhere, it was in the direction of putting a stop to dacoities, and that very direction has now been done away with. That section of the Criminal Investigation Department

which was concerned with the suppression of dacoities ceases to exist and thereby a saving of one lakh of rupees has been made.

Under this head we also find that there is what is called the "permanent force" and the "temporary force." What is meant by the "temporary force" we do not know; in the budget it is only given as "temporary force"; it requires considerable insight and insight into the secrecy of things to understand what this "temporary force" means. On the other hand, we have got the details of the permanent force, details which require an expenditure which is budgeted at Rs. 1,36,272, but this "temporary force" without any details is put down at Rs. 1,85,000 which is more than the cost of the "permanent force." Add to that Rs. 75,000 for the Secret Service!

[The member having reached the time-limit was allowed two minutes to conclude his speech.]

This Secret Service is another thing about which we know nothing and no information has been given in the budget. My time is up: I cannot take any more time especially as the Book of numbers has always been a sealed book to me and I always fight shy when faced with the jugglery of figures. I therefore submit to you, Mr. President, that the figures in these two heads, judicial administration and the administration of police, should be overhauled so far as this budget is concerned.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President returned to the Chair].

Maulvi ABDUL QUADER: I agree with Babu Umes Chandra Chatterjee, who spoke yesterday that we should completely oppose the budget. In the Blue Book I find abstract of revenue and expenditure from which an idea can be gathered and general criticism be made. In Expenditure No. 6—Excise, nearly all the money is spent for the pay of officers and establishments. In Expenditure No. 8—Forests, nearly half; in Expenditure No. 9—Registration, the whole is spent for service and establishment. Under the above three heads the expenditure amounts to 40 lakhs of rupees. In Expenditure No. 22—General Administration nearly the whole amount is spent for the establishment and pay of the provincial heads of Government, Divisional Commissioners and the District Magistrates and their subordinates and the amount is more than a crore of rupees. In Expenditure No. 24—Administration of Justice nearly the whole amount is spent for the pay of the High Court Judges, District Judges and their subordinates and Judges of Courts of Small Causes, Calcutta, and the amount is more than a crore of rupees. In Expenditure No. 26—Police nearly a crore and 75 lakhs of rupees are spent annually for the pay of Presidency and District Police Officers and their subordinates and establishments. In Expenditure No. 31.—Education we find that a little over a crore of rupees is spent for the education of the children of the soil and of this amount nearly 11 lakhs goes to Government Secondary Schools, more than 11½ lakhs to Government Arts Colleges

and 12½ lakhs to Inspection and Direction work. In Expenditure No. 32—Medical, and Expenditure No. 33—Public Health Department the total expenditure is only 46 lakhs and odd and Rs. 28 lakhs and odd and in these departments also we have got European Officers on high pay. In Expenditure No. 34—Agriculture, out of a total expenditure of 17 lakhs and odd Rs. 9 lakhs and odd are spent for the pay of Agricultural officers with no work. In Expenditure No. 35— Industries, more than half goes to the pay of officers and their establishment. In Expenditure No. 41—Civil Works economy can be effected if the officers can properly check their subordinates and contractors who are generally greedy and dishonest. These are the bigger departments and I leave aside the minor and miscellaneous departments where also the service-holders get the lion's share. Now all these departments mentioned above are administered by Government as they say, efficiently, but the effect of the administration does not satisfy the wishes of the people. The officers both of the Indian and Provincial Services are irresponsible and the more their pay has been increased, the more irresponsible they have become. Since the war for the last ten years the people of this country has suffered economically, but the only people who are happy in this unhappy land are the European and Indian service-holders belonging to the Indian and Provincial Services. There is a saying in Persian "*Bat ra az tufan che bak*"; even if the flood is mountains high the duck has nothing to fear. In our country since the outbreak of the war every profession has suffered except the service-holders. To add to this the bureaucracy to check the spirit of non-co-operation has made an unholy alliance with the service-holders, and have increased their pay in all departments of public services to such an extent as no one could possibly dream of. The result has been that they have become more and more irresponsible. In the Police Department we find that the expenditure has increased by leaps and bounds for the last few years in reward for their magnificent services for the upholding of law and order as was the case at Chandpur and Charmanair and other places at the connivance of their superior officers and executive officers. In the Executive Department we find there is an army of fatly paid officers. Deputy Magistrates and Sub-Deputy Magistrates and Collectors is very very light. In the Judicial Department we find Munsifs all over the country have got light files and they are not overworked as of old as many people still believe them to be. For the last three years contested cases have greatly fallen off in many districts and subdivisions of Bengal, and I have seen Munsifs passing their time merrily during working hours in their chambers and bungalows like their brothers of the Executive Department. In spite of all this their pay has been increased permanently and their number has also been increased. Now when they have been fully satisfied provision is going to be made for

services by the appointment of the Lee Commission. To whichever side we turn our attention we find gigantic provision has been made or are being made by Government on a large scale with a vengeance for the big pay of their numerous officers in the Provincial and Indian Services and Government thinks that its chief duty is thus finished.

Now what is the condition of the people? Trade and industry have not prospered. Trade is completely in the hands of the foreigners. Small industries sprang up in many places after the partition agitation in Bengal only to die in a short time without Government help and patronage. After the war the need for industrial development has been all the greater. To quote the words of the authors of the Montagu-Chelmsford Report on the Reform proposals in April, 1918, Part II-A, para. 336—

> India will certainly consider herself entitled to claim all the help that her Government can give her to enable her to take her place as a manufacturing country and unless the claim is admitted it will surely turn into an insistent request for a tariff which will penalise imported articles without respect of origin. On all grounds a forward policy in industrial development is urgently called for not merely to give India economic stability; but in order to satisfy the aspirations of her people who desire to see her stand before the world as a well-poised, up-to-date country, in order to provide an outlet for the energies of her young men who are otherwise drawn exclusively to Government service or a few overstocked professions; in order that money lying unproductive may be applied to the benefit of the whole country and in order that the too speculative and literary tendencies of Indian thought may be bent to more practical ends, and the people may be better qualified to shoulder the new responsibilities which the new constitution will lay upon them. These considerations led Lord Hardinge's Government to recommend the appointment of the Industrial Commission which is at present sitting.

Now I ask, has the Government done anything in this direction except the appointment of a Commission which is a panacea for all the evils and which throws dust into our eyes? During the Muhammadan rule many young men of the respectable classes among the Muhammadans and Hindus took to military service. But with the disappearance of the Muhammadan rule that opening was closed. If we get provincial autonomy and the bar to the admission of Bengalis to the military service is removed then besides public services which should be provincialised and Indianised we have two more outlets for the employment of educated middle class Hindu and Muhammadan youths of our country, viz., Industry and the Army. To greatly add to the moral prestige of the country the Excise Department should be abolished and to effect economy the pay of all the State service-holders carrying a pay of Rs. 200 and upwards should be reduced. Higher and secondary education should be deprovincialised and primary education be made free and technical education should greatly be encouraged. In this way instead of complication in administration, over-taxation and discontent in the land, there will be simplicity in the system of Government, improvement in the economic condition of the people and real peace and order in

the country. Stamp and other oppressive taxes should be reduced and chowkidari tax abolished. There is another thing which I wish to state. Executive and Judicial functions should be separated. Deputy Magistrates should be placed under the District Judges and thus the terror of the police in the minds of the people will disappear and people will begin to realise that they are no longer strangers in their own country. The Police Department should be amalgamated with the General Department in matters of finance and control and the administrative machinery will become further simplified and more workable with good results. I know all these my pious wishes are vain so long as the present bureaucracy continues and until and unless it is mended or ended. But I am drawing a picture as to how our future Swaraj Government should administer from the points of view of economy, morality, and removal of discontent from this unhappy land of ours.

Now as to the condition of the country people, the raiyats. That which matters most to the raiyat is his relation with his landlord. But to quote the first part of the Montagu-Chelmsford Report on Reforms,

> Much of the activity of Government comes home to him (raiyat) eventually; and whatever helps him in his difficulties adds enormously to the happiness of the country as a whole. It is not merely a matter of securing him in possession of his plot of land, of assessing his dues equitably and collecting them with discrimination, of advancing him money in bad days and waiting till he is in a position to repay it. A simple, cheap and certain system of law is one of his greatest needs. He greatly requires to be protected against the intricacies of courts and the subtleties of law and enabled to defeat the advantage enjoyed by his long-pursed opponents. The working of all the great procedure codes, the Law of Usury, of Registration, of Limitation, of Contract, the Court-fees Act, the Stamp Act, is felt in the remotest village in the land. The raiyat and hundreds of thousands of his kind may be lifted from penury to comfort by a canal project costing millions of pounds. One of his constant needs is protection against exactions of petty official oppressions, improvements in seed or stock, manures, ploughs, wells, the buildings of a new road or new railway, facilities for grazing his cattle or getting wood for his implement, the protection of his crop from wild animals, his cattle from diseases and his brass vessels from burglars; co-operative banks to lend him money and co-operative societies to develop his market; the provision of schools and dispensaries within reasonable distance, these are the things that make all the difference to his life.

All these were said in praise of the District Officers' so called solicitude for the poor raiyats of the villages. But I should say that since the passing of the Permanent Settlement neither the Government nor the zamindars have ever shown any real sympathy for the grievances of the raiyats enumerated above. Attempts are being made now and then in these directions by Government, but these do not bear fruit on account of the costly top-heavy administration. The intricacies of law, the exactions of money-lenders, the corruption of officers, the enormous increase of court-fees and stamp, want of education and sanitation and, above all, the non-development of his market has made his life intolerable. Unhappily, the raiyat is too often the victim of scarcity and disease. Speaking for my

poor district of Jessore, once the most flourishing in Bengal, malaria, kala-azar and poverty have reduced its population considerably as the census will show. Those who are alive are more dead than living, and the villagers are poor and emaciated. The attention of the Government has been drawn for the last 30 years for the reclamation of the Bhairab and other dead rivers of Jessore, but the bureaucracy has all along turned a deaf ear to all the entreaties, reasonings and arguments advanced to Government on many occasions by our pro-Government and distinguished countryman Rai Jadu Nath Majumdar Bahadur, C.I.E., of Jessore. If the bold peasantry and the countrypeople are dead and dying, what will be the benefit of the reforms?

Mr. K. C. ROY CHAUDHURI: I am going to make just a few passing remarks about the principle of the budget which sings the same song year after year. The budget deserves neither congratulation nor condemnation. With a few cuts here and there and with the wind-fall from Stamps and Excise duties, the Finance Member must have made most desperate efforts to balance the budget. Sir, I am for out-an-out modification of the policy of taxation.

Taxation must be justified by proof that revenue derived thereby will be used in a way which will produce a large measure of general well-being. Taxation should be in proportion to ability to pay and to the protection and benefit conferred on the individual by the State.

My point is that the masses, I mean the raiyats and working classes, bear most of the burden of the 10 and odd crores of rupees realised as revenue. Let us take, e.g., Land Revenue, which brings in more than 3 crores of rupees. Can anyone deny that every penny of it is paid by the raiyats through that historical agency known as the *Bengal zamindars*, whose capture of this Council has been somewhat checked by the advent of the Swarajists? Take, Sir, the next item the Excise, which brings in bumper harvests at the expense of the health of millions of raiyats and working men. Can anybody doubt that the major portion of it is from proceeds of sale of country liquor and drugs not patronised by the intellectuals, but the raiyats and working men who drink the slow poi on made and sold by the Government? The third item which brings in between 3 and 4 crores is from Stamps? My information is that a very large portion of it comes from the pockets of the raiyats who are obliged to litigate and borrow owing to that peculiar system of land revenue created by the historical statute known as the Permanent Settlement.

I can give you statistics to support my statements which are no use to the Swarajists or the Nationalists. The overthrow of the Government first, masses and that kind of thing afterwards is their motto. Let us examine for a moment how this 10 crores of rupees taken out of the pockets of those whose inability to pay needs little or no demonstration, is spent.

The largest portion is spent on Police, viz., nearly 2 crores of rupees. Can anybody deny that the Police which we have in Bengal to-day is nothing but an engine of oppression and exactly the opposite of protection to the masses? I shall give you an instance to prove my case. It was in August last year the porters at Howrah Station were restless over the heavy toll they have to pay to the labour contractor. There is long history attached to it. I will not trouble you with the details. The porters on the pay-day refused to pay Mr. Love, the contractor, Rs. 7 a month. Some thirty-seven of them were arrested and tied with ropes at the instigation of the contractor and the Station Superintendent on the pretext that they were trespassers and the worthy Deputy Magistrate of Howrah in consultation with the District Magistrate fined them Rs. 5 each. They were simply shocked and some of them told me that the British system of justice was no good. We took the matter up to High Court and the Judges have not only squashed the sentence but made very strong observations in the judgment pointing out the Deputy Magistrate was absolutely ignorant of law and that there was telephone message between the District Magistrate and the Railway Company and that kind of thing on the day of trial. The European Sergeant at Howrah Station whose name I can give told me that the arrest was illegal, but he had to do it because the Superintendent, Railway Police, ordered it. The next item of expenditure, viz., 1¼ crore of rupees is for education and out of this a magnificent sum of 23 lakhs were spent on primary education, which alone should benefit the masses. It is a pity that very few people took any interest in that excellent report made by Mr. Biss on primary education after proper inquiries. He estimated at 3 crores of rupees as capital outlay and a recurring cost of nearly 2 crores of rupees. In my humble opinion the Ministry of Education should concentrate on this one single question—viz., primary education on which depends the real Swaraj Government and not a top-heavy *bourgois* régime which Swarajists aim to attain.

Taxation, if properly understood, is a blessing and not a curse to the community and if the proceeds of the taxes are spent for maximum good for the maximum number of people.

I want to indicate, Sir, a few extra sources of taxation to meet the cost for primary education. It is well-known that Jute and Tea Industries are more or less monopolies of this country and that during the war and the following years the industrialists made colossal fortunes out of them without paying proper bonuses to labour which was exploited to its utmost capacity. Jute employs 300,000 hands taken out of agriculture. They drink and acquire all the vices of the mill area. I suggest that the Bengal Government takes power to impose a provincial tax per loom or on the looms which weave Gunnies and Hessians worth 50 crores of rupees a year. A tax or Excise duty of 1 per cent. which is very small indeed will fetch 50 lakhs of rupees. It is true that the Government of India takes 1½ crores of rupees on export of Jute fabrics, but let us fight

for powers to tax it ourselves. In the same way the present prosperity of Tea Trade can bear small taxes to yield a quarter of a crore of rupee. This and a few lakhs from Coal will give us enough funds to start primary education in select areas.

There is still another suitable source to tax, viz., *inheritance* known as Death duty. Every civilized country has adopted it as one of the most suitable form of taxes. In this country big estates quickly vanish through litigation and succession suits. A portion of it for the benefit of the nation and not for the benefit of lawyers and law-agents would be welcome as revenue.

I think, Sir, a graduated death duty ranging from 5 to 50 per cent. depending on the value of the estates will give us a substantial sum to supplement the cost of education. In fact the living zamindars are becoming more and more anxious to do something for the tenants who are being greatly exploited. They should welcome this as their *post-mortem* contributions to the National Revenue.

Mr. SATCOWRIPATI ROY: I thought I should not speak in this Council so long the Government does not become our own, but when I find that everybody is speaking, if I do not speak my constituency will consider me to be a dumb representative. I must therefore speak.

From yesterday, Sir, I am hearing hon'ble members speaking upon the budget that has been introduced by the Hon'ble the Finance Member. Some have criticized the powers that have been given under the Reforms Act to this Council to control the expenditure. Some have criticised the allotments that have been made in the budget under different heads. Most of them, not excluding the ex-Minister of Education, have spoken about the disproportionate allotments made to the transferred departments, specially the head Education. But I am surprised to see that very few have criticized the sources of revenue and the amounts of revenue realized from these sources. Very few have remarked whether the sources of revenue are proper or not and the amounts realized from these sources are adequate, more than *adequate* or *inadequate*. But one like me, Sir, a newcomer to such a Council, one who seldom cared to look into the budget of a bureaucratic Government antagonistic to the interest of the people of this country—one like me is really astonished when he looks to the sources of revenue upon which the administration of this presidency depends.

What are the major heads of revenue?—(1) Land Revenue, (2) Excise, (3) Stamps. Leaving aside the Land Revenue, one of the major heads of income, we find about half the estimated total income comes from the sources, existence of which depends upon the vice of the people of this country. It appears from what is stated in the budget report that the Hon'ble the Finance Member is jubilant over the increase in the revenue from Excise. It is stated that there is a steady improvement in excise

revenue. He seems to be more jolly for as it is stated the growth of this revenue has been further accelerated by the collapse of the non-co-operation movement; or in other words, Sir, the non-co-operators tried to dissuade the people from becoming addicted to drinking and that the failure of that movement has increased this revenue. Sir, though I represent in this Council the Barabazar people of Calcutta, I really live in a village in the district of Midnapore. I know full well how the agents of this Government try their best to accelerate the sale of liquor. I know how the poor Santhals lose almost all they earn in drinking *Hensa*. The sight is lamentable when one sees a *Hensa* shop on a *hat*-day in a village. The fault of the non-co-operators was to dissuade these poor men from this habit. I think hon'ble members of this Council know very well how these non-co-operators suffered at the hands of the police, the preservers of law and order. This is one of the primary sources of revenue upon which the present Government depends for its administration. Nothing seems to me to be more humiliating for a Government than to depend for its existence upon the sinful acts of the people. The Hindus and the Muhammadans who form the major portion of the population of this presidency consider it a sin to addict to drinking. The moral instinct of every member of every nationality will tell him that it is wrong to addict to drinking. But, Sir, the administration of our Province depends mostly upon the income from this source. It is not only that if more liquor is sold more revenue is realized, but when one gets drunk with the liquor provided by the precious trade of the present Government he is taken to the nearest Magisterial Court and there is another source of revenue in the shape of fines realized.

Another big head, Sir, is Stamp duty. What is it but a duty realized from the people when they want to quarrel with each other. A brother quarrels with his brother, a neighbour quarrels with his neighbour, and when he wants to settle it or to get justice he is to pay in the shape of stamp duty and the administration depends on it. If the people cease to quarrel with each other, if the people cease to be intoxicated, i.e., if the people become what they ought to be or what their well-wishers like them to be, the administrators lose about half the revenue and the administration would surely fail.

Hon'ble members were arguing furiously for not finding allotments of the sufficient portion of the revenue for the so-called nation-building departments of this Government, but I ask them—do they like to educate their children by intoxicating their fathers and their brothers and their fellow-countrymen, by introducing more quarrels amongst the people of this Province? I therefore ask the hon'ble members to scrutinise the sources of income first before they want to divide the revenue to different heads. If the reforms mean only to make the administration top-heavy, to open several departments with a large number of highly paid officers, one should like to be saved from such reforms. Where is the reform in the sources of income? Where is an administrator under this reforms to

remove these baneful sources of income and to supplement them with proper and healthy source of income? If the budget means to seek any means possible to squeeze out money from the people of this country then pass this budget and go on with your administration for the ruin of the people, but if it means to devise legitimate and proper sources of income to go on with an administration that would bring welfare of the people, I would ask this Council to throw off the budget altogether for it is not the budget of the income that ought to be the income of an healthy administration.

Bengal, Sir, is not wanting in yielding revenue, from legitimate sources. Nobody can deny that it is an agricultural province and that jute is one of the biggest agricultural produce. But the revenue realized from this agricultural source has been appropriated or if I may be permitted to say, misappropriated by the Imperial Government. Taxes on income of the people—the income derived mainly from the trades with the foreign countries—are another major source of revenue of this Province. But that is also appropriated by the Government of India. There are other natural products—the revenue derived from which sources, I do not find, have any place in the present budget. I do not know what the Hon'ble Member in charge of Finance would say, but if he agrees with me in the view that the income from excise and stamp duties should not form part of a budget for a good and healthy administration of a country, is it not his duty to say so clearly when he introduces the budget? He may say that his duty is only to place before this House a statement in the form of a budget of the existing sources of revenue and of the amounts derived therefrom without at the same time pointing out which are improper sources. But, Sir, the duty of this House is quite clear and as I have stated before, this House can only do its duty by rejecting the whole budget as it has been presented.

Dr. BIDHAN CHANDRA ROY: The annual ceremony has been gone through to a certain extent, namely, that of presenting the budget. We have been carefully listening to the speeches around the table, discussing the provisions of the budget. But with what object? If we look at the regulations under which we are acting to-day, I find that we are precluded from initiating any grant or augmenting it or transferring the provision of a grant from one head to another, following, I believe, the precedent that obtains in the Imperial Parliament, where the Crown, on the advice of his Ministers who happen to be the executive and are therefore responsible for the revenue, demand the money and the Commons grant it. As a general rule these demands are granted without any reduction, because there the executive happen to be responsible in various ways to the legislature as well as to the country. What is the remedy in our case? How can this House control the Executive? Was it, I wonder, the intention of the Government of India Act to show that the only possible and practical means by which the legislature here can have any influence over the executive is either to refuse a grant or to

reduce it, whenever the legislature wishes to make its voice felt. It is a truism, Sir, " give a man power and he is sure to abuse it " (if he does not do so, he is not a man, he is perhaps a superman) "unless there is a strong public opinion against it," and that is very well illustrated in the proceedings of the budget that has been presented to us. A part of the revenue for the ensuing year is derived from the taxes that were imposed in the year 1922. I find from the speech of the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr, as he then was, in the course of his introduction of the Taxation Bill that he promised that if the Government could secure a moderate surplus after providing for the bed-rock anticipated deficit of 90 lakhs for 1922-23 it would be possible to use this surplus for the purpose of financing a loan for capital works, thus relieving the revenue budget and further he said that the surplus would become available for those schemes of educational, sanitary and medical progress which, he was sure, the Council had as much at heart as the Hon'ble Ministers, who were charged with them, earnestly desired to see. That was a solemn promise given by one of the previous Finance Members on the authority of the promise made by His Excellency the Governor in 1921. I do not know whether the present Hon'ble Finance Member is bound by it, but I will give certain figures which, I hope, the Finance Member will not be able to refute. The closing balance of 1921-22 was Rs. 67 laks 51 thousands. The closing balance of 1922-23 was Rs. 90 lakhs and 92 thousands and that of 1923-24 was Rs. 1 crore 21 lakhs and 73 thousands and next year it is expected that the balance will be Rs. 1 crore 23 lakhs and 24 thousands. It is obvious that the surplus has gone on increasing. Where is this promise fulfilled? Then, again, I come to the other side of the picture. The expenditure has gone on increasing. In 1920-21 it was Rs. 9 crores 16 lakhs and 89 thousands; in 1921-22 it was Rs. 10 crores 48 lakhs and 22 thousands, leaving aside loan operations. In 1922-23 it was Rs. 9 crores 59 lakhs and 64 thousands and in 1924-25 it is expected to be Rs. 10 crores 31 lakhs and 79 thousands. I seriously ask if the expenditure had not been allowed to go on increasing to the extent it has? According to the assurance given by Sir John Kerr to us in 1922, could this surplus in the ordinary course be employed for any other purpose but two, viz., for floating a loan for capital accounts, and, secondly, for the provision of schemes in the transferred departments? How is the legislature at the present moment going to enforce this promise on the executive? It is a well-known fact that the Members of the Executive Government do not know and cannot know the wishes of the people. Therefore, the only way in which they are to be made cognisant of the wishes of the people is either to refuse a grant or to reduce it.

Coming to the budget itself, I find that the Hon'ble the Finance Member is very glad that he has been able to make certain retrenchments. He says in page 4 of his speech that General Administration, Administration of Justice, Irrigation, Agriculture and Public Health and Police happen to share the most important items of retrenchments.

He has deplored the fact that Rs. 12 lakhs had to be retrenched to the detriment of Police administration from the Police budget and he again says that the efficiency of the force has suffered in the absence of effective supervision. May I ask, supervision over whom? It is granted that only 13 per cent. of the people of this country are literate. A most elaborate scheme to maintain law and order would be futile if the people do now know or are not intelligent enough to understand the value of such measures. I am connected intimately with a very important educational institution and that is the Calcutta University. Mr. Mitter yesterday was eloquent in his demand for further measures to help primary and secondary education in the province; and he deplored that the Hon'ble the Finance Member was wanting in statesmanship. Now, what is the position of the University with reference to this Council? I take it that the University had been established as a constituted authority, to act on behalf of the Government whose primary duty is to provide for education and higher education for the people. The University is charged to do that duty as the agent of the Government. Therefore, if the University is wanting in funds, the Government cannot absolve itself from all liabilities with regard to that. The Calcutta University was given a certain contribution from the Imperial Government in 1912 by Lord Hardinge, who said—

> I cannot regard the present facilities for higher education, higher studies and research as at all sufficient when not a few students who wish to take the M A degree have to be turned away for want of accommodation;
> Many of our undergraduates are engaged in advanced studies and research work and it is very important that we should turn out good M A s in sufficient numbers, otherwise it will be difficult to find capable lecturers for the schools and colleges

That grant was given in 1912 and the same grant had been maintained by the Government of India and by the Bengal Government. But since 1912 Rs. 45 lakhs have been donated to the university by private benefactors. What has the Government done in response to it? I quote from Sir Henry Wheeler's speech who, with reference to the Kalimpong Homes and the Loreto Convent, said that these institutions attracted private generosity on an extensive scale and he urged eloquently that they were accordingly entitled to liberal assistance from the public funds, for, as he put it tersely—"It is a sound business transaction to encourage private liberality." I want to know what encouragement to private liberality in reference to the University has been given by this Government or by the Government of India? Only the other day, as President of the Board of Accounts of the Calcutta University, I had to refuse a modest request for Rs. 4,000 only for chemicals to be used in the Science College from Sir P. C. Ray, whose name a household word in the country and who has given up a pay of Rs. 1,000 a month in consideration of the lack of funds of the University. Mr. Mitter had warned the members of the Council and the Executive Government regarding the want of statesmanship in regard to their neglect of primary

and secondary education. I want to warn the Government as regards their want of statesmanship, so far as the question of relief to the University is concerned. With regard to the Public Health and Medical Departments in which I am most interested, it is said that a grant has been made to the extent of Rs. 1 lakh and 20 thousands for giving quinine to the different parts of the Province. Mr. G. S. Dutt said, in answer to a question, that two millions of the people had been treated during last year for malaria I am sure, if we used a little arithmetic, we would find that two millions of people could receive with this sum treatment for three days only. Everyone knows that a persistent treatment for even three months will not drive malaria out of the system. Therefore, it is only a tinkering process. It helps nobody. I find there is a good deal of want of water-supply in the Province. I am told that the heart of the Government has changed but the adamantine heart of Mr. Donald has not changed. However, water has come out of stone to the extent that a provision of Rs. 50,000 has been made for rural water-supply. I belong to a small village in East Bengal, where last year we had occasion to re-excavate one tank and the cost was Rs. 1,000; so if Rs. 50,000 be provided, it will meet the cost of excavating 50 tanks and if each tank provides water for 500 people, so Rs. 50,000 will relieve 25,000 people from the scarcity of water out of a population of 42 millions of people who reside in villages in different parts of the Province. But water scarcity is not all. A great uneasiness has become manifest in India. There is a good deal of discomfort in the Province and it is no good hiding our heads in the sands. There is some rise of temperature, a good deal of delirious talk naturally follows. If we apply the ordinary methods of diagnosis and treatment to the body politic that a practitioner generally does with regard to the human body, we shall find that the countless millions of the people in India are engaged daily in a grim struggle against death and disease. This disease means poverty and poverty brings disease in its train. There is a vicious circle. More than five millons of people suffer the death penalty every year from preventable diseases. Many days of work are lost yearly by each worker due to the same cause and a very large number are left maimed for life. These are facts which can be ascertained by reference to the health figures. This state of affairs is so miserable that it is only the anodyne of fatalism that has enabled the people to endure suffering with resignation. Let us not forget that the treatment of disease is costing the country a large sum of money yearly. Whenever any demand is made by the people for the expenditure of more money for medical relief, the poverty of the province is put forward as a plea but poverty is to a great extent due to the preventable diseases. It would be an irony of fate if India is unable to pay for the remedies needed to restore her to health and prosperity. The countries that have done so and deliberately purchased health have made a splendid bargain even from the business point of

view. Control the preventable diseases, increase the productive power, the finances of India will be placed on a satisfactory footing. Sir, that is the message of awakened India. The responsibilities of the Government of India and the Secretary of State and their local advisers are great; as sure as day follows night, they will have to give an account of their stewardship to the people of the country. They will ask why large sums of money are being spent on the ineffective efforts which are directed to soothe the sufferings of the injured rather than seeking and destroying the enemy. Let them remember that the first principle of warfare is to seek out the enemy—the causes of the preventable diseases. Make out an organised plan of campaign against them and the enemy of the crying millions will be stifled. Neglect it and the country will be prepared to fight against the present order of things; and if they fight, they will be right

Mr. TARIT BHUSAN ROY: I regret I am unable to offer any congratulations on the budget which has been presented for the years 1924 and 1925 although it appears to be a surplus budget. It is no doubt true that the budget shows a very small surplus but if we consider the sources of the revenue we find that the revenue has increased during the last three years by about a crore and forty lakhs, out of which it appears that fifty-six lakhs represent the increase in our Stamp revenues and thirty-two lakhs represent the increase in Amusement taxation, leaving aside the revenue from the Court-fees. It is therefore quite clear that the surplus budget as it now stands is mainly due to the increase of revenue from the burden imposed upon the people by taxation as stated above as well as to the temporary relief which has been given to the Province of Bengal by the Government of India by remitting the annual contribution of sixty-three lakhs This being the position it is doubtful whether any one can exult over the surplus in the budget. It may therefore be observed that the growth of revenues depending as it does mainly upon extra taxation is more or less uncertain. No one can deny the well-known fact that the ordinary requirements of solvent finance demand that the normal growth of expenditure should not be allowed to go beyond the normal rate of growth of revenue. It is no exaggeration to say that our finances are in a bad condition. Taxation has always been odious and nowhere is it more so than in a country where according to the illustrious authors of the Montford report the utmost taxable capacity has been reached. One is bound to recognise the plain fact that the imposition of burdensome taxation upon an impoverished country is calculated to give rise to discontent. It is a well-known fact that for efficient and good administration even the Provincial services have been tampered. I have always been an ardent advocate of economy and retrenchment. Economy is necessary in every country but more than anywhere else is it necessary to-day in Bengal which has failed and refused to reconcile itself to the inequitable financial adjustment which has necessitated the

imposition of burdensome taxation upon the people. Already there is a widespread feeling for repealing the taxation measures which were inaugurated some time ago. I believe it is in contemplation to put an end to the Amusement Tax. It is a painful yet undeniable fact that the constitutional changes have cast burdens far beyond the financial capacities of the Province. I will in this connection merely refer to the following weighty words used by His Excellency the Governor on the 30th March, 1922—

> I have a sincere desire to see the success of the new Act and I agree with you that it has but a small chance of success if its only visible fruits in early years are an increase of officials and heavier burden of taxation.

In fact Mr. Campbell Forrester has already given notice of resolution for exempting theatres, cinemas and other forms of entertainments such as dances, exhibitions, etc., from the liability of an entertainment tax.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member has been pleased to observe in his budget speech that Excise revenue has been going in well with the improvement of administration and what is more under the present conditions and with the improved means of administration Excise would still further increase. He has anticipated a further increase of six lakhs under this head. May I ask is it desirable that our revenues should increase by cultivating the habit of intemperance of the people? Any increase of revenue from Excise is an unmistakable evidence of the fact that the people have been addicted to drunkenness and other incidental vices which are bound to lead to lawlessness and crimes. Although Excise has been characterised as one of the main sources of income of Government it cannot be denied that it is one of the most undesirable sources which it is the duty of Government to check and control as much as possible for the benefit of the society as well as the rulers and the ruled.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member has stated that although our expenditure falls just short of our income it has been decided to embark on new schemes which are urgent and important for administration, development and progress and that a sum of Rs. 88,00,000 of the balances have been ear-marked for this purpose out of which thirty-six lakhs in the budget represent the first instalment of expenditure. It is very unfortunate that while the nation-building departments like Education, Local Self-Government, Sanitation and Public Health are starving, the largest portion of the said small sum of thirty-six lakhs has been assigned to the reserved side of the administration. I do not propose to go into the details at the present moment, but it is sufficient to say that in the present state of our country and the conditions of the people who are dying not by thousands or tens of thousands but by hundreds of thousands every year from malaria and kala-azar, who are suffering from high prices of food-grains, scarcity of good drinking water in the rural areas, not to speak of the appalling ravages of water-hyacinth it is fair and just that in any event 50 per cent. of the revenues should be allocated to the nation-building departments.

It is a pity that in the name of economy and retrenchment a large cut has been made in education to the extent of one lakh eighty-five thousands. I am surprised to find that even the small grant of three lakhs to the Calcutta University has been stopped. I cannot believe that our Education Minister, the Hon'ble Maulvi Fazl-ul Huq, could persuade himself to lend his support to such a course. I hope he will tell us as to why even the grant of such a sum of three lakhs has been denied to the Calcutta University in the budget.

Public Health is far more important than Education inasmuch as the people have got to live and be healthy before they can think of education. Are the grants made to this important department adequate? The only answer that can be given is "No."

The country has a right to demand an equitable readjustment of the allocation of revenues between the reserved and the transferred departments inasmuch as the former are pampered at the expense of the latter which have been starving all along. Unless this is done at once to enable the transferred departments to take immediate action for saving the health and life of the people from the inroads of preventable diseases and pestilence, chronic famine and water scarcity, and from the terrible ravages of water-hyacinth, the situation will become perilous.

It is a well-known fact that a deficit has been converted into a surplus in the budget by increasing the revenue mainly by new taxation namely, increased stamp Court-fees and by taxing amusements. This being so, we fail to understand why the policy of rigid economy and retrenchments in accordance with the report of the Retrenchment Committee at any rate should not be not only scrupulously but relentlessly pursued.

It is an undeniable fact that the administration is top-heavy and that the establishment charges are very heavy and there are large non-voted items even in the transferred departments. I urge that the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee should be strictly followed.

I would urge upon the Government to deal with the needs of the country with real and large-hearted sympathy. The hot weather is coming, and there will be cries of anguish from all over the country for supply of water. The water-hyacinth is choking up our waters and water courses. I trust Government will lend no deaf ear to the cries of our people and will make substantial attempts to alleviate misery.

Babu ROMES CHANDRA BACCHI: Ever since the Councils came into existence budget debates and discussions on the yearly statements of revenue and expenditure are being held in Council Chambers of our Government, but in spite of these, the country is still poorer than the rest of the world, its inhabitants are still immersed in ignorance and illiteracy, and are being carried away by thousands every year by malaria and other preventible diseases, its agriculture still in its primitive stages,

its industries all gone, the country being a field for foreign exploitation, its sons dishonoured and despised at home and abroad, and the administration of the country still another name for foreign exploitation and foreign domination.

Still, the budgets are helpful in this way that they give once a year, an opportunity to the people to have a look at the policy of the Government in the governance of the country. What are the policies as reflected in this year's budget? The first policy is that the system must be carried on at a ruinous cost in the most extravagant way, not in the interest of the people, but in the interest of the governing class. The Hon'ble the Finance Member gives us the figure 10 crores 32 lakhs and 28 thousands to be next year's revenue, and of this amount about 5 crores 34 lakhs 56 thousands and 900 are to be spent in the shape of pay of officers and establishment and their allowances. I have intentionally left out the contingencies which, if brought into calculation, will leave very little for the people. Again, in the budget of 1904-1905 Rs. 65 lakhs were allotted for the police for the provinces of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and in 1924-25 we find one crore and 84 lakhs 68 thousand for the police of Bengal only, which is in excess of last year's revised allotment by 9 lakhs and 44 thousands. The Retrenchment Committee's recommendations were treated with scant courtesy in this as in other matters. The Reforms Act, with all the seeming good intentions of its framers, cannot help us in the least. What is the reason? Because the policy of the Government is more to keep the people, with the help of the pampered police, in constant dread of the ruling power, than to keep their life and property safe and under protection.

The leaders of the people, Sir, have raised their voices on numerous occasions and from various platforms against this ruinously extravagant system of Government, quite unsuited to a poor country like ours. But ours has been a cry in the wilderness, and departments after departments have been added to the system making it the most top-heavy and notoriously costly system of the world. The only remedy is the complete Indianisation of the services in all departments and making the Executive responsible to the Legislature. But there is no scope for this change, under the present constitution, so the whole of it has to be changed.

Now, Sir, as ours is pre-eminently an agricultural country its main resources coming from the land, let me consider the item of agriculture in the budget. In order to understand the true nature and object of this department and what account has the department, so far given for its existence, it is necessary to have a peep into the past history of our country.

I shall be very brief. It is not unknown to students of history that at the very dawn of the British Rule in this country a great famine visited this unfortunate land, commonly known as the Manuantar of 1176 which carried away about half the population of Bengal. On the 21st October,

1791, the Government passed some rules for repairing the embankments, for encouraging digging of tanks, reservoirs and water-courses so that a sufficient portion of the crops may be preserved in season of drought or inundation for the subsistence of the people and consequently the recurrence of the miseries which the country has so often suffered from, may be prevented. The rules provided for granting advances to proprietors, farmer, dependent talukdars and raiyats for making embankments, tanks, reservoirs and water-courses because the Government thought at that time and I think they did so rightly, that by making the cultivators free from the uncertainties of nature at times when monsoon ceases or the lands become inundated by heavy rainfall a considerable advancement would be made in increasing the resources of an agricultural country like ours. History is silent as to how far progress was made under these rules. But we find, that these rules afterwards embodied in the Regulation 33 of 1793 were subsequently modified and made for all practical purposes nugatory, by the Regulations of 1806 and 1829, because I think the compelling circumstances of 1789-90 were not present at that time. Next I come to the famine of 1873-74. It was due, as then the Lieutenant-Governor Sir George Campbell observed, entirely to the failure of the monsoon of 1873. A commission was appointed, the report was submitted in 1881 and the Commissioners, among other things, recommended better methods of cultivation and means for the improvement of agriculture. The Secretary of State sanctioned the starting of the Agriculture Department for the general improvement of agriculture with a view to increasing the food supplies and the general resources of the people. The Agricultural Department was started with two civilians and one deputy collector which I think, has gradually developed to its present formidable dimensions with a Minister at the head and with the Director, Deputy Director and host of other gazetted and non-gazetted officers; but in spite of the professed attempts on the part of the Government from 1793 to the present date has a real agricultural problem in the country been solved? Has Indian agriculture been improved in the least? And have the resources of the poor raiyats been increased to any appreciable extent. Have the lands been made free from the ravages of inundation or have they got now sufficient water in their canals, water courses, tanks and reservoirs so that they may safely fall back upon them whenever a monsoon fails or their lands become inundated? The answer is an emphatic "No" and is sufficiently given by the North Bengal flood of the last year.

Will you still persist, Sir, in making us believe in the hollowness of promises made by our rulers? Let me now turn to the next year's budget. It shows an amount of Rs. 10,71,000 for agriculture, out of which Rs. 4,60,000 to go to the pockets of the officers as pay, establishment charges and allowances; Rs. 2,95,000 are set apart as contingencies; Rs. 1,15,334 are meant for the Botanical Garden, and Rs. 2,00,200

are left to agricultural and sericultural improvement of a country having an area of 76,843 square miles and a rural population of 43,509,236.

If we turn to the history of sanitary improvement of this country the same story has to be repeated. The first warning to the Government as regards the sanitary condition of this country came in 1862 in the shape of what is known as the Burdwan Fever. A Comission was appointed as is customary with our Government, the commissioners, one of whom was Raja Digambar Mitter, recommended improvements of the drainage of the country obstructed by silting up of rivers and khals, and I think the same view is also held to-day by the present Director of Public Health. But has any practical step since 1862 been seriously taken to remove silt from our rivers and water courses? So far as my knowledge goes, all the rivers of the Rajshahi Division and the Ganges to a large extent have become completely silted up, and if I remember aright, the other day the hon'ble member from Rajshahi tried to get an answer from Government on a question as to the dredging of the Boral river. In my district the river Kalindri, a branch from the Ganges to the Mahananda, has become almost silted up and the Mahananda itself is fast approaching the same state. Sir, the other hon'ble members will say their own say, but I am certain that none of them will be able to give a brighter picture of rural Bengal than I have tried to give. This question of public health and sanitation leads me naturally to the question of water-supply and the supply of quinine. Sir, I find in the budget estimate that cinchona plantation is a reserved part of transferred subject, "Industry". It was, Sir, in 1862 that the plantation was started with a view to supply the hospitals and the people with the chief remedy for malarious fever. In 1878 it yielded a profit of Rs. 11,000 and the Hon'ble the Finance Member estimates the probable profit in 1924-25 to be more than Rs. 5,00,000. Sir, cannot the Government make quinine and cinchona febrituge a little more cheap? And should they not ear-mark the profit for anti-malarial measures only? It is our distress out of which this profit is being made, as our helplessness makes us a prey to foreign exploitation in various directions. As regards the question of rural water-supply, I need only to bring to the notice of the House, that the budget makes a provision of Rs. 50,000 for the purpose. There are 84,981 villages in Bengal and it is mockery to think each village quenching its thirst for pure drinking water with annas 9 and pies 4 only.

The question of primary education has a history from 1872, if not earlier. I am not going into it now. But what I bring to the special notice of the House, is that after 52 years we find only 9 per cent. of her population approaching any appreciable degree of literacy, and if the same progress is maintained, we shall be able to come up to the same level with other civilised nations of the world only after a period of 550 years and not before. The education budget is less than the revised estimate by about Rs. 2,00,000. The principle of this curtailment is to be found, I think, in the earnestness of the Government to keep up the rate

of progress hitherto maintained. It is surprising to find that the Government which can provide one lakh of rupees for the mosquito nets of the police cannot give a grant of more than Rs. 1,15,000 to the Calcutta University though in urgent need of funds.

Let me again revert to the question of primary and secondary education of this province. In the budget estimates we find that the Government have allotted Rs. 4,41,000 for primary education and Rs. 6,90,000 for secondary education of European and Anglo-Indian boys. Assuming primary school age to be from 5 to 10 years and secondary school age to be from 10 to 18 years, we find by referring to the last census reports that no more than 1,250 boys and girls of 5 to 10 years of age and 998 boys and girls of 10 to 18 years can take advantage of such grants. Again Government have allotted Rs. 23,04,000 for primary education and Rs. 19,32,000 for secondary education of Indian boys and girls. The same census report gives us the figures 7,488,228 and 7,731,062 as the number of boys and girls between 5 to 10 and 10 to 18 years respectively. It is matter of simple calculation to find out, that while Government mean to spend Rs. 352 for each European and Anglo-Indian boy and girl for the primary education, Rs. 900 for their secondary education, each Indian body and girl cannot expect to get more than annas 4 and pies 9 for his primary and annas 4 for his secondary education. I think any comment on this is needless. The magnitude of the task of educating so many of our boys and girls is very great I admit, but the Government by continued neglect of all our interests, have aggravated the situation so much, that any more delay in grappling with these vital problems, in true spirit, upon the true solution of which our very existence depends, will be fraught with dangerous possibilities.

Now, Sir, after what I have said I think none will be surprised if we and the people of the country at our back, have a deep distrust of the real intention of the Government in matters vitally concerning our welfare and we are now determined to throw out the budgets. We find the present constitution to be too rigid and too costly and too unreal, to claim any support from the people. We have got Toy-Ministers and they have got their departments too, but they can give us also nothing but toys in the shape of small boons. We, as of right, claim a real power to control the policy of the Government in the governance of our country and until that is gained all our strength will be exerted in the best of manners, which will bring us every day nearer our goal and make our progress surer at every step.

Adjournment.

There being no quorum present, the Council adjourned till 3 P.M. on Thursday, the 28th February, 1924, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 28th February, 1924, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President in the Chair, the four Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council, two Hon'ble Ministers (the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq and the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Ghuznavi), and 113 nominated and elected members.

Oath.

Babu Jogendra Nath Mitra made an affirmation of his allegiance to the Crown.

Discussion of the Budget of the Government of Bengal for 1924-25.

Babu NALINI RANJAN SARKAR: I regret I cannot congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member on his performance this year. But at the same time I must say that I am not in the least surprised at it. The Hon'ble Member is the victim of a soulless system which grinds slowly but surely, and I would add, relentlessly. My hon'ble friend, Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy, has regretted that the adamantine heart of Mr. Donald has not changed, but he forgets that it is not the adamantine heart of Mr. Donald that is manifest but the steel hand of his bureaucratic framework. Adamant and steel alike would have melted if the Government of which they form the bulwarks, had been accountable to the children of the soil. Mr. Donald belongs to the Reserved side of the administration and is not responsible for his actions to the people who are bled to pay him (together with his compeers in the heaven-born service) the not unsubstantial salary which has attracted him to this "Land of Regrets." He has no need to worry about the vital interests of the people as under the steel-frame administration of this country those who pay the piper cannot call for the tune. And I fully agree with Mr. Chintamoni, who, when he had once been entrusted with the administration of a Transferred Department in a sister Province, had said, "The misfortunes of the Finance Department, being particularly a reserved department, began to be felt and it was only by continual struggle that the transferred departments were able to get even a part of the funds required for development. The smallest concessions were of the nature of the extraction of a tooth by surgical operation." The

anomlay of a joint purse precludes the possibility of the Ministers getting what they want. Unless and until this preposterous system is ended or mended the Ministers in charge of Transferred subject, the "connecting links" as the Hon'ble Mr. Fazl-ul Huq would say, between the Government and the people, must remain in an awkward predicament. We sympathise with them in their position, which is as painful to their countrymen as it must be galling to their own sense of self-respect, dumb spectators as they are of the fight between the peoples' representatives and the bureaucracy. They cannot change the system which they have to work. They cannot reduce the strength of the superior services nor the salaries of their so-called subordinates. By far the greater portion of the money allotted to them is swallowed up in paying for the paraphernalia of the administration and little or nothing is left for really useful work in the nation-building departments.

As for us, the members of the Council, what powers have even we got? We have no effective control over the supplies in so far as the reserved side is concerned as the expenditure can be reinstated by certification. We are faced with a board with the words "keep off the grass" if any attempt is made to touch the reserved side. Can we change the destination of a grant or increase it? We can only reduce or refuse our assent to a grant and not even that in the case of the large amounts which are non-voted.

So, unless and until full control over the purse is achieved, our protest, however stentorian, is bound to be a voice in the wilderness. The Reformed budgets of the last three years have been practically deficit-budgets as admitted by the Hon'ble the Finance Member. In the first year the mainstay was the drawing upon the Provincial balances which were accumulated in pre-Reform days owing to restrictions on beneficent expenditure during the war. During the second and the third year the increased taxation and the remission of the contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs to the Central Government barely saved the situation.

The so-called equilibrium arrived at this year is a delusion. It is bolstered up on the three shaky legs of over-estimate of revenue, reduction in the allotments to the Agriculture and Industries Departments, and remission in the contribution to the Central Government. It is not safe to build our castles on the quicksand of the generosity of the Government of India which bids fair to give way to the pressure of its own burdens this year. Taxation has reached its maximum limit and a dejected and dying people cannot be taxed any further. If this is the position, how are you to attend to the primary needs of the Province—Education and Sanitation, Agricultural Improvement and Development of Industries—by which alone any real amelioration in the lot of the people can be effected?

Unless he Meston Award which is responsible for the appropriation by the Central Government of about Rs. 20 crores a year or 70 per cent.

of the taxes realised in Bengal, is readjusted, not in the shape of a remission of this year's contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs alone, but by a radical re-estimate of the proportion of such contribution we cannot hope for much. What is more, the very system of administration is not suited to the conditions of the country. Unless that system is changed it is useless to talk of nation-building departments, as under it a huge portion of our resources inevitably stands mortgaged to the services and buildings and other paraphernalia of a foreign administration. That is why, even the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee have not been loyally carried out, and the actual figures contradict the statement made by the Hon'ble the Finance Member that the Government have strained every nerve to retrench expenditure. The Sir Rajendra Committee recommended a cut of about Rs. 1 crore 90 lakhs. Even if a reduction is made of Rs. 1 crore per year (which represents a reduction of less than 10 per cent. of the total estimated expenditure) the Government would be in a position to raise a loan of Rs. 10 to 12 crores and provide for its redemption in 20 or 25 years out of such savings and could utilize the same in solving the pressing problem of water scarcity, and making a good start towards meeting the other primary needs of the people. But where is the sincerity, where is the earnestness, where is the feeling of common brotherhood which can inspire such a policy in our rulers, and thereby impel them to an anxious consideration of retrenchment possibilities? Their one excuse always is loss of efficiency. Sir Robert Peel has said, "In time of peace, you must, if you mean to retrench, incur some risk," but all such wise counsel is of no avail where our irresponsible and self-sufficient bureaucracy is concerned.

Fancy a benevolent Government allotting only Rs. 50,000 as a provision for the improvement of rural water-supply for upwards of three crores of Bengalis who succumb to cholera at the rate of 9 per hour, whereas the cots and mosquito curtains for police constables absorb a full lakh of rupees. Then again, Rs. 50,000 has been allotted (under a promise, thanks to the Minister in charge, of being a recurring grant) to anti-malarial measures. We can very well imagine the Angel of Death carrying on its ravages at the rate of 160 per hour and snapping its fingers at these heroic efforts made by the Government to combat the ruinous progress of malaria which is converting a once smiling countryside into howling wildernesses. It is, indeed, a sad spectacle that you find in the villages of Bengal, specially heart-rending to such as myself, who have their roots struck deep in their village homes. The bold peasantry who were the country's pride have been reduced to emaciated apathetic drudges. Cartloads of Blue Books cannot cover up the terrible fact of the awful havoc that is being caused by malaria, kala-azar and scarcity of drinking water, the two former cutting down innocent souls at the rate of 84 per hour. Even with this tragic situation staring us in the face, I cannot but commend the abstract sense of consistency which impels the Government to make provision for a lump grant of Rs. 1 lakh

for quarters for nurses of the Presidency General Hospital, in view of the fact that they have likewise provided quarters for married European sergeants. The Finance Member seems to have taken credit for allotting Rs. 2 lakhs 20 thousand for malaria, kala-azar and quinine, but this amount we know is obtained by exploiting the distress of the poor suffering people who really contribute this sum by consuming quinine which is estimated to yield a net saving of Rs. 2 lakhs 19 thousand as revealed in the accounts appertaining to cinchona plantations.

As pointed out by the Hon'ble the Finance Member, there has admittedly been a slight increase of allotment for the nation-building departments, just to save the face of the Government, as it were, but the distribution of the amounts under the several heads, far from being in keeping with the needs of the people, is only another indication of bureaucratic misadjustment, due to the high-handedness which goes with the lofty aloofness of their vision.

If we examine the Budget allotment under the heading of "Medical" we find the same obsession persisting throughout. Thus, out of Rs. 58,35,000 only Rs. 22,38,000 goes for hospitals and dispensaries and of the latter only Rs. 3 lakhs 39 thousand for the mufassal hospitals and dispensaries, i.e., a sum of about Rs. 54,000 less than the actuals of 1922-23, while the bulk remains for the Presidency Hospital in spite of the more urgent rural needs. Though a sum of Rs. 22,000 has been allotted for a Medical School at Mymensingh, Rs. 1 lagh 18 thousand has been granted to various nursing institutes and associations patronised by people wealthy enough to pay for their own favourite scheme (apart from the contribution of Rs. 1 lakh towards the establishment of a nurses' quarters referred to above) entailing a total cost of Rs. 3 lakhs.

In 1921-22 Rs. 7,43,000 and odd was spent for Lunatic Asylums, in 1922-23 Rs. 8 lakhs 12 thousand and odd, in 1923-24 Rs. 8 lakhs 19 thousands and the next budget allots Rs. 12 lakhs 25 thousands, *i.e.*, more than Rs. 4 lakhs of the actuals of 1922-23. The magnificent arrangements, the luxurious grandeur and the sublime atmosphere of the Ranchi Mental Hospital for which 75 per cent. of next year's allotment goes may well tempt us, malaria-stricken, starving people, to pose as lunatics and enjoy the amenities of a lunatics life. Or is this solicitude for dementia but a symptom of the fate which a just providence has in store for the bureaucracy itself?

Out of about Rs. 19 lakhs granted for public health purposes more than Rs. 10 lakhs represents grants to towns people only. Grants are asked for the water-supply scheme of Noakhali and the sewerage scheme of Dacca and sundry other town-improvement projects These may be laudable undertakings but how many men will be benefited by them, while thousands, nay, millions suffer in silence in rural areas, a suffering which should be the first anxiety of a civilised Government.

Education has suffered a cut of Rs. 1 lakh and 85 thousand as against the revised estimate for the year 1923-24. This may strike many as having affected both the reserved and transferred sides of the department. Practically, however, it is not so. The cut has been made in the transferred side to fatten the allotments on the reserved side which is responsible for European and Anglo-Indian education. Out of a total of Rs. 90 lakhs 30 thousand, provided for secondary, primary and special education, including direction and supervision, Rs. 13 lakhs 64 thousand goes to the reserved department catering for an Anglo-Indian and European population of about 445 thousand and the balance of Rs. 76,66,000 to the transferred subjects to meet the requirements of a population of about 4 crores 20 lakhs, whereas in every other civilised Government the end of every budget is the greatest good to the greatest number. I would like to point out here that I fully realize the proper claims of important minorities, that cannot however be made a ground of showing undue favouritism to a certain section while most important and pressing needs rot. The ever-increasing salaries of the ever-expanding departments, the British character of the administration, law and order, public buildings—these are the things money must be found for, and the reserved department sits tight over the money guarded over-jealously by the Finance Member; or, to put it in the pithy words of a reputed journalist: "The Dyarchy rests on Law and Order, Brick and Mortar, and expensive supervision."

Out of the total estimated revenue of Rs. 10,32,28,000, Rs. 3,33,50,000 or more than 32 per cent. goes towards the maintenance of law and order and Rs. 1,20,04,000 or more than 11 per cent. without taking into consideration the huge amount as steam launch charges shown in ports and pilotage is absorbed under the name of general administration. The total allotment in the nation-building departments of education, sanitation, agriculture and industries is about Rs. 2,49,00,000 or about 23 per cent. of the total revenue. The personal and household expenses of His Excellency the Governor, the Military Secretary, the A.-D.-C.'s (of whom an extra one is to be added next year), their clerks and attendants, travelling expenses, the band establishment and the Body-guard will cost the State nearly Rs. 11 lakhs. The Body-guard is a relic of an autocratic régime which is long dead and gone and this as well as other paraphernalia of the Governor are neither of any practical use, nor will they serve any longer to bolster up the prestige which this kind of budgetting so effectually destroys. The Premier of England has recently shown the way to true dignity by travelling third class.

To be brief, Sir, the system has got to be mended, and mended from top to bottom, or ended. There can be no *via media*. No patchwork, no white-washing, no tinkering will do. This state of affairs—of pampered servicemen, of a top-heavy administration, of a bloated bureaucracy—and the helpless condition of starving millions will be repeated

from year to year, unless and until we have got full responsible Government where the executive are responsible to the legislature. Political lollypops and civic lozenges can no longer satisfy the growing consciousness of the people who are being ground down under the Juggannath Car of the present hybrid system of dyarchy—a sorry child whose parrentage no one seems willing to acknowledge.

Small cuts here and there can do no appreciable good. The system has to be changed and provincial autonomy with full powers vested in the Legislatures should be established. Towards that end we should unitedly strive. The Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan may call the only method by which under existing circumstances we can hope to get it, a negation or cessation of Government, but that method is the only constitutional means left to us since we are convinced that the hitherto pursued "co-operative waiting and patience" method is a played out game. And I appeal to this Council to make a beginning with the present budget and stop the supplies, if necessary, in order to convince the Government of the urgency of changing the system and replacing it by one suited to the requirements of the people of the country as distinct from the requirements of a foreign bureaucracy.

The ex-Professor and my revered friend, Mr. S. C. Mukerji, has discovered intellectual bankruptcy among us, the Swarajists. I cannot but congratulate him on this great discovery to which his transfer from the cool cloistered life of Serampore to the hot and dusty atmosphere of the Alipore Criminal Court must have helped him. The monopoly of intellect is in the bureaucracy. The bureaucracy has nominated Mr. Mukerji, *Ergo*, Mr. Mukerji is an intellectual giant. Nothing could be more self-evident, and we must hide our diminished heads in order to repress our titters.

There are others amongst the members of this Council, who are horror-stricken at the idea of constitutional obstruction and imagine a reign of terror if the policy of obstruction is pursued, but, alas! they have misread the Britishers. They are like the date-tree of Bengal which does not yield its sweetness until it is repeatedly hammered at. For myself I am convinced that there is nothing like a good constitutional hammering to bend them to mend.

Babu KHAGENDRA NATH GANGULY: Yesterday and the day before we heard a chorus of congratulations as also some trenchant criticisms in respect of the budget estimates for the ensuing year. For my part I must confess that I cannot consistently with my own self-respect or the self-respect of my countrymen add my voice to those of the congratulators nor do I feel equal to the task of adequately criticising the details of an elaborate budget. In going through the pages of the budget, within the short space of time at our disposal, I find that there is absolutely no justification for the robust optimism of the Hon'ble the Finance Member. In fact, all those important problems of Bengal, viz.,

eradication of malaria, spread of primary education and the supply of good drinking water to people have not been properly or rather most shabbily provided for. Well, Gentlemen, if you question why—then all I can say is that the budget is framed by a set of persons who neither care for nor are anxious about the weals and woes of the people in general. These bureaucrats steeped in prejudice against the best interests and aspirations of the children of the soil know not or do not care to know the ways and means of benefiting the people whom they govern. I am honestly of opinion that these debates and discussions on the budget are mere mock discussions and what has been decided on by the bureaucrats will be carried out in spite of this farce of a long-drawn debate. These are to my mind mere antiquated methods of perpetuating a form of administration which is tremendously expensive and to which the people administered have no real voice. Our predecessors in this Council indulged in long speeches, set in beautiful phrases during the budget debates and we the second productions of the Reformed constitution are asked to carry on a similar wordy warfare, but may I enquire of the members of the House how it advances the cause of Swaraj to which we are pledged. My conviction is that instead of advancing our cause, this sort of eye-washing gloss of a fracical budget over which we have no substantial control and which does not fit in with the real necessities of the masses is likely to retard our progress.

Let me deal with some of the figures. At the outset permit me to state that there has been no serious attempt to reduce the cost of the administration—the same reckless and expensive administration is maintained as was done in the first three years of the Reform régime. Several of the previous speakers have referred to the top-heavy nature of the administration and I do not want to go over the same beaten track, but all I can say is that if some of these high offices were done away with and I believe that some of them are really sinecure—then large funds could be available for works of public utility. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has tried to be optimistic and tried further to pacify the members of the House by informing them that considerable provisions have been made for what have been euphemistically called the nation-building departments.

Take the Department of Education. The expenditure on education in the current year is Rs. 124 lakhs and odd, while the next year's provision is only Rs. 122 lakhs and odd—that means to say that the Government are providing Rs. 2 lakhs less than the present provision. Why? The explanation is that a grant of Rs. 3 lakhs to the Calcutta University is proposed to be discontinued and retrenchment is effected in Government secondary and primary schools; and from the surpluses, grants have been carried on to the reserved side. Well, can there be anything more inequitable and can there be any clearer demonstration of the truth that

bureaucracy are absolutely irresponsive to popular views, nay, antagonistically disposed towards people's interests. Why should the poor University of Calcutta which is suffering from financial stringency be deprived of the grant of Rs. 3 lakhs. As Mr. P. C. Mitter so eloquently described day before yesterday these actions exhibit an utter want of responsibility in the members of the Government. Neither is there any justification for treating the Government secondary and primary schools in a miserly way, the consequence of which will be the closing of some of them. In any case the sacred cause of education should not have been handicapped in this way.

Let me now deal with the question of the provision for ensuring the health of the people of the Province. Every one of us knows how the fell disease malaria is depopulating this fair Province of Bengal and how in place of prosperous villages the ghastly sight of deserted homesteads meets our eyes on every side. Our benign Government has provided with unexampled generosity the princely sum of Rs. 50,000 for anti-malarial measures, and a similar sum has been allotted for anti-kala-azar campaign. Well, if the members responsible for framing the budget provisions lay the flattering unctions to their souls that these provisions are adequate or anything near the mark, I can only say that either they are extremely credulous themselves or believe that the people in general would swallow any bait thrown at them. All I can urge is that it is not only inadequate but this petty amount can meet the needs of one district only if there is a sincere desire on the part of the Government to tackle the problem of malaria.

As a representative of the municipal areas of Howrah, I would be failing in my duty to my constituency if I were not to express my deep sense of disappointment at the action of the Government in making no arrangements for the introduction of the Howrah Improvement Trust Bill, although there was a definite assurance on the part of the Hon'ble the Minister in the last Council that the matter would be taken in hand in the near future. The town of Howrah is in urgent need of improvement but the finances of our municipality are not equal to the task of taking up such improvements on a large scale. Calcutta and Howrah are so closely connected with each other that unless the operations of the Improvement Trust are extended to Howrah, much of the effect of the improvement undertaken in Calcutta will be nullified by the condition of things prevailing in Howrah. In answer to a question on the subject by me, the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government said "The financial proposals involved in the creation of the Trust depend partly on the settlement of the finances of the new Howrah Bridge, and no definite statement can therefore be made as to when Government will be in a position to introduce the proposed Howrah Improvement Trust Bill into the Council." Sir, if this is not shelving the matter I do not know what it is. In fact, the Government would far prefer to launch on

a costly type of bridge of, perhaps, doubtful utility to undertaking a scheme of improvement to which it is pledged from before.

I am loth to repeat the same dismal tale told by many of the previous speakers regarding provision for the police, provision for the education of Anglo-Indian boys and similar other subjects which do not reflect credit to the framers of the budget, but I certainly do want to point out that however much the Government may put on the cloak of "law and order" the ugly truth peeps out that the Government has to be carried on not for the benefit or advantage of the people of the Province, but absolutely with an eye to the gain and ultimate advantage of the present rulers of the land. If we could once clearly grasp that conception of the truth then all the inner significance of these so-called discussions could be at once understood. To make my position quite clear, I would but cite only one instance which would at once show the iniquities we are suffering from. In the town of Howrah and its neighbourhood, the Railway Company wanted large quantities of land for the extension of their quarters and curiously enough the Company chose lands which contained the ancestral homesteads of hundreds of middle-class men. The Government at the instigation of the Company set the operations of the elastic Land Acquisition Act and in spite of the protests and lamentations of the residents their land and dwelling houses have been compulsorily acquired for inadequate compensations. That is the type of mentality which pervades throughout, and however much we may fret, fume, argue or pray, the adamantine hearts of the rulers can never change. I, therefore, repeat again that the budget provisions are not made and not intended to be made with an eye to the eradication of malaria, cholera, kala-azar and other preventible diseases from the Province, nor are they made with a view to improve the economic condition of the people—they are framed with the sole object of maintaining the prestige and self-interest of the bureaucracy intact.

I do not want to detain the House with further comments on the budget, but I want to conclude with this solemn warning that the tinkering processes in the words of Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy, adopted in respect of the important subjects of the transferred side can never satisfy the popular representatives in the Council and we regard the Budget as not only disappointing and inequitable but falling far below expectations. To crown all comes the message from Lord Olivier, the Secretary of State for India, that the British Government were not prepared to accept the recommendations of a Round Table Conference which means in other words that the same kind of miserable autocratic Government will continue, a position which the Indians are not prepared to accept.

Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR: May I speak in Bengali, Mr. President?

Mr. PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Mr. H. E. A. Cotton): I don't think I can allow you. The rule, rule 14, says that any member who is not fluent in English may speak in the vernacular. I know very well that you are one of the most intellectually gifted members of the Council, and I certainly would not care to affront you by suggesting that you are not fluent in English.

Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR: Very well, Sir, but I shall not be responsible for any mistakes in my speech.

At the very outset I must frankly tell the House that unlike many of my colleagues I did not think it worth the trouble to go through the budget so ably presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Member. I am absolutely sure that as long as he is amongst us to preserve the British character of the administration and as its necessary corollary to sit tight on the purse, the British character of the budget, as it is understood in this country, will also be preserved. And this has amply been proved by the learned speeches delivered by the members of this House with so much assiduity and perseverance.

When I learnt from their speeches that the Government wanted to set apart fifty thousand rupees for anti-malarial measures, I thought the Government which declared itself not to be a charitable institution, had not yet been altogether devoid of that virtue which blesseth him that gives and him that takes. A sum of fifty thousand rupees for fighting a disease which takes away fifty thousand souls in little over a fortnight in Bengal may be something to start with. The District of Nadia which I have the honour to represent in this House shows a decrease of population by a lakh and a half during the last decade. The population now comes to a little over 14 lakhs, and I can clearly see a day will soon arrive when there will be none in that district to pay the taxes of the Government. But, Sir, I suppose in anticipation of that catastrophe Government has arranged for maintaining a good number of nurses in the hospitals here, for whose comforts year after year lakhs of rupees are being spent. This time we have been asked to vote a sum of Rs. 1 lakh out of an estimated cost of Rs. 3 lakhs 10 thousand for nurses' quarters. I am glad that the Hon'ble the present Minister in charge of Public Health does not lag behind his predecessor in his admiration for these ministering angels of love and kindness to suffering humanity.

The Government has also demanded another lakh for supplying cots and mosquito nets to the police. I wonder if the mosquitoes of Bengal are not afraid of the almighty police and they make no distinction in biting the ill-clad, half-fed meek people of the soil and the well-dressed, over-fed, awe-inspiring police of this country. (Laughter). I suppose if this sum is not provided for, the Government will have to restore it by certification. The safety of the Empire is involved in

this question. In yesterday's *Forward* I read an article on why Rome had fallen and now mosquitoes had undermined an empire. The article says: "Mosquitoes in an early experiment were actually caused to bite malarial patients in the Campagna, and they are conveyed alive, to Aberdeen—to which place I believe the Hon'ble the Finance Member belongs—where they were caused to bite the son of Sir Patrick Manson, who had never been out of Scotland, and who duly contracted malaria thereafter, with "plasmodia' in his blood."

Mr. PRESIDENT: What are you quoting that for? Is it an instance of quality of treatment?

Babu HEMANTA KUMAR SARKAR: I am just showing that the safety of the Empire is involved. (Laughter).

Such a creature is a danger to the State and a danger to the guardians of law and order; besides, if the police are not protected against anopheles, who will record the deaths of our countrymen and if the vital statistics are not kept properly, the efficiency of the administration will badly suffer.

My district has the honour of altogether getting Rs. 35 thousand in the coming year's budget. Of this Rs. 5 thousand will go to meet the balance of expenditure amounting to Rs. 32 thousand sanctioned for the construction of a palace for the Deputy Superintendent of Police, Nadia. (Hear, hear.) The remaining Rs. 30 thousand will be devoted to a more important work, namely, the additions and alterations to the court room of the bureaucratic head of the district—I mean the Collector.

I should naturally mention something about the education budget, too, as one who was for some time at least connected with the department. The hope of establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College has filled with glee the hearts of many a Muhammadan member of this House. There is much artfulness behind this proposal for an Arts College. I am only sorry for the whole community for whom this institution will be established. It will only add to the number of educational slaughter-houses in our country and increase the number of the unemployed. As the poet Rabindranath has remarked that the 26 letters of the English alphabet are not any the less responsible for keeping up law and order than the innumerable provisions of the Indian Penal Code. They are the root-cause of producing dyspepsia, myopia and a thousand other "ias" (laughter) and it is only a matter of natural consequence that arms should be taken away from these enfeebled hands! So are the Arts Colleges. And our Muhammadan friends will have yet a factory which will specialise in producing such specimens of art. The Muhammadans would have been grateful had the Government spent the amount for a technical institution.

I congratulate the Hon'ble the Minister of Education on taking away the grant of Rs. 3 lakhs from the University of Calcutta. A whilom

nationalist he cannot forsake us; this shows only his inner sympathies with us, the non-co-operators, who were out to demolish this citadel of cultural denationalisation. I wish he had the wisdom also to take away the big grant wasted over the Dacca University.

* * *

Lastly, Sir, I speak a few words on the expenditure in connection with the British Empire Exhibition. Our predecessors in this House at a meeting held on the 24th January, 1923, committed themselves to a resolution recommending the participation of this Government in the British Empire Exhibition and later voted a grant of Rs. 15,700 for meeting the expenditure. This time a demand has been made for Rs. 1,27,000 under this head. The whole of India has declared in an unmistakable voice the refusal to be a willing partner or rather maid-servant of an Empire which has treated her so shabbily on so many occasions. Even the Prince of Moderates—I mean the Right Hon'ble Mr. Srinivas Sastri—urged the boycott of the Exhibition and even of the Imperial Conference in view of the inhuman and unjust treatment meted out to the Indians in the Colonies.

The Imperial connection is no longer regarded as a matter of pride by Indians. The Indian National Congress has left it beautifully vague whether India wants Swaraj within or without the Empire. That is some concession. That mystic term "Swaraj" carries the idea of self-dependence as interpreted by my revered chief, Mr. C. R. Das, the idea of inter-dependence as interpreted by the poet Rabindranath, or even the idea of eternal dependence on the British as the leader of the defunct constitutional party would like to have it understood—but, Sir, even if the older people might have had some fascination for British connection, may I inform this House, on behalf of the younger generation, that they are determined to have Swaraj without the Empire? (Applause). The Imperial policy of the British Government is alone responsible for their attitude. India refuses to be a dependency—a willing victim to exploitation. Her tradition, her culture, in fact, the whole trend of her civilisation is diametrically opposed to that of the British people, and their connection with India can never by its very nature be other than harmful to the best interests of India and her full self-experience which we understand by the word "Swaraj."

We are now citizens of an Empire which professing equality treats us like helots. We refuse any longer to be hewers of wood and drawers of water of our white masters. I admit we have been given representation in the League of Nations, but the bureaucracy selects those representatives whose participation is only a plea for realising a huge amount from the Indian Exchequer. Our so-called representatives sit in the Councils of the Empire and the League of Nations, but they are as much the representatives of India, as the members of the Indian Civil Service are our servants.

Besides this, we suspect there is a "sinister background"—to quote the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of Education—to the idea of exhibiting our products in London. The British merchants and manufacturers want to know which of the raw materials and cottage industries have yet escaped their greedy attention. And for this they want to have the exhibits shown in London at the cost of the Indian taxpayers. This should also be one of the reasons why we should refuse the demand.

I have selected only an item or two to show the callous disregard of proportions with which public money is wasted by Government. Unless there is a wholesale change, it is no use discussing the budget item by item, and for bringing about such a change. I commend to this House the entire throwing out of the budget so admirably drawn up by the Hon'ble the Finance Member.

Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I am sorry I cannot congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member for the supposed surplus budget presented by him. We are grateful to the Hon'ble the Finance Member for having presented us with a copy of Budget speech, with the Budget and the Civil estimates for year 1924-25. A careful perusal of the three leaves an impression on one's mind that even with ruthless retrenchment in the nation-building departments, and imposition of unpopular new taxes we have just been able to make both ends meet. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has rightly pointed out that if the contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs is again forced upon us by the Central Government, we shall be faced with a big deficit unless we propose to wipe out the whole of our balances. What the Central Government will do is not known to us and we must therefore say that the first three years of the Reforms have been a continuous financial embarrassment to the Province. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has enumerated the amounts allotted to the Ministers for new works. As I read and examine the items and compare them with new expenditures on the reserved side I get absolutely disappointed.

For example, when I compare the amounts granted for some of the items of the Police Department with that of the other departments, namely, the Department of Agriculture and Industry or even Education and Health, I cannot but feel a sort of astonishment as to how the nation-building departments on which the welfare of the people mainly depends could be shown so much indifference. If this sort of things continue it will only make it a point of paramount necessity of having a Joint Financial Secretary to look after the interest of the Transferred Departments.

There can be no surer way of making the Ministers unpopular than by limiting the scope of their usefulness by withholding monies for schemes likely to benefit the masses. (Hear, hear.) While only Rs. 33 thousand has been provided for sinking the tube-wells throughout the

Province, large amounts have been budgeted for dredging of the Lower Kumar River at the entrance of the Bhil route—a project which benefits only jute but does not solve the daily growing problem of drinking water to the masses of Bengal. We have succeeded in abolishing the Fisheries Department, in crippling the Agriculture Department and we have reduced almost beyond recognition the Department of Industries and all these because we are out to economise. (A voice: But who is responsible?) We have discharged officers who have served us loyally for years because of the result of this retrenchment. They have been sent adrift and have, perhaps, joined the masses of the unemployed and discontented and all these, because we have no money and yet we find money for police luxuries. These departments were being administered even before the Reforms came into being.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President left the Chamber and the Deputy-President took the Chair.]

May one inquire why nothing was said so long with regard to their supposed extravagance and why should all on a sudden the recommendations of a committee be followed so rigidly, directly after Ministers came to administer them. Was it because the Reforms meant heavy expenditure? That will really be very bad logic. If that was the idea, what then did the Ministers come in to administer? The Hon'ble the Finance Member has promised to place in a few days before the Council an up-to-date statements of Retrenchment decisions. I heartily wish he had done so before the Budget debate began, for that would have given the Council an idea as to how far these decisions have affected the transferred and the reserved departments of this Government. Comparisons are always invidious but are sometimes inevitable. You cannot ask the Ministers to thrive, flourish and be popular with the public and withhold their demands regarding their departments. If the Ministers have to prove successful in running their departments, they must have funds.

I turned eagerly to the budget of the transferred departments to see the results of the retrenchments we were called upon to effect. I find them there indeed. The trees have been pruned down, but where are the new shoots which were to come forth? It is true, in the Moslem Arts College we have something which is long overdue. I only hope—and indeed I believe—that the provision for this college is not, as our Swarajist friends suggest, a mere political dodge to capture Muhammadan votes. I give the Hon'ble the Minister for Education credit for finer feelings and I would not think that he could traffic thus in the needs of his community, bargaining for votes with something which we have all felt for years common justice demands.

I turn, however, to Agriculture and Industries and there I search in vain for the development I had expected. It is true there are two new farms, a veterinary hospital at Dacca, a provision for an electric installation to demonstrate power-weaving. These are all to the good, but

they are a mere drop in the ocean. Where are the education schemes we fondly hoped for? These are minus quantities. Chinsura school, which had the promise of great things in it, is closed after having been given a trial only for one complete year. Rangpur and Rajshahi had asked for similar schools and made generous offers to Government in their eagerness to have them. There is no sign in the budget of any encouragement to such local offers of help. What will the local people say in future but that making local effort is useless since not only are their offers not accepted but the whole policy indicated by the budget suggests that such offers are not wanted? Where is the Agricultural Institute at Dacca for which land was acquired? That institute was to give our youth the highest agricultural training and teach them to approach our greatest industry in the most modern scientific way.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President returned to the Chair.]

It was a splendidly conceived idea, capable of being carried out with the best results on our agriculture. It would have been a great addition to the University centre at Dacca. It would have encouraged science, which that great English industrialist, Lord Leverhulme, has just been telling us is the greatest need of India. Yet there is no sign of it in the budget. Moreover, Sir, perhaps it is not unknown that the Sabour Agricultural College which was the only place where our students could go for higher agricultural training has been abolished and consequently some provision must be made in Bengal, otherwise Agriculture in the Province will badly suffer. Equally do I search in vain for a trace of consideration of primary agricultural education with farm schools dotted over the country on little demonstration farms for which I am convinced the public-spirited zamindars and others in this Province would have gladly placed the land at the disposal of Government. There is no sign of encouragement for this public spirit in the budget before us. I feel strongly inclined to ask what earthly benefit will it serve by spending huge amount of money on research and experiments in the district farms if we have not sufficient provisions made for demonstrating the results of these experiments in the interior of the districts. I believe the farm schools would have very well served this purpose.

And where is the sericulture schools we hoped for, real technical schools in which something might be done to encourage the revival of a great industry? These are some of the things I hoped for from retrenchment and it is no consolation to say the budget is balanced and a surplus exists if we cannot find anything progressive on the lines I have indicated.

Before I leave agriculture I would like to say that I think the districts chosen for the two new farms are not the happiest choice. I should prefer to have seen one of these farms in Malda where the land is of a peculiar type and conditions more nearly approach the conditions of Bihar.

There is another matter in connection with the Agricultural Department to which I would also invite the attention of the Council and that is the question of cattle-breeding. The Council must be unanimously of the opinion that the cattle of Bengal require improvement. I have on previous occasions urged before this Council the extreme necessity of doing something in this direction and I am disappointed at seeing no provision in the budget towards this end. I would urge upon the Minister the desirability of making provision for an expert in cattle-breeding as I am convinced that the evolution of the improvement of the type of cattle which is necessary for Bengal will require the services of a man who has been trained in this line.

And it is the same in Industries as in Agriculture. Education which is an essential to the development we hoped for is starved. No technical schools, no trade or commercial schools are provided for, and yet we discussed schemes for such schools here frequently in the last Council. How can we develop industries if we have not technical education?

I know the Hon'ble the Minister took over this portfolio too late to make much impression on the budget before us, but I think if he had searched in the offices of the departments he might have found schemes such as those I have mentioned already for incorporation and if he found that money was available he might indeed have claimed some for those purposes. He might have increased the provision for grants-in-aid so as to be able to help such schools which the people in their great desire to have them might have started of their own accord if Government only gave them the encouragement. I see that there is a lump provision of Rs 20,000 for industrial development. Is it too late to hope that this may be utilized for grants-in-aid to local efforts towards agricultural and industrial education? It will not go far but it will be something and it will encourage others and next year with this encouragement I am sure the Hon'ble the Minister will find many more local authorities and local people eager to help themselves in the hope of getting help from Government.

My desire in what I have said is not to impede but to help the Hon'ble the Minister. I know well how a Minister wants help and I can assure the House that it is our duty and my desire to give that help generously and without self-seeking.

The whole of the Agriculture development programme has been held up for want of funds and I must say that our works of years will go for nothing if funds are not found to proceed with the projects of the development programme. I leave it, Sir, to the House to decide whether in view of the urgent demands in this direction more funds should not be placed at the disposal of the Minister for Agriculture.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: While going through the budget of 1924-25, and hearing the speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Member, I thought it proper to go through the budget of 1921-22, and also the

proceedings of January, 1922, to see what has been done by Government during the last three years. Well, in 1921-22—I should be more precise in saying January, 1922—three new Taxation Bills were passed, namely, the Court Fees Amendment Bill, the new Stamp Act, and the Amusement Act. While presenting these Bills before the House the then Finance Member, Sir John Kerr, said: I shall quote his words—" In view therefore of His Excellency's remarks and of what I have said as to the powers of this Council to decide on the ultimate distribution of any surplus funds, that we may have, I think I can safely say, although I cannot give any definite figure, that a substantial share of any surplus that we may obtain, will be divided to objects which commend themselves to the judgment of this Council." So we all thought while giving our assent to the passing of these Bills, that a substantial portion of the amount would be given to the transferred departments. By substantial portion of the surplus, nobody thought that one-fourth, or one-fifth or one-sixth of the amount would be given to the transferred departments. Of course, a substantial portion of the amount means that at least more than half the amount would be set apart for and allotted to the transferred departments.

Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea on behalf of the Ministers said: I shall quote his words also—" That we are doing all we can to rescue this hapless Province from the grip of malaria. That is a duty which we all must perform. However much we may try to disguise it, that is the mandate of our inarticulate constituents, that is the mandate of our conscience, that is the solemn duty which the sense of our obligations has imposed upon us". Then he said: " For six months you will not be able to add a single medical school or hospital in this Province, for six months you will have done nothing to extend your water-supply. I ask hon'ble members, can they contemplate a prospect like this with anything like equanimity? Think of your country, think of your constituencies, think of your duty, the duty that is imposed upon you, and give your votes according to the biddings of your conscience and the dictates of what is right and proper." So we all thought a good portion of the surplus amount would be devoted to the improvement of sanitation, education, improvement of agriculture, improvement of industries and the cognate subjects. What is the amount which we expect to get this year from these three Taxation Bills? This is what the Hon'ble the Finance Member said on page 10 of his Budget speech: " Of the difference between the figures of 1921-22 and 1924-25, Rs. 56 lakhs represents the increase in our stamp revenues and Rs. 32 lakhs the receipts from the Amusements Tax. " That is, he expects a surplus of Rs. 88 lakhs from these taxes. As I have already said, I have compared the budget of 1921 so far as these heads are concerned, namely, Education, Medical, Public Health, Agriculture, Industries and Civil Works. In 1921-22 the amount which was allotted to Education was Rs. 1 crore, 26 lakhs and odd thousand, in 1924-25 it is Rs. 1,22,36,000.

This is inclusive of the reserved subjects. As regards Medical, I find in 1921-22 there was a sum of Rs. 52,24,000, while in the present budget of 1924-25 we find Rs. 58,35,000 provided under this head. In the Public Health Department in 1921-22 it was Rs. 19,46,000, while this year it is Rs. 29,87,000. I may tell you here that most of this amount will be eaten up in paying the salaries of some highly paid officers. Then comes Agriculture. In 1921-22 it was Rs. 13,48,000, while in the present year it is Rs. 19,14,000. Under Industries in 1921-22 we had Rs. 12,99,000, this year it is Rs. 10,26,000. Then under Civil Works, it was Rs. 1,55,00,000 in 1921-22. Probably the Government had in contemplation to carry out the partitions of Midnapore and Mymensingh and therefore such a large amount was allotted that year under this head. But this year the amount is Rs. 81,61,000. Now I have added and subtracted and I find that there has been an increase of Rs. 15,63,000 in the transferred departments, but the increase in revenue has been, as I have said, Rs. 88 lakhs. So a substantial portion of the sum of Rs. 88 lakhs, even if you take half, it will be Rs. 44 lakhs and not Rs. 15 lakhs. As we were given the assurance that a substantial portion of the amount would be devoted to the transferred departments, I should like to know where that money has gone. We want our pound of flesh. The transferred departments must have at least Rs. 44 lakhs, and if you do not give us this Rs. 44 lakhs, we say that it is a budget which ought not to be presented to a body of intelligent members. If you want to have their support you must present a presentable budget and not a budget which does not satisfy the demands of the people. When we gave our support to the three Taxation Bills, we were on the tip-toe of expectation of getting more primary education throughout the country, of having more pure drinking water - -

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: But you did not vote

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I was then the occupant of the Chair and had no occasion to vote

I say that if the Government want to have our support, present us with a presentable budget and not a budget which makes no provision for the necessary demands of the transferred departments. I do not want to go into details, but unless we have a good explanation from the Hon'ble the Finance Member as to why he has not been able to set apart a good round sum—a substantial amount—for the transferred departments, we do not know what we shall do with the budget.

Maulvi SAYEDAL HOQUE: Looking to the figures in the budget for the year 1924-25 we find that the main sources of revenue of the Government are three in number, namely—(1) Land Revenue, (2) Excise and (3) Stamps. Stamps yields the highest revenue, next comes land revenue and then comes Excise. Excise swells by 19 lakhs and Stamps by 15 lakhs in the Budget of 1924-15. The Land Revenue has also increased but not so remarkably. To these statements of facts I mention here the words

of the Hon'ble the Finance Member. On page 3 of his budget speech he says: "Excise revenue has been coming in well with the improvement in administration." On page 12 of the budget he says: "The improvement in Excise revenue has further been accelerated by the collapse of the non-co-operation movement." We may here mention also the steps taken by the Government for changing the hour of closing some of the liquor shops from sunset to 8 P.M. Also we find the Hon'ble the Finance Member expressing his regret that the Stamp revenue did not altogether realise the expectations. But his statement on page 10 of his budget speech shows that the difference between the figures of the years 1921-22 and 1924-25 of Rs. 56 lakhs represents the increase in the Stamp revenue. Our thanks are due to the Hon'ble the Finance Member for these statements, because these greatly help us to form an idea as to the underlying principle on which the framing of the budget is entirely based. The increment in Excise revenue means increment in the vice of intemperance. The increment in Stamps revenue means the increment in litigation. The honest expressions of the Hon'ble the Finance Member unmistakably shows that the Government would be very glad to see the annual increments in the vice of intemperance and litigation by arithmetical progression, geometrical progression shall have its own charms, because every increment thereof brings in its train, the necessary increment in revenue. So, reasonably there should be rejoicing at the collapse of non-co-operation or any other similar movement which at a loss to the revenue, always tries to persuade people not to be litigant and not to go to the liquor shops, while the look out of the Government is to see those shops kept open even after sunset. This vice of litigation and intemperance can very well be called a virtue because it is a double blessing to the Government—it both swells the revenue and makes the run of the Government more easy by reducing the people to absolute poverty and helplessness. This principle quite befits an alien Government. There should be no hide and seek. The card must be placed on the table. I again thank the Hon'ble the Finance Member for his plain and outspoken confession of the real spirit that pervades the minds of the framers and upholders of the budget. Now let us examine the expenditure side of the budget and seek for some principle of distribution therein. The total receipt from the three main sources of Land Revenue, Excise and Stamps is Rs. 8½ crores, I draw the attention of the members to the figures that stand against—(1) General Administration, (2) Police, (3) Education, (4) Medical, (5) Public Health, (6) Agriculture and (7) Industry. To make the point more comprehensive and less complex I have calculated to show what amount is spent for every hundred rupees out of that total of Rs. 8½ crores under the different expenditure heads.

Figures approximate.

Rs. 22 for Police.

Rs. 14 for General Administration.

Rs. 12 for Education transferred.
As. 8 for Engineering College, 3 As. for Engineering and Survey Schools.
An. 1 for School of Arts.
An. 1 for Commercial Institute.
As. 3 for Grants for Medical Purposes.
Re. 1/6 for Medical Schools and Colleges.
As. 7 for Epidemic Diseases.
As. 6 for Agricultural Experiments and Demonstrations.
As. 8 for Industrial Development, Education and Scholarships.

This shows that the Police Department swallows the greatest portion. This is quite in keeping with the spirit we have seen in the revenue side of the budget. There must be police to see that the liquor shops are not closed at sunset, and above all there must be police to preserve peace and order. Thanks to police, but for them, there would have been frequent break of law and order. How can one grudge the provision of Rs. 1 lakh for the supply of iron cots and mosquito-nets for them. This is what is called improved means of administration for increasing revenue. Then comes general administration. How can it be too much but it is rather too little to meet the requirement of the Civilians who have come from a far-off land and leaving behind them all comforts of home, only to preserve law and order amongst the drunkards and discontended litigants. Then comes education. There have been a time when this Rs. 12 in every hundred would not have been a very small amount for the purpose of education because then the number of educated men were few, but that is not the case now. At present qualified candidates come in their hundreds and patiently wait looking and lingering for posts. There is room for cuts. The more education, the more unemployment, the more discontent and disaffection. Perhaps this accounts for the non-repetition of the grant of Rs. 3 lakhs to the Calcutta University. Let us look to this education from another point of view. If I am right in saying that education improves a man's quality it will surely make a man more careful of temperance and less addicted to litigation. This heavily tells upon the Excise revenue. Now when the heart of the framers and upholders of the budget rejoices at the collapse of a movement, the collapse of which accelerates this revenue, how can one expect from them any encouragement for the education, the well working of which retards or tends to retard that fund. Surely this lack of funds for education cannot be said inconsistent with the spirit we have already discovered. We must not forget to differentiate between the interest of the Government and the interest of the others. We cannot claim for more for education, but at the cost of law and order. We, non-violent people, should realize the value of law and order. I simply refer again how much we receive for Medical Relief, Public Health, Agriculture and Industry. The figures eloquently tell their stories for themselves.

Out of this amount again to pay and establishment goes the lion's share leaving only a very small—rather a negligible—percentage for the poor tax-payers. The Hon'ble the Finance Member gives us a surplus budget. He says "I now come to the Transferred side and I have no doubt hon'ble members will be keenly interested in knowing what provision we have made to meet the want of what are often called the nation-building departments whose activities have been so far circumscribed by our financial difficulties." Fine words indeed, we are really and very much keenly interested in knowing that a sum of Rs. 50,000 which will be recurring has been allotted towards schemes for improvent in rural water-supply. This is for the whole of Bengal. Half a lakh has been included for anti-malarial measures. These paltry sums are only scarecrows for these diseases or perhaps these are meant for buying magic wands for the Ministers to help the successful running of their departments. The real thing is taxation from all quarters by all imaginable ways for the running of the Government fairly maintaining law and order amongst the drunkards and litigants. If this be the real idea that pervades the minds of the framers of the budget and the upholders of it, I must say it is well drawn up. I know not whether the analysis of the budget drives one to any other conclusion or not, but I find no other way out of it. And also I cannot trace any reason why it should be otherwise when this Government is not a Government of the people for the people. Those who believe in the present system of Government they are welcome to support the budget in its present form, but I for one have not the least faith in the virtues of the present system. I stand on "No taxation without representation;" people are taxed to their utmost capacity, but yet the nation-building departments have so long remained, say after the rule of 150 years, circumscribed by financial difficulties is a remarkable confession made by the Hon'ble the Finance Member in his speech. The whole spirit of the budget goes against the popular wish. They are taxed without their consent and their purse is placed in the hands of those who are responsible to them. And we have clearly seen how that purse is skilfully managed to suit the purposes of others only granting them baits here and there to lull them to sleep. We have come here as the representatives of the people only to make recommendations without any power of making those recommendations keenly felt. Our friends on the Government side have come here with the purpose of construction and we, the members on the popular side, have come here with the programme of destruction. We are often blamed for this. Yes, our friends can do much constructive work in the way of swelling the Excise revenue and adding facilities to the improved means of administration by granting lakhs of rupees for iron cots and like, but they are circumscribed in the nation-building departments where their constructive programme comes to a standstill. What did our late Minister of Education say But we must destruct the present system which is capable of no good or at the very best capable of very little good to the taxpayers. We have a constructive programme behind

it. Our friends ought to know that there is no absolute destruction. The process of destruction means a process of transformation. We must obstruct till the whole spirit of the budget, that is of the Government, is changed to a popular spirit, the Government of the people, by the people, for the people becomes the pervading spirit of the whole.

Mr. D. J. COHEN: I join the previous speakers in expressing my disappointment at the budget presented to us. It provides practically for the mere carrying on of the administration and as usual the transferred departments are practically starved and have not been given a chance. The departments under our Ministers are admittedly the most important to the people of the Province and it is a matter of extreme dissatisfaction that comparatively very little money can be found for them. There are various proposals made by the Retrenchment Committee other than those that Government has given effect to, or are not feasible to carry out, that could be carried out. The point I wish to make clear is this. No further taxation proposal has any chance of being carried in this House, and we can only hope to satisfy the reasonable demands of the transferred departments with money that can be got by retrenching in the establishment. Stern necessity demands that retrenching should be carried out even at the sacrifice of some efficiency. I hope the Finance Member in his reply will be able to give us some indication as to the steps Government intend taking in this direction. It is not enough for the Ministers seated at their desks to draw up comprehensive schemes which they cannot hope to carry out in the near future, and which may require to be modified afterwards owing to changed circumstances. The Ministers are in an unenviable position of men whose hands are tied owing to lack of funds. In the Education Department, I find simply because a sum of Rs. 3 lakhs is not going to be given to the Calcutta University that money has not been placed at the disposal of the Ministers, over and above the sums included in the budget. I regret this very much.

Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKAT: The subject of the last two days, proceedings of this Council has been the general criticism of the budget estimate for year 1924-25 as was presented before this House. You have heard many speeches from many eminent members about this. I think that they are all unanimously of opinion that fair justice has not been done to the "transferred subjects" or "the nation-building departments" by the provisions made in the budget estimate of the year under review. This is quite apparent from the speeches of every previous speaker. Even the late Education Minister has complained of this defect in the budget. Moreover, since the inauguration of the much-talked of Reforms, this subject has been pressed in season and out of season both from the platform and the press. But the Government has turned deaf ears all along and even in the present budget too, they have not done anything in the direction of doing any good to the people.

Now let us see how much the Government has set apart for nation-building departments. For the higher, secondary and primary educations they have set apart a very small sum but for European and Anglo-Indian education they have made sufficient provisions in the present budget.

Now, Sir, I may point out to you and my brother members that "the manufacture of souls of a good quality" is the first and essential duty of a Government. If this is neglected then no amount of efficient police and efficient administration will bring prosperity to the country. There will be no salvation of this nation unless and until the Government adopt the policy of mass education in right earnest and bank facilities given to the peasants as it has been done in the case of Scotland. Only Rs. 50 thousand has been provided in the budget for anti-malarial measures for 46 millions of people. Every thing rests with the Government. I request the Finance Member to find out the means and ways for plentiful of money for the nation-building purposes.

Then for Medical Relief and Public Health the Government has set apart a paltry sum, the major portion of which will be spent for the construction works, for instance nurses' quarters in the Presidency General Hospital. It is ridiculous in my opinion. We are crying for a Medical School in Jalpaiguri but nothing has been done to this effect. Now I ask, is this sufficient in comparison with the expenditure which will be incurred in other departments and also in comparison with the number of people I mean 45 millions of people living in Bengal and the vastness of the country.

To crown all, nothing has been provided for improving the agricultural condition of the Province—though the people depends solely on agriculture. In my opinion the so-called Agricultural Department should be abolished altogether and money which will be saved may be profitably utilized in ameliorating the miserable condition of the starving millions of peasants.

The question of unemployment has also taken a very serious turn and thousands of our young men are rotting for want of any opening in the country. Has Government made any provision in that direction? I say none.

But I see the Government is keen about making provisions for police, general administration and other things in the name of keeping peace and order in the country. I fail to understand why the Government is so afraid of this dying nation and starving people.

In civilized and free countries the people are taxed simply for the public good and prosperity. But here in Bengal the principle of taxing the people is quite opposite to this principle.

I need not repeat these things any more and thus waste the time of the House.

Let me remind the Hon'ble the Member in charge of Finance, the pitiable condition of the Bengal villages and their inhabitants—who are half-naked, starving and suffering from different kinds of diseases specially malaria. But the Government is taking no care of them and spending their hard-earned money in other directions.

In conclusion, I beg to point out that I am at a loss to understand in what sense the Finance Member calls this budget as prosperous when this nation is going to die out, specially the Bengali nation, within one hundred years' time.

Babu ABANISH CHANDRA RAY: For some time past I have been awaiting with keen interest as to what sort of budget the Government would present this year. It is admitted on all hands that the political situation is very serious and that constructive statesmanship demands that at this critical moment the Government should show more anxiety to placate the sentiments of the people and thereby to consolidate their own power. As a matter of fact the Hon'ble Mr. Donald has done his best to serve the nation-building departments. But, Sir, he has failed—hopelessly failed— and that not through any fault of his. Sir, he is the agent of a system which lives and flourishes on the ruin and demoralisation of the people and it is a pity that men of such sterling qualities are being exploited to run a machine which is grinding this people—these inheritors of a noble past—a noble civilization to slow but steady and inevitable death. Sir, it takes my breath away to find one crore of rupees, the provisions that have been made for the education, sanitation and medical help of a Province containing 45 millions of people. I need not go into any detail. Many of my friends in this House have specially shown how monstrously inadequate are the provisions made. I shall only look into the principle, the policy upon which the budget has been constructed. The Government is to be carried on not in the interest of the people of the soil but to serve other people and other lands; but so that there may not be any *golmal* so that the down-trodden worm may not raise its hood in self-defence—sufficient dust has been thrown into its eyes. That is the policy and the principle in a nutshell. All the nation-building departments have been mentioned by names, so that the Government may pose that they are not at all unmindful of the interest of the people. But a cursory glance at the figures will show that whatever may be the chief concern of the Government it is certainly not the interests of the people. Lest the people may create any *golmal* under such unnatural arrangments, the police—the agent of law and order—have been sufficiently strengthened. While Rs. 50,000 only have been granted to fight malaria in the whole province a sum of Rs. 1,00,000 has been given to purchase mosquito curtains to protect constables from mosquito bites. To keep down a people against their wishes, to exploit them, you must strengthen the hands of law and order and thus

under the existing system and the current policy, the Hon'ble Mr. Donald has admirably performed the task entrusted to his hands.

What the interest of the Government lies has been frankly admitted by Sir Malcolm Hailey when he opposed our demand for Swaraj on the ground that that would affect British commercial interest and the men in the services. It is in their interest that the administration is really being run and under such circumstances to talk of nation-building is only abuse of words and that will no longer deceive any right-thinking Indian. Forty per cent. of our people do not know what a full meal is from years' end and to years' end, and lakhs of people have not sufficient clothing to cover their nakedness and protect their bodies from the biting cold or heat, the intensity of which is well known. In order to really build this nation you must take immediate steps to remove the deep chronic poverty of the people and the only means of doing this is to supplement agriculture in this country by industries. What steps has the British Government taken to develop indigenous industry? They have deliberately destroyed the biggest industry in India, viz., cloth-making, in order to build their own industry at Lancashire. As a result, Sir, India, which was the richest country on earth before the advent of the benign British rule, is now the poorest. This is how you have executed your so-called trust. Really India is held by you in trust—but the beneficiaries are not the Indian people but the British people through the services and commerce to which Sir Malcolm Hailey has referred in his most frank and truthful speech. The other day the *Morning Post* referring to the purchase of some stores from Germany, bluntly remarked that they should rather get out of India than submit to this. The cat, Sir, is out of the bag and all attempts at an eyewash will be so much labour lost.

The Hon'ble Member has shown how our revenues are increasing. The increase, Sir, is not due to the increase of production or prosperity in the country, but to the increase of vice and demoralisation and emasculation. Sir, I need not discuss whether it is right to raise a revenue from the sale of liquor and other intoxicants; but I have no doubt about this that if any revenue is collected from this source it ought to be spent solely for the purpose of removing this evil. All excise revenue ought to be spent in furthering the temperance movement. Similarly, all revenues raised from quinine and cinchona plantation ought to be spent in fighting malaria. But this thoroughly irrational budget shows that the excise revenue and cinchona revenue and the stamp revenue instead of being spent in fighfing infemperance and malaria and in the administration of justice have been diverted to the maintenance of law and order, and this blessed system which I have already said is being run not in the interest of Indian people but in that of the British people and British commerce. By law and order in India at present is meant only that state of things in which the vested interests of the British people will not be disturbed or endangered in

the least. And for this law and order a police system is being maintained, starving the real interests of the people of the soil and patriotic gentlemen are being snatched away from their legitimate occupations and are made to rot in dungeons which remind us of the middle ages and of the state of things prevailing in France and Russia before the historic revolutions.

I think, Sir, I have sufficiently explained to you that the policy of this Government is to serve the interests of the British people even to the detriment of the interests of the country itself and the whole budget has been framed in accordance with that policy. If we accept that policy, then enter into the details and try to improve tinkering measures as much as you can. But if we do not agree with this policy, if you think that the Government ought to serve the interest of the people first and foremost, then refuse to consider any budget that is placed before you. I appeal to this House in the interest of the country to throw out the budget entirely.

Maulvi WAHED HOSSAIN: The spectacle of a Finance Member struggling against adversity and trying "to keep his head above water" cannot fail to call forth our sympathy. This struggle is going on for the last three years since the inauguration of the inauspicious Reforms. I call the Reforms inauspicious because this siren has bewitched some of our countrymen and swallowed up the opening balance of about 2½ crores in the very first year of her birth (1921-22). Her growth and development have equally been inauspicious and disastrous to the prosperity of the country. While she has been grinding the resources of the country, supplies for her cruel demands have to be kept up by the imposition of three new taxations which are weighing down the people. The Hon'ble the Finance Member in his financial statement for 1924-25 has shown a closing balance of Rs. 1,23,24,000. This would have been a cheerful figure had the savings been secured without the help and operation of the oppressive taxations. The three new taxations—the concommitant evils of the dyarchy—have squeezed out of the people the enormous amount of Rs. 56 lakhs from the Stamp duty including Court-fees which represents the increase in Stamp revenues and Rs. 32 lakhs, the receipts from the Amusement Tax. Then Bengal has to pay Rs. 63 lakhs as its contribution to the Central Government under the Reform schemes. Deduct these three sums (56 -32- 63-151) amounting to Rs. 1 crore and 51 lakhs and we shall have a bankrupt exchequer. Had there been no top-heavy administration, no Reforms and Dyarchy, the country would have been saved from bankruptcy and the imposition of the fresh taxations. These taxes should be abolished and the contribution withheld as they have done no real good to the country. On the other hand, we have been forced to pay those heavy amounts simply to bolster up the Reforms and perpetuate the dyarchy with a costly administration.

I think I shall be justified in raising the question of principle. I desire to know on what principle the subjects called "the reserved" and "the transferred" have been classified? What is the basic principle for ascertaining the *voted* and *non-voted* grants? What is the principle of adjustment of public revenues and of allotting 65 per cent. to the reserved and 35 per cent to the transferred? Looking to the report of the Joint Committee I find a significant passage. It runs thus:—

"The Committee do not endorse the suggestion that certain sources of the revenue should be allocated in the proportion of two-thirds to reserved and one-third to transferred subjects, and similarly a proportion, though not necessarily the same fraction of the balances."

The Hon'ble the Finance Member in his speech presenting the budget for the next year, does not say what principle he followed in allocating the amounts to the reserved and transferred subjects. But from the speech of the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr it appears that he followed the principle of two-thirds against one-third. What we desire to know is whether the Hon'ble Mr. Donald has followed the principle of his predecessor or has given effect to the suggestion of the Joint Committee.

Now turning to the budget for 1924-25, we find that there is a small margin between the income and the expenditure viz., of Rs. 49,000 only. We have, no doubt, a balance of Rs. 1,23,24,000 in hand, out of which Rs. 88 lakhs have been earmarked for new schemes, leaving a margin of Rs. 35,24,000. The Hon'ble the Finance Member and the Hon'ble Mr. Stephenson have already made demands for supplementary grants to the extent of Rs. 3,67,000. Deducting this amount we shall have Rs. 31,57,000 only in hand. Now in the event of bad realization of revenue or in the case of drought, famine or flood we shall have to fall back on this amount. This is not a very sound financial position. But if we have to pay the contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs to the Central Government, then there will be no other alternative but to draw upon the earmarked amount of Rs. 88 lakhs and stop all new schemes. Such is the position to which we may be driven. Taking notice of the very early and pretentious approach of the hot season, I shudder at the likelihood of a famine and drought in this year with such a dubious state of finance. But I may get a rebuff from the official stalwart for my pessimism and for hinting that Government should be ready to cope with a possible famine in the near future. We have already been told that Government is not a charitable institution. But let us see, Sir, how Government has been charitable for some other purposes. We have in the budget of the current and this year some amazing figures which stagger a bold intellect though not a valiant heart. They are as under:—

For H. E.'s Saloon (this year) Rs. 10,000, (next year) Rs. 1,40,000; payment to Mr. Greaves for plan of Council Chamber—

Rs. 48,000; rearrangement of electric installation and of officers in Writers' Buildings—Rs. 1,00,000 out of Rs. 1,58,000; Expenditure *re* Council elections—Rs. 4,50,000; Publicity work—Rs. 81,000; Jails and convict settlement—Rs. 37,76,000; Police—Rs. 1,25,82,000; supply of iron cots and mosquito curtains (included in the estimate—Rs. 1,00,000; Criminal Investigation Department (included in the estimate)—Rs. 7,50,000.

This lavish scale of expenditure indicates that there is somebody who is more powerful to spend the public money in the way he thinks fit. Discussion in papers has no effect; protest meets with rebuff; solicitation goes in vain. What hope is there then to mend the ways of Government? This Council is powerless, the real power rests with the Government. The Council has been working for the last three years and the Budget shows an ever-increasing expenditure in those matters against which it has raised its voice.

Sir, some hope was cherished in certain quarters when the new Reforms were ushered in by a flourish of trumpet. May I ask what benefits they have conferred upon the country? In what way the people have been benefited? The last three budgets which are the real criterion of the progress of the country, have failed to show its prosperity, neither do they show that the Government has been more responsive to popular demands. On the other hand the top-heavy administration, unable to meet its own demands, still goes on with increasing taxations. While a costly dyarchy has made new demands upon the country, it has had to be maintained by the imposition of new taxes and suspension of all works of utility. A gloomy record of the working of the Reforms has been given by the successive Finance Members while presenting their deficit budgets. If this be the benefits of the Reforms, the sooner it is withdrawn, the better for the people. We cried for the bread, we got a stone. We cried for a responsible Government, and we have got this vampire—Dyarchy. We cried against an expensive administration, we got a still more costlier one with top-heavy administration, menacing to be costlier even after the Lee Commission. We cried against the burden of taxes, we have been subjected to new taxations. The consideration of all these and other circumstances have made us sick. In a word, we have lost all faith in British justice and the present system of Government.

Sir, regarding the grant of Rs. 1 lakh for a Muhammadan Art College, there have been some misgivings and whisperings as to the attitude of the Moslem members belonging to the Swarajya party. I like to remove the misgiving by making a clear statement on the subject. The Moslem members, except a few, desire to have a college of their own for which they have fought for so long. The proposal for a Muhammadan college and the agitation consequent upon it, has a history of its own, since the time of the Bengal Provincial Muhammadan Educational Conference.

I do not like to tire the patience of the Council by repeating the history and request the members not to oppose the grant without hearing me on the subject. I am well acquainted with the facts as I was the Secretary to the said Conference since it was established. But I desire to make one thing clear. It may be asked how will it be consistent with our conduct to accept the grant and at the same time to oppose the entire budget if occasion arises? I say, Sir, that if the entire budget is thrown out, this grant must go with it. Our attitude will be determined by the attitude of the Government towards our national demands.

Yesterday some member characterized this grant as a bait to lure away the Moslem members. I am sorry that I cannot accept the half-truth. There is something deeper, and if you dive deep into the subject you will discover the whole truth. I know full well how we—the Moslems—cried in vain for a Muhammadan college and larger grants for Muhammadan education. Our cry, like all other cries, has been a cry in wilderness. Ultimately we lost all confidence in the official promises and formed a coalition with those of four Hindu brethren who have also lost faith in the Government, not for any selfish gain but for fighting out what legitimately and justly belong to us. This coalition shows to some extent the strength of Hindu-Moslem unity and the result is apparent. The Government had so long refused to listen to our prayers and supplications. Now the cry is heard. Its moral effect is obvious.

While on this subject I like to make another thing clear to our Moslem friends who are not with us. In the budget there are other grants—small indeed—for Muhammadan education and it is glibly said that if the Swarajist Moslems do not support the budget, Muhammadan education will suffer. Similar timorous voices have been heard from the Hindu members as well. I maintain that this nervousness ariess from a narrow outlook. What is our object? Does any member seriously believe that our object is to check the progress of education in the country or to injure any communal interest? No, never. We want neither rake's progress nor slave's progress. Our object is to put an end to this top-heavy administration and the effete system of Government from which we can expect nothing but small grants which starve the nation-building departments. We want to establish a fully responsible Government which will not devote the bulk of its revenues for Police and Jail Administration and Convict Settlements. I therefore, request my friends not to draw hasty conclusions from our action. We are fighting your battle and we will not grudge even if you enjoy the fruits of our victory.

A few words more, Sir, and I have done. Mr. P. C. Mitter made an exhibition of his sorry plight in which he was placed when he was in his office. In fulness of his heart he told the House that all his earnest endeavours, solicitations and supplications went in vain. He tried his best to keep up good relation and cultivate good-will. That, too, was in

vain. May I ask him what advice he has now to give us in the light of his experience? He has not been satisfied with the present budget and charged the Secretary of State with indifference. But he did not suggest the remedy which would cure the evil. Will he advise us to sit on the fence with the same sort of sanity, sobriety and amiability with which he consoled himself when he was in the office. I like to be profited by his past experience. But I may be excused when I say that Mr. Mitter's sorry plight should be an object-lesson to those who are now in the office.

Mr. S. MAHBOOB ALEY: I thank the Hon'ble the Finance Member for his lucid statement in introducing the budget. Though it is some relief that we are not going to have a deficit year, we look in vain for any large policy for the welfare of the people or for development of those departments that are concerned with looking after public health or the economic welfare of the people.

In dealing with our finances we must always remember that out of the sources of revenue left to our Province a very considerable part depends on our vices. The Excise revenue depends on our drink and narcotic habit, and Court-fees depend upon our habit of litigation.

I think we all desire that our Government should so regulate our financial policy as not to be dependent for its upkeep on revenue derived from drink and narcotics. The evil of litigation has also become widespread. Like the water hyacinth it is an evil of luxerious growth. It is pauperising the people. It fritters away their money and energies. It tends to set up man against man instead of setting them up shoulder to shoulder to work jointly for the common welfare and progress. Courts and lawyers may be useful, but those that have the good of the country at heart cannot but desire that there should be less of law courts and lawyers, and they would look with satisfaction at the dwindling of revenue realised from Court-fees.

What I find in the budget is a tendency on the part of Government to keep on moving in the old grooves. There is no movement on the part of the Government to strike out new paths. Government appears to think that India is at a standstill like Joshua's moon at Ajalon.

India is advancing with rapid strides. But the system of administration under which she is sought to be kept is framed to suit the times when she was immobile. There was a time when district communications and sanitation, town management and other things were in the hands of the executive officers. Since the institution of district boards, local boards and municipalities a large part of the work has been taken away from the hands of executive officers but their number has increased. The revenue work can be done very well by Deputy Collectors. We do not see why work which can be very well done by a less expensive agency should have a highly paid agency merely for purposes of show.

I shall say a few words about the Department of Police. The expenditure is growing. But it cannot be said that the efficiency of the police services is increasing. The superior staff should be considerably reduced, and there should be better pay and prospects for the subordinate staff. I may note in passing that in the superior grades of the police service there are very few Musalmans. There are no Musalman Deputy Commissioners or Assistant Commissioners in the Calcutta Police. I request the Government to remedy this state of things at an early date.

I welcome the provision made in the budget for a Muhammadan Arts College. Our thanks are due to the Minister for this progressive step. I would request my friends of other communities not to look at the proposal from a communal point of view. We have all to face the fact that the Muhammadan community is numerically the largest community in Bengal. But they are educationally and economically backward. It is necessary that special measures should be taken on behalf of the State to extend a helping hand so that a community which is so important may come into line with the other communities, and all communities may work hand in hand with equal capabilities and equal opportunities for the common welfare. I would request the sister communities not to grudge to the great Muhammadan community the hand of help and good fellowship which it needs in the present stage of its development.

I regret that the public health of the Province has received such meagre attention from the Government. Having regard to our deficiencies in matters of health and education it was to be expected in the usual course that the Government should take proper steps to safeguard the interests of the people. But I am sorry that practically no advance has been made, and the people have been left where they were.

Maharaj Kumar SRIS CHANDRA NANDY: It is surely gratifying to note that after three successive years of deficit budgets under the Reforms this the fourth year there is a budget which is not a deficit one. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has cleverly abstained from calling it a surplus budget. Prosperous budget it cannot be called, because it does not betoken prosperity of the people, inasmuch as the heavy Provincial Taxation Bills imposed to meet the previous deficits have not been revoked and their consequent burden has not been lightened.

There is nothing in fact, Sir, in the budget which can appeal to the imagination. No bold projects involving recurring expenditure have been launched in the Departments of Education, Sanitation, Agriculture and Industry in the next financial year.

It is distressing to find that the provisions that have been made for the nation-building departments are quite meagre and unsatisfactory.

As primary education is admittedly the great need of India, it is disappointing to notice no progress adumbrated in that direction in the budget. In particular, one would have liked to know whether any steps have been taken to give effect to the recommendations of Mr. Biss of the

Educational Service who had been, it is understood, deputed to study the problem of primary education as a whole. One cannot help his disappointment when he finds that even on the general head of Education there has been a slight reduction in the present budget on the very admission of the Hon'ble the Finance Member. It is difficult to understand why the grant to the Calcutta University is not renewed and how the circumstances of this year differ from those of the last year when the benefit of a grant was extended to that body. One cannot also help observing that the retrenchment effected in primary and secondary schools is no matter for congratulation, as it is calculated to retard the microscopic progress that has hitherto been made in that direction.

For a big and populous Province like Bengal, Sir, 50 thousands for improvement in rural water-supplies, and an equal amount for anti-malarial measures and a similar sum for anti-kala-azar operations and Rs. 16 thousands for anti-cholera propaganda are considered mere doles.

On the head of Public Health, Rs. 25 thousands for maternity and child-welfare work and Rs. 25 thousands for safeguard against small-pox are extremely inadequate, considering the large percentage of maternal, infant and small-pox mortality that has been disclosed by figures supplied by the department itself at the last Child-Welfare Exhibition held in the Eden Gardens in January last.

I cannot but express my sincere disappointment when I come to undertakings proposed to be made in the Department of Agriculture in the financial year. Two district farms and a veterinary hospital are the only items mentioned in that direction. Instead of frittering away our surpluses on a host of smaller schemes our first line of advance should be towards what would appear to be the prime necessity of Indian progress—agricultural development. One can hardly recognise that agriculture is the mainstay of the country, the backbone at once of our finances and export trade, and our basic industry—when we see the small figure set down for being expended on it. We might spend advisedly a great deal more on district farms, research work and demonstration work. The sum allotted to co-operative propaganda should also be largely added to in order to secure that consummation which Sir D. Hamilton has so ably advocated the bringing of co-operation to the door of every agriculturist.

The grants made towards Local Self-Government are equally unsatisfactory and disappointing. We have nowhere been told what provisions have been made for establishing and maintaining industrial, technical, and technological institutions, notwithstanding the existence of a well-sustained Industry Department and its costly paraphernalia. Surely, Sir, a small Demonstration Factory in Weaving Institute at Serampore and a Survey Institute at Mainamati are not calculated to gratify the crying needs of the Province for Industrial, Technical, and Vocational education on a large scale.

While there is every prospect of an increase in the Land Revenue and while the new taxes on Stamps and Amusements promise a decent income, it is cruel to anticipate an increase under Excise, though that may be obtained as vaguely put "under present conditions and with improved means of administration." Sir, we cannot shut our eyes to the fact that augmentation in Excise revenue goes hand in hand with the moral degradation of the people.

One important factor to which we have all anxiously looked forward in the coming budget, that is the retrenchment scheme. The Hon'ble the Finance Member has times and over again said that retrenchment has been effected considerably in such and such directions, but, unfortunately, nowhere he has told us explicitly what items have been cut down and what specific amounts have been retrenched on those heads. The Government should furnish the public with a general review of the way and in which way economies have been effected in each department in something like fair detail. It will then be seen which departments have borne the brunt of the retrenchment and what other departments have failed to contribute their quota. To me, Sir, it seems that deep cuts have nowhere been effected. Some of the big and unnecessary posts that were recommended to be abolished still continue. Various unnecessary items of expenditure recommended to be done away with are still maintained. The police expenditure was recommended to be restricted to Rs. 26 lakhs 20 thousands and 8 hundreds. But what do we find in the present budget? An increased grant of Rs. 9 lakhs 44 thousands over the estimate of 1923-24. Similarly, under Land Revenue, the Retrenchment Committee recommended Rs. 4 lakhs, but the Hon'ble the Finance Member demands an additional sum of Rs. 6 lakhs 20 thousands over the revised estimate of 1923-24 which stood at Rs. 29 lakhs 97 thousands. Under General Administration, the Committee recommended a net reduction of Rs. 4 lakhs 10 thousands, but the Hon'ble the Finance Member shows an increase of Rs. 19 thousands over the revised estimate of the last year. Under Irrigation, the Committee recommended a net reduction of Rs. 3 lakhs 50 thousands by suggesting means of increase of revenue from Tolls and Fees. But the Hon'ble the Finance Member wants under this head an identical sum in addition to the revised estimate of 1923-24. All these items of expenditure go to show to what extent the Finance Department are ready to carry out the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee.

On the whole, Sir, the budget estimates have been quite unsatisfactory and disappointing. A rough calculation of the figures shows that while about Rs. 3 crores have been allotted to the whole of the Transferred department, an allocation of about Rs. 5 crores has been made to Police and General Administration and Administration of Justice heads of the Reserved subjects. From the peoples' point of view this is really an incongruous state of things.

As recommended by a resolution in a previous year, if at least 40 per cent. of the receipts have been awarded to the Transferred subjects, the budget would have gone somewhat towards meeting popular aspirations.

It needs no gainsaying, Sir, that increased taxes on Stamps and Court-fees put a high premium on every-day legal transactions and litigation in general throughout the whole Province. The budget would have been a popular budget if the two Taxation Bills could have been withdrawn. And it would have added further to its popularity if the budget have been so framed that the temporary remission of Rs. 63 lakhs, allowed by the Central Government and about which so much nervousness is betrayed, could have been easily forked out from the receipts for payment whenever demanded.

Nothing would be impracticable, no hope would be unrealised, no scheme would be unfulfilled, if the framers of the budget would realise what the people really wanted and what really conduced to their well-being. Drastic cuts in the General Administration and the Police expenditure and a slight modification and adjustment of expenses here and there would for mere sake of an experiment bring about the desired state of things.

Maulvi TAYEBUDDIN AHMED: I rise to associate myself with what has already been said by some of the members of this House in order to voice the sentiments of the people of my district. Agriculture is the economic stand-by of the people of the Mymensingh district; the cultivators is growing poorer and poorer day by day, he is struggling for his very existence, he is dying of hunger, thirst and disease; but the Government is not making any serious attempt to improve his lot. If the Government really want to do any good to the country they should help the raiyat in his poverty, remove his ignorance and improve the sanitary condition of the cultivator. Sir, you will have to take him out of the money-lender's hand and he should be protected against enhanced rent and illegal demands of the landlords and to remove his ignorance he should be given primary education, free and compulsory. For the improvement of sanitary condition, Sir, you will have to look after good water-supply and drainage. There are some *khals* and rivers in the district of Mymensingh that have been silted up on account of repeated earthquakes, the consequence being pestilence and disease in the locality, the re-excavation of these *khals* and rivers will do incalculable good to a very large population of my district, the biggest in Bengal. But one becomes quite despondent when he sees the allotment on these heads to be staggeringly small and miserably inadequate.

You know the unsatisfactory condition of the agricultural community is a most serious danger to any Government. The people have come to realize that the Government is quite unsympathetic and unwilling to concede to these legitimate demands of the people of the country and consequently there is the cry for Swaraj and Swaraj is the only panacea.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member has with a rejoicing said: "Excise revenue has been coming in well with the improvements in administration." But the Government should recognise that the Excise revenue is a revenue derived from the degradation and moral ruin of the people of the country, therefore it is not an improvement in administration but an improvement in the humiliation of administration. I am speaking from my own experience that the Government is trying its level best to increase the number of *ganja* smokers in the rural areas. Instead of devising means to check the spread of consumption of these intoxicants among the poorer classes, more shops are being opened. Instances are not wanting where shops have been set down near schools. Some effective measures should be taken to find remedy for this evil.

One word about education and I shall finish. There is no denying of the fact that Musalmans are very backward in education. If the Musalmans do not make more progress in education, I fear they shall not be able to keep pace with their Hindu brethren in political matters. In wealth, in education and public spirit, our Hindu brethren have got greater advantage, so a special responsibility lies with them for the educational and political advancement of the Musalmans. Maulvi Md. Nurul Huq Chaudhury said the other day that there is no necessity for a Muhammadan Arts College. Here I differ from him. An Arts College is a necessity, a crying necessity. I am not so much concerned whether it comes into existence under the present Government or under the Swaraj Government, but the sooner it is established the better. To my mind it is the duty of everyone to make the utmost endeavour to spread education amongst the Musalmans because with the spread of education the shadow of suspicion and distrust between the Hindus and Musalmans and also between the Government and the people will disappear and greater confidence and good-will will be substituted. Education amongst the Musalmans can no longer be neglected because even under the Swaraj Government they will have to satisfy the least test in order to enjoy the promised advantage regarding services and I am not sure what will be that least test. So all attempts should be made to give facilities for Muhammadan education.

Mr. SYED M. MASIH: I am not ashamed to confess that within the short time allowed to us to study the budget I do not find it humanly possible for me to do justice to it and far less to make any effective criticism at this stage. Whatever observations I now make I gather from the very lucid speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Member with which he presented the budget the other day. Going through that speech as carefully as I could I find that the outstanding feature of the budget is the provision made for new schemes to the extent of about Rs. 36 lakhs. However gratifying that feature may be I am sorry to say it has not struck me to have been detailed with sufficient sense of responsibility of the Government to the people. Whether the whole

or only a part of the Government be responsible to the people, we all know that the Government exist for the people, and in whatever form it may manifest itself its responsibility on this one point cannot for a moment be minimised. If this proposition is once admitted then I feel no hesitation in asserting that the budget which has been presented to the Council discloses a lamentable sense of irresponsibility towards the well-being of the people at large.

Times without number both in this Council and elsewhere the members have impressed upon the executive authorities of the Government the necessity of introducing free and compulsory primary education throughout the country—a need which to my mind throws everything else in the background and in this view, I believe even my friends opposite will also agree with me. In the circumstances, it took my breath away when I found provision being very light-heartedly made of a lakh of rupees for the supply of iron cots and mosquito nets for the police and not a rupee added to the usual grant made for primary education in the Province year after year. This, Sir, I must confess is beyond my comprehension.

I believe this Council would not have pardoned my friend the Hon'ble the Minister for Education for having agreed to a compromise of this character, but considering the fact that he had hardly been in office a month before he was called upon to formulate his demands, I for one leave him alone with a word of sympathy in his favour. If, however, there be any chance of revising the present policy, I beg of him to exert all his influence and to impress upon the Finance Member this claim of primary education with all the vigour and emphasis at his command.

Speaking on the educational grants, I think, I would be doing an injustice to the Hon'ble the Minister for Education if as a representative of the Muhammadan community I were not to express my gratification at his having secured a provision of a lakh of rupees for a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta—a thing to which the Muhammadans of Calcutta and the whole Province have been looking forward for the last 9 or 10 years—a thing to which I believe the Hon'ble the Minister himself has been looking forward since the time he first entered the Council. I congratulate him on his success at last.

I shall not take up the time of the Council in discussing other subjects, because members have spoken on every conceivable subject and as I myself do not believe in sniffing at everything and catching nothing. I concentrated my attention on this one point alone, and I say if the Government are mindful towards the well-being of the masses they will at least demonstrate their sympathy in a practical way by making as large a grant as they possibly can for the early introduction in this country of free and compulsory primary education. Sir, in reply to a question of mine regarding the introduction of free primary education in the country, the Hon'ble the Minister for Education gave me, I cannot say an evasive

answer, but an unsatisfactory answer. I was told that the local bodies had already had powers to introduce free primary education within their jurisdiction and if they had not done their duty Government cannot compel them to do so. Sir, it strikes me as though the Government is not at all serious in asking the local bodies to do their duty for most of these local bodies, we know, have not fund enough to keep their street lamps burning even in dark and moonless nights. This to my mind is shirking a great responsibility which I feel all responsible Governments ought to undertake if they want to impress upon the masses that something is being done towards their welfare. The masses are not interested in anything else—they are interested mainly in their agriculture and they are anxious to educate their children. These are, no doubt, the paramount needs of the country. Sir, if I were in the position of the Finance Member I would have put as much as I could under this head and I am sure the country would have been grateful.

Before I resume my seat I want to impress upon all the members of this Council the necessity of intensifying their energies on this one question as by doing this alone we can achieve some tangible result of our activities in this Council. Sir, everyone will agree with me that so long as the masses are steeped in ignorance it is useless to talk of awakening political consciousness in them.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: There might be considerable difference of opinion about congratulating the Hon'ble Mr. Donald on his financial abilities; but my congratulations to the Hon'ble the Finance Member are because of his brilliant budget speech, both for its literary style and the cleverness with which he tries to outwit us. I must give him credit for providing us with a series of sensational thrills from beginning to end. Once he raises our hopes high, we are going to have a surplus budget, the Ministers would now be able to begin their nation-building works, from all our sources of income torrents are pouring in and so forth; but next he damps our spirits by saying that it is drugs and litigation which are the most flourishing sources of revenue; and regarding the surplus he hastens to tell us that we must not touch it for nation-building purposes, for it is destined to be swallowed up by new-fangled schemes like Howrah Bridge and so forth. So, alas, our current revenues must provide both for ordinary expenses of administration and huge capital expenditure like police buildings and widening of Madaripur Bhil route—though I do not know why the name of the Madaripur Bhil route has been changed to the lower Kumar River, perhaps again to deceive us. And, Sir, if hopes had been raised in us that our Ministers' schemes would be given effect to when they once break through their chrysallis stage, a remote possibility no doubt, our hopes in the next sentence are dashed to the ground. Really, Sir, what an artist the Hon'ble Mr. Donald is! What brilliant display or light and shade. And our Finance Member is a clever man, too, manœuvring

with the greatest skill and circumspection. For he carried us with him in effecting all-round cuts last year and managed to earn our gratitude for economic management. But, in the next year's budget, we find that the cuts are vanishing from the reserved departments and only those in the Ministers' Departments being granted a permanent place. And the Hon'ble the Finance Member is ready with his reasons too, for when in the reserved department he wants to make the cuts whole, he bemoans their crippled conditions and laments over their loss of efficiency; while in leaving alone the transferred departments, he points to their contented mother, the amenable Minister, and expects us to keep quiet.

He is however magnanimous enough to allot Rs. 36 lakhs to new schemes from our current revenue, of which,if we compare the budget estimates of the current year with those of the next, it will be seen that only about Rs. 11 lakhs have been doled out to the nation-building departments. The budget estimates of 1923-24 under the heads "Education, Medical, Public Health, Agriculture and Industries" amounts to Rs. 238½ lakhs, and the estimates for the next year under those heads come up to Rs. 240 lakhs. Thus, about Rs. 1½ lakhs have been provided for new schemes. To this about Rs. 9½ lakhs have to be added for fresh brick and mortar activities provided in the budget, bringing the total to Rs. 11 lakhs as I have said already. This is really deplorable. Then with regard to the investment on brick and mortar, I am constrained to say that this only benefits the people living in the towns, whereas the time has come when it is absolutely necessary for a popular Government to reach the masses and bring relief to the village folk. The Government ought to bear in mind that by far the great majority of us have been returned to this Council by rural electorates and it is our paramount duty to attend to their needs first. We therefore want that larger and larger amounts should be allotted to rural water-supply, anti-malarial measures and anti-kala-azar campaign. But, fancy a paltry sum of Rs. 50,000 have been allotted to rural water-supply and another Rs. 50,000 to anti-kala-azar campaign! Such callous treatment of rural needs as compared to lavish expenses on nurses' quarters, for tar macadamising the Strand Road, and construction of new roads in the Duars only embitter our feelings. And the reason assigned by the Finance Member for this differential treatment is that expenses on rural needs are of a recurring character and those on nurses' quarters are of a non-recurring character; and as it is bad principle to spend the surplus on projects involving recurring expenses he would rather allot Rs. 10 lakhs to nurses' quarters than provide more than Rs. 50,000 for rural water-supply. Beautiful logic indeed! Sir, I have no quarrel with him if he has a soft corner in his heart for the nurses, but I surely differ from him if he thinks that rural water-supply is an item involving recurring expenses. I maintain therefore that there is not the least justification for this neglect of an urgent rural need unless it be that our Ministers are afraid of incurring the displeasure of *de facto* powers and have not the

courage to press their claims. The belated outbursts of our ex-Ministers certainly illustrate their helplessness before the Finance Member and if that really be the condition in the Department of Finance, it is high time that we should put some check on his arbitrary authority. In the pre-Reform days we had a strong Finance Committee which helped the Finance Department in making the allotments and if my information is correct, we have such a Committee at Delhi too. So I do not see any reason why we should not have such a Committee here specially when we see that so long as in office the Ministers, even men like our good old Nawab Sahib and the sober Mr. Mitter who denounced the Finance Department the other day, dare not show any fight with the Finance Member but much rather evince a tendency for tenaciously sticking to their office at any cost and so submit to the whims of the strong man of the Finance Department.

Talking of Ministers, Sir, I cannot help alluding to a peculiar thing, and I do not know what I shall attribute it to. For in the first budget after the Reforms, we found the Ministers' salary placed as a non-voted item in a Reserved Department. But thanks to the Solicitor-General in England it was placed later on as a voted item, but still in the Reserved Department and so subject to certification. But this year we find a still further change. It is a voted item in the transferred department and so free from the trammels of certification! Change in the angle of vision or further advice from the Solicitor-General? And, Sir, if our kind and Hon'ble the Finance Member has conceded so far, why does he not go a bit farther, and bring the system on a par with the English Parliamentary practice where each Minister demands his own salary? For, otherwise, for the sins of one, all do suffer. However, Sir, we welcome this change, and eagerly expecting the next we hope the Ministers too would note this change and act accordingly.

Dr. PRAMATHANATH BANERJEA: The budget for the ensuing year has been described in some quarters as a surplus budget. The margin, however, is so narrow that if you allow for slight inaccuracies in the details the so-called surplus budget may really turn out to be a deficit budget. Besides, the conditions are so different in unhappy India and in this unhappy province of Bengal from those of other countries where the finances are under popular control, that even a real surplus budget does not always afford an occasion for congratulation. For no sooner do you realize or expect to realize—a surplus than your rulers begin to indulge in expenditure which is either wholly or in part wasteful. Our Finance Member, in the expectation of a surplus, and in view of the fact that there is a considerable balance on hand, feels justified in embarking on new schemes, and earmarks for the purpose Rs. 88 lakhs. Some of these schemes, it is admitted, will involve recurring expenditure. But what will happen if the financial situation becomes difficult next year? The Finance Member says that these

schemes are urgent and important in administration and for development and progress. I am a layman uninitiated in the mysterious of Governmental business, and it would certainly be regarded as a presumptuous on my part if I attempted to give my opinion on questions relating to administration. But the House will, I am sure, agree with me when I say that the words "development" and "progress" bear in the Anglo-Indian official dictionary meanings different from those they bear in ordinary parlance. A few of the schemes adumbrated by the Finance Member may be beneficial to the country, but as regards the majority of them I am not convinced that they will in any way conduce to the welfare of the people.

A few words may here be said about the principle and policy of meeting ordinary expenditure out of the balances. The history of the depletion of the balances of this Province is, I believe, known to members of this Council. When the Government of India Act of 1919 was passed, Bengal had a large accumulated balance, amounting to no less a figure than Rs. 3 crores 44 lakhs. But as a combined result of the introduction of the Reforms and the acceptance of the Meston Award, the annual expenditure greatly exceeded the annual revenue, and the consequent deficit had to be made up by drawing very largely upon the balances. It should be remembered in this connection that the balances consisted mainly of funds set apart for subjects connected with what are called "the nation-building departments." But for what purposes were they spent in 1921-22? For carrying on the ordinary work of administration, in other words, for the benefit chiefly of the secretariat, the police, the prisons, and so forth. Was it fair, I ask? Was it just? Was it consistent with good policy? No. One cannot help describing such action as a misapplication of the public revenues.

It may be objected that I am harping on the past. But the same policy is going to be repeated in future. You starve the departments which are intimately connected with the welfare of the country and gather up a surplus, and then devote it to objects which may be dear to your heart but which the public does not want. In the current year's budget, in the hope of realising a surplus certain supplementary demands are being placed before the Council. To what department do these demands relate? Does any of the nation-building departments such as education, sanitation, or industrial development figure prominently in the supplementary estimates? No. The favoured subjects are police-buildings, the British Empire Exhibition, and so on.

I desire to enter my emphatic protest against this policy of frittering away the balances. And what I suggest is this. Let a certain amount, say Rs. 50 lakhs, be fixed as the minimum provincial balance, and let any sum that may be left over and above this be set apart so as to constitute a Special Fund, to be devoted to some urgent public need of

the Province. The members of the Council will, I am sure, agree with me in holding that sanitation is the most important problem of Bengal at the present moment and on the solution of this problem depends the very life of the nation. But no sanitary improvement is possible without large capital expenditure. I, therefore, urge that the provincial balance be utilized for this purpose, and to this Sanitation Fund be added every year whatever surplus may be available. A change of policy in the direction I have indicated will not only be welcomed by the people as the dawn of an era of sound financial management but will confer a lasting benefit on the people.

The Hon'ble the Finance Member claims credit for his department and the other departments of the Government for having retrenched the expenditure to a very large extent. In so far as an attempt has been made to avoid wasteful expenditure, he has my full support. But, it is worthy of note that the knife has been applied ruthlessly, to use the words of an ex-Minister, to the transferred departments. Nor can I overlook the fact that the policy of retrenchment has been carried out with great care and circumspection so as not to entail the abolition of any of the highly paid posts. Let me take an illustration. In the Department of Industries, the services of all the highly paid officers, such as the Director, the Deputy Director, the Industrial Engineer, etc., have been retained, but the five Indian Superintendents who were drawing Rs. 250 or Rs. 300 each and were doing important work have, along with a number of clerks and peons, been dismissed.

Coming to the ensuing year's budget, we find that the usual ratio between the two halves of the Government has been carefully maintained. In the revised estimates for the current year, the expenditure on the reserved side is Rs. 6 crores 70 lakhs, and on the transferred side Rs. 3 crores 35 lakhs. The provision for the coming year is Rs. 6 crores 95 lakhs for the reserved departments and Rs. 3 crores 47 lakhs for the transferred. These figures are significant in this that they prove that in the opinion of the Government the reserved departments are at least twice as important as the transferred departments. It should be remembered in this connection that some of the transferred subjects are not really connected with the well-being of the people. Anyway, the time has come when the Council must urge with all the emphasis at its command that the distinction between these two halves of the Government must be entirely abolished.

The entire budget is so disappointing—nay, exasperating—that it is useless to discuss its details at any length. I will, therefore, content myself with only a few observations on the most important subjects. An increase has been provided for General Administration in the budget, while the police has been indulgently treated. The increase under the latter head is, it should be noted, for supervision charges. But this need not cause any surprise, for supervision, and not work, is the primary concern of the British Indian system of administration.

As regards Education, the Hon'ble the Finance Member confesses—I hope with a sense of shame—that the provision made in the ensuing year's budget is less than the expenditure of the current year. Certain European and Anglo-Indian schools have received substantial grants, and I do not envy their good luck. I am also glad that the Dacca University has obtained Rs. 9 lakhs. I earnestly desire that a centre of culture should grow up in the eastern part of this Province. But when I find that neither a non-recurring grant nor an additional recurring grant has been made to the Calcutta University I cannot help feeling that a great injustice has been done. Is there a single member in this Council who will not strongly condemn the attitude of those who seek to starve an institution which has been producing scholars of world-wide fame—one of whom has recently been elected a Fellow of the Royal Society of London—an institution which we all wish, should be the pride and glory not only of Bengal but the whole of India. Higher education is an expensive affair, and it can never be made a success unless large grants are made by the State for this purpose. I hope, therefore, that it is not too late now to provide for a non-recurring grant of Rs. 1½ lakhs to cover the deficit of the Calcutta University and a recurring additional grant of a similar amount for purposes of improvement.

Nothing can be more regrettable than that there should be a decrease of Rs. 44 lakhs in expenditure on the transferred side of secondary education and a decrease of Rs. 27 lakhs on the transferred side of primary education. The Finance Member refers to two new schemes in the Department of Industries, namely, the erection of a small demonstration factory in the Serampore Weaving Institute and the construction of a permanent building for the Survey School at Mainamati. When this important subject of industry is receiving such earnest attention at the hands of our paternal Government, nobody need despair of the industrial future of the province!

[At this stage the member reached the time-limit, but he asked for two minutes more to finish his speech.]

Mr. PRESIDENT: I am sorry I cannot allow you any more time, Dr. Banerjea. You have arrived at a full stop, and it is the most convenient point to conclude.

Dr. MOHINI MOHON DAS addressed the Council in Bengali. The translation of his speech is as follows:—

I am afraid that my language may not be understood by any one here with the single exception of Shah Emdadul Haq. It is a misfortune of the country that though this Council is the Council of Bengal and of the Bengalis, yet it is filled up by men who are ignorant of the Bengali language, for which there is no room here.

The budget, too, which we are going to discuss here, is drawn up by a person who is perhaps ignorant of Bengali and who has had no opportunity of acquainting himself with the language, ideas and wants of the masses of the country.

We fail to understand the result of such discussion. The budget was not prepared by any of us, nor would the resolutions, carried by us in this House after discussion, be binding upon Government; the Government would arrange for expenditure according to their wishes. And yet for the purpose of such discussion, so many talented persons of Bengal, whose time is valuable (have assembled here and) have been for the last three days holding discussions on it. Again, the very elections for this Council cost us more than 4 lakhs of rupees, whereas we see that just similar elections, namely, the elections for the Bengal Provincial Congress Committee cost only Rs. 400 or even less than that.

Last year, though a large sum of money was sanctioned for the education of the depressed classes, yet ultimately the Government were prepared to spend only Rs. 2,000 (?). This year I find no such sum mentioned in the budget, and I thank Government for this. For, it is known to all to-day what benefit is derived from such education. Do Government think that the depressed classes have had their fill of education or, that they do not deserve it, or was the grant which was made last year, due to other causes? During the stormy days of the Bengal Partition, references were made to the favourite and unfavourite queens and by creating separate interests for (our) Moslem brethren, a division was effected among the people of this country. If anybody thinks now that the grant of the last year was made with the sole object of winning over the vast community of the depressed classes, during the non-co-operation agitation, what have we to say in reply to that? Otherwise, why has the grant been stopped after only one year? Many people think that a plot of land was acquired for a college for our Moslem brethren seven years ago; and that afterwards when, concentrating upon the Khilafat agitation, they marched on the way to Swaraj, then there came a lakh of rupees. Some people think that the sum of Rs. 20,000 mentioned above and the grant for the college for Moslems were sanctioned with the same object.

We have been surprised to find the grant for Primary Education reduced by Rs. 27,000. If we had Swaraj Government, we would have sanctioned two crores for this purpose. Ninety-five per cent. of the population of this country live in the villages and are illiterate; it is Primary Education which they require. It is absolutely impossible for them to come to the towns for their education. This year, nearly ten and a half lakhs of rupees have been allotted to the Dacca and Calcutta Universities in the budget. What benefit will the poor illiterate people derive from this? Why should their money, which is like life-blood, be spent for the luxury of education on such an extensive scale?

The town universities, maintained at such huge expenditure, serve only to produce a number of officers to support and carry on the Government.

Next comes the Police. This department costs nearly two crores of rupees. What need is there for us, rural agriculturists, for the police? The chaukidars and the panchayets are enough for our purposes. When police officers, higher than these, come to us, they come as a storm, as a veritable danger. Life becomes extremely miserable to please them. We get no money to drain our bheels, no money to enable us to defend ourselves against the attacks of malaria and kala-azar, yet we have to spend nearly two crores of rupees for the police.

We need food for our stomachs, medicine when we are ill, and education. But food we have not got in our stomachs, and medicine we cannot get in our illness. The money provided in the budget this year for the supply of medicine is, as Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy, an experienced and well-known physician, says, just enough for three days' supply for the number of persons who undergo medical treatment in this country. We have heard that in some dispensaries in the mufassal, in fever cases, the doctors, after putting medicines into the phials with the doses marked thereon, advise the patients to "buy quinine from the post office and take it."

In the world, the rebellion of the belly is the most serious rebellion. We warn Government that if the vast, inert masses, who are the images of God, are disturbed and roused in this manner—if the hungry men and women are awakened—a terrible disaster will befall this country, society will be destroyed and the centre of the administration of the State will be dislocated.

Mr. PRESIDENT: Order, order. I want to bring it to the notice of members before I adjourn the House for 15 minutes that I shall bring this debate to a close this afternoon so far as the non-official members are concerned. We will adjourn now for 15 minutes until 6-25 P.M. and the House will then reassemble and sit up to 7-25. To-morrow I shall call upon the Members of Government to reply.

[Here the Council was adjourned for 15 minutes.]

After the adjournment.

Babu MANMATHA NATH ROY: I have very serious doubts whether any useful purpose is served by a general discussion of the budget. It seems to produce no effect on the Government. It appears to me to be a cry in the wilderness so long as the present system continues and the dyarchy does not go. I was not a member of the last Council, but on looking into the proceedings of the Council at the time of the general discussion of the budget about a year ago, I find that almost all the elected members sounded a note of disappointment. It was felt that although the Government had exploited all sources of revenue, and had imposed additional taxes with a view to provide funds

for the nation-building departments, no progress had been achieved, and that so long as the policy was not changed—so long as a response from the whole Government in all its departments, transferred and reserved, did not come, there was no possibility of room for any improvement or development. It was also felt that the administration, since the Reforms were introduced, had become very expensive and top-heavy and there ought to be cuts at the top. These two questions appear to me to be of essential importance. The policy ought to be changed, there ought to be response from the whole Government, and there ought to be cuts at the top. I ask the Hon'ble the Finance Member what evidence is furnished by the figures in the budget that has been presented to us that there has been any substantial response from the Government? We find that this Council has always objected to an increase in expenditure in the Police Department; notwithstanding that, an additional grant of Rs. 10 lakhs has been demanded. Another additional grant of Rs. 6 lakhs has been demanded for nurses' quarters. The nurses may be in the good books of the bureaucracy, but while all these demands are there, we find that only half a lakh has been demanded for anti-malarial measures all over the Presidency.

Is this any evidence of a change of policy or response from the Government? I will also ask the Finance Member what retrenchments have been effected at the top? Recently a resolution was passed in this Council that the post of the Director of Public Instruction should be abolished. I found in the *Calcutta Gazette* yesterday that a member of the Indian Educational Service had been appointed to officiate for the late Dr. Dunn. Is this any evidence of response or that the Government is anxious to effect retrenchment? We hear that the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan vacates his office within the next few months. It is rumoured that appointment will be made in his place. Would it not be a desirable economy, if in place of four reserved departments we have three, and the work that used to be done in these four departments were divided amongst these three? What I feel is that if we want to have money for these nation-building departments, we have to effect retrenchments and no appreciable retrenchment can be effected unless we have cuts at the top. We oppose the budget because we want the Government to change its policy, we want the Government to respond to this Council, not the Government in its transferred departments alone, but the Government as a whole.

Sir, I do not propose to go into details, but there is one other matter to which I wish to refer. I happen to be connected with it in another place,—I mean the Calcutta University and the treatment that has been accorded to it. It may be in the recollection of this House, and it appears from the papers that have been circulated to us, that a grant of Rs. 3 lakhs was made to the Calcutta University last year. One cannot understand why the whole of this amount has been omitted in the present budget, although there is a

deficit of Rs. 1½ lakhs in the University budget of the current year, for which amount the University had applied to the Government in September last. Since last year we have made all possible economies in the University; the deficit for the last year was Rs. 5½ lakhs, while the deficit for the current year is only Rs. 1½ lakhs, this has been the result of the many economies that we effected in expenditure in the University. I put a question to the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of Education some time ago, as to whether it was intended to make a grant for the purpose of wiping out this deficit. The answer I got then was that the matter was under the consideration of the Government. I would wish the Hon'ble the Minister to let this Council know why it has not been possible to accede to the request of the University, although demands have been made for Rs. 9 lakhs for the Dacca University and another lakh for the purpose of establishing a Muhammadan Arts College. I do not propose at present to go into the controversial question of the Muhammadan Arts College. I would rather leave it alone there for the present. The amount that has been demanded for the Calcutta University is a recurring grant given annually during the last few years to which the Government is committed since the days when the Government of India was at the helm of its affairs; and surely the University which has worked notwithstanding difficulties and obstacles is entitled to that small fraction of the Government revenue, which will enable it to wipe out its present deficit.

Babu SATYENDRA CHANDRA MITRA: I would have been very glad to speak in my own vernacular, but under the existing rules I know we have no other alternative but to speak in English. I do hope, however, that in the near future the House will see its way to alter its rules.

Mr. PRESIDENT: We have no power in this Council to alter the Statutory Rules under the Government of India Act. I am afraid it is no use to labour that point.

Babu SATYENDRA CHANDRA MITRA: I beg your pardon, Sir. Now as to the budget. As a Swarajist I am against the present system of Government under which more than half the Provincial revenue is appropriated by the Central Government, the major part of which is spent in maintaining an army which, as the present Premier once said, is primarily needed not for Indian but for Imperial purposes. Of the remaining half of the revenues that is left to provide for the needs of the Province nearly two-thirds are appropriated by the reserved departments under the present hybrid system of Government, known as dyarchy—a system hitherto unknown in the history of the world, ancient or modern. Even when peoples' representatives have control over grants, they do not appear to have any real or effective control

over appropriation. They have no power to see whether the money voted is properly and economically spent. Members vote a certain sum for certain works and it is not unusual that supplementary grants are demanded for these works when they are half-finished. The members then have hardly any option in the matter of voting the supplementary grants. Members ought to have control over the execution of works and periodical reports ought to be submitted to show that there is no likelihood of the grant being exceeded and that the work is being efficiently and economically done.

Coming from a small town and being intimately associated with the poor villagers, it is but natural that I should look into the budget to see what provision the Government have made to spread education, to combat kala-azar and malaria and for drinking water. But when I looked into the budget I was disappointed. The Government indeed pose as the guardians of the dumb millions but they have not taken adequate steps to remove the apalling ignorance and poverty of their wards, they have not adopted measures to combat kala-azar and malaria which claim victims by tens of thousands every year. The Government, who pose as the guardians of the inarticulate masses, are not responsible to the people, their self-imposed responsibility they may brush aside, for however much they may have behind them the mandate of guns, howitzers and aeroplanes they have not the mandate of the starving, diseased and ignorant millions. But we who have been elected by the people cannot so brush aside our responsibility to them. The hungry diseased people look up to us for helping them to get food and light. What are we to say to them? With the best of intentions the Government have not yet been able to have a compulsory Primary Education Act or an Old Age Pension Act. We all know that he who opens a school closes a prison; but the Government seem to doubt the truth of the saying; otherwise how can you explain that while the actuals for the year 1920-21 for secondary education were Rs. 19,19,000 the Budget estimate for 1924-25 is only Rs. 19,32,000, an increase of only Rs. 13,000, while the actuals for primary education were Rs. 22,80,000, the Budget estimate for 1924-25 is Rs. 23,04,000, an increase of Rs. 24,000 only, whereas the jail expenditure has risen from Rs. 26,16,000 to Rs. 27,01,000 in course of a year; and the police expenditure, the revised estimate of which for the year 1923-24 was Rs. 1,75,24,000, has risen to Rs. 1,84,68,000. It should be remembered that the Retrenchment Committee recommended a reduction of Rs. 26,28,000 in their report of 7th January, 1923. On page 96 of the budget will be found expenditure under allowances and contingencies of District Police. The five items (1) travelling allowance, (2) house-rent and other allowances, (3) cost of railway warrants, (4) escort charges and (5) fixed boat hire charges and contingencies alone consume about Rs. 20 lakhs. It is certainly a terrible amount, but what I want to say is that if this amount or Rs. 26,28,000 the reduction recommended

by the Retrenchment Committee were spent in opening primary schools, excavating tanks and adopting anti-malarial and kala-azar measures the distress and grievances of the masses for whom the Government seem to have great sympathy would have been partially removed. While speaking of the very slight increase of Rs. 13,000 plus Rs. 24,000 in the budget estimate for primary and secondary education, above the actuals for 1920-21, I should have said that during the said period the increase in those departments under the Reserved head has been Rs. 3,05,000. The actuals for 1920-21 were Rs. 8,26,000, in the budget estimate for 1924-25 the figure is Rs. 11,31,000. While the expenditure under these heads for Anglo-Indian boys has increased by 37 per cent., that for Indian boys has increased by 7 per cent.

So far I have dealt with primary and secondary education. I now turn to sanitation. I belong to Noakhali. The people of my district are being decimated by kala-azar. I admit that the people have practically no idea of sanitation. This idea can only be inculcated to them if you open primary schools. Carlyle has said that a single man who has capacity for knowledge should die ignorant is the greatest tragedy. While I am helplessly witnessing this tragedy everywhere around me I may yet be consoled to see that their lives are being saved. Looking into the Financial Statement (page 54), I see that last year the Government did not spend a rupee on anti-malarial measures or for anti-kala-azar campaign. If this represent the measure of the sympathy of the Government for the people, well may they cry, "save us from this sympathetic Government." It is but natural that people have lost all faith in this Government and regard all their talk of sympathy as hollow mockery. They have placed their confidence in us to see if we can bring anything out of the Government to save their lives. After all they too know that blood is thicker than water. But the present system of Government has to be completely overhauled before anything really good can be secured for the people. But that is by the way. If early steps to prevent the ruinous progress of kala-azar be not taken East Bengal villages, especially those of my district, would come to be as sparsely peopled as West Bengal villages are now. We cannot, however, allow the villages to decay; we have to improve them. It is, therefore, no wonder that I view with great concern that no money has been budgeted for for preventive measures. Tinkering and patch-works which prove to be ineffective and wasteful expenditure are resorted to in times of epidemics. This will not do; sufficient funds should be set apart for anti-malarial and anti-kala-azar measures. Not a hundredth part of Bengal's revenue has been budgeted for for this purpose. Instead of setting apart only Rs. 1 lakh for anti-malarial measures and kala-azar campaign (pages 54 and 55), the Government should have set apart at least Rs. 10 lakhs to combat malaria and kala-azar. The District Board of Noakhali has demanded Rs. 25,000 for kala-azar from the Government.

I now turn to the question of drinking water. A sum of Rs. 50,000 has been budgeted for for improvement of rural water-supply. The District Board of Noakhali wanted Rs. 50,000 for Noakhali! I know of cases of men dying for want of drinking water. This fact may not appear in Police Register where the deaths might have been referred to as due to sunstroke or other diseases. There are extensive *char* lands in my district where for miles no drinking water is available. These *char* lands are mostly Government Khas Mahal which yield a considerable revenue, but the poor people are left to live as best as they can, or to die if they cannot, without drinking water. Ten times Rs. 50,000 would be too inadequate a sum for the supply of drinking water to villages. The Government owes it to itself, to the people, to the legislature to fulfil the primary needs of the people. For the sake of humanity the Government should reconsider and increase the amount tenfold at least. No wonder the Hon'ble the Ministers have the odium for no fault of their own, but for being entrusted with most responsible portfolios without being provided with funds. A top-heavy administration without a practical programme of work for the development of the resources of the country, which only can bring in additional revenue, will never be able to discharge its primary duties to the people—to save their lives and to educate them.

Verily, we have a Rolls Royce administration in a country of bullock-carts and suffer from many evils in consequence.

I have dealt with the three questions of primary education, malaria, kala-azar and drinking water. All these are intimately connected. Primary education would help them to realize the fundamental rules of sanitation; some experts say that malaria can be prevented by good drinking water and efficient drainage. The excavation of tanks and ponds, stocked with fish is another preventive of malaria, because certain fishes are said to devour the ova of anopheles.

I shall now draw your attention to some figures in the budget which require explanation and some of which appear curious, and make passing remarks thereon.

It is not possible to discover from the budget on what principle voted and non-voted expenditure have been increased, rendering it more difficult for the Council to effect reduction—*vide* pages 47, 49, 52, 53, 57, 61, 62, 81, 89, 93, 94, 126, 137 and 145 of the budget estimate of 1924-25.

(Page 48.)—Why should the salary of A.-D.-C. be shown in two parts; Rs. 4,350 only being voted. Rs. 14,000 is provided for travelling allowance although it is understood that both Military Secretary and A.-D.-C. travel with the Governor in his special train.

(Page 49.)—Cost of furniture and carpets should be cut down There was nothing non-voted in this item in previous year. Rs. 13,209 for maintenance grant (non-voted) should be cut down.

(Page 50.)—Body-guard establishment should be done away with as recommended by the Retrenchment Committee. Tour expenses have enormously increased from Rs. 1,04,000 in 1923-24 to Rs. 2,67,000 (of course including Rs. 1,40,000 for a saloon) in budget estimate (see, Financial Statement, page 27) which shows that the tour expenses have steadily increased from Rs. 75,000 in 1920-21. There should be no special saloon. If the Premier can travel in third class the Governor should be able to travel without any special saloon.

(Page 54.)—The figure against "Officer on Special Duty" is *nil* where Rs. 3,000 *plus* Rs. 7,000 is provided for his salary. The salary of the Publicity Officer and his contingencies are omitted; but Rs. 5,000 *plus* Rs. 23,000 are provided a little higher up for Publicity Officer and Reporting Agency. Fuller explanation is needed. It is the same thing under a different mask. No money appears to have been spent on this account last year.

(Page 55.)—The nature and usefulness of the duties of the two officers, Labour Intelligence Officer and the Officer on Special duty provided for should be clearly explained.

(Page 57.)—Officers on Special Duty: The salaries Rs. 33,000 were voted in the budget estimate of 1923-24, half-voted in the Revised estimate (for 1923-24) and fully non-voted in 1924-25. The actuals for 1922-23 were Rs. 17,503 which was on the voted list. What is the policy that has guided the Government in placing the pay on the non-voted list this year?

(Page 62.)—Contingencies should be reduced, and what do the "other charges" refer to? No such other charges were seen in other years.

(Page 63.)—The numbers of Collectors, Magistrates (Joint Assistant, Deputy and Sub-Deputy Magistrates) as well as their salaries should be shown.

(Page 71.) What does Rs. 4,500 (allowance of Advocate-General) represent?

(Page 73.)—Fees for Criminal cases (Rs. 2,40,000) should be cut down.

(Page 76.)—Provision for temporary District and Sessions Judges (Rs. 40,000 *plus* Rs. 1,46,000) and for temporary Sub-Judges Rs. 77,000 what does this mean? No charges were incurred in other years under this head. Why should there be any house-rent and other allowances?

(Page 77.)—The number of process-serving peons should be shown?

(Page 89.)—The 16 posts of Deputy and Assistant Commissioners should be justified.

(Page 90.) There are 138 Sergeants on salaries of Rs. 200 and less. The great question is whether these could not be replaced by competent Indians. What is the difference between a Sergeant and Assistant Sub-Inspector or a Head Constable as regards duty and competence. House-rent Rs. 60,920, contingencies Rs. 1,09,000 and rent, rates and taxes Rs. 3,91,000 should be cut down.

(Page 93.)—There are 8 superior officers costing Rs. 1,93,000 a year. Cannot it be reduced?

(Page 96.) The total allowances are as follows:—

	Rs.
Travelling ...	12,32,000
House-rent and other allowances	1,43,000
Cost of Railway Warrants ...	2,79,000
Escort charges	1,42,800
Fixed boat-hire and contingencies ..	1,97,000
Total ...	19,93,800

nearly Rs. 20 lakhs. The figure is terrible.

It is said that new rules have been framed which will have the effect of reducing travelling expenses. What is the financial effect of these rules upon the cost of travelling by police officer?

(Page 100.) There are 10 European Constables costing Rs. 6,980 a year cannot the same work be done by Indian agency?

(Page 121.) The grants to local bodies for primary education has remained practically constant since 1920-21, while under reserved heads the grant to primary and secondary schools has been freely increased from Rs. 8,26,000 in 1920-21 to Rs. 11,31,000 in 1924-25. The number of students benefited in each case should be stated. Expenditure (over receipts) on account of Dow Hill School with 120 pupils is Rs. 98,000 (page 76) (R.C.) and expenditure on account of Victoria School with 190 pupils is Rs. 94,000 (R.C.).

(Page 116.) Grant to Calcutta University is Rs. 1,47,000. Is the question of giving adequate grant to Calcutta University fixed in consultation with the University authorities? Is there any application pending before the Government for a grant of Rs. 1,45,000 for improvement of scientific education? If so, why has this been omitted from the budget if the application was received in time? How are we going to interpret the Hon'ble the Education Minister's declaration that one of his tasks would be to "rescue" the University?

(Page 124.) Rs. 850 is shown as salary of one of the teaching staff of the Commercial Institute. Who is the gentleman drawing this salary and what are his qualifications?

(Page 128.) There are 34 Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors costing Rs. 2,43,400 in salary, 350 Subordinate Inspectors costing Rs. 5,96,000 in salary, and Rs. 1,80,000 in travelling expenses. Considering the type of schools (primary and secondary) which they are required to inspect, it is possible to have the work done mostly by Sub-Inspectors at a much less cost. The higher posts require sufficient justification.

(Page 134.)—The Presidency General Hospital is reserved for Europeans and the cost of its maintenance should not be charged on the general taxpayers except to the extent that the inmates are public servants. It is only the difference between the special charges incurred for European patients, *qua* Europeans and the ordinary charge for an Indian that should be charged to general revenues.

(Page 137.)—What is the explanation for the fact that while in 1922-23 Rs. 62,636 was voted and Rs. 1,62,276 was non-voted, the corresponding figures for 1924-25 are Rs. 67,620 and Rs. 1,88,400? Why has there been such a large increase in the non-voted class of expenditure?

(Page 143.)—Rs. 1,82,000 are provided for expenses during prevalence of malaria. This is remedial expenditure which, of course, provides a palliative. But what about preventive measures?

(Page 147.)—Provision is made for hundred Veterinary Inspectors and assistants at an annual cost of Rs. 77,800. What benefit do the agriculturists get from the services of these officers? What is the nature of their duties? Do they travel into the villages to look after the cattle of the agriculturists? If not, on what grounds can their appointments be justified?

(Page 152.) It is found that a reduction of five officers has been made in the superior staff at a total reduction of Rs. 17,000 in the cost. What kind of work is done by this staff and what improvements in the methods of agriculture had been carried out by these officers so as to increase the agricultural wealth of the country? What is the nature of the duties of 131 men of the technical staff? Do they visit the villages and give technical advice and guidance to the raiyats?

(Page 153.)—The Sericultural Department costs Rs. 1,97,000. The total expenditure in five years is shown below:—

	Rs.
1920-21	2,01,689
1921-22	2,22,380
1922-23	2,03,395
1923-24	1,81,600
1924-25	1,97,000

The Retrenchment Committee recommended the Department should earn three-fourths of the amount it spends (Page 98 R.C.). An inquiry may be made whether the outturn of work done by the department in the shape of increase of wealth is worth the amount spent during the last 10 years. Retrenchment Committee recommended a decrease of Rs. 71,000 by abolishing the post of one Superintendent and by other means. The pay of Superintendent has been increased by about Rs. 3,000.

[The speaker having reached the time-limit at this stage had to resume his seat.]

Mr. DEPUTY PRESIDENT (Major Hassan Suhrawardy): For the first time since the inauguration of the Reforms the House is presented with a budget showing a surplus. I am not going to discuss whether this prosperity is real or only apparent or whether in the event of the Central Government claiming their share of the provincial contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs from Bengal, we are going to be again faced with a deficit budget. What I want to discuss is that although for the first time we have been lucky in getting a budget with a surplus, we are unlucky in finding that the transferred departments have not been shown the justice and the fairness and the generous treatment which was expected from Government as soon as it was in a position to give more money for schemes for the development of the nation-building departments. The Meston Award has been condemned on all hands and we all urge that it should be revised at the earliest possible moment. We want a just and equitable treatment by the Central Government towards our Province, but we also want that the Hon'ble the Finance Member should treat the transferred departments with equity and justice.

The speeches of my hon'ble friends Mr. P. C. Mitter and Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, past Ministers of Government, have thrown a flood of light on the manner in which the developments of the nation-building departments are hampered and cramped for want of generous treatment in the matter of funds from the Finance Department. In the readjustment of the financial control of the transferred departments I see one of the easiest means of showing that evidence of change of attitude of Government of, if I may use that much used phrase "change of heart of Government," which would be the mending of the dyarchy and the ending, I trust, of the programme of obstruction, and would herald the inauguration of peace and co-operation in the Council. I commend this to the serious consideration of Government.

I was amazed to read on page 4 of the Hon'ble the Finance Member's speech that retrenchments had a large say in the savings of about Rs. 2 lakhs each under Agriculture and Public Health, and I notice with regret that now that we have the good fortune of having a budget with a surplus, advantage has not been taken of compensating this wrong by a generous treatment of the Medical and Public Health Departments. Nor do I find adequate allotments of money for the development of schemes of rural sanitation, supply of good drinking water, eradication of microbic and epidemic diseases, medical relief of the sick, prevention of the spread of diseases amongst the healthy or for the protection of children and the young from injurious environments and vicious influences. We find an allotment of only Rs. 50,000 for anti-malarial and anti-kala-azar schemes: we find about Rs. 25,000

for maternity and child-welfare organisation: we find Rs. 25,000 set apart for checking the spread of small-pox and other epidemic diseases. There has been a crying need for adequate water-supply in Bengal. People have been crying for what they call *pinako jol*, good drinking water and *chashèr jol*, water for agricultural purposes, but their frantic cry has not changed the heart of the Finance Member. Nothing has been done for any scheme which might do away with this great handicap in Bengal and no scheme has been put forward for meeting this most important and necessary demand. We find that an allotment of Rs. 33,000 has been made for sinking tube-wells all over Bengal. I do not think that these things show that the nation-building departments have been in any way generously treated by the Finance Department; especially the very ungenerous treatment of the Public Health Department is very much against what we all expected from Government as soon as they were in a position to give more money. I remember distinctly the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea telling us that as soon as the financial position changes, we shall have an effective campaign for the eradication of malaria and kala-azar and for the adequate supply of good drinking water and for rural sanitation. But nothing has been done. On the bedrock of sound health is broad based the superstructure of education and the development of agriculture and industries beyond which lies the goal of Swaraj to which we are so ardently looking forward. I for one do not grudge fair treatment to anyone including the Police Department. I know that by getting houses of their own, a lot of recurring expenditure incurred now in the shape of house-rent would be saved. I know that by providing mosquito nets sickness amongst the police will be reduced. But in the relative fitness of things, the transferred side should have been shown the same thoughtfulness and generous treatment which has been shown to the Police Department and other reserved departments of Government. If Government is responsible to and responds to the wishes of the people, then the departments that have been transferred to the responsibility of the people should get generous support and the finances of those departments should be controlled by the people to whom the Ministers are responsible.

The next question which I would touch is the question of unemployment. We all know that idle mind is the devil's workshop, and much of the discontent that has been in the country has been fostered by unemployment. We do not find any definite scheme for counteracting this evil. To my mind it seems the establishment of a Bengali Regiment would be one of the ways of solving this problem of unemployment. It will give employment to a large number of Bengalis who at the present moment swell the number of the discontented. It will inculcate discipline and restraint in them and develop martial instincts amongst them. It has been said that the martial spirit is lacking amongst the Bengalis. I have been associated with the territorial

movement and from what I have seen of the Bengali Territorial boys, I can say that they have got the makings of a soldier and I have the authority of the Gurkha Instructors who told me that in two months the Bengali boys have grasped the essentials of parade and drilling, and in six months' time given encouragement and opportunity, they will shape into as good sepoys as can be found in the other presidencies of India. There are other means of finding relief for the unemployed, but the makers of the budget have not thought of any of these means. Then the next point which I wish to touch is about the establishment of more medical schools in Bengal. We all know that for every 42,000 of people there is only one qualified medical man in Bengal, and, therefore, we want to increase the number of qualified medical men and give them short but efficient training, so that they can go and practise in the rural areas where their need is felt to the greatest extent. For this purpose a committee was appointed by Government during the last Council and I acted as the Honorary Secretary and wrote a memorandum on the establishment of more medical schools in Bengal and pointed out how by the association of non-official practitioners on the teaching staff and remodelling of the existing sadar hospitals, good medical schools could be started with the minimum amount of expenditure at every district headquarters in Bengal and thus the need for more qualified medical men for the country met to some extent. The needs of Jalpaiguri in the north and of Chittagong in the far south-eastern end of the Province were very strongly brought forward before the committee. I am sorry that nothing has been done to give effect to the recommendation of the committee regarding the establishment of medical schools in these two centres. My hon'ble friend, Mr. Travers, brought forward the need for the establishment of a medical school at Jalpaiguri, and I believe he and his friends have gone forward a good deal in getting together resources for the establishment of a medical school at Jalpaiguri and Government ought to help those who have shown a tendency to help themselves.

Now, Sir, I want to say a few words regarding the Finance Member's statement that the Muhammadan members of the Council will doubtless be glad to hear that in the coming year the establishment of Muhammadan Arts College will be taken in hand. I must say hope deferred had nearly made our hearts sick. We welcome the establishment of an institution which will give opportunities of education to a larger number of Muhammadan students, because we do recognise that our salvation lies through the door of education and we must educate our boys. But I do not agree that the Arts College would be the type of college which will go to relieve the poverty and remove the discontent and overcome the subordinate position in which the Muhammadans find themselves to-day. Now that we have raised ourselves from our lethargy in our pursuit for modern education, let us not

repeat the mistake of wasting our energy in having our cultural education. "Read, Persian and sold oil" is a most expressive denunciation of cultural education, and I trust my hon'ble friend Maulvi Fasl-ul Huq will not concentrate his attention on the establishment of an Arts College, but rather a college for the Muhammadans where there will be technical, vocational and other scientific courses of training. There is no objection to having an arts section and he should not be content with less than a twenty lakhs scheme, we are not pleased with a two lakh schemes.

I take this opportunity of making a reference to the important question of female education for the serious consideration of the first Muhammadan Minister of Education—the educated man naturally looks forward to his companion for life to be a partner of his aims and aspirations, his ideals and ambitions. If he finds he has no reciprocity of views and enlightenment in his own home or in his own community, he seeks intellectual companionship elsewhere with the natural fatal results.

[Here the member reached the time-limit and resumed his seat.]

Babu NIRMAL CHANDRA CHUNDER: At this late stage I would not have taken part in the discussion if I had wanted to carry on the debate on the lines on which it has been carried on so long. On the general discussion of the budget some members have congratulated the Finance Member and some have complained against him, but what I say is that as a historical record this budget stands as a condemnation of the bureaucracy. If this budget had been presented, say, a century ago, we might have congratulated the Finance Member for his having been able to present such an attractive budget, but in this third decade of the twentieth century to have a budget like this is something which only a bureaucracy is capable of. By criticising it in detail we give it more value than it deserves. I only point out that this is an archaic budget.

In the first place, look at the revenue side. The previous speakers have complained that the major portion of the Bengal revenue is derived from Stamps and Excise. What else do they expect the major portion of the Bengal revenue to be derived from? In all countries the doctrine of indirect taxation taxation on commodities is considered as having been exploded. Even in conservative England, since 1906, if you compare the budget of 1906 with the budget 10 years back, what do you find? Indirect taxation disappearing and direct taxation taking its place, because direct taxation is the only equitable taxation that is possible in a free country. But no Government can resort to direct taxation unless that is a popular Government, and I challenge the British Indian Government to impose direct taxation all round, because it is very probable that in that case within a year there will be a break out of revolution for the simple reason that it is neither a

beneficial Government nor a popular one. You cannot possibly constituted as you are, go to the people and ask them: "Hallo, you are able to pay and so you must pay so that your poor brothers may have something to eat, so that their diseases may be attended to." You cannot say that. You have got to keep the police going: you have to keep your administration of justice as expensive as possible, because you have got to maintain a certain number of people in this country whom you cannot get without paying for their services much more than they deserve.

Then, Sir, looking at the expenditure side, what do we find there? Is there any attempt to recognise in these figures that the first and most paramount duty of a Government is to protect human life and not law and order. We must live first before our property is to be protected, because what is property worth unless we are allowed to live. Diseases of all kinds, which in other countries break out in an epidemic form once in a century, have become a permanent feature in this Province as also in other provinces in India. What serious attempt has been made to eradicate these diseases, may I ask? Nothing of the kind, because we have not the money. But we have got to pay for the police. Any householder who pays for insurance against burglary if he has to pay half his income for that will have very little left to insure against. As I began by saying I repeat again that I challenge this Government to place this budget before a board of economists and you will find the final condemnation of the bureaucracy. But apart from that in the budget itself we find misleading statements which might be excusable in the Home Member but certainly not in the Finance Member who has to deal with mathematics. Ever since our boyhood we have been told that mathematics is an exact science, and yet the Finance Member has wrongly quoted figures or has given explanations wrongly. Take for example, the explanation given at page 35 the savings of over Rs. 4,34,000 under allowances. This deals with the police and is due mainly to the curtailment of touring and inspections as already explained. Very well, look to the detailed estimate, what do we find? There is no difference so far as superintendence is concerned. Then so far as the District Police is concerned - I mean travelling allowance in 1922-23 it was Rs. 13,23,414; it was Rs. 13,89,000 in the budget of 1923-24; it was Rs. 11,11,000 in the revised estimate, and it is Rs. 12,00,000 in this budget. So there was a reduction of Rs. 2 lakhs only. Then, take the case of the Railway Police. There you find Rs. 2,65,000 in 1922-23, Rs. 2,40,000 in the revised estimate that means a saving of Rs. 25,000, and in this budget Rs. 2,77,000 has been provided for. In the C.I.D. travelling you find only Rs. 12,000 less. Then again, you take the budget estimate for 1924-25 which has been fixed at Rs. 7,50,000. It generally follows the revised estimate but allows for larger provision. There is larger provision as compared with the revised estimate under temporary

force. But why this provision has been made? We are told that there has been an attempt on the part of Government to make retrenchments, but we do not find any serious attempt. Then, Sir, there is another remark which I wish to make and with that I close and it is this. I think it is a mistake to provide for surplus budgets. If there are deficit budgets and we provide for education, medical relief and all these things generously, then there will be always an attempt in all the departments of Government to reduce their expenditure all round, but on the other hand, if you give them a surplus budget they will never try to reduce their expenditure, because they know that at the end of the year they will be able to come up to the Council and ask for more money. As I have said, the beauty of a deficit budget is always to be found in attempts to economise whereas I have found, especially during the Curzonian days, that whenever you have got a surplus there is always the tendency for Government towards extravagance.

Maulvi Md. ABDUL JUBBAR PAHLOWAN: It has been said: "Tell me what the financial position of a country is, and I will tell you the character of the Government and the position of the people." From this standard of judgment one might apparently congratulate the Government for bringing such a budget. But alas! we cannot congratulate the Government because if I look to my constituency, what do I find? I find men starving for want of food, men dying for want of good drinking water. In last December, in my village about a hundred persons died of kala-azar and malaria. If you do not believe me, I would ask you to refer to the vital statistics. The Government do not care for the good of the country: they have come to rule the country. They will rule it or kill it, no matter. The people pay the taxes through fear of bayonets and guns and not from their independent will. Year before last the Court-fees Act was passed, but it was stated at that time that when the Government had sufficient money they would abolish the tax. Now I find that the Government has got a surplus budget, but they do not care to abolish the tax. The time being short, I am obliged to stop to discuss the budget in detail, but I only appeal to the Government to adopt a cautious policy in the future.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned till 3 P.M. on Friday, the 29th February, 1924, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

The Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Friday, the 29th February, 1924, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President in the Chair, the four Hon'ble Members of the Executive Council, two Hon'ble Ministers (the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq and the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Ghuznavi) and 110 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Match manufacturing industry in Bengal.

***LII. Babu ROMES CHANDRA BACCHI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the number of the match factories now existing in Bengal?

(*b*) Will the the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government have arrived at any decision as to the prospect of the match industry in this Province with indigenous materials and machinery, so far available?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government have, so far, taken any steps to help the growth and success of the match industry, by—

(*i*) practical instructions and suggestions to the manufacturers;

(*ii*) subsidy; and

(*iii*) supervision and other means? If so, with what result?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking such steps?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Ghuznavi): (*a*) A statement furnishing information is laid on the table.

(*b*) to (*d*) The member is referred to the report, submitted by Mr. A. P. Ghosh, Match Manufacturing Expert, who was appointed by

the Government of Bengal to investigate the possibilities of the industry in Bengal, a copy of which is placed on the Library table. The report is now under the consideration of Government. The member is also referred to the Department of Industries bulletin on the bleaching of Gangwa wood in the manufacture of matches, giving some results of the researches of the Department, a copy of which is also laid on the table. The Department is at present engaged in research into the possibility of damp-proofing matches, which is of the greatest importance to the industry in Bengal. The question of giving subsidies cannot be considered until legislation is passed enabling Government to subsidise industries.

Statement showing the number of match factories in Bengal referred to in the answer to Starred Question No. LII (a) by Babu Romes Chandra Bagchi.

(1) Bandemataram Match Factory, Tollygunge.
(2) Sunderban Match Factory, 12, Dalhousie Square, Calcutta.
(3) A match factory owned by C. A. Mahammad, Tollygunge.
(4) National Match Factory, Ultadingi, Calcutta.
(5) The Bengal Match Factory & Saw Mills Ltd, 285/10, Bowbazar Street, Calcutta.
(6) Mohan Match Factory, Malda.
(7) Swaraj Match Factory, Kurigram, Rangpur.
(8) Bhovani Match Factory, 122-1, Upper Circular Road, Calcutta.
(9) Pioneer Match Factory, Comilla.
(10) Binajury Match Factory, Bufijuri, Chittagong.
(11) Hiranmayee Match Factory, Chittagong.
(12) Patiya Match Factory, Patiya, Chittagong
(13) Ghose's Match Factory, Comilla.
(14) Islamia Match Factory, Chatra, Comilla.
(15) Brahmanberia Match Factory, Brahmanberia, Tipperah.
(16) Dr. Nandi's Match Factory, Kalikachha, Tipperah.
(17) Sahatali Match Factory, Puranbazar, Chandpur, Tipperah.
(18) Barisal Match Factory, Barisal.
(19) Jovdurga Match Factory, Chaumuhani, Noakhali.
(20) Bhaumik Bros. Match Factory, Rajarampur, Noakhali.
(21) Feni Match Factory, Feni, Noakhali.
(22) A match factory managed by House of Labourers, Comilla.
(23) Kalachand Shilpagar Match Factory, Mymensingh.
(24) Prasanna Match Factory, Mechuabazar, Mymensingh.
(25) Sonarang Match Factory, Dacca.
(26) The Adhar Match Factory, Narsingdi, Dacca.
(27) The Bikrampore Match Factory, Dacca.
(28) The Govindo Match Factory, Narayanganj, Dacca.
(29) A match factory of the Narayanganj Industrial Co., Narayanganj.

(30) The Bharat-Mata Match Factory, Dacca.

(31) Bangiya Nirapad Match Factory, Faridpur.

(32) A match factory managed by Messrs. Ghatak & Co., Behala, Calcutta.

Proposed abolition of the Chinsura Agricultural School.

*LIII. **Babu BORODA PROSAD DEY:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the object with which the Agricultural School in connection with the Agricultural Farm at Chinsura was established about two years ago?

(*b*) Is it a fact that it is proposed to abolish the said school?

(*c*) If so, what is the reason for this?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN GHUZNAVI: (*a*) The Agricultural Vernacular School at Chinsura was converted into a Secondary Agricultural School in 1922 for training demonstrators and *gurus* and for giving a more advanced agricultural education to those who desired it.

(*b*) The answer is in the affirmative, but representations that have been made to the Government for a reversal of this decision are now under consideration.

(*c*) The recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee.

Defalcation in the Excise Department, Calcutta.

*LIV. **Babu ANILBARAN RAY:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that there was a case of defalcation of a large sum of money in the Excise Department in Calcutta about a year ago?

(*b*) If so, was the fact of the defalcation immediately reported to the Police and the Accountant-General as required by rule?

(*c*) If the fact was not immediately reported, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the name of the Excise Commissioner responsible for the said breach of the rule?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state —

(*i*) whether any steps were taken against the Commissioner for not reporting the matter at the proper time according to rule;

(*ii*) whether it was a fact that the cashier in charge of the money was kept in the office and he was paid his salary for months after the detection of defalcation;

(*iii*) whether it is a fact that the matter was reported to the police only after the cashier had disappeared;

(iv) whether it is a fact that this defalcation took place during the time of the then Excise Commissioner's Personal Assistant Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Choinuddin;

(v) whether it is a fact that the Office Superintendent was on account of this defalcation made to retire after censure; and

(vi) whether the said Office Superintendent had any control over account matters?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: (*a*) A case of defalcation of a considerable sum of money was discovered in the Excise Department of Calcutta about two years ago. The defalcation was going on for a number of years

(*b*) There was some delay in reporting the case to the Police and the Accountant-General, Bengal.

(*c*) Rai Sarat Kumar Raha Bahadur.

(*d*) (*i*) Proceedings were drawn up against the officer.

(*ii*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*iii*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*iv*) Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Choinuddin was Personal Assistant to the Excise Commissioner only for a part of the period during which the defalcations were going on.

(*v*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*vi*) The officer referred to had general control over the office.

Proposed acquisition of lands near Belur Math.

***LV. Babu MANMATHA NATH ROY:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the proposal to acquire lands contiguous to the Ram Krishna Mission compound at Belur for the East Indian Railway Company has given rise to public protest and indignation?

(*b*) If so, what action, if any, are the Government contemplating taking in the matter?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to the reply given to unstarred question No. 101 on the subject asked by Babu Khagendra Nath Ganguly at this meeting.

Patuakhali Waterworks Scheme.

***LVI. Rai SATYENDRA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI Bahadur:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that the health of the Patuakhali Municipal town

in the district of Bakarganj has become unsatisfactory for want of good drinking water?

(*b*) Is it a fact that a scheme for constructing water-works with the street-hydrants was made some time ago and a portion of the fund collected, but that it was kept in abeyance for an experiment with tube-wells which was tried but which failed?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of instituting an inquiry into the matter and of giving effect to the scheme?

SECRETARY to GOVERNMENT, DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (Mr. C. S. Dutt): (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Inquiry is being made as to the practicability of carrying out the alternative scheme originally proposed.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Proposed acquisition of land near Belur Math.

100. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that about 105 acres of land are going to be acquired just to the north and west of the Ram Krishna Mission grounds at Belur;

(*ii*) what is the particular object for which this acquisition is going to be made;

(*iii*) what are the reasons which have led the Government to sanction the acquisition of this particular site; and

(*iv*) why can no other site be selected and acquired for the purpose?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that this project has given rise to public indignation?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS [RAILWAYS] (the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan Chuznavi): (*a*) (*i*) This was the intention, but the question is under inquiry. The member's attention is drawn to the reply given to a similar unstarred question No. 101 asked by Babu Khagendra Nath Ganguly at this meeting.

(*ii*) The object is given in the *Calcutta Gazette* Notification No. 10145 L.A. of 2nd November, 1923.

(*iii*) Suitability of the site for the purpose for which it is required.

(*iv*) The question of an alternative site is now being examined.

(*b*) Yes, and full weight is being given to the local representations.

Proposed acquisition of land near Belur Math.

101. Babu KHAGENDRA NATH GANGULY: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works (Railways) aware that the declaration dated the 2nd November, 1923, as announced in the *Calcutta Gazette* of 7th November, 1923, regarding the proposed acquisition of about 106 acres of land at Belur by the Government at the expense of the East Indian Railway Company has been objected to by the local public and by the managing committee of the famous Hindu Monastery known as the Belur Math?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the effect of the said acquisition will be the removal of 249 residential holdings and the deprivation of as many as 37 families, who live on the manufacture of tiles and potteries, of their only source of maintenance?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the alternative site suggested by the people of Belur has got very few holdings on it and will be not only less objectionable to the public but could be acquired at a lesser cost?

(*d*) Have the Government considered the effect that the proposed acquisition, if proceeded with, will have on the religious susceptibilities of a large number of Hindus in all parts of the country who entertain a feeling of reverence for the Belur Math?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of requesting the Railway Board to relinquish the proposal of acquiring the site as announced in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 7th November, 1923?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Government are not aware of the details of homesteads and families falling in the proposed area.

(*c*) to (*e*) The question of an alternative site is now being examined and due consideration is being given to the protests made to Government. It has already been decided to exclude from the acquisition sufficient land contiguous to the Math to preserve its tranquillity and another portion to the north-east will certainly be omitted. Whether the remainder of the land included in the declaration will be acquired or an entirely alternative site selected has not yet been decided.

Confirmation in Subordinate Executive Service.

102. Babu BEJOY KRISHNA BOSE: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the confirmations of officers of the Subordinate Executive Service are being withheld since April, 1923?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the number of officers held back from confirmation;

(*ii*) the length of their service; and

(*iii*) the due date of their confirmation?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be also pleased to lay on the table a comparative statement of officers of the above service held back from confirmation, for the last three years?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that this has been the cause of discontent among the officers?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): (*a*) Confirmation in the Subordinate Executive Service is dependent on the following conditions:—

(*i*) the officer having completed two years' service,

(*ii*) his having passed the departmental examinations completely by both standards and having submitted a Treasury Training Certificate and case records to the satisfaction of the Legal Remembrancer.

(*iii*) The officer's general fitness.

It is not a fact that the confirmation of any officer who has satisfied these conditions has been withheld since April, 1923. There are two officers who had satisfied conditions (*i*) and (*ii*) before that month who have not yet been confirmed as Government are not yet satisfied as to their general fitness.

(*b*) to (*d*) Do not arise.

Hostels for Calcutta Medical College students.

103. Mr. P. N. CUHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of students of the Calcutta Medical College, residing in—

(*i*) messes, and

(*ii*) boarding houses, attached to the College?

(*b*) How many houses are there for the accommodation of the students?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the medical students are suffering inconvenience for want of accommodation in these houses?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of constructing suitable residential quarters for the students in the vicinity of the Medical College?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: (*a*) (*i*) Three hundred and twenty-seven students residing in 17 attached messes.

(*ii*) Nil.

(*b*) Seventeen.

(*c*) No serious inconvenience has been reported.

(*d*) Government consider it desirable that suitable hostels should be constructed for the students of the Calcutta Medical College. Land has already been acquired for the purpose at a cost of Rs. 7,05,000 and the project for construction of hostels at an estimated cost of Rs. 8,51,419 has received the administrative approval of Government. The project has, however, been held up for want of funds.

Appointments in the Excise Department.

104. Mr. P. N. CUHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the number of appointments that fell vacant in the Excise Department during the last three months?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether all these vacancies have been filled up?

(*c*) If so, when were they filled up?

(*d*) Were they filled up by the present Hon'ble the Minister or by his predecessor?

(*e*) How many of these appointments were filled up by the appointment of Hindus and how many by the appointment of Muhammadans?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI:

(*a*) There were sixteen temporary Excise Sub-Inspectorships to be filled up in the last three months.

(*b*) All the vacancies were filled up, but one of the selected candidates having refused the appointment offered to him, there is at present one vacancy.

(*c*) The above appointments were made on the 8th January, 1924.

(*d*) The appointments were made by the Commissioner of Excise and Salt, Bengal, in accordance with the recruitment rules.

(*e*) Eight appointments were given to Hindus and eight to Muhammadans.

Abolition of Circle Schools.

105. SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) for how many years the proposal for the abolition of the Circle Schools is going on;

(*ii*) how many of the Circle Pandits have been transferred to the retained schools during that period;

(*iii*) whether new men of the same qualifications have been taken into those schools; and

(*iv*) if so, what is the number of the new recruits?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state why the permanent Circle Pandits have not been provided with the new vacancies?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of providing the Circle Pandits thrown out of service with suitable posts?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the abolished Circle Schools had funds of their own?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the Government have taken possession of those funds after the abolition of the Circle Schools?

(*f*) If the answer to clause (*e*) is in the affirmative will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) the amount thus acquired by the Government; and

(*ii*) the head under which the money has been credited in the budget?

(*g*) Are the Government considering the desirability of spending the money in giving the Circle Pandits maintenance allowances unless and until they are provided with posts?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq): (*a*) (*i*) Over 21 years.

(*ii*) The information is not available, and protracted inquiry would be required to get the figures.

(*iii*) and (*iv*) Information received from Inspectors of Schools indicates that no new men were appointed permanently to the retained schools.

(*b*) Each case was decided on its merits mainly in the interest of the Pandit concerned.

(*c*) Yes; so far as is possible, will be done.

(*d*) This appears to be the case in some instances.

(*e*) The abolition of Circle Schools is not yet complete, and Government are not yet in possession of all the facts; but the available information indicates that in some cases money owned by these schools has been deposited in the treasury.

(*f*) (*i*) The exact amount is not yet known. As stated above, the case is still in progress.

(*ii*) The money is received as a Government receipt under the general head of Education.

(*g*) No. All Pandits holding permanent appointments who are not provided with posts under Government will be paid from provincial revenues such pensions or gratuities as they may have earned.

Hand spinning industry.

106. Maulvi ABDUR RASHID KHAN: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken by the Government to improve and encourage hand spinning and the amount spent on this industry by the Government during the last three years?

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: Designs of improved *charkas* were supplied by the department of Industries to several firms, six of whom put the *charkas* on the market and sold them. Certain firms in Europe were asked to supply hand spinning machines such as were used in Europe before power-driven machinery was introduced. Several sets of spinning machines have been constructed and supplied by the Government Weaving Institute, Serampore, to inquirers. A special department in hand spinning was opened at the Government Weaving Institute, Serampore. The Government peripatetic weaving schools all over Bengal regularly gave demonstrations in the spinning of jute, hemp, wool, coir and other long stapled fibres with spinning machines made at Serampore. Demonstrations were also given at all exhibitions in which the Weaving Institute participated. In addition to other expenditure incurred but difficult to estimate Government spent Rs. 3,000 on the manufacture and demonstration of spinning machines. These are but some examples of the various steps taken by Government for the encouragement of hand spinning.

Admission of visitors to meetings of local bodies.

107. Maulvi ABDUL QUADER: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether visitors are allowed to attend the sittings of District Boards and Municipalities?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: The member is referred to the answer given to clause (*a*) of unstarred question No. 25 asked by Shah Syed Emdadul Haq in the November Session of 1922, which is printed at page 69 of Volume X of the Bengal Legislative Council Proceedings.

Discussion of the Budget of the Government of Bengal for 1924-25.

Mr. C. R. Das: If I rise on the last day of this debate it is not to inflict a long speech on this House but to make a few observations in self-defence and to make a constructive suggestion. Sir, it has been said that I am the high priest of destruction in Indian politics. This criticism may delude those who are fond of copy-book maxims of morality. But I feel sure it will not appeal to those who are in the habit of dealing with living principles and questions of life. I ask my critics to point out one single instance where there has been any real constructive work without some destruction somewhere. If I am destructive, it is because I want to construct. If I am a non-co-operator, I can assure my friends it is because I believe in co-operation, and I believe that no co-operation is possible in this country unless you start with non-co-operation. Is co-operation possible between masters and slaves? What kind of co-operation may I ask do you expect between masters and slaves? My friend, Mr. P. C. Mitter, has always been a stout champion of co-operation, but what did we hear from him the other day? He said that all the time that he was seeking co-operation of course he was speaking as a co-operator his voice was not heard and he was crying in the wilderness. Well, I do not know whether he realised this fact then but whether he did or whether he did not he has certainly given expression to what is true of this so-called co-operation. Can we co-operate when our rights are disregarded? It is abundantly clear that if the Government really desires the co-operation of the people (hear, hear), they must respond to the wishes of the people. We are not prepared to co-operate where our rights are disregarded and when our finances are played with in the manner it has been done for the last 160 years.

Now, Sir, I tremble to make a constructive suggestion. I find the same policy is pursued even to-day—the policy of mistrust. We are charged with mistrust in the Government, but my answer is—it is because the Government has always mistrusted the people. Was it not pointed out by Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea (as he then was) that the history of Anglo-Indian administration is strewn broadcast with fragments of broken pledges? Since the declaration that memorable declaration of 1857, I refer to the Queen's Proclamation—down to the Reforms Act, for our part the history of Anglo-Indian administration has been the history of dead hopes and crushed aspirations, and yet we are asked to co-operate with the Government. What about the budget speech to which we listened the other day? We are told that there was a surplus I am speaking from memory—of a crore and twenty-four or twenty-five lakhs from the new taxes. Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy pointed out that the Government is promise-bound to spend that for the transferred departments. He pointed out promise after promise—the promise of His Excellency the Governor, the promise of those who come under him—but that promise has been wholly broken and the other day we were told that

this surplus was reserved for something else. Sir, I put a constructive suggestion before the Government for the last time. Now, out of this one crore and twenty-four thousand—(A voice: 24 lakhs)—I cannot think of crores and lakhs—why not out of this, if you want to waste, waste two-thirds of it, leave one-third for the transferred department? Surely, this is a modest request. Borrow Rs. 5 crores at 6 per cent. interest and arrange for a sinking fund at 2½ per cent. I think I have worked it out in this way: if you spend 13½ lakhs for sinking fund charges and 30 lakhs to pay the interest you will clear the whole debt in 20 years. With 5 crores for nation-building purposes you can do a great deal. Spend one crore for technical education in Bengal, spend one crore for primary education, spend 30 lakhs for special Muhammadan educational institutions (hear, hear), spend 30 lakhs for those who are called the depressed classes. I do not believe that they are depressed classes they are oppressed classes (hear, hear)- oppressed by the Government and the higher classes alike: spend one crore for the development of cottage industries, spend one crore for weeding out malaria and kala-azar and spend 40 lakhs for the development of agriculture you can do all this with five crores without any special efforts if you borrow it at 6 per cent. and spend one-third of the sum—the whole of which you are promise-bound to spend towards the transferred departments, and one-third to pay the interest and one-third towards the sinking fund charges, and I am sure you can better the condition of the people in this province. But will this be done? I, for one, hardly hope it will be done. I speak bitterly because we feel that our case is a case of lost opportunities, broken promises and neglected interests. I make this constructive suggestion for the last time and I want to see how the Government deals with it. You are always referring to the nation-building departments. I have often been told "Why, you have got responsible Government, the nation-building departments," but these so-called nation-building departments were instituted to be starved, the nation-building departments which are put forward as a pretence of self-government -the nation-building departments which were never at any time intended to be worked in the spirit of the Reforms Act. If you are sincere are you sincere? I make this constructive suggestion. Let us see how you deal with it.

The Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. ABU AHMED KHAN CHUZNAVI: I think it is fairly well known that the budget generally takes its final form for presentation to the Council by about the middle of January. Hence Ministers appointed in January can scarcely have an opportunity of influencing their first year's budget, whereas if the elections were held in June and Ministers took office in July, they would have time till October to survey the scene and decide what should or should not be provided for in the subsequent budget. This has been our initial difficulty, and this is our answer to some of the criticisms in that direction.

It will, however, be possible for me to make my policy felt in the administration of the funds which I found already provided in the budget by reappropriation for which I trust I shall have the approval of the Council, when necessary, in order to enable me to utilise those funds, for the purpose of working my policy which I shall have the privilege of outlining for the approval of the Council.

The responsible and constructive criticism of those who desire to see progress made, who desire to prove that we have the capacity of self-government in us and to take away by practical demonstration the last prop that supports the argument against handing over the complete administration of the country to the representatives of the people, a consummation which all alike desire, this responsible and constructive criticism will always strengthen my hands in giving effect to my policy and it will receive my most earnest and sympathetic consideration.

The country has had an unfortunate succession of deficit budgets coinciding with the initiation of the reforms and it must have been particularly galling to those who were eager for progress and for further reform; but in this, our country did not stand alone, for most of the budgets of the world have been unsatisfactory for that period. The inevitable reaction of the world-wide struggles of the last decade upon trade and commerce and the economic conditions of countries generally was the cause. We are emerging, it may be hoped, from that reaction now. Rai Harendra Nath Chaudhuri and others have mentioned about the Meston Award. Yes, we have still to fight the Meston Award or else all the sacrifices of taxation and retrenchments will have been in vain and our ambitious schemes of development in the transferred departments will be but idle dreams. Responsibility and sacrifice will be our greatest assets in that fight. Sacrifice our people have already shown. Let us not throw away our other weapon of responsibility and retard the progress of Bengal for another decade. Let this Council act in a responsible manner and display its desire and its zeal to carry on and then, in face of the sacrifices we have made, the Meston Award cannot subsist. With the Meston Award revised, Bengal can look to developments which cannot fail to convince the people that within the four corners of the present constitution there are possibilities far greater than have yet been dreamt of, possibilities the greatness of which is not unworthy of our best efforts to achieve and the consummation of which will be the one unanswerable argument against those who would longer withhold from us the plenitude of power which we all desire.

Sir, I abjure my countrymen in the name of God, in the name of all that is holy, not to strengthen the hands of those reactionaries and diehards who would so withhold from us what is our birthright, by our refusing to take advantage of the opportunities already placed within our reach by an obstructive policy which may, on the contrary, only prove that we are unfit for self-government or even for the present measure of responsibility. Such a refusal will be the very height of unwisdom at

the present juncture when in the political field of England the reins of policy have come into the hands of a Labour Government and in particular of a Secretary of State who has already given evidence of his sincere good-will for India and his sympathy for her attainment of Dominion Status. Here in this Council let us take this opportunity of expressing our gratitude to the Secretary of State for the assurance which he has thus given us and let us in our turn assure him of our support and co-operation in helping us to the early attainment of our goal.

Turning from these general considerations to the departments for which I am more immediately responsible, there comes first the Agricultural Department.

Agriculture is admittedly the greatest industry not only of Bengal but of the whole of India. In more senses than one the salvation of the country lies in the improvement of the agricultural industry from its present depressed condition. Not only is the present unemployment due largely to the failure of the agricultural industry but we have it on the high authority of Dr. Bentley, the present Director of Public Health, that it is only through the improvement of agriculture that the problems of disease and depopulation and even of the prevention of malaria can be satisfactorily solved. Thus not only from the point of view of industrial welfare but also from the point of view of public health generally it is the bounden duty of Government to explore all possible avenues for the improvement of the agricultural industry throughout the province.

To put it in a nutshell the position is this: Agriculture as a paying industry has broken down. People have ceased to believe in agriculture as a paying business concern. A great many people among the *bhadralogks* as well as peasants still keep up agriculture as their ancestral occupation, but in many cases at an actual loss. As a result, the children of peasants as well as of petty landlords are forsaking agriculture as a profession and are swelling the ranks of candidates for Government and other clerkships on salaries varying from Rs. 20 to Rs. 60 a month. Having ceased to be a paying profession, agriculture has also ceased to be a dignified profession and *bhadralokx* no longer care to go in for it as they did in the old days in the villages.

In order therefore to raise agriculture to its proper position in the national economy we must prove to the people that agriculture pays and that properly conducted it is highly remunerative. We must demonstrate before the people how by making agriculture into a "better business" we can bring about "better living" for the community.

It must obviously be the duty of the Government to take a lead in this matter. The work of the Agricultural Department in the field of research has brought forth valuable results in the shape of knowledge in respect of seed, manure, new crops, new methods, proper crop-rotations, etc. Where it has been defective it appears to me is in the matter of making the knowledge of the results a part of the common possession of the

agricultural community. It is, I fear, unfortunately only too true that the general body of agriculturists still continues to have little faith in the instruction imparted by the officers of the Agricultural Department. The general reply with which officers of the department are met is: "Before we can adopt your advice and your method, show us that your method has brought about the result which you claim for it." Government have established a number of farms in the province and the people naturally turn to them to find confirmation of the instructions issued by the department. To the scientist the farms may to some extent supply that confirmation but to the ordinary cultivator the confirmation is not obvious and to reach his comprehension it must be made obvious, it must be made clear and easily intelligible. Otherwise the farms may produce the very reverse of the effect which they are intended to produce. Nowhere in these farms is there a clear demonstration that agriculture can be a remunerative profession. On the other hand the figures published in the annual reports show that the annual expenditure on each farm greatly exceeds the receipts, and suggest that agriculture even as practised by Government departments is not a paying proposition.

It is true that one of the most important functions of these farms is to conduct experiments with seeds, manure, irrigation, new crops, new methods, crop rotations and the suitability of special methods to the soil of the farm and of the district in which it is situated and these experiments must continue to be an essential part of the work of each farm. At the same time it is obvious that the whole object of Government will be frustrated unless these farms possess besides the experimental section another section in which the method of conducting agriculture as a "better business" can be exemplified before the people. That is to say, these farms must contain a section where agriculture is conducted as a remunerative profession and where it can be shown that a typical holding cannot only be worked at a profit, but at a profit much greater than what accrues to the ordinary agriculturists who conducts his operations according to the old time-worn methods.

In the experimental section the considerations of economy do not arise. This section, however, must be kept entirely distinct from the other section which should be run on business lines and in which the results of successful experiments of the experimental section will be put into practice and demonstrated to the public. Separate accounts should be kept for the first section, the strictest economy should be observed and purely business methods followed. It should be the business of the officer in charge of the farm to show in this section at the end of the year a clear and satisfactory balance of profit on the working of the farm. According to the various needs of each district the operations in the farm should include field crops, fodder crops, market gardening, fruit farming, poultry farming and dairy farming. The experimental portion of each farm should be reduced, the portion conducted on business lines should be considerably increased. If the practical results

are commensurate with the experimental work, as it ought to be, then in no distant future there may be a possibility of the Agricultural Department paying its own way to a large extent.

If it could be shown that a holding of this nature could be made sufficiently remunerative it would have a great result in popularising agriculture as a profession in inducing educated people to take up scientific agriculture and farming than any lectures on the mere abstract principles of scientific agriculture. It will constitute a practical illustration to our people of how farming should be conducted.

Now in this matter Government farms of the nature I have indicated would offer a special suitable field of work. One of the most serious obstacles to the improvement of agriculture in the country is the extreme subdivision of holdings into fragmentary plots. Anything that will encourage the agriculturists to consolidate their holdings by joining up scattered plots into large blocks will have a highly beneficial effect and will be a step towards the creation of farms in the sense in which the word is understood in all progressive countries. Satisfactory solution lies in the way of teaching people to apply the principles of co-operation to agriculture. This can only be effectively brought about if the Government farms can be made to show practical results.

The farm should be a self-contained block or blocks of land with the necessary farm buildings standing on it, its plough, cattle and its own irrigation facilities. By managing a portion of each Government farm in the way suggested above Government will directly encourage the creation of farms in the true sense of the word and this will have a far-reaching influence on agricultural reform. Each Government farm is a compact block of land with its farm buildings, plough cattle and irrigation facilities and if conducted on business lines and shown to be remunerative it will stand out as an object lesson to the people in the matter of consolidation of holdings and it will serve as an incentive to the creation of similar self-contained farms as well as the introduction of scientific agriculture as conducted on the principles enunciated by the experts of Government.

As incidental advantages of the management of the Government farms on business lines it may be mentioned that the agricultural officers themselves will acquire a more practical training and will command more confidence among the cultivators. Training grounds will be created for apprentices of the peasant as well as of the *bhadralog* class who will learn there not only to regard agriculture as an honourable profession but also to conduct it in a profitable manner and this will go a great way in encouraging cultivators and capitalists to invest more money on agriculture than they do at present.

It is of the utmost importance that a careful record should be kept separately of the income and expenditure of the demonstration section of the farm and the statement of income and expenditure along with

the details of the method of cultivation, irrigation, etc., should be printed in Bengali at the end of each year and circulated among the people in order to create confidence in the methods of the department. It is needless to mention that not only should the method of cultivation receive careful attention in the farm, but the marketing aspect of the question should receive careful consideration and it should be the business of the officers in charge to make necessary arrangements to sell the produce of the farm at the most profitable market. In this way an admirable lead will be given to the people in each district as to how to conduct farming as it should be conducted, and to restore to the great profession of agriculture the high position which it ought to occupy in the national economy, and they will be prepared for the formation of those co-operative market associations which the Co-operative Department has for twenty years endeavoured in vain to initiate.

I have outlined a policy which I intend to pursue with the material which we have and the funds for which we are asking the Council. But I am considering a further development. We have no really big modern farms in Bengal, farms of, say, 200 acres or so, run with modern machinery on modern methods. It has too often been taken for granted that such farms are an impossibility in this country, yet I am told there are examples or there is at least one example of such a farm within a few hundred miles of Calcutta, at a place called Daulatpur employing motor tractors and modern farm machinery and what is most important, paying well. If we could demonstrate the possibility of such practical large scale farming we might open up a new profession for educated men with some capital and initiative. Figures have been placed before me which show that a good return can be expected from large scale modern farming in Bengal. As a zamindar I know that there are in many places large areas of lands from which such farms could be constituted. I know zamindars who are anxious to induce their sons to take up large areas of their Khas lands and farm them on modern lines. But they have no place to look for the guidance and training which is necessary for such an undertaking. I am examining this question with a view to demonstrating what can be done. If we could be successful and if we could induce even half a dozen young men in every district to take up large scale farming on scientific lines we should have a great achievement to our credit. A wonderful effect would be exercised on agriculture by the influence of these farms on surrounding holdings. The social life of the people in the mufassal would be influenced no less than their agriculture and a healthy and honourable profession would be opened up for young men. The more I think of the possibilities of such development the more convinced I become and I trust I shall have the support of the Council in investigating these possibilities.

Apart from the existing farms we are adding two more to our list this year, namely, Dinajpur and Jalpaiguri, and I am grateful to Mr.

Travers, Khan Bahadur Musharraf Hossain and Dr. Moreno for their appreciation of our policy.

My predecessor, the Nawab Sahib, has referred to educational schemes in agriculture. It is undoubtedly alluring for some to lay great stress on educational schemes in agriculture and to deplore the want of agricultural schools. Past experience has amply shown that students passing out from such institutions invariably hanker after Government employment, and what is the reason? It is simply and solely because they do not believe that agriculture can be a paying business. Therefore it is all the more necessary to demonstrate with practical result that agriculture can be run on business lines than to have agricultural schools which will only turn out an additional quota to swell the rank of the disconted. The Nawab Sahib has also said that if I had searched in the offices of the departments I would have found schemes such as those he has mentioned, ready for incorporation. In reply I can only say that I did not fail looking into every pigeon-hole in search of them but to my grief without any success. He also thinks that the districts chosen for the two new farms in Jalpaiguri and Dinajpur are not the happiest choice. May I say that if that choice was not happy, he is himself to blame as the choice was made by him? I am however very much obliged to him for being assured that he has every desire to help rather than to impede me.

The improvement of cattle is a most important function of the Agriculture Department. The last Council refused to provide funds to employ an expert, but something is being done in Rangpur Cattle Farm and in Dacca to evolve a strain of cattle which will provide good milk and good draught cattle. Anything that can tend to bring about this evolution will, I hope, have the support of the Council, for with good milk, public health is largely concerned and with good draught cattle agriculture might be very considerably improved. So far we are importing bulls of proved good strains for our purpose and crossing them with deshi and Sindhi cows in our possession to achieve our results by selection and distribute the results amongst the people.

In Sericulture we are pursuing the policy of distributing diseases free seed from our nurseries, increasing the number of nurseries and extending sericulture into districts in which it has fallen into disuse always from disease among the worms. There is an insatiable market, especially in America, for silk, but high standards are required for that market. If we can achieve those standards the industry will flourish. Our seeds are still popular and the rearers are willing to pay more and more for them so that we are more nearly approaching the realization of the cost price of their production.

There are two small departments—to some extent the handmaids of the Agriculture Department—to which I must briefly refer. I mean the Veterinary and Co-operative Departments. Each of these is essential

to successful agriculture although they both extend their influence to other fields as well. The agriculture of the province depends for its power and to a large extent for its manure on our cattle and the particular charge of the Veterinary Department is the cattle of the country. We are asking for funds to build a veterinary hospital in Dacca. There is no large veterinary hospital in Eastern Bengal and it is hoped that the opening of this new hospital will be greatly appreciated. The estimated cost is Rs. 29,000. No provision has yet been made for the staff, because the building will not be ready by next year. This hospital is not like the small District Board hospital to which Khan Bahadur Musharruf Hossain referred as being empty of patients in Jalpaiguri. If this means healthy cattle in Jalpaiguri I congratulate him, but I am certain our hospital in Dacca will not be empty.

Co-operative credit has been well organised and although there is room for very much more expansion there is scarcely a corner of the country which is not within easy reach of a society now. Co-operative trade and marketing, however, are still almost unknown. The organization of cottage industries, especially weaving, has made good progress and it is our policy to encourage this progress. The number of these societies and their variety is daily increasing and we shall encourage them in every way. But perhaps the development of co-operative irrigation in Western Bengal is one of the best lines of our policy and one that we intend to pursue with the greatest vigour. A few years ago an experimental irrigation society revealed during the famine in Bankura the limitless possibilities of such societies in Western Bengal and in his latest reports the Registrar proudly boasts of areas of blooming corps watered by these societies surrounded by the withering fields of those less fortunate and unorganised. There is no form of local effort that Government will more readily assist than this which has so striking a feature of the districts of Bankura and Birbhum.

It is with great reluctance that I now turn to Excise. My friend Mr. Sudarsan Chakravorty as well as Mr. Bejoy Krishna Bose resent the idea of exploiting vice for the sake of revenue. I am absolutely at one with them. Speaking for myself I cannot but abhor the traffic in intoxicating liquors and drugs as I belong to that greatest Temperance Federation of the world, namely, Islam. What that great and wonderful prophet of Arabia (may peace be upon him) did, it has taken over 13 centuries for America to achieve. To me America is a proud example and a country to be envied. Once she was saturated with drink; to-day she is absolutely dry. I envy her magnificent efforts which have culminated in eradicating the evils which must eat away the very vitals of a nation. I envy the education, the grit of her people, the efforts of her womanhood and the eloquence of her preachers which achieved this glorious result. I envy the independence which enabled her to cut herself adrift from alcoholism, and I pray fervently to God that one day in the near future my own country will follow that proud example and will

achieve that glorious end. Speaking for myself I do believe that total prohibition should be our goal. I can see perhaps the hand of Providence in the fact that Excise portfolio should be in my charge. But even in the fervour which religious obligations and natural instinct alike produce, I cannot shut my eyes to the limitations of the case; and unfortunately Government cannot adopt at least for the present total prohibition as their policy. I feel sure, however, that the Council will believe me when I say that within the limitations which we must recognise, I shall spare no effort towards reform.

I agree with Professor Mukerji that it is an unfortunate fact that Excise revenue is increasing and is responsible for more than one-fifth of our total provincial revenues. But the loss of this revenue at once without anything to replace it would effectively paralyse the Government, and until our agriculture and industries can give us increased returns to compensate for the loss, I am afraid, it will not be possible for Government to go to the length of adopting total prohibition as their fixed policy. It is a hopeful sign that increase in Excise revenue is not due to increase in consumption and my friend Professor Mukerji can satisfy himself on the point by a glance at the figures.

There is another limitation on our Excise policy which all will recognise and which none will object to. Where alcohol and drugs are used for medicinal purposes no one—not even a Muslim—will insist on their suppression. There is in many places a demand for increase in the number of opium shops, and this demand comes from the most unexpected quarters. The reason is that opium is amongst our people very largely a medicine, a specific for certain illnesses and diseases. Where this is the case and while there is such a dearth of medical aid we shall recognise it as a necessary limitation on our policy.

Subject to these limitations our policy has been defined. One of the first cases I took up after receiving this portfolio was the case dealing with the resolution carried in this Council on the motion of Professor Mukerji in September, 1921. On this question of Temperance and Excise reform I admit freely the reasonableness of Professor Mukerji's attitude. No Minister and least of all one brought up in the faith of Islam can turn a deaf ear to such reasonable pleading. We accept as our policy the increase of duties, the abolition of the auction system, the restriction of hours of sale, the raising of the age limit, the restriction of the number of shops, the insistence on proper sanitation, and the gradual increase of the powers of the Advisory Committees aiming at the creation of licensing boards. But the Council may perhaps fail to realise how far we have gone. Of the total revenue of 2·16 crores of rupees derived from Excise nearly half is derived from Calcutta and we have handed over to a licensing board complete powers in the Calcutta area. Presiding over that licensing board is that pillar of the Temperance cause, the Hon'ble

Sir Devaprasad Sarbadhikari, and on the board are advocates of temperance. They have used their powers in a reasonable way recognizing apparently that the advance they desire to make must be gradual and sure. I do not think that they will complain that Government has in any way interfered with their laudable intentions. I can assure them that there will be no undue interference from me, but on the contrary I shall encourage them in their good work in every possible way.

There remains the rest of the country where the system of Advisory Committees with limited powers exists. No one claims, neither the temperance advocates nor Government, that this is a perfect system. It was admittedly an experiment with a view to the devolution of even wider and wider powers as the powers already given are found to be used wisely and well. Any abuse of existing powers, or failure to use them or irresponsible use of them, and there have been such cases, cannot fail to delay further extension. I am considering the whole of this case and I hope to produce some solution which will commend itself to the Council and operate to the satisfaction of the genuine advocate of temperance and the welfare of the country.

The policy of enhancing duties, of avoiding the auction system, of reducing the number of shops and the hours of sale has been and will be still more steadfastly followed. It has been extended to the whole province and to pachwai and tari. It is a policy which produces more revenue and less vice. It has its faults—but what policy has not? It however appears to be giving better and better results, and Government will gladly welcome suggestions for the eradication of any faults that exist so as to attain more rapidly to the policy which may be considered perfect.

A word on the expenditure side of the Excise budget. I need not enter into details as detailed consideration will come later on. The voted estimate for 1924-25 is Rs. 11,97,000 compared with Rs. 13,62,000 which was the estimate for last year, and yet Rai Bahadur Satyendra Nath Roy Chaudhuri has said that there has been no retrenchment. The saving compared to last year's estimate is 1·65 lakhs and if we take voted and non-voted together the saving is 1·93 lakhs a very considerable reduction. This reduction would have been more but for the fact that the subordinate staff of the Excise Department, which is very large, is generally on a time-scale of pay, and increments are accruing annually. A certain amount of the expenditure on staff is of course recoverable from the proprietors of bonded warehouses and others. The expenditure too includes compensation of over a lakh of rupees which is paid to the Bhutan Durbar and the French authorities at Chandernagore. When one considers the enormous tract of country and the long seaboard with which we have to deal with it cannot be said that this is excessive expenditure. As a result of the Retrenchment Committee's recommendations the retrenchments have become possible. Some of them involve a certain amount of

risk but after mature consideration Government decided to take that risk and the coming year will tell you with what results.

I now turn to Civil Works. The demands for funds to construct new buildings have been subjected to a rigorous scrutiny by the Finance Department and such projects as escaped their ban were further combed out by both sides of Government in two successive meetings. The final result shows a small and select list of new projects which represents practically an irreducible minimum necessary for a slight expansion of the Departments for which they are required.

In the list of works in progress for which funds are required next year, are included the comparatively few buildings which were started this year and those which have been in progress since last year or year before.

The increase over this year in the amount asked for under the head "Repairs" is mainly due to the increased number of buildings taken over for maintenance as every new completed building requires an additional provision for its repair.

Under "Communication" it has been possible only to provide for laying tar macadam on one of the Calcutta maidan roads, for building a bridge in the Darjeeling Terai and for continuing with the programme of improving the system of roads in the Jalpaiguri Duars. The latter includes the construction of the Lower Jaldhaka Bridge referred to by Mr. Travers and no new road projects are provided for.

The bridge in the Terai for which provision is made in next year's budget is a non-voted item, but since Khan Bahadur Musharruf Hossain has made mention of it in his speech I would explain that the reason for its inclusion is that the present timber bridge is nearing the end of its life, and has cost so much in repairs during the last few years that expenditure on a new steel bridge would be more economical than wasting large sums on ineffective repairs.

Under "Establishment" there is a slight increase which is due to the normal increments of pay, drawn by the staff under the new time-scale.

I can only say a few words about the policy of the Industrial Department. Retrenchment has made considerable inroads into this Department which was admittedly overstaffed, but a glance at the figures will show that it has been well-directed retrenchment. The estimate for Direction has come down and the estimate for Development and Education has gone up. This is the line we have always been urged by Council to take. I am not in a position yet to say whether we have gone as far on this line as we can, but I shall certainly go into the working of the whole department with a view to following that line as far as possible and diverting funds from salaries towards development and education.

The Department of Industries has done a good deal for weaving and for technical schools. It is my policy to do more and more. In Serampore Weaving Institute an electric power loom will, I hope, be working

in the course of the year. Now the application of cheap electric power to the working of looms may open the weaving profession to a class who are now unemployed and who are not likely to take to ordinary weaving. In fact we have been anticipated in this idea by plans which are being formed and carried into execution in Kandapara in Khulna.

The department has completed a survey of the possibilities of the match industry and is now engaged on work in connection with the damp proofing of matches. The department is engaged in other investigations too and the results of these will be given to the public or perhaps, if funds are available, demonstrated in model industrial concerns like the research tannery.

It is, however, in industrial education that the department naturally finds its chief outlet now and here we have budgeted for Rs. 3,36,000. Some of the schools which were under the Industries Department have been retransferred as more properly belonging to the Education Department and this shows an apparent diminution in the estimate for industrial education. In fact, however, there has been an increase in the estimate for schools remaining under the department. The estimate is Rs. 163,000 compared to a revised estimate of Rs. 1,19,000 for the current year. We have provided almost the same figure for scholarships, and although there is an apparent decrease in grants-in-aid this will be found to be more than balanced by the increase under the head "Miscellaneous" which also includes some grants-in-aid.

I am afraid, Sir, I have taken up a good deal of time of this House. Yet I have not been able to fully outline my policy and my aims. It shall always be my best endeavour to take this Council into my confidence and appeal to my friends on both sides of the House to help me and to help towards progress in the transferred departments. Sir, we are passing through strenuous times. Let us all join, Moslems, Hindus, Jains and Christians for one common object, namely, the attainment of real Swaraj and demonstrate to the world by our constructive work, that we deserve what we desire.

The Hon'ble Maulvi FAZL-UL HUQ: Before I proceed to deal with the various criticisms that have been levelled against that portion of the budget which concerns the administration committed to my charge, I deem it my mournful duty to refer to the loss we have sustained by the tragic and untimely death of Dr. Dunn. To the very fitting tribute which you, Sir, paid to his memory the other day, I have but little to add; and if, at this moment, I take up the time of the Council to say a few words, it is because I feel that we should place on record our sense of the loss which we have all sustained by his sudden and untimely death. He was destined to achieve great things for Education in Bengal and, Sir, in mourning his loss we feel that we are really mourning something in the nature of a public calamity.

Passing to the criticisms that have been made regarding the budget concerning Education and Registration, I would like to say a few words as regards the attitude taken up by members generally, towards the budget that has been presented to this House. Sir, some of the criticisms that have been levelled against the budget, I confess, were somewhat amusing. But, Sir, my amusement turned into utter astonishment the other day when my esteemed friend, Mr. P. C. Miller, made a pointed outburst of eloquence as regards the impotence of the Ministers and the unsatisfactory character of the Education Budget. Now, Sir, I was somewhat surprised that my friend should have thought it fit to say all those things about a budget for the preparation of which he, and not I, was chiefly responsible. As I will explain to the Council later on, I had absolutely nothing to do with the framing of the budget, the main framework of which had been finished so long ago as September last and it was surprising that my friend, Mr. Mitter, should have chosen to try and turn down his own handiwork. I now find myself placed in a somewhat embarassing position, in that my friend who is responsible for the budget criticised it as unsatisfactory and it has devolved upon me to stand in Council and defend the budget which the framer himself was not satisfied with. However, Sir, this is only by the way.

Criticisms after criticisms have been levelled against the parsimoniousness of the Finance Member in not supplying funds to the transferred departments. With that criticism, I certainly agree, because I am also a victim of that parsimoniousness, but at the same time I cannot but say that the Finance Member had to dole out all those grants within the limits of the Finance committed to his charge. The administration of the province must necessarily be one of daily expanding expenditure. The expenses naturally increase; and unless there is a corresponding increase in the revenue, a time must come, as it has come in this province—when it is desirable to keep the legitimate expenditure within the bounds of the income in the budget. I know that the Finance Member will be quite competent to defend his own position, but I only say these few words in order to demonstrate the principle of the proposition that to render the work in the transferred departments really useful to the people, co-operation is necessary between the Members of the Government and of the non-official members of the Council. Sir, I do not wish to discuss at the present moment whether that co-operation is to come through a probationary period of non-co-operation or whether it is to come directly. These matters do not concern us at the present moment; and I may be pardoned if I say that, although all those criticisms are made against the Finance Member, nothing practical has yet been done by any of the critics of this budget to develop the resources of this province. Not one man has done anything to raise his little finger to make two blades of grass grow where one grew before; and unless the resources are developed and measures

are adopted to increase the revenue, of the country, it is idle to expect that the Finance Member whether he is a Member of the Executive Council, or a Minister responsible to the Legislative Council, will be able to supply those in charge of the administration sufficient money to carry on even the ordinary daily duties of administration. Sir, I leave this point to be dealt with more fully by the Finance Member himself.

As regards the Education Department, as I have said just now, owing to the daily expanding activities, the expenditure cannot remain stationary. There is an inevitable and steady growth of expenditure due to such causes as increment in pay and this is no light matter in an administration with some 2,700 officers, an increase in the number of pupils, an increase in the number of schools to be inspected and the resultant increases in all matters of departmental activities.

We can only hope that this inevitable growth of expenditure will be more than counterbalanced next year by a saving effected on the lines suggested by the Retrenchment Committee. I can assure the Council that these suggestions have been most carefully considered and examined by the Director of Public Instruction and his Officers. The result is that a saving of nearly 2 lakhs 28 thousand has been effected. I confess that I find some difficulty in understanding the attitude of those friends of mine in this Council regarding the question of retrenchment. On the one hand we have cried for retrenchment and economy and on the other hand we are blamed that, owing to this retrenchment, estimates for the coming year show a reduction from this in the current year. Sir, I cannot accept that responsibility, and from the other point of view I cannot blame the critics for such retrenchment as has been effected in the estimate for education. All these were discussed and decided upon before I assumed charge of office. Sir, to set against this natural growth of expenditure provision for certain new schemes have necessitated an increase of 2 lakhs 12 thousands in the estimate of this year. Members will perhaps ask why, if the Sinking Fund increases only by about Rs. 16,000, the total provision under Education transferred is less by 3 lakhs and 77 thousands than the budget estimate for the current year. As a matter of fact more than one member has referred to this apparent deficit. This is due to two causes. In the first place the item of Rs. 61,000 for Bengal's share in the cost of the Hazaribagh Reformatory School which was last year erroneously shown under Education transferred, is this year correctly entered under Education reserved.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President left the Chamber and the Deputy President took the Chair.]

This leaves a difference of Rs. 3 lakhs which represents the grant made last year to the Calcutta University. Some members have commented upon the fact that no provision has been made in next year's

estimates for a special grant to the Calcutta University. Some of my friends have declared that I owe an explanation to the Council as to why no provision for the Calcutta University has been made in the budget. The matter, Sir, can be very simply explained. The Calcutta University made an application to Government for financial assistance. The question was considered from various points of view and it was thought proper to ascertain from the University the exact amount they required to free them from their financial embarrassments. Although correspondence has passed between this Government and the University, no definite answer has yet been received from the University. Government will be ready to help the University when certain information regarding certain matters has been furnished and I feel confident that the University will not find it difficult to furnish the information that has been required. When this is done, I propose to come up before the Council with a demand for a grant to the Calcutta University. I hope, Sir, that all the anxiety for the Calcutta University and the solicitude for its interests which have been evinced by this Council will assume a practical shape when the time comes for voting on my demand. I hope I can confidently rely on the sincerity of my critics when I express the hope that the sympathy which has been so warmly expressed for the University will be readily translated into action and that I shall be able to secure an undivided vote of this House in favour of my motion for a supplementary grant to the Calcutta University. Sir, I wish to declare to the House how deeply I realise the debt I owe the University. Under no circumstances could I be ungrateful to my own *alma mater*. The welfare of the Calcutta University has always been a matter of deep concern to me, ever since I assumed charge of my office, and its cause will always be nearest to my heart.

I shall next refer briefly to the main heads shown under "Education —Transferred" on page 108 of the estimates. As regards "A.—University" I have already dealt with the question of the Calcutta University. Then comes the item of a grant of Rs. 9 lakhs to the Dacca University. I do not remember that any member has seriously questioned the propriety of this grant, but in view of the fact that many members of this Council have come here for the first time and are not acquainted with the history of this grant I will say a few words as to why it is that we are making this grant of Rs. 9 lakhs from year to year to the Dacca University. Before the introduction of the reforms scheme, the Government of India had made certain grants towards the establishment of the Dacca University. On the 1st July, 1921, the unexpended balance of these grants amounted to Rs. 51 lakhs, but under the financial arrangements then made by the Secretary of State and the Government of India, this balance merged in the general balances of the Government of Bengal. This Government, however, decided that it would gradually pay to the University of Dacca the balance of

Rs. 51 lakhs by making it an annual grant of Rs. 4 lakhs for non-recurring expenditure until the whole sum was exhausted. In addition it has made an annual grant of Rs. 5 lakhs towards recurring expenditure since the University started on 1st July, 1921. The whole question of the financial position of the Dacca University is at present under consideration, but it is not proposed to ask the Council to vote more than the usual annual grant.

Coming to the minor head "B," it provides for secondary education and under this head there is some reduction due to retrenchment. I am fully alive to the crying need of money for secondary schools and I appreciate the force of the figures quoted by my predecessor in office, Mr. P. C. Mitter. I know that these schools need an infinitely greater measure of Government assistance, and that the lot of teachers in secondary schools is really a very hard one. But here again it is a question of money. I can assure the Council that so far as funds permit I shall do my best to help the secondary schools and improve the lot of the teachers.

Provision for primary education is made under minor head "C." There is a reduction under this head due chiefly to the deprovincialisation of a number of primary schools. Provision for Rs. 75,000 has been included to assist local bodies to introduce schemes of primary education on the lines of Mr. Biss' report. Where the local bodies are willing to introduce such a scheme and to bear half the capital and the recurring cost, Government have undertaken to make a grant to meet the other half. In reply to a question put by my friend, Mr. Masih, I explained to the Council that hitherto we had received very few applications from the municipalities and union boards. Provision for the expansion of primary education has been made under three different heads. Provision has been made to meet those cases in which applications have been made in accordance with Mr. Biss' scheme. Provision has been made for primary schools under the Biss's system and another provision has been made for free compulsory education in municipalities and other areas, where there is a genuine demand and where local efforts are ready to organise in order to carry on the working of the scheme. I hope I realise just as much as any member of the Council here that one of the primary duties of a Minister for Education is to undertake schemes for primary education. The scheme, however, is so vast and it requires so much money that it is almost impossible for me at the present moment to make any statement. Speaking from memory, Sir, I may say that in the year 1915 I pressed upon the Government the question of introducing a system of free primary education. The Member in charge of the Education Department told me that apart from the non-recurring expenditure the annual recurring expenditure alone would amount to nearly Rs. 30 lakhs. I would ask the Council to consider for a moment the enormous amount of money that will have to be capitalised to allow a permanent revenue of Rs. 30 lakhs.

Taxation is out of the question, although, Sir, if we levied an education cess the whole problem could perhaps have been easily solved. This is, however, a matter on which I express no opinion because in introducing a new Bill of that character I must be guided by the opinions of my colleagues in this Council. Before I leave the subject of primary education I wish to say that I am in entire agreement with the members who have complained that the expenditure on primary education in Bengal is wholly inadequate. I trust that as our finances improve it will be possible to spend more money under this head, but I must remind the members that the field of work is so vast that Government cannot possibly find all the money that may be necessary.

The increase under minor head "D" is largely due to the transfer of the School of Art, provision Rs. 45,000, and the Commercial Institute, provision Rs. 57,000, from Industries to Education. A provision of Rs. 40,000 has also been made to meet the capital outlay involved in the duplication of classes at the Ahsanulla School of Engineering, Dacca. The demand for admission to the school has exceeded all expectations. Its passed pupils have no difficulty in finding employment, and I am sure the Council will agree that a capital expenditure of Rs. 40,000 and an increase in recurring expenditure, which will ultimately amount to Rs. 19,000, is a small price to pay in order that we may double the number of pupils who can be admitted.

The large reduction under the head "E—General" is largely due to the fact that in the original estimates for the current year a provision of Rs. 85,000 was made under this head to meet the cost of re-organising the services below the Bengal Educational Service and improving their pay and prospects. In next year's estimate no provision has been made under this head, but the necessary funds have been provided under the appropriate detailed heads.

I now turn to the new schemes for which we have made provision in the estimates under consideration. I must remind members that I assumed charge of my office only on the 4th January. By that time the frame-work of the budget had been completed. One matter, however, remained for consideration—the distribution of the money available for new schemes. But even in that matter the decision as to how the money available for the Education Department should be spent was not entirely at my discretion. As members are doubtless aware, provision cannot be made in the budget for a new scheme until the proposals have been worked out in detail and approved by Government. The scheme must be worked out by the Head of the Department; he submits it for examination first by the administrative Department concerned, and secondly, by the Finance Department. When he has satisfied both these departments as to the merits of the scheme and they have agreed that is satisfactory from the administrative point of view and has been drawn up with due regard to economy, Government give administrative approval to the scheme. Only then is it

permissible to make budget provision for the scheme. It will be clear to members that these processes necessarily take a considerable time. Therefore in selecting new schemes for inclusion in this year's budget I was limited to a choice of the schemes which had already been completed or were approaching completion.

Fortunately I found among these schemes one, which for many years I have done my best to push on—I mean the scheme for a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta. In the old Council, in pre-Reform days I urged the importance of this scheme on more than one occasion. In the first Council under the Reforms I again pressed its claims. Therefore, it was a great satisfaction to me, after I assumed charge of my office, to find that the scheme was in such a state of readiness that I could ask my hon'ble friend, the Finance Member, to make provision for it in next year's budget. That satisfaction will, I am sure, be shared not only by the Muhammadan members of the Council but by the members of all communities. The future of Bengal depends on the progress both of the Hindu and of the Muhammadan communities. If one community is advanced and the other backward, the development of the province must be hampered by inter-communal differences. Their point of view, their standards and their ideals will be different. The two communities must advance together, or the less advanced community is bound to be a great handicap to the progress of the other. The necessity for a Muhammadan College has not been questioned. Sir, I am reminded that I have left out the word "Arts," and I am going to explain to the Council why I have done so. I do not find my young friend, Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury here, but I may tell the Council that my young friend was one of a band of young enthusiasts for Muhammadan education who urged upon me as early as 1914 the desirability of moving Government for the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta. I had just then entered the Council and Maulvi Nurul Huq Chaudhury will bear me out that he was incessant in his demand for a Muhammadan Arts College and a hostel for Muhammadan students in College Square. He told us the other day that it was only a bait. I do not know what authority he had for saying so, but if Government had really intended it by way of a bait I cannot congratulate Government, not only on its want of discretion but on its want of commonsense. Sir, a bait in order to be effective, ought to be direct. An indirect bait seldom takes effect, but Sir, bait or no bait, the scheme cannot be said to be a new one. It was considered by the Educational Committee appointed by Government in 1915 who very strongly recommended the necessity of establishing a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta. Then again, Sir, the All-India Muhammadan Educational Conference which met in Calcutta in 1917 made the recommendation that in their opinion the Government of Bengal should take early steps to establish a Muhammadan Arts College for which land had been acquired and that the scheme

should not be postponed any longer. The Sadler Commission considered the scheme and recommended that the fact of the gradual increase in the number of Mussalmans passing the Matriculation and Intermediate Examinations suggests to the Government of Bengal the desirability of reopening the question of a Moslem College. A scheme was worked out and land was purchased in Wellesley Street at a cost of Rs. 1,23,000.

Now, Sir, my chief desire in bringing up before the Council so often before I assumed charge of this office, the question of establishing a Muhammadan Arts College has been principally my anxiety to secure for the youths of my community some amount of religious instruction along with the secular education that they receive in our educational institutions. I voice the popular feeling when I say that our educational institutions have become somewhat notorious for the almost godless education that is imparted there, and I think that these institutions have failed in the primary function which they have to carry out, namely, that of the formation of character. The whole atmosphere of our educational institutions, from the moral point of view, is bleak and barren. The boys learn a good deal to enable them to pass the examinations, but they have very little of moral instruction given them. I have come across Muhammadan graduates who do not know even the fundamental tenets of our own faith. It is certainly a most deplorable state of things. We cannot make provision for strict religious instruction in all its forms in institutions which are meant not for one particular community but for various communities. The idea of sectional institutions is certainly not a new one. I may refer to the Daulatpur Hindu Academy, the Benares Hindu College, the Islamia College at Peshawar and last but not the least, the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College at Aligarh. That sectional institutions can be of some use in moulding the character of our young men must be evident to every one who has come across the products of the institutions I have just mentioned. Considering all these facts the Sadler Commission very strongly recommended, as I have already said, the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College. Now, Sir, my friend, Mr. Shaheed Suhrawardy, comes to me and says that I had left out the word "Arts" when I was speaking of the Muhammadan College. I may mention that so far as the college is concerned I accept the criticism that a training merely in arts is not of so much importance as a training in technical matters. I propose to call it a Muhammadan College, but I may explain to the Council that provision has been made this year for only a part of the whole programme. The non-recurring expenditure will amount to nearly 5 lakhs of rupees but we have made provision for 1 lakh this year because in the forthcoming financial year we do not expect that the Public Works Department will be able to spend more than that sum. The recurring expenditure will amount to over a lakh of rupees. It may be possible for us to provide instruction in arts and at the same time to make some provision for technical education also. I do not wish to take

up the time of the Council, but I find, Sir, in the speech which you (the Deputy President) delivered on the budget yesterday you made certain suggestions regarding this college and also regarding female education. I need hardly say that I have the greatest regard for your opinion and I will certainly give your suggestions my most serious consideration. If I may now sum up, Sir, the case for the Muhammadan Arts College is briefly this. There is no doubt that the existing colleges do not afford sufficient facilities to Muhammadan students when they come up for collegiate education—I mean there is not sufficient room in the various colleges to accommodate the large number of Muhammadan students who pass the Matriculation examination every year. It has been suggested that the necessity of the case may be met by reserving a number of seats in the existing colleges for Muhammadan students. One member has suggested that we should reserve about 50 per cent. of seats for Muhammadan students. That, Sir, I submit for your consideration, is not practicable or possible. That means that you will have to reduce the number of seats allotted to the other communities. Rather than do that, it is much better that Government should make provision for a college for the Muhammadan community. I wish to remind the members that Government is pledged to give the Muhammadan community a college of their own. We have only just now been reminded that in so far as the Government record is concerned, it is one of broken pledges and promises, and I hope that this pledge will not be one of that number.

After we have got this college I propose that we should set our hand to work and make it really the nucleus of a bigger institution with a wider outlook. It will give an opportunity to our philanthropic Muhammadans to endow it. Let us remember the small beginning out of which the Muhammadan Anglo-Oriental College at Aligarh has grown. It was a small school, a struggling school housed in a hut and out of that it has developed into the biggest institution of its kind in Asia. Now, Sir, why should it not be that once we have got this Muhammadan College in Calcutta, if we put forth all our energies and concentrate our efforts, we should have in Calcutta something similar to the monumental work of the late Sir Syed Ahmed at Aligarh? It is with that bigger outlook in the future that I have always contemplated the establishment of a Muhammadan Arts College in Calcutta. I have tried to explain to the Council the necessity, the potentiality of this scheme, and if, after this, any Muhammadan member should come forward to oppose this proposal, he is certainly welcome to do so.

Another important project for which money has been found is the construction of new buildings for the Chittagong Collegiate School. I need not compare the relative importance of this work with other schemes which are awaiting the allotment of funds, for we have no choice but to take up this project at once. The present buildings are in a dangerous

state. One portion has in fact already collapsed. The engineers in charge report that the life of the buildings is at an end and they are incapable of proper repair and money spent on them would be money wasted. The only course is to erect new buildings for this school. The total cost of the work is estimated at Rs. 2,35,000 and in next year's budget we have provided Rs. 40,000, the amount which the Public Works Department hope they will be able to spend during the year.

Provision has been made for Rs. 1,75,000 for the erection of buildings for the David Hare Training College. We have only two institutions in Bengal for the training of secondary teachers, one at Dacca and the other is the David Hare Training College in Calcutta. It is located in a dwelling house, which is a building entirely unsuited for the purpose of a training institution. This has been recognised for many years, and so long ago as 1915 a suitable site for a building was acquired in Ballygunge. Unfortunately the deterioration of the financial position prevented furthe rprogress, and the site is standing empty. I need not enlarge upon the want of trained teachers for our secondary schools. To anyone acquainted with our secondary institutions the need of trained men is only too evident. Now that our financial position shows some sign of improvement, this scheme should have a place in the forefront of our programme.

Equally pressing is the necessity of some improvement in the training of primary school teachers. The present *guru*-training schools have long been recognised as unsuitable and inadequate to the needs of the province. A new scheme was drawn up for the establishment of *guru*-training schools of an improved type and considerable progress was made with it until progress was stopped by financial stringency. There are at present 19 schools of the new type in Eastern Bengal, and 2 in Western Bengal. We have decided to proceed with this scheme and have made provision for 8 new type schools in Western Bengal. I should explain that the opening of these 8 new schools will involve no additional recurring expenditure. As soon as they are ready, we shall abolish 32 schools of the old and inefficient type. The money so saved will be sufficient to meet the cost of running new schools, and at the same time the number of *guru*-trained.

The other new schemes which I should mention are a grant of Rs. 12,000 to the Diocesan College to save that institution from debt and a provision of Rs. 86,000 to the Rajshahi College for additional accommodation, of which Rs. 50,000 will be spent this year.

Turning finally to the estimates of the Registration Department, it will be seen that the demand which the Council will be asked to provide is Rs. 18,49,000 as against Rs. 18,37,000 in the current year, an increase of Rs. 12,000. In this Department every effort has been made to secure economy. A non-recurring provision of Rs. 45,000 has been made for the construction of new racks, the purchase of furniture and the binding

of registers. Expenditure on these objects has for some time past been held in abeyance in view of the financial position, and the need is now a very pressing one. In spite of this special provision of Rs. 45,000 and of the fact that practically all the officers of the department are on incremental pay, the total increase in the estimate is only Rs. 12,000.

I have dealt with the various new schemes for which provision has been made. I do not think I need take up the time of the Council in replying in detail to what individual members have said in connection with the Education budget. My friend Shah Syed Emdadul Haq has referred to the Hussamia Madrassah and the Fyazunissa Girls' Schools in his district. I can only tell him that it is for him to submit to Government schemes which he thinks necessary for the development of these institutions, and I can assure him that his suggestions will be carefully considered. I am afriad I have got to warn him that the schemes will have to pass through the elaborate processes which I have just referred to.

My friend, Babu Bejay Krishna Bose, has said many things about what the Reforms should have done, and have not been able to do. He said that he could have accepted the Reforms if primary education had been made free and compulsory and if the State had come forward to help the struggling universities, if there had been an anti-malarial campaign throughout the province and something done to prevent kala-azar and other epidemics. Now, it is not for me to defend the Reforms and this is neither the occasion nor the place to do so, but I can assure my friend Mr. Bose that if he only gives us an opportunity to put our plans into operation, we will be able to do something. We may not be able to make primary education free and compulsory at once; we cannot promise that we will drive malaria out of the province but will do something to counteract the rigours of this scourge. As regards exploitation by foreigners, that is a matter about which I do not propose to say anything.

My friend Maulvi Ekramul Huq has referred to model *maktabs* which have been abolished in certain places in the province. I can only tell him that these questions are all connected with proposals for retrenchment which have to be given effect to in consequence of the financial stringency of the province. As regards these *maktabs* whose usefulness has been established, we have in one or two cases re-considered their claim for existence, but it is difficult to say that all these *muktabs*, many of which are languishing institutions, should be allowed to exist and be a drag on the finances of the province.

I think I have dealt with the points that have been raised by various members in connection with the budget. I shall, however, Sir, correct one mistake that my friend Mr. Syed M. Masih has made regarding the introduction of these schemes in mufassal areas. He said if local bodies did not do their duty, Government could not do theirs. I think I have explained to the Council the position: if local bodies come forward and accept these schemes and are prepared to meet half the cost, recurring

and non-recurring. Government are always prepared to supply the necessary funds in order to carry them out. I do not think I can take up the time of the Council any further. I hope that those of my friends who have criticised the budget will only give us the time and opportunity to put our schemes into action, and given time and opportunity, then and only then will be the time for legitimate criticism.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the President returned to the Chair.]

Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER: May I offer a personal explantation. Mr. Huq has stated that I criticised the budget which he framed. I never criticised the budget; I strongly criticised the action of the Secretary of State. I further understand that my hon'ble friend has stated that he is not responsible for the budget, but that I am responsible for it. I find, however, that there are many things in the budget of which I did not approve.

The Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Huq: I have this point, however, very correctly reported, that he criticised the budget. Although I said he was responsible for the budget, I also said that it contains many new schemes which have been taken up, and many new schemes for which we are trying to find funds; there are also many other schemes which have been worked out by him.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: May I say something by way of personal explanation? My friend has referred to what I said in 1914, regarding the Muhammadan Arts College. Everybody knows that since the great war in 1914 there has been a great upheaval in the whole world; even in the great German Empire, Austria Hungary and others what do we find? There are many things that have been said and done then——

Mr. PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Mr. H. E. A. Cotton): You cannot make another speech.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: I am just finishing. What we said in 1914 is not true at the present moment. I have consulted many of my friends in Calcutta and round about and they told me that they would rather have a Science College than an Arts College——

Mr. PRESIDENT: That is making another speech. I cannot allow that.

Mr. G. S. DUTT: In the absence of the Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Mallik it has devolved upon me to explain the policy of Government in the Department of Local Self-Government including its two branches, Medical and Public Health. The members have had the budget before

them, and it is needless for me to go into particular items and discuss them. Broadly speaking, I may point out that the budget for this year is a more satisfactory one than it has ever been in the past. The proposed expenditure (voted) under the head "Medical" is nearly 47 lakhs and including the non-voted is 58 lakhs as compared with 44 lakhs and 54 lakhs of last year. The voted expenditure for the Department of Public Health is nearly 28 lakhs as against 23 lakhs in the revised estimate. There is a mistake here. I should point out that it ought to be Rs. 1,21,000 less than what is shown in the budget, as an item, namely, Berhampore Water Works, was by mistake included in Public Health and this should be excluded. Therefore, the total proposed voted expenditure under "Public Health" is Rs. 27,61,000, and including the non-voted, it is nearly 29 lakhs as against 24 lakhs and 25 lakhs in the present year. I would like to point out a few new features in the budget.

Under the head "Medical Education," we have made a distinct step in advance, and we propose to erect the Mymensingh Medical School in the coming year. This will cost Government Rs. 71,000 in the coming year, under capital expenditure and Rs. 22,000 for recurring expenditure. We propose opening the School in July next. In this connection I may mention the cases of the Jalpaiguri and Chittagong Medical Schools which more than one speaker has referred to, particularly Mr. Travers who has taken a very great deal of interest in the Jalpaiguri Medical School and has raised no less a sum than Rs. 40,000 towards improving the hospital there. Mr. Travers is anxious that Jalpaiguri should not be considered to be third in the list of new medical schools taken up in the province, but should be first in the list. In this connection I have very little to add to what His Excellency said the other day in reply to the address of the Municipality at Jalpaiguri, namely, that although Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea declared last year that he intended to give the first place in order of priority to Chittagong, the second place to Mymensingh and the third place to Jalpaiguri, if any of these districts by their enterprise could raise their hospital to the requisite standard of 100 beds, and could raise the necessary contribution towards the capital expenditure, then Government would be prepared to consider the claim of that district to be advanced in the order of priority. Government hoped, therefore, that these three districts would emulate with each other as to who should have the first place. I may mention here that my friend Mr. J. M. Sen Gupta said yesterday that he does not want a Medical School at Chittagong and I believe that Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury also expressed a similar view.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: May I make a personal explanation?

Mr. PRESIDENT: You are always making personal explanations.

Maulvi Md. HURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: Am I not entitled to make a personal explanation?

Mr. PRESIDENT: Undoubtedly, but you are not entitled to make another speech nor are you entitled to waste the time of the House by interrupting.

Maulvi Md. NURUL HUQ CHAUDHURY: But I am entitled to tell him what my explanation is. It is this, that my friends are going to have ——

Mr. PRESIDENT: Order, order, that is not a personal explanation; I cannot permit a speech.

Mr. C. S. DUTT: I do not know whether I am in order in referring to what passed outside the Council Chamber; probably I am not. In that case, I withdraw what I said. Anyhow, I hope that the people and these three districts will emulate each other in their anxiety and zeal to have their district put first in order of priority.

With regard to medical relief, we have provided a sum of 3 lakhs to be spent in 3 successive years beginning from next year, for establishing rural dispensaries. This is in pursuance of a promise made to members of this Council 2 years ago for allowing Rs. 1,15,000 a year for 3 years for the establishment of rural dispensaries. Unfortunately, on account of financial stringency, it was not possible during the past 2 years to provide more than Rs. 15,000 only for this purpose instead of the amount of Rs. 1,50,000 promised. It is therefore a matter for congratulation, and credit for it must be given to the Hon'ble Mr. Mallik who is absent to-day, that he has been able to secure one lakh this year in place of Rs. 15,000. This will enable the District Boards to open 400 new village dispensaries in the course of the next year, and I am sure this aspect of the budget is one that they will all eagerly welcome.

Next we have a scheme for a Pasteur Institute which will dispense with the necessity of patients bitten by rabid dogs making a journey to Shillong, and will enable them to obtain treatment at Calcutta. We propose to open this Institute from the 1st of April. This will be a step in the nature of a retrenchment as it will have the effect of saving more than Rs. 10,000 in the amount which we now pay as contribution to the Shillong Institute. Then we are going to open a Mental Observation Hospital at Bhowanipur for the observation of Indian mental patients for which a sum of Rs. 15,000 has been provided. The Hon'ble Minister has also been able to secure a provision of Rs. 6,000 which, although small, is important, in that it secures an increase in the pay of compounders, a very poorly paid body of public servants whose pay was not raised last year along with the increase of pay of other officers in the province.

Then we have provided a sum of Rs. 3,10,000 for nurses' quarters in the Presidency General Hospital to be spent in 3 years. This is in the Civil Works budget, but the scheme belongs to the Medical Department. Of this, one lakh is to be spent in the coming year. This scheme has been very much criticised by more than one speaker. I would remind the House that the nurses are a very useful body of public servants who minister to the sick and suffering, and if we find it necessary to employ them in our hospitals, it is certainly our duty to see that we provide sufficient accommodation for them to live in. The Hon'ble Mr. Mallik considered this matter very carefully and was advised that this was a very urgent scheme. This scheme was given the foremost place by Sir Henry Wheeler in his report of the Committee which sat in 1919 and considered especially urgent schemes in connection with the Presidency General Hospital. The present nurses' quarters in the Presidency General Hospital are said to be very much overcrowded, and it is said that the Pilgrim Memorial Ward, which was built about 8 years ago, has not yet been opened, owing partly to the difficulty of accommodating nurses who will be required for the Ward.

Under "Public Health" we have a number of grants to municipalities for water-supply amounting to nearly 3 lakhs of rupees. We have provided for loans amounting to Rs. 5,80,000 to municipalities for water works, and in the revised budget for the current year there is a provision for a loan which is not mentioned in the budget here, because it has been sanctioned since the budget was printed a loan of Rs. 50,000 for rural water-supply in the district of Birbhum. This is an important scheme which goes towards supplying a much needed requirement of rural areas for water-supply which has been referred to by more than one speaker in this House.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: Why loan?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: I will come to that presently. Then we have a sum of Rs. 25,000 additional under "Small-pox." The District Boards have been given a recurring sum of Rs. 25,000 a year for free vaccination; the Hon'ble Minister wanted to give Rs. 50,000, but it was impossible to provide the other Rs. 25,000 as a recurring item; therefore, Rs. 25,000 was allowed as a special grant in view of the virulent epidemic of small-pox which was expected next year. The district boards will thus have a provision next year of Rs. 50,000 for free vaccination which was promised to them by Government.

Then for publicity work, for providing lantern slides, etc., for educating the public, for the use of the publicity officer who is doing very good work in the matter of educating the public in health and sanitation, we have provided Rs. 7,000. We have made a provision of Rs. 1,20,000 for free grant of quinine to local bodies which is practically double of the allotment of the last 3 years. Under anti-malarial

measures, by which, as I shall presently explain, we mean grants to voluntary organisations for anti-malarial work, we have provided Rs. 50,000; for anti-kala-azar, we have provided Rs. 50,000; and for anti-cholera Rs. 16,000. These three items are practically new items in this year's budget. As one of the speakers remarked, the provision is very small compared with the needs of the province, but they are only the beginnings, and I think the Hon'ble Minister, who is absent to-day, deserves the thanks of the Council for providing these amounts, but I am sorry to find he has not received any thanks.

Then we have two very important items, one of which has been very much criticised, but the other has hardly been mentioned by anyone, I mean the recurring grant of Rs. 25,000 for maternity and child-welfare work. It is strange that this new recurring item has escaped the attention of the members. Surely maternity and child-welfare work is a very very important work in this province, and the Hon'ble Minister deserves the congratulation of the House for having been able to include this item in the budget. The object of this to provide for the training of *dhais* in the mufassal.

Then we have the much-discussed item of Rs. 50,000 for rural water-supply, with which I shall deal presently in some detail. It is a recurring expenditure.

The Hon'ble Minister claims that he has been able to make a distinct advance in this year's budget in principle if not in figures, and he wishes me to say that although he does not regard the Public Health and Medical budget as satisfactory, still he has accepted it in view of the limitations of provincial finance, and of the requirements of other departments, and he believes that the budget items, although insufficient in some ways, still provide a basis for much useful work in the coming year.

I shall proceed at once to the item of rural water-supply which has taken the Council several hours in criticisms from several speakers, and I feel that I yield to none in this Council in my zeal to see every village in Bengal provided with a sufficient water-supply. But this is a very knotty problem which has puzzled Government and district boards for many years. For the last 20 years Government has been trying to solve this problem. In 1904, it was decided that a grant of one-third should be made to the district boards, one-third should be raised by loans and one-third by public subscriptions. This proved insufficient. In 1905-06 a sum of Rs. 9 lakhs a year in the shape of the augmentation grant was made over to district boards with instructions that a substantial portion of it should be utilised on water-supply, and in 1913-14 the public works cess amounting to 37 lakhs of rupees a year was similarly made over to district boards with instructions to spend a substantial portion for the same purpose. But it was found that District Boards were not spending a substantial portion of the cess or of the

augmentation grant on water-supply. This matter was discussed at the District Boards' Conference last year and year before last; and last year it was decided that at least 33 per cent. of the public works cess should be spent by district boards on rural water-supply and sanitation.

Mr. BYOMKES CHAKRAVARTI: Road cess, not public works cess.

Mr. C. S. DUTT: Public works cess, not road cess. The road cess is spent mainly on roads.

The district boards have not in the past carried out their obligations in this respect, as I shall show by figures. The Director of Public Health reports that Noakhali has spent on water-supply only 1·4 per cent. of the public works cess in 1922, Hooghly 2·20 per cent., Chittagong 2·9 per cent., Midnapore only 5 per cent.,—the district from which my friend Mr. Sasmal hails.

Mr. BIRENDRA NATH SASMAL: I may inform the Minister in charge or the Secretary-Minister whatever it may be that out of the total income of Rs. 7,75,000 of the District Board I have allotted Rs. 1 lakh.

Mr. C. S. DUTT: I know Mr. Sasmal would do it, but I was speaking of the allotment before his time.

I mention that to show that in the past district boards have not done their duty in this respect, and the Director of Public Health has pointed out that these are the districts in which cholera has been most prevalent—the districts which spent the least on water-supply were the worst sufferers. Well, Sir, if you are going to criticise Government for not spending money on water-supply, surely district boards deserve equal, if not more criticism, but here in this Council we have not heard any criticism levelled against anybody else. I shall presently show, Sir, that district boards are even more responsible for water-supply than Government.

Then we come to union boards. This is a subject in which Mr. Sasmal is no doubt very much interested. We should have about 7,000 union boards in the province—there are nearly 7,000 unions. But, Sir, unfortunately for this province and unfortunately for those interested in public health and thanks mainly to the mistaken opposition set up against the creation of union boards, it has been possible for Government to sanction only 2,000 union boards and out of this only 1,264 union boards are in working order. All these 1,264 union boards have spent only Rs. 57,000 on water-supply during the past year out of a total income of Rs. 24 lakhs. However, this is no doubt a move in the right direction. Now let us consider the magnitude of this problem. We have got 84,981 villages in this province as one speaker has pointed out. Now, Sir, Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy has pointed out that one tank costs

about Rs. 1,000 and a well costs about Rs. 500. But some tanks cost about Rs. 3,000 to Rs. 4,000. Therefore, I think on an average if you give at least one tank or well to each village at an average cost of Rs. 1,000 if not Rs. 2,000 then at the rate of Rs. 1,000 it will be about Rs. 8½ crores and at the rate of Rs. 2,000 Rs. 17 crores. Is it possible, Sir, for Government to undertake complete responsibility for this amount? I appeal to the members of this House to realise the magnitude of the problem. I am not here to criticise them, but we must come to realise the nature of the problem and its magnitude before we can speak about its solution. Now, if you want to give a sufficient water-supply to each village, I am sure you will require at least Rs. 50 crores if not Rs. 100 crores. Therefore, it is a very big problem. Then, again, the present system is very unsatisfactory. We have district boards and union boards meeting this expenditure out of revenue instead of loans. It is not fair that the present generation should be made to bear the full burden for benefits which posterity will in a great measure enjoy. In no other country, I may point out, is rural water-supply the province of Government. In every country that I know of—I speak subject to correction—rural water-supply is provided by local efforts on the part of small organisations of district or village communities. Supposing Government were in a position to spare Rs. 50 crores or 100 crores to provide each village with a sufficient water-supply, it will be a futile waste of money, because in the first place you will not be able to carry out the work through Government agency or even through district board agency; secondly, you will not be able to know where the need is the greatest. Further what is most important is that it is not so much that water is wanted but *pure* water is wanted. It is not so much that tanks are wanted but a machinery is wanted for keeping them under proper repair and for guarding them against pollution. I want this Council to bear in mind that we have tanks galore, in fact far too many of them, unfortunately,—so many indeed that they are themselves a source of malaria because they are not properly kept up, and that is the case in most parts of the province. Now if you are to keep up properly the tanks which you excavate at a cost of Rs. 50 crores you will require Rs. 2 crores annually. Government cannot do it; their whole annual revenue of Rs. 11 crores. Then again—and here we come to a very practical matter—it is futile to give money to areas where there are no union boards and where there are no village organisations which can take up the responsibility of keeping these tanks free from pollution. Those who are Chairmen of District or Local Boards know that they are not properly kept: they are polluted. Our people commit unspeakable nuisances in them. These things cannot be prevented unless there is a proper village sanitary authority. Therefore, the question of rural water-supply is absolutely bound up with the question of union boards. I say again that if you are not prepared to have union boards in every village of your province, you

cannot expect to solve this question—this vital question of rural water-supply on which the health of the people and their prosperity depends. I can predict from the experience I have of the matter—and I challenge any one to refute me—that you cannot solve this question unless you have union boards or some constituted authority in every union of the province which can look after these things. Does this Council believe that it is possible for Government to provide anything like the fine tanks which a former generation of rich zamindars supplied to the villages of Bengal but which have been allowed to fall into decay and disrepair through apathy, inaction and want of organisation? No, Sir, the problem is therefore not so much one of new construction as of the *maintenance* of these tanks and the guarding of them against pollution and that can only be done by the village authorities, and you must organise these if you want progress in this direction. Government have, therefore, advisedly kept Rs. 50,000 only. The Hon'ble Minister wanted to give more, but financial considerations stood in the way. This Rs. 50,000 is only a beginning. Although this is a matter which rests primarily with village authorities still Government think that they cannot stand by and see this important matter neglected, and therefore, Government are prepared to give some assistance to union boards and union boards alone in this matter, because if you give to villages where there are no union boards, we know that interested persons will see that their own interests are served and thus it will be a waste of money. Therefore, the principle has been adopted of helping union boards in proportion to the amount which they themselves spend every year, so that they get a grant in the succeeding year in proportion. But it must be impressed upon these local bodies that the solution of the problem rests mainly with them.

The question of these union boards raises the general question of public health. It is extraordinary how every member has assumed that Government should remove malaria from the country, that Government should remove all the diseases from the country. It is true that Government have responsibility in this matter, but financial considerations prevent them from fully carrying out their responsibility. A greater responsibility, however, devolves upon the local self-governing bodies which have been created for the express purpose of dealing with sanitation and public health. These things can best be solved by local organisations and the central authority cannot solve these problems. I think our most violent critics will admit this. Here from Calcutta you may spend Rs. 20 crores and it will go nowhere but let the self-governing bodies raise a fraction of the money and with the assistance that we can give them let them carry out works of improvement of public health and that will go a long way in solving the problem. Any money given through them will be multiplied tenfold by the combined efforts of the villagers themselves. Therefore, it is essential that you must have

village organisations. Here again I wish to impress another fact on the members of this House. I trust that I shall be believed by the Council that I yield to none in my solicitude for the villagers of this province who are dying daily from various preventable disease. I have done my little share in alleviating their sufferings. I have felt for them, my heart has bled for them. I have tried to solve the problem and I have found that it is not so much a problem of money, it is a problem of education, it is a problem of organisation. If you can create the organisation, money will flow in. Little drops will make an ocean. Our villages are not organised; in the municipalities they are organised—they have a corporate existence and they can fight against diseases because they have the machineries constituted for that purpose. The villagers of Bengal, thanks partly or mostly to the propaganda which has been unfortunately carried on by well-meaning friends against the establishment of union boards and thanks partly to other reasons also, are against the establishment of these union boards and therefore they are so many isolated units of humanity without any organisation and consequently they will continue to be open to the attacks of diseases and they will continue to die in thousands and nobody can save them. Why talk of Rs. 50,000? Even 50 crores will not save them unless we organise them. I say, Sir, that every day that we waste—I trust my Swarajist friends will mark this—every day that we lose in not organising the villages we are responsible for the death of hundreds of our countrymen. Therefore I say—organise. The most important organisation is the organisation of union boards, and here I wish to quote what A. E., the well-known Irish author has said. Speaking of Ireland he said:—

> Wherever rural prosperity is reported of any country, inquire into it and it will be found that it depends on rural organisation. Wherever there is rural decay, if it is inquired into, it would be found that there was a rural population, but no rural community, no organisation, no guild to promote common interests and to unite the countrymen in defence of them.

Here, therefore, you have the problem as well as the solution in a nutshell. It is no use crying about village decay. Organise your villages, organise the union boards. Do not call them "union boards"; if you do not like that term, call them by any other nicer name—call them *Palli samitis* if you please. Have a better type of union boards if you like, but have an organisation. I have not heard yet of any suggestion for a better system of village organisation, but if you have a better organisation in mind you should have it at once—have it soon—to-morrow. If this Council does not do anything in this direction, then the elected representatives would be responsible for the deaths which are now occurring every day throughout the country from kala-azar and malaria. This is the only solution—there can be no other solution—whether of kala-azar, malaria or rural water-supply. I feel very strongly in this matter—I say this not merely because I am

here to speak on behalf of Government but because as a Bengali, as a countryman of yours—I felt it every day that I worked in the districts.

There are other forms of organisation which will also greatly help and as a matter of fact which are also helping—I mean co-operative organisations like the Co-operative Irrigation Societies of Bankura and the Central Anti-malarial Society under the initiative of that great man Rai Bahadur Gopal Chandra Chatterji. It is those organisations which will help to solve the problem. They are organising the people to fight disease, they are rousing the dormant instincts of the people to fight not only against disease but against poverty and decay. These things will solve the problem as no Government action however supported by large sums of money will do. Government may subsidise them but Government cannot alone solve the problem without them. I therefore appeal to the members of this Council to organise the rural community of this Province into organisations of this nature and to rid the people of the worst maladies they are suffering from—the malady of utter and helpless dependence on Government action, the malady of mutual distrust and dissensions and the malady of a thousand social customs which bar the road to progress. This is what Sir Rabindra Nath Tagore said only the other day speaking at the conference of anti-malarial societies. He said:—

> The worst malady arising out of their sufferings was their lethargy, mental and physical, and indolence. They should not be left to depend on the workers of miracles for effecting their cure. They had got to inspire confidence in themselves. It would not do to depend merely on politics, for that was like building on quicksands.
>
> They could not effect a magic cure in one single day but they must try and stimulate the minds of the people to a sense of their responsibility. In days gone by, the wants of the country, such as excavation of tanks, clearing of jungles, etc., were done by the wealthy and the rich of the villages who were actuated to do this charitable work not for the good of the people but for gaining merit both in this and after life. This made the people desist from all corporate attempts to meet their own wants and through their dependence on the rich they brought themselves to a condition of helplessness. Now when times had changed and when the people were told to remove their own grievances through co-operation they became vexed and intolerant.
>
> It was by stimulating the many-sided powers and activities of the country that they could remove all their misery and all their sufferings. They must have faith in themselves. Beginning with the killing of mosquitoes they had got to stand up against all the evils that they were suffering from. They had to realise their inner power. And this, like spring itself, would awake the inner soul of the whole country.

Well, Sir, I think I have sufficiently indicated the solution of this problem. I do not for a moment disclaim the responsibility of Government. Government, as I have said, admit their responsibility, but at the same time it must be pointed out that it is not possible for any Government to banish disease. It is the organised efforts of the people

which alone can banish disease in six months. Wherever this has been tried it has succeeded. Try to rouse their inner soul, let them organise and disease would be driven out from the country.

Babu TARIT BHUSAN ROY: What about water-hyacinth?

Mr. C. S. DUTT: This belongs to the Agricultural Department and although I should have liked to speak on it I do not think I am competent to speak about it in this House. But I think the remedy in this case also lies in the organisation and co-operation of the people. I have taken a great deal of time—I have many things to say. Let not my Swarajist friends opposite think that I have come here to criticise. I am a Swarajist at the bottom of my heart. I feel for my country as they feel, but the time has come when they must accept their responsibility and must not remain content with blaming the Government and depending on Government for everything. We can assist them with Government funds but it must be theirs to organise. Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy has said that we should remember the principles of warfare, which are that we should seek out our enemy and carry on an organised campaign against him. Yes, seek out the enemies—the diseases of malaria and kala-azar, of dissensions and of the many social evils which prevent us from realising our nationhood and which stand in the way of our progress and carry on an organised campaign against them and we shall then banish all the evils out of the country.

I have one suggestion to make, Sir, finally and that is this. We have seen a great deal of organisation in this Province lately. Our friends have shown that they can organise and organise with very good effect. But as Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy said, organise against the enemy. You at present believe that there is one enemy and that is Diarchy, and you are organising against it, but Sir, your real enemy is not Diarchy, your real enemies are disease and decay and dissensions and social evils, which prevent you from realising your nationhood. Let them devote a part of the zeal which they have shown in organising in other directions—let them devote a part of that zeal in organising against these real enemies and I have no doubt that in the course of the next year we shall see the dawn of better times in the country.

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL and POLICE DEPARTMENTS and DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [JAILS] (the Hon'ble Sir Hugh Stephenson): For the most part of my time in this Council I have always been ready to hand over my portfolio to any of my colleagues. On the budget discussion, however, there are so many Aunt Sallies that I expect to escape a certain amount of hits. On this occasion, Sir, I have not escaped as much as I expected, although the Police Department has got off with the usual remarks—the abuse of the police is too worn a subject to create very much enthusiasm—I find that on this

occasion I have come in for a share of the general abuse of the reserved departments.

Well, Sir, turning to the budget for 1924-25, I have not heard a single word spoken on the subject of jails. I therefore presume that with the intimate knowledge of the Council on the subject of jails, there is no complaint to make.

Mr. C. R. DAS: We are all jail birds.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: The Hon'ble Mr. Donald has pointed out in his budget speech that the actuals are less than the budget estimate by nearly Rs. 12 lakhs. The revised is a figure for which I am not responsible. It is a figure which the Accountant-General puts up in a secret conclave with the Finance Department as being what they consider we are actually going to spend this year and for purposes of this debate I must take it that it is accurate. The revised estimate is Rs. 10 lakhs below the actuals of 1922-23. In moving for the Police demand last March for the current year, I pointed out that the budget was Rs. 3 lakhs less than that of the preceding year in spite of the fact that normal increase in the time-scale, both in the gazetted and non-gazetted ranks and among the ministerial officers amounted to nearly Rs. 6 lakhs. The present year's budget was Rs. 2 lakhs higher than the actuals of 1922-23 and this was more than accounted for by the normal rise in the cost of the time-scale of pay. The revised figures show a saving of Rs. 12 lakhs on the budget of the current year and Rs. 10 lakhs on the actuals of last year. I think we may claim that this result is due to close and almost cheese-paring economy; the bulk of it, namely, Rs. 8½ lakhs, is accounted for under the head of District Executive Force. The largest items under this head are the pay of the force Rs. 2,44,000, allowance Rs. 2,70,000 and contingencies Rs. 71,000. The first saving is due to our keeping recruitment down to the lowest possible figure. We can now, with the scale of pay we give, get recruits, but for reasons of economy we have abstained from recruiting to the full. The saving of Rs. 2,70,000 under allowances is practically entirely due to curtailment of expenditure under travelling allowance. This has been effected partly by close supervision, partly by an alteration in the rules in the course of the year, and partly by cutting down the amount of touring done. The saving under contingencies is due to the exercise of strict control over this head. There is also a saving of Rs. 89,000 under the head "Presidency Police" as compared with the actuals of 1922-23, but it is due to the same cause as in the District Executive Force, viz., abstention from recruitment and the free grant of leave. As the revised is the nearest we can get to the actuals of the current year, it is a better comparison with the actuals of the previous year, and I will not trouble the Council with any comparison between the revised and the budget estimates for the current year.

The budget for next year shows an increase of Rs. 9 lakhs on the revised estimate for this year, but it still more than half a lakh less than the actuals of 1922-23. The excess is made up of Rs. 1,83,000 under Presidency Police and Rs. 7,61,000 under Bengal Police. The increase in the first item is due mainly to the operations of the time-scales sanctioned 4 years ago, while the increase in contingencies is largely due to the increase in rent, rates and taxes and with our rents continually increasing, I think great credit is due to the Commissioner of Police if he can keep the expenditure under that head within the actuals of 1922-23.

Turning to the Bengal Police, the main increase, viz., Rs. 6,47,000 is under District Executive Force. Of this 3 lakhs is due to the increase in time-scale and in keeping the establishment up to strength. There is an increase of nearly 2 lakhs under the head of allowances, of this Rs. 70,000 comes under the cost of railway warrants and escort charges. I think one member criticised this item. Railway warrants and escort charges are the amounts which we pay direct to the railway for transporting our force. Under the revised pay we gave to the police some 4 years ago, one of the concessions given was a railway warrant to their homes on leave within certain limitations. These are charges which we cannot avoid. Then, Sir, Rs. 25,000 is accounted for under House Rent and Other Allowances of the Bengal Police which we are still keeping so low that it is very difficult to defend ourselves against the charge of breach of faith with our officers. We promised our officers up to certain ranks free quarters. We do not give them all free quarters but we give some of them house allowances and others we give nothing. It is a charge which, I think, Government is bound to pay in order to keep faith with its officers who were engaged on definite terms. Rs. 89,000 is the increase in Travelling Allowance for the whole of the police force in Bengal; and we have raised it in order that we should not have to restrict touring for supervision again in the coming year, as we have to do this year. The travelling allowance estimate for next year is still Rs. 1,23,000 less than the actuals of 1922-23. Under the head "Contingencies" there is an increase of Rs. 1,23,000, but of this Rs. 1 lakh is a new provision for the purchase of cots and mosquito curtains for a portion of the police force. This item has been the butt of a certain amount of witticism during the course of the debate and has also been heavily criticised, the idea being apparently that I have been looking about for something to spend on for the Police and as they are well fed, clothed, etc., in preference to providing them with wrist watches we have given them mosquito curtains. The reason however for this provision is as follows:

I have on previous occasions in this Council admitted that we house our police disgracefully and if we force our own servants to live in unhealthy malarious places in tumbled-down sheds with leaky roofs, the least we can do is to see that they do not have to sleep on the

floor or on the verandah, which is at present the case in far too many thanas and police-stations. The provision of cots and mosquito curtains is to my mind a part of an absolute duty of any employer of labour in similar circumstances, a health insurance for the force and though the results cannot be measured in money, we undoubtedly obtain more than equivalent results in the increased efficiency of the force and the decrease in the sick rate. Every constable while in hospital is a dead loss to the force and the healthier we keep the force the more economical it is. This provision of Rs. 1 lakh is the only specific new expenditure in the whole of the police budget for the improvement of the condition of the force.

The only other large increases are Rs. 86,000 under railway police and Rs. 88,000 under Criminal Investigation Department. The former is mainly due to the police on Assam-Bengal Railway. Hitherto the cost of policing the railways was borne by the province which controlled the police on these railways, for example, we policed a certain portion of the Eastern Bengal Railway which was situated within the boundaries of Assam and Assam policed the whole of the Assam-Bengal Railway including the portion within Bengal. The Government of India ruled last year that irrespective of the question of which Government had control over the police force on a railway, each Government must pay for the cost of the police employed on the lines within its borders. We were better off under the old system financially, but as in any case we should have to pay in future for the cost of the police within our borders, we decided that we would take over the control of them as well. So, for the future, Assam has taken over the police on the Eastern Bengal Railway within its boundaries and we have taken over the police within the boundaries of Bengal. The same arrangement will eventually be made with respect to the police on the Bengal-Nagpur Railway within our boundaries, and the details of the project are being worked out. Well, this ruling of the Government of India will cost us an extra sum of Rs. 60,000.

Under the Criminal Investigation Department, we have repeated the budget demand for the current year, though by dint of reducing the force to the utmost minimum, we have been able to effect a considerable saving on the budget of the current year; but in view of the facts I have placed before the Council on several occasions, I hold out no hope that we shall be able to effect the same economy next year.

Well, Sir, a good deal has been said in the course of the debate with regard to the Retrenchment Committee's proposals, and a great point has been made of the fact that although the Retrenchment Committee recommended savings in the Bengal Police to the extent of Rs. 26 lakhs and Rs. 8 lakhs in the Calcutta Police, the police budget for next year is less than a lakh below the actuals of 1922-23. In the first place, I would like to point out that the Retrenchment Committee's proposed cuts were not on the actuals of 1922-23, they were on

the budget for 1922-23, which was a very different matter, and, secondly, that the Retrenchment Committee never proposed for one single moment that the cost of the Police Department was not bound to expand. They suggested certain immediate cuts and the abolition of certain appointments. They never for one moment contended that the pay of the rank and file of the force should be reduced or that the normal rise under the head of establishment due to the operation of the time-scale then in force could be avoided. Last year, I pointed out what we had done to meet the suggestions of the Retrenchment Committee and I also made certain criticisms of their figures. Perhaps the Council will bear with me if I repeat the figures. In the Bengal Police the total reduction suggested was Rs. 26,28,000 and the biggest item was nearly Rs. 11½ lakhs under the head of District Force. The Retrenchment Committee proposed to go back to the year 1912 and abolish all the police-stations that have been established since that year. Their estimate was that this would result in over 200 police-stations being abolished with a corresponding reduction of staff. It was admittedly a sweeping recommendation, for reduction of expenditure. They did not go into the details, they did not go into the question whether these new thanas were necessary, or whether we were justified in their establishment, but they simply said that our expenditure is too high and that therefore we must go back to the year 1912, which was immediately before the re-partition of Bengal. But, Sir, in making these calculations they made three serious miscalculations. In the first place, in reckoning up how many police-stations there were in 1912, they omitted all the railway police-stations but included them in their calculations for 1921. The second mistake they made was that in reckoning the police-stations in 1912, they omitted all the independent outposts; the independent outposts were mostly in Eastern Bengal, and for all practical purposes they had the same powers, the same staff and the same jurisdiction as a police-station; but they were not called thanas, because in Eastern Bengal they were afraid of altering the area of a thana, it being at the same time a revenue area so these new thanas were called independent outposts. Since 1912, i.e., after the re-partition, all these independent outposts have been made police-stations without the expenditure of a single pice. So, Sir, even if we carried out the Retrenchment Committee proposals, instead of 200 police-stations being got rid of—even going back to the *status quo* of 1912, we found that only 87 could be got rid of. In calculating the staff that can be abolished with their 200 police-stations, they include the entire increase between 1912 and 1921 in other branches of the police, viz., the prosecuting agencies, the armed police, town police and other miscellaneous police. To take one figure, merely as an example, they suggest abolishing 2,998 constables. We worked out according to their suggestion and found that the number of constables that could be abolished on their own showing was 990. If we accepted their recommendation in

full and went back to the position of 1912, we would get actual savings very much less than Rs. 11½ lakhs—something below 6 lakhs. As regards what we have done on their recommendation, we have in the teeth of local opposition abolished three police-stations and two more are now under consideration. The Inspector-General is or has been examining the case of every single police-station with a view to seeing whether it is possible to abolish it or not: but in each case the opposition comes from the local people. Wherever we propose to abolish a police-station, the people of that locality send petitions to Government that it should not be abolished.

The next biggest saving they proposed was Rs. 6,12,000 under the Intelligence Branch of the Criminal Investigation Department. They nowhere gave the details of this figure and as the total actuals for 1922-23 were Rs. 6,68,000 and they still propose to keep up a Criminal Investigation Department, it is clear that their figures were badly wrong somewhere. I pointed out last year that we had made a cut of Rs. 2,21,000 from the budget figures of 1922-23 under this head. We have since made further cuts and have abolished the Criminal Tribes Section in accordance with their recommendation. I think Babu Sarat Chunder Bose pointed out that we have abolished the Dacoity Section but that is a mistake—a misprint in the budget.

The next biggest cut was Rs. 2,20,000 for the Police Training School. The Committee's figures were wrong as regards the cost of upkeep of Sarda by at least Rs. 30,000. Therefore, out of Rs. 1,90,000 they suggested we should retrench we did retrench Rs. 1,64,000. Out of Rs. 2 lakhs they asked us to reduce on the River Police—we actually retrenched Rs. 1,07,000. We have also kept unfilled three appointments of Additional Superintendents of Police and made other retrenchments. Therefore, out of Rs. 26 lakhs which they suggested as the maximum reduction possible in the Bengal Police—I would emphasise the fact that the bulk of their recommendations were in the nature of forced economies not of desirable savings. Out of the Rs. 26 lakhs about Rs. 6,00,000 at least goes out, because it is a fictitious saving, due only to miscalculations on the part of the Committee. There is another Rs. 2 lakhs or so, I have not been able to trace, under the head of the Criminal Investigation Department, and we have actually made savings amounting to Rs. 6 or 7 lakhs. I may claim, therefore, that we have taken sincerely the Retrenchment Committee's proposals and have done our level best to work them out.

Turning to the Calcutta Police the bulk of the savings of Rs. 8 lakhs depended upon very drastic rearrangement of the city police force, including a complete separation of the investigating from the patrol force—practically all their retrenchments depended on that being done. We have examined this proposal with the greatest care and we have come to the conclusion that the economies hoped for from their proposals would not materialise to any large extent, while the efficiency of the protection given to the public would be very considerably decreased. We [illegible]

accepted most of their proposals which do not hinge upon this drastic reorganisation, but the most important of their recommendations with regard to the Calcutta Police was that the number of police buildings should be reduced to the smallest number compatible with good administration and that suitable Government buildings should be erected. I have worked out a scheme to carry out that recommendation and I confidently look to the Council for its support when I bring that scheme before it. It is a scheme purely economical from the financial point of view. I have no doubt many of you know the present buildings in which our police are housed, specially in the town. They are absolutely unsuitable, absolutely wasteful in space and health and inordinately expensive.

Turning now to the general criticism on the budget—they are twofold: firstly, that the expenditure on the reserved side exceeds that on the transferred side: and secondly, that there is no policy behind the budget. Well, Sir, I demur entirely to the first criticism; it is utterly unfair. The reserved departments are mainly the machinery of Government and in every Government you will find that the machinery is the most expensive part of it. It is not fair to hand us the machinery of Government and then to say "You are spending too much because the other side is not spending so much." (A VOICE: "Your machinery is expensive.) Yes, you may say that, but that is a different matter, and that I am prepared to argue with you. But my point is that it is not a fair criticism of the budget to say that because Rs. 4 crores are spent on the reserved side and 3 or 2 crores on the transferred side there must be something wrong. (A VOICE: "Give us the reserved side and we shall manage it").

I agree with Mr. Mitter—it is one of the few things with which I agree in his speech—when he said that there was no distinction between the reserved and transferred departments. I deny entirely that Mr. Fazl-ul Huq's schools are not my schools and that my policemen are not Mr. Fazl-ul Huq's. His schools are educating Bengal, so that there will be less necessity for the police and my police are protecting him while he is doing it. The interest of the whole Government is one.

There has been a good deal of misunderstanding as to the allocation of funds in the budget. I think if you will examine the budget you will see that the bulk of it is purely compulsory expenditure and that was shown very clearly two years ago when we had a deficit budget, and when orders went round from the Financial Department that no new expenditure whatever should be included in the budget. We then made our budget just the same as we have done now. You cannot get away from our compulsory charges except by a radical alteration of our system.

Mr. BYOMKES CHAKRAVARTI: That is what we want.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: But you can't radically alter your system by a budget.

As regards the allegation that the Hon'ble the Finance Member sits upon the purse and when the Minister comes for money he says he has got none but when a Member of Council asks for money he gives it, I can only say that that is not what is done. The Finance Member tells us what is the margin after the compulsory expenditure has been provided for—that is his business. Government as a whole decides as to how the margin is to be spent and what is the most urgent scheme. The Government's decision is the decision of the Government as a whole. The Members of the reserved side are accused of not supporting the expansion of the transferred subjects—education, agriculture, industries, sanitation, etc. But it is obvious that it is the interest of us all to expand those subjects. Our experience—I am speaking as an official Member—may make us more cautious, we may see dangers—we may be right, we may be wrong—but the suggestion that we always oppose the policy of expansion of the transferred subjects is only to be stated to be shown to be absolutely absurd.

But, Sir, who is responsible for the policy? Is it not the Council which is responsible? So far as the reserved departments are concerned our policy is the policy of keeping the machinery going. Take for instance, the Police Department. We have got to keep the machinery going. Eventually we will have to hand it over to our successors and we shall try to do so as a going concern and in decent order. But what about the policy of development which is mainly in the departments that have been transferred? Who is it who will formulate the policy of the country so far as the transferred subjects are concerned? Surely it is the country itself—surely it is your business, the business of the Council to formulate the policy. But, Sir, during the last three years during which I have sat in this Council I have never been able to understand what the policy of this Council was, say, in education. Was it the development of primary education or of the secondary education or of the higher education? It is quite obvious that in a country like Bengal, you cannot develop all these three sides of education at once.

Mr. BYOMKES CHAKRAVARTI: For the last three years you have been developing Ministers only.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: I can only say that if this Council will definitely formulate a policy of education or of sanitation or anything else which they are prepared to pay for and if the Council support their Ministers while they are carrying out the policy the Council can rely on the assistance of the other Members of Government, too, those who are responsible to Parliament.

Mr. C. R. Das has suggested a policy this afternoon. As regards the financial aspect of that policy I shall leave it to the Finance Member to deal with, but I would only point out that though the idea of spending one crore on primary education is attractive it is really no policy at all. If you have a crore in your budget how are you going to spend it? What

would be your policy—are you going to train teachers first or are you going to start schools first? What are you going to do with it? Merely to say that we have not provided enough money in the budget for education, therefore we are starving education will not do. If you take away the money from the reserved side and hand it over to the Agriculture Department what would they do with it? They would not know how to spend the money. Where is the policy? (VOICES: Leave that to us: we will formulate our own policy.) I can assure you that so far as the reserved side is concerned you will have no opposition to a policy of expansion.

Coming more specifically to the Police Budget, the general criticism on this also falls under two categories: firstly, that the police is inefficient, and secondly that too much is spent on the Police budget. As regards the first point, I think there can be no doubt that within the last 20 years there has been an enormous improvement in the efficiency of the Police. There is a better stamp of men in the police now—graduates as Sub-Inspectors and Assistant Sub-Inspectors—a better stamp of men all round. They are trained better—we have even trained constables in the Constables' Training School not only about their powers but about their duties towards the public as a whole. We have also trained detectives in the Detective Training School which was the admiration of other provinces. But, Sir, traditions and reputations take a long time to die out and so we still have abuse thrown upon the police largely for what it used to be 20 or 30 years ago. Discipline is quite essential in the police force and to preserve discipline you must have proper supervision. You are bound to trust your police force with powers, and when you are going to trust your police force with powers you must have supervision.

Mr. PRESIDENT: I am sorry to interrupt you, Sir Hugh Stephenson, but I should like to adjourn the Council now unless you would like to complete any part of your speech.

[Here the Council was adjourned for 15 minutes.]

After the adjournment.

The Hon'ble Sir HUGH STEPHENSON: I will only add one word of appeal to the Council. I maintain that we have in Bengal a police force which is worthy of comparison with any force. The whole basis of a good police force must be self-respect and I put it to the Council how can it expect the police to maintain its self-respect with a constant shower of mud being thrown at it. It is often said that Government support the police right or wrong. That is not the view of the police and Government have no interest in supporting the police when they are wrong. An inefficient or oppressive police officer does more harm to Government than he does to the country. Government is keenly interested in keeping the police force pure and efficient. But when mud is thrown wildly, it disguises the issue—it disguises facts and it is

impossible for Government to ascertain what the real facts are. Government has got to treat its servants with justice and so long as mud-throwing is indiscriminate it is impossible for Government to co-operate with the people in the way there ought to be co-operation to keep a good and efficient police force.

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL and LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENTS (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): As regards my departments' budget not very much has been said by the critics of the budget generally, and therefore, I will not occupy much of the time of the Council. I shall say one or two words with regard to the general criticisms that have been levelled against the administration so far as the budget is concerned. It has been said by Mr. C. R. Das that it is not possible to put any confidence in the promises of the Government and that therefore it would be justifiable for him and his followers to reject the budget altogether. But I am sorry he adduced no particular proof. As an Indian I must ask him this question: Can he truly say, whatever the demerits of the administration have been, that India does not owe a great deal to the British administration? For instance, can it be denied that peace has been kept in India as it was never kept before? India has been protected from external aggression and there has been no internecine warfare for a long time. That is a great blessing of the British Government. Perhaps it is not possible for us who live in the present generation to realise its full significance. But it is an inestimable blessing. Then what about Education? May I ask my friends, the Swarajists, would there have been this cry for Swaraj but for the English education that they have received? There can be but one answer. If this education had not spread to the extent that it has done here we would not have this cry for Swaraj, self-government, responsible self-government or Dominion status. As an Indian I would protest against such sweeping criticism of the British administration.

Mr. C. R. Das has told us that for the last time he is going to put forward a constructive proposal. I strained my ears to hear what this proposal was. I must confess first of all that never before did I hear of any constructive proposal coming from him or his party. I am an assiduous reader of their paper and this is the first time and not the last that I have heard of any constructive proposal. And what is this constructive proposal? "Give me 5 crores and I will make Bengal a great healthy province and an industrial centre and change the whole face of the country." I say this to him—I have got a simpler remedy: "Give me Aladin's Lamp and I will accomplish this object much more easily. I would ask the genii at my command to raise the level of Bengal by 3,000 feet and we shall then get rid of malaria and many other evils." What, Sir, is this great constructive scheme? One crore for primary education, one crore for secondary education, one crore for banishing malaria, and 30 lakhs for Muhammadan education, etc. But where is your programme? (A Voice: We shall make out our own programme.)

Yes, we will have to find it for you. (A Voice: Not you, but we.) It has never been in their contemplation to put forward schemes. (A Voice: It will be put forward later on.) They have never had any scheme to put forward. (A Voice: Because we are not scheming persons.)

Mr. PRESIDENT: I must point out to the Council that 50 speeches have been made during the last three days without the slightest interruption. Now when the Members of Government are replying, it seems that they cannot be permitted to speak without constant interruption.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I want to submit, Sir, that there was no interruption during our speeches because we were reasonable in our utterances.

Mr. PRESIDENT: That is a matter of opinion. I have listened to some speeches which might have been subject to very considerable interruption by those who did not agree with them.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I am obliged to you, Sir, for helping me to continue my speech. They say they have been very reasonable, but I wish they could learn to be a little more polite and courteous. Those are very valuable qualities if they want to run self-government. Sir, as regards Mr. C. R. Das' scheme it is mere moonshine that he has placed before the Council. Sir Hugh Stephenson has pointed out that it is quite impossible for any department to spend all this money within the year. You must have a practical programme of work in accordance with the policy that is to be carried out. I would not call this a scheme at all.

I must also say one word as regards the charges that have been levelled against the reserved departments generally. It has been represented by speaker after speaker that it is our business and indeed that we consider it to be our duty to grab all the money that there is in the budget leaving the Ministers nothing. As has already been explained the budget is considered as a whole. All the departments put forward their demands and then the Members in charge of the reserved departments and the Ministers in charge of the transferred departments consider the importance of various schemes and then funds are allocated. All the departments reserved as well as transferred have their own duties to perform. I say that the reserved departments are absolutely essential for good government and I do not think that even the Swarajists can possibly say that the reserved departments ought not to be provided for. There can be no Government if these departments are starved. And I for my part can assert that none of us ever refuse to help the transferred departments as much as it is possible within the limits of our purse. Is it to be thought of for a moment that no one is interested in the spread of education in the province or to see that disease is eradicated? I say that it is not fair to bring this charge against the members responsible for the reserved departments.

Now Sir, as the time is limited I will say one or two words about the criticisms as regards the Paper Book Department of the High Court. I find Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury is not here. He wanted to have some information as regards the expenditure in this department, and we have supplied him with that information. He also complained that the Paper Book Department has injuriously affected the junior pleaders a number of whom used to find employment in preparing paper books. I sent for information regarding this from the High Court, and I wish to remind this Council that the paper book department was started by a distinguished Vakil Judge, Sir Asutosh Mukherji whom no one will accuse of thinking of injuring the interests of junior pleaders. It was he when he was officiating Chief Justice of the Calcutta High Court who initiated this department and I have got figures to show that far from injuring the interest of junior pleaders this Paper Book Department have employed a number of them. I find that formerly 30 pleaders used to find employment in preparing paper books. Now in this department no less than 36 pleaders have found employment in various capacities. Besides these 36 there is a list of about 68 pleaders who also do special job work in connection with paper books. This was the [illegible] complaint of Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury, but it will be seen that the department has in no way injured the interests of the junior pleaders. Mr. Sarat Chandra Bose complained of delays in the Munsif and Subordinate Judge's courts at Burdwan and Asansol. As regards that everyone knows that a strong committee has been constituted to inquire into the whole question of delays presided over by Mr. Justice Rankin and I assure this House that we expect substantial results from their labours. They are inquiring as to how far the procedure and arrangements of the court are responsible for the delay and I am sure that when their report is published we shall be in a position to deal with this question in an effective way. Mr. Bose suggested that we should increase the staff of judicial officers. That I submit to the House is not possible within the limits of our present resources. We are doing as much as we can in consultation with the High Court to see that there is an adequate staff and that the cases are not unduly prolonged.

Another hon'ble member raised the question of a Civil Court building at Serampore. He suggested that we should buy the building in which the Civil Courts are now housed. We have consulted an expert on this point and have been assured that this building is entirely unsuitable and is in such a dilapidated condition that there will be very little saving of money if we were to repair it properly. So it has been thought better to have a new building. As we have been strongly advised to that affect, that is why we have provided money for a new building. I would not like to take up the time of the Council any more.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENTS of LAND REVENUE, FORESTS, IRRIGATION and EUROPEAN EDUCATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): My 17 years' experience in the Bengal Legislative Council without a break, Sir, has taught me that this academic discussion of the budget is really getting more and more dreary in view of the fact that we have the very same things repeated when different votes for grants come up. I was sorry that yesterday you, Sir, missed a little amusement—the only amusement really during the last three dreary days. I was responsible for the first amusement for having indulged in the Parliamentary weakness of forty winks, whereas my friend Mr. Byomkes Chakravarti, who I am sorry is not in the House just now, came up and was telling me what the amusement was about when he was called to order by Dr. Moreno for standing with his back to the Chair. With three graceful bows he resumed his seat. They were the three most graceful bows that I have seen in my life. My hon'ble friend, Mr. Chakravarti as you know, Sir, as we all know, is a born courtier and he really should have lived in the days of the "*grande monarchie*" for I am sure King Louis XIV when he wanted to use his pet phrase *cherchez la femme* would have found Mr. Byomkes Chakravarti very useful with his graceful bows. From graceful bows we have got to come down to facts and I have to offer to the Council some explanations regarding certain items of expenditure which we have provided in that portion of the Budget which is under my charge. Babu Sudarsan Chakravarty and one or two other speakers want the removal of the silt at the mouth of the Boral river. Regarding the Boral river some of those gentlemen who were members of the late Bengal Legislative Council and who have been returned here may remember that it was brought before the House by one or two members interested in the locality, and I had on more than one occasion to mention the real facts of the case.

The mouth of the Boral river is on the Ganges About 28 miles upstream of the Hardinge Bridge. The Boral river is a spill river connecting the Ganges and the Jamuna and it has silted up very badly and there is also an obstruction at the mouth. We are constantly receiving representations to dredge this river but we are unable to do so as it would endanger the Hardinge Bridge for one thing and might divert the course of the Ganges for another.

I got the railway authorities to agree to certain irrigation schemes being carried out from the Boral provided that a proper regulator was built to prevent the Boral enlarging itself so as to become dangerous.

The Secretary, Local Self-Government Department was about a year ago in communication with the people who asked for irrigation facilities, inquiring if they were willing to find money to construct this weir, but from that time to this nothing further has been heard about the matter by this Department. If the people wish to have the Boral improved the

matter lies largely in their own hands. I was glad to find Rai Satyendra Nath Chaudhury Bahadur give us a pat on the back regarding the colonisation scheme of Bakarganj and I hope that this Council by voting the money that we have asked for in this year's budget will permit the Revenue Department to increase its resources under this head and at the same time help the people who want to colonise and settle there. Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury made certain caustic remarks about the provision made in the budget for the reserved side of Education. I shall at a later stage mention something about this bogey of reserved and transferred. Meanwhile I may mention this to those who, like Mr. Nurul Huq Chaudhury, might be of the same opinion that we are spending in proportion to the population of Europeans in the province very large sums of money, that where minorities are concerned—minorities like the European and the Anglo-Indian communities—it is not only fallacious but unjust to apply the population test. Their requirements are different.

Another thing which I should like those who consider that European education is getting a large share to bear in mind is that the majority of the institutions like the La Martiniére were founded by non-official Europeans and are maintained largely by them and if the Government are supplementing those institutions with grants the Government is doing so because it considers that their claim is fair and just and it does not do so with any idea of giving them money at the expense of others. As regards the Dow Hill School and the Victoria School at Kurseong, I may perhaps for those who are new to this Council mention that these schools are maintained mainly for the children and relations of European and Anglo-Indian Government servants and they are maintained with that degree of efficiency which is essential for the training that they receive. An erroneous conception seems to have come in regarding the Darjeeling High School. The Darjeeling High School is maintained for the natives of that district and the new school building as well as the improvement of the class rooms is absolutely essential specially in view of the fact that the Nepalese and the Bhutias are now beginning to appreciate the fruits of education and the demand for better education for the children of the soil in that part of the province is growing. Dr. Moreno mentioned about a new Anglo-Indian hostel which is a matter more for the University authorities than myself; although it relates to European education it does not come directly under me. Khan Bahadur Musharuff Hossain wants to inquire as to whether the vested interest of the parties would be protected in the settlement operations at Chittagong. I may say it will certainly be protected as Government itself is the vested interest there.

I am sorry that in view of the earnestness with which he spoke I am unable to see eye to eye with Mr. Sultan Ali who comes from Khulna regarding the picture he drew of the famine in Khulna some years past. It is true that in some of the parts it was very bad, but I visited some of

these parts myself and the *communique* which was issued by Government after my inspection was a clear statement as to why Government was not in a position or did not consider it necessary to declare the tract under the Famine Code. I am sorry that from the little group that used to sit in the corner in the old Council one has left us, namely, Babu Nalini Nath Roy, whose death we all deplore. I am glad to find my friend Rai Harendranath Chaudhuri who as usual with his eagle eye has tried to find fault with us in some of our provisions in the Irrigation Department. I am always anxious to help him and my friend the Kumar Saheb who is specialising for becoming an expert in matters relating to Irrigation and I shall be very glad to supply them with any such information regarding the details of the budget.

A complaint has come from Rai Harendranath Chaudhuri that our Irrigation budget information is scanty. If he will kindly point out either to Mr. Huntingford or to myself in what respect he considers the information scanty then we shall not only try to give him the information he wants but perhaps like the Hon'ble Mr. Donald who seems to be a good boy in the eyes of Rai Harendranath Chaudhuri, my successor in office might also emulate his example and when introducing the budget next year he might give more details. Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray in this connection has discovered that we have been hankey-pankying with the Madaripur bhil route scheme and he in his usual sensorial manner wants information as to why we have been inclined to deceive the members of this Council by calling a part of the Madaripur bhil route scheme as the Lower Kumar river scheme. If he will refer to page 76 of the Grey Book he will find "Improvement of the Lower Kumar river by dredging (included in the Madaripur bhil route)." Therefore, Sir, there is no idea of deception. The idea simply is that the portion of the Madaripur bhil route, which is known as the Lower Kumar river, is the portion that is proposed to be taken up in the next year's budget. Now, Sir, these are all what I have to say on some of the provisions relating to my department, but I should like to make some general observations and I beg your indulgence as well as the indulgence of those members who are present here, as this is the last occasion on which I shall be addressing this House as a Member of Government on the general discussion of the budget.

We have heard, I hope, Sir, you will pardon the expression, a certain amount of *Beuglement du Taureau* from certain members of the Swaraj party to throw out the budget as a whole. I hope that in view of the expression of opinion by their leader Mr. C. R. Das and in view of the fact that in his so-called graciousness he has thrown a sop to Government in the shape of what he calls a constructive scheme that they will reconsider this matter carefully: but before I say anything I should like to make a personal explanation to both my friends Mr. C. R. Das and Babu Bejoy Krishna Bose whom I have had the pleasure of knowing during the last few days only, who think that I have

a natural tendency to intimidate, and Bejoy Babu, I think, just at the time when I was in the middle of my slumber yesterday, said that in spite of the Maharaja's veiled threat they were going to throw out the budget. I should like to point out to my friends that there was a time when I was perhaps one of the most persecuted persons and there was no one to whom more intimidation was conveyed than to myself. Sir, if anybody hates intimidation it is myself. Therefore, I should like to assure my friends that there was no idea either of intimidating or of playing the rôle of a superior person on my part, when, in the debate on the question of release of political prisoners or in the debate on the vote of no confidence on the Ministers I sounded a note of warning. I did so and I do so now with the best of intentions because I feel that I have a right as a patriotic Indian just as much as those who have now labelled themselves as Swarajists to claim for India that emancipation and that realisation step by step for which not only every Indian in India aspires for, but every honest and right-minded European and Englishman is willing to help.

Now, Sir, regarding the question of reserved and transferred sides, I am not going to go into the mentalities of my two late Hon'ble Colleagues, Mr. P. C. Mitter and Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, because I am sure they know as much as I do that whether they were able to produce new schemes or policies we in the Government had always tried to work as a unified whole and as Sir Hugh Stephenson very rightly pointed out a little while ago it is to our interest just as much as to those of our Hon'ble Colleagues on the transferred side to produce schemes and to get them passed with the sanction of the representatives of the country, namely, the members of the Bengal Legislative Council. Mr. C. R. Das has given us a programme costing, I think, 5 crores. I may point out to him at once but he is not here—I am sure his friends will convey it to him—that in the Irrigation Department alone we have got schemes relating to anti-malarial projects—to give only one instance—the Bhairab-Matabhanga scheme which alone will cost double the figure which Mr. C. R. Das has given for all the different improvements he proposes. Therefore, it is not a question of money simply; it is a question on our side of being able to produce schemes and for the Finance Member with the condition of the finances to be able to give as much money as he can for the schemes and for the members of the Council on the other hand to consider the schemes in their proper light and not to block every scheme because we have not been able to produce some fantastic idea of putting down a large figure which could not possibly be spent in a year. I would like my friends who have criticised us to remember that none of us—neither Sir Hugh Stephenson nor Mr. Donald, nor the two brown members of the bureaucracy with them—none of us are here, to imitate the words of rather a popular song of the day "Dreaming dreams or scheming schemes or building castles in the air or for ever blowing bubbles, pretty bubbles in the air." We

are here to try to the best of our abilities to produce schemes for the benefit of the country whether they relate to the reserevd or the transferred half of Government, and it is our duty so long as we are members of the Government to try and take with us the members of the Legislative Council and I sincerely hope that when the final discussion of the budget comes up, for the sake of the province, for the sake of the country itself saner judgments will prevail and that we shall be able to get through many things which are so urgently needed for the development of the province and for expenditure on the right lines.

MEMBER in charge of FINANCE, COMMERCE, and MARINE DEPARTMENTS (the Hon'ble Mr. J. Donald): Since the discussion of the budget I have begun to think that we might have had a better procedure than that followed on this and previous occasions. We have been told we have got very little policy behind this budget. It might have been better if, instead of explaining the policy at the end of this debate, my Hon'ble Colleagues had explained the policy which lies behind the budget and then had a discussion on it. If we had adopted this course then the debate might not have appeared so dreary as it has to several members. I am afraid what I have to say may also be somewhat of a dreary nature.

There has been very little comment on that part of the budget relating to the departments with which I am concerned. Therefore, I am spared the trouble—it may only be temporarily—of dealing with the details under the various budget heads of my department. The criticisms that I have to meet fall into two categories, namely, the comments made on the budget as a whole, and the more general issues. The chief among them is that behind this budget there is no policy; it is a budget of rupees, an account of expenditure and receipts and little more. And further that I am the villain. It is said that the revenues of the province are at my disposal, that I have turned down schemes, that I have refused money and that I have blocked the way to progress and made no efforts to get money to meet the demands of the various departments, especially the nation-building departments. In order to meet these criticisms I shall have to explain what the position of the Finance Department is in the constitution of the Government, but let me first refer briefly to one or two small detailed criticisms of the budget. I think there is a good deal of misconception and misunderstanding as to what the revised estimate means. A revised estimate is entirely a matter for the Finance Department; it has nothing to do with the budget grants—the grants that have been voted by the Council; we cannot cut those grants. The departments can spend them in full. What we do in the Finance Department is to keep an eye on the expenditure during the year and our experience of past expenditure and the expenditure that is going on leads us to certain conclusions that at the close of the year a certain figure of expenditure will be reached. These conclusions we put down in the revised estimate. The budget

grants are not cut; the departments have full power to spend their money. These estimates are also necessary in order that we should know what funds we have got at our credit in the balances. That is necessary for expenditure in the following year and it helps us in determining what expenditure will be required to carry on for the following year.

There has been some criticism of our revenues particularly as regards Stamps and Excise. The Hon'ble Mr. Ghuznavi has dealt with Excise and I need not repeat it. But we are told that taxation is a great burden on the people and an out-and-out modification of the present policy of taxation is suggested. I refer to this merely to draw the attention of members probably to what they have already noticed that the Government of India contemplate an inquiry into the general system of taxation in this country, whether it is equitable and in accord with the general principles of taxation, and whether the burden is properly distributed. One member referred to contingencies and said that only a small retrenchment had been made and he quoted in that connection the figures which I gave him in answer to a question which he put in Council the other day. The member seems to have forgotten or to have overlooked the second part of my answer which told him that a special officer is still going on making inquiries and that we hope to make still further retrenchments in that line. Mr. Satyendra Chandra Mitra found some difficulty in following the budget. I found it difficult to follow his criticisms. May I suggest to him that it would save a great deal of trouble if he would come over to the Secretariat—it is much simpler to explain these things quietly over the table. Behind me is Rai Harendranath Chaudhuri who always comes to us and we give him very full information on the points he desires. One particular item to which a member on this side referred was why some items of expenditure were shown as voted and some as non-voted. If he will come round to my office I shall be able to explain to him clearly in detail. These small details over, let me turn to the main criticisms.

It is said that the Finance Member, with his adamantine heart, has not accorded generous treatment to the transferred departments. More than one speaker has referred to this and even the ex-Ministers have used this as an explanation of why more has not been done in the transferred departments. I am accused of obstruction and hard-heartedness and the Kumar Saheb has referred to the arbitrary methods in which I make allotments to the various departments. He referred to the fact that there used to be a Finance Committee which allotted funds for new expenditure. There was, it is true, a Finance Committee in former days, but what this Committee did was to consider schemes for new expenditure and make recommendations to Government. Then the Government allocated the money. The Kumar Saheb seems to think that I have vested in myself the powers of the committee, nay even of the whole Government.

Let me now explain the position of the Finance Department. I want to make this clear because there are many, even in the Secretariat, who are not particularly conversant with the work of the Finance Department. Now, the Finance Department has nothing to do with the allocation of money. The business of the Finance Department is to examine and advise on schemes for new expenditure. This is all laid down in the rules. New schemes involving expenditure must all come before the Finance Department. This is laid down in the Devolution Rules. What the Finance Department has to do may be dealt with under four heads. Their duty is—

(1) to see that that a scheme is based on sound financial principles and in accord with the recognised canons for expenditure of public money;

(2) to ensure that the scheme is not extravagant or a wasteful one. It might, for example, suggest that the scheme that is put forward would be done in a better way and at a cheaper cost;

(3) to ensure co-ordination between the departments; as e.g., in the matter of salaries;

(4) to see that the proper sanction is obtained there are certain rules of sanction and the Finance Department sees that necessary sanction is obtained.

There is nothing in all these which gives the Finance Department power to say that a scheme cannot be proceeded with because there is no money. In connection with a scheme the business of the Finance Department is finished when it has examined the scheme on its merits. The provision of money stands on a quite different footing. This is laid down in the Devolution Rules. Rule 31 of the Devolution Rules lays down that framing of proposals for expenditure in regard to transferred and reserved subjects will be a matter for agreement between that part of the Government which is responsible for the administration of the transferred subjects and that part of the Government which is responsible for the administration of reserved subjects. In other words the Members and Ministers sit together to decide what schemes are to be provided for.

It will be helpful if I give some indication as to how a budget is prepared. All departments send in their estimates of expenditure for the ensuing year. These deal with expenditure which has already been approved, sanctioned and which is going on. There are certain variations of expenditure caused by such items as increments of pay, progressive salaries, certain works which may be coming to a close—all variations of expenditure which has already been voted by the Council and passed. All these are checked and examined, consolidated and collected in the light of experience of past expenditure, firstly, in the Accountant-General's office, and secondly, in the Finance Department. While this is going on, all the new schemes, schemes for new expenditure, which the Departments want to put in the next year's budget, are

sent into the Finance Department. These schemes have already been examined and approved by the Finance Department, in accordance with the rules and all that the Finance Department does is to see that they are properly presented and that they have been approved. About the 15th January the first edition of the budget incorporating the sanctioned expenditure and estimates of revenue based on the figures up to the end of December, or about that time, is fixed up, and checked. We have then a budget of sanctioned expenditure for the coming year. Then we know how we stand; we know what our revenue and existing expenditure will be, what our general financial position is. What the Finance Department does is to place before the whole Government this budget showing the exact financial position of the province and the proposals for new expenditure. It is the business of Government as a whole to determine which of the new schemes shall be included in the budget. This has, of course, to be considered with reference to the funds available. The Finance Department merely comes in to record the decision of Government. The Finance Member does not as such allocate the money; it is allocated by the Members and Ministers of Government sitting together. The Finance Department cannot sanction new expenditure, it must be done by Government as a whole. Therefore I am not, personally, as Finance Member, responsible for the allocation of funds. Let me now look at it from another point of view. How does a scheme find a place in the budget? With regard to a scheme we must first have a policy. When a Minister or Member determines a policy he works out a scheme and that scheme comes up to the Finance Department to be examined on the principles which I have mentioned. As I have said the Finance Department cannot turn down a scheme. The Finance Department may differ from a Member or Minister in regard to a particular scheme but it cannot reject the scheme. If the Member or Minister is not satisfied with the decision of the Finance Department he can take it, according to the principle of diarchy, to the Governor in Council if the question relates to the reserved side or to the Governor sitting with his Ministers if it relates to the transferred side. But we are working on a unified system and the whole Government would be consulted in a matter in which the Finance Department differs from a Member or Minister. Then the decision arrived at is the decision of the Government and there can be no rejection by the Finance Member. If it is decided that it is an approved scheme the next thing is to find funds. As I have said the finding of funds for expenditure on the schemes is a matter which is determined by the Government as a whole. In order that a scheme might find a place in the budget there must therefore be a policy and it must be an approved scheme.

Let me apply this with regard to the remarks made by the ex-Minister, Mr. Mitter, who has pleaded that nothing has been done for primary and secondary education despite his protests because of the obstruction of the Finance Member. I may repeat that it is not in my

power to turn down a scheme. He says that my answer will be "there is no money." But I have quite a different answer "there were no schemes." How could I say there was no money for these schemes when the schemes did not exist?

Turning to the remarks of the ex-Minister (Nawab Sahib), I find he says that the trees have been cut down, but where are the shoots to take their places. Now if there are to be shoots the seeds must be planted or the ground sown. He refers as one instance to the absence of the scheme for primary agricultural education from the budget. I believe there is such a scheme, but I have never seen it in the Finance Department and that is one reason why it does not appear in the budget.

Then, Mr. Mitter has said that I have not shown statesmanship. Surely, the proper statesmanship to my mind is to formulate a policy, to secure the acceptance of that policy by this Council, and then to push on with determination to secure funds for carrying out that policy.

Now, I turn to the budget for the coming year. In the first place, the ordinary expenditure was determined with reference to past expenditure as modified by the Retrenchment Committee. Now, the proposals of the Retrenchment Committee were considered by Government as a whole, Members and Ministers sitting together discussed and came to conclusions on every one or most of the items: there are some items still pending. But the administrative expenditure, as it now appears, was the considered opinion of the Joint Government, the Ministers no less than the Members had their say, and so far as I am concerned, the budget has been framed in accordance with their conclusions.

Now, we have had some new criticisms. We have been referred to promises in the past. Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy and Babu Surendra Nath Ray referred to them. Dr. Roy referred to Sir John Kerr's speech in 1922 about the possibility of financing a loan for capital works when a small surplus would be available. He has quoted some figures to show that the surplus which he has worked out could be employed in floating a loan for capital works and the provision of schemes in the transferred departments. I think if he will refer to my speech, he will find that I have not referred to a surplus—as a matter of fact, so long as the contribution of Rs. 63 lakhs to the Government of India hangs over our heads, we cannot feel that we have a recurring surplus. Therefore, at the moment we have really no money to raise a loan or embark on schemes of a recurring character. We have not yet got to that position.

Babu Surendra Nath Ray was also on the wrong tack, he took our increase of revenue from stamps and the amusements tax and he called it a surplus—but it is not a surplus at all.

I would now like to turn to our new expenditure. When we prepared our budget for 1924-25 about the 15th of January last, we found that we

had a closing balance of a little over a crore, and the margin between our income and administrative expenditure was about Rs. 36 lakhs. Out of this sum of about 136 lakhs, I considered we should be justified in spending not more than roughly Rs. 90 lakhs. Be it remembered that at that time the new Ministers had just come into office and it was not expected that, within the short time at their disposal, they could formulate a policy and have schemes ready for inclusion in the budget. The sum of Rs. 90 lakhs was what I thought we would be justified in putting into the budget. We have, as I said in my opening speech, committed ourselves to the expenditure of Rs. 88 lakhs all on new schemes. And may I again remind the House that this money was distributed by Government as a whole—Members and Ministers sitting together and all having a say in the matter. I think some member suggested our having a joint purse. He fails to realise that this would mean that Ministers would have very little say in the provision of funds for the reserved departments. I will now explain where this sum of Rs. 88 lakhs has gone, as we are told that most of it has been given to the reserved departments and very little to the transferred departments. Now, firstly, we had an obligation—it was imperative that we should re-settle the Chittagong district—that is an obligation on us to carry out in order that the new settlement may come into force as soon as the old settlement ceases. This will take Rs. 15 lakhs out of the Rs. 88 lakhs leaving Rs. 73 lakhs. The next is a provision for making wealth. We have added something to the Forest Department for development, so that we may have more money. There is also a provision of Rs. 1 lakh—practically, a health contribution—for mosquito nets and cots for the Police. There are one or two provisions amounting to about Rs. 2,80,000 required for Printing and Stationery, an unproductive but nevertheless necessary administrative expenditure, required to replace machinery which is very old. This takes us down to Rs. 56,80,000. Now, of this, we have earmarked Rs. 14 lakhs in addition to the Rs. 3 lakhs of expenditure for police buildings in Calcutta which appears in the budget. That is a paying proposition, because if we have our own buildings, we shall set free some of our recurring expenditure which we are now incurring in rents, rates and taxes for hired buildings, and this will help us in meeting new schemes of recurring expenditure, which is the class of expenditure the transferred departments require. Then, we have one or two judicial buildings. Next we come to a scheme of Rs. 12 lakhs for the benefit of the people, irrigation in the Tamluk subdivision required for agricultural improvement and for the general health of the area. Irrigation, I may say, is practically for the benefit of the people and it does not stand on the same footing as other departments on the reserved side. Then, we have schemes for Education amounting to Rs. 1,50,000, for Medical to Rs. 4,25,000, Public Health nearly Rs. 7 lakhs, Industries Rs. 25,000 and Civil Works about Rs. 18 lakhs: all items connected with the nation-building departments and for the benefit of the people.

Thus after deducting the Rs. 15 lakhs for the Chittagong Settlement, which, as I have mentioned, is an obligation, we are reduced to Rs. 73 lakhs and we are spending Rs. 47 lakhs out of this Rs. 73 lakhs on schemes meant for the welfare of the people. Does this support the allegation that the bureaucracy is paying no heed to the welfare of the people?

I admit—and I found it so when I was preparing my budget speech, that there is not much policy behind this budget—it is possibly a colourless allocation of the revenues, but it is hardly to be expected that Ministers who had only been in their appointments for about 10 days before the preparation of the budget could frame their policy and furnish new schemes in accordance with that policy.

There is another point which is also connected with the budget. It may be said that although we are spending Rs. 46 lakhs out of our commitments for activities in the interests of the people's health and welfare, the provision in the next year's budget is very small. The amounts allotted for anti-kala-azar and anti-malarial measures have already been mentioned, and it is said that they are altogether insufficient and not commensurate with the problems with which we are faced. This is another feature of the budget which I may explain here. It is not proper budgeting to put into the budget more money than can be spent in the course of the year. What is the use of putting in large sums of money which cannot possibly be spent? To do so would, when our resources are limited, merely mean the exclusion of schemes which might be carried through and which might be equally necessary for the benefit of the people. Surely it is better to include as many schemes as can profitably be dealt with than to include a large amount on one or two schemes which cannot be spent. It may be argued that there should be no difficulty in spending far more than the sums provided. Those who would so argue have had little experience of the difficulties of administration. Unless a scheme is fully thought out beforehand and all preparation made for putting it into immediate practice a considerable time is taken up in the necessary preparation. Local bodies have to be consulted if the scheme involves the co-operation of local bodies such as District Boards, Municipalities, Union Boards and the like, and I can tell the House that this is a very fruitful source of delay. The result is that it is difficult to ensure the spending of the money within the financial year. But in any case the Council should recognise that a beginning is being made, and should encourage the Ministers in their efforts to deal with the problems. And I can assure the House that all the Members of the Government would only be too glad to have Ministers furnished with more funds for the objects which they have to administer.

Sir, when I am on this point, I must refer to Mr. Das's proposal. It is a very interesting proposal, but it has difficulties. If you are going to spend the money you have got to have a scheme ready and that is going

to take some time and when you work out a scheme you have got to determine how much money you can spend annually and the execution of the scheme is also going to take time; so the question involves the preparation of schemes and a programme of expenditure and it depends on the period of the working out of the scheme. I presume there will be no difficulty in raising the sum of Rs. 5 crores. Then, we have got to consider the fact that the loan is going to cost us annually Rs. 40 lakhs. Where are we going to get that Rs. 40 lakhs? I am not going to dismiss the suggestion—I am quite prepared to discuss the proposal with Mr. Das, and I suggest that a discussion round a table is a far better way of tackling it than by making speeches from our places in this Chamber. (Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: A round table conference.) I thought that would bring forth that remark. Now, if we have to spend Rs. 40 lakhs for the loan, how are we going to get that money? You may say—"Cut down your expenditure." Well, we have already cut down and we may do so a little more, but there is not much possibility of making any further reduction. I do not suppose that more taxation will be acceptable. Then our hope really lies in the continued remission of our provincial contribution and in the revision of the Meston Settlement. I understand that the Government of India have already suggested a reduction in the contributions of other provinces. If that be so, surely, Bengal, who have always complained against the unjust arrangement, should be able to get a chance of having its contribution remitted, and for that end we shall fight. If we get that remission as a permanency, we shall be in a far better position, and instead of devoting, as we have done this year, the money available as between our revenue and expenditure to schemes of a non-recurring character, we shall be able to push ahead with schemes of a recurring character in the transferred departments. With the remission of the contributions of other provinces, we shall certainly have a stronger case for the continued remission of our provincial contribution.

Mr. Mitter has said that we do not protest enough. Well, we will protest and will not rest content until the Meston Settlement is revised. I said last year that we were waiting till the Government of India were in a more assured financial position. As far as I can make out, they are now so. The other day we accepted a resolution to approach the Government of India with a view to the revision of the Settlement. With that authority behind us and the possibility of a remission of the contribution of other provinces and the financial position of the Government of India more assured, we shall again return to the attack and I hope that by this time next year, we shall have secured better justice for Bengal (Applause).

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned till 3 P.M. on Wednesday, the 12th March, 1924, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

INDEX

TO

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

VOL. XIV.—NO. 3.—FOURTEENTH SESSION.

February 26th to 29th, 1924.

Adjournment, 59, 109, 167, 284.

Admission of visitors to meetings of local bodies, 177

Agricultural School, Chinsurah, 65.

Agriculture

Posting of a Superintendent of — to Suri, 4.

Ahmed, Maulvi Tayebuddin

Budget discussion, 143

Aley, Mr. S. Mahboob

Budget discussion, 139

Ali, Maulvi Sayyed Sultan

Alleged dissection of Muhammadans dying in jails, 61.
Budget discussion, 59, 66.
Proposed Satkhira-Navaran Railway line, 13.
Silted up route from Chittagong to Calcutta, 12.

Alipore Central Jail

Accommodation of State prisoners in, 5.

Allowances

Alleged differential treatment in the matter of house— to officers, 14

Anjana River Scheme, 62.

Balur Math

Proposed acquisition of land near, 171, 172, 173.

Bagchi, Babu Romes Chandra

Budget discussion, 106.
Discontinuance of certain trains Katihar-Godagari line, 2.
Match manufacturing industry in jail, 164.
Telegraph office at Nawabganj (Malda), 80.

Banerjea, Dr. Pramathanath

Budget discussion, 148

Banerjee, Babu Satya Kishore

Residential quarters of District Judge, Midnapore, 11.
Waterways on Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway, 13.

Banerjee, Mr. A. C.

Anjana River Scheme, 62

Basu, Babu Sarat Chandra

Budget discussion, 88, 90.

Bidyadhari River

Dredging, 15.

Bogra

Failure of paddy crop in, 3.

Bose, Babu Bejoy Krishna

Budget discussion, 59, 74.
Confirmation in Subordinate Executive Service, 174.

British Empire Exhibition

Deputation of Mr. J. M. Mitra to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at, 9.

Budget discussion, 20, 66, 110, 178.

Calcutta

Chief Judge, Small Causes Court, 12.

Chakravarti, Mr. Syamkesh

Budget discussion, 206, 217, 218.

Chaiganarty, Babu Sudarsan

Budget discussion, 20.

Chatterjee, Babu Umes Chandra

Budget discussion, 48.

Chaudhuri, Nawab Bahadur Saiyid Nawab Ali

Budget discussion, 122.

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath

Budget discussion, 68.

District Board Dispensary in Barrackpur rural area, 13.

Proposed acquisition of land near Balur Math, 172.

Choudhury, Maulvi Md. Nurul Huq

Budget discussion, 40, 41, 43, 45, 85, 86, 201, 202, 208.

Chief Judge, Calcutta Small Causes Court, 12.

Chinsura Agricultural School, 65, 170.

Chittagong

Silted up route from—to Calcutta, 12.

Choinuddin, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Md.

Budget discussion, 84, 86.

Chunder, Mr. Nirmal Chandra

Budget discussion, 165.

Cohen, Mr. D. J.

Budget discussion, 131.

Committee

Election of members of Standing, 20.

Das, Dr. Mohini Mohan

Budget discussion, 151.

Das, Mr. C. R.

Budget discussion, 178, 212.

Das Gupta, Dr. J. M.

Failure of paddy crop in Bogra, 3

Datta, Babu Akhil Chandra

Budget discussion, 78.

Death of Dr. T. O. D. Dunn, 1.

Defalcations in the Excise Department, Calcutta, 170.

Deputation

—of Mr. J. M. Mitra to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at British Empire Exhibition, 9.

Deputy-President

Budget discussion, 41, 90, 162.

Dey, Babu Baroda Prasad

Budget discussion, 29.

Chinsurah Agricultural School, 65.

Municipal taxes on arable lands within municipalities, 61.

Nuisances caused from the use of earth for metalling Grand Trunk Road, 4.

Proposed abolition of the Chinsurah Agricultural School, 170.

Dispensary

District Board—in Barrackpore rural area, 13.

District Board Dispensary

—in Barrackpore rural area, 13

Donald, the Hon'ble Mr. J.

Alleged differential treatment in the matter of house-allowances to officers, 14.

Budget discussion, 35, 227.

Telegraph office at Nawabganj (Malda), 60.

Dunn, Dr. T. O. D.

Death of—1.

Durbar grants, 19.

Dutt, Mr. G. S.

Admission of visitors to meetings of local bodies, 177.

Budget discussion, 202, 203, 204, 206, 211.

Bell, Mr. G. S.

District Board Dispensary in Barrackpore rural area, 14.
Fumes from a factory in Konnagar, 17.
Hostels for Calcutta Medical College students, 175.
Kala-azar in certain thanas of the 24-Parganas, 18.
Muhicipal taxes on arable lands within municipalities, 61.
Patuakhali Waterworks Scheme, 172.
Vital statistics of Tippera, 62.

Erosion of Noakhali Town, 63.

Excise Department

Appointments in the, 175.
Defalcations in the—, Calcutta, 171.

Factory

Fumes from a—in Konnagar, 17.

Forrester, Mr. J. Campbell

Alleged differential treatment in the matter of house-allowances to officers, 14.
Budget discussion, 31.

Election of members

—of Standing Committee, 90

Embankment

Mohan Khali Circle, 11.

Ganguly, Babu Khagendra Nath

Budget discussion, 115.
Mohankhali Circle Embankment, 11.
Proposed acquisition of land near Belur Math, 173.

Ghuznavi, the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan

Appointments in the Excise Department, 175.
Budget discussion, 179.
Chinsurah Agricultural School, 65, 66.
Defalcations in the Excise Department, Calcutta, 171.
Deputation of Mr. J. M. Mitra to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at the British Empire Exhibition, 9.
Discontinuance of certain trains on the Katihar-Godagari line, 2.
Hand spinning industry, 177.
Match manufacturing industry in Bengal, 166.

Ghuznavi, the Hon'ble Hadji Mr. A. K. Abu Ahmed Khan

Nuisances caused from the use of earth for metalling Grand Trunk Road, 4.
Posting of a Superintendent of Agriculture to Suri, 5.
Proposed abolition of the Chinsurah Agricultural School, 170.
Proposed acquisition of land near Belur Math, 171, 172, 173.
Proposed Satkhira-Navaran Railway line, 13.
Registrar, Co-operative Societies, 16.
Research work in cotton, 19.
Serampore Weaving Institute, 16.
Waiting Room at Noakhali Railway Station, 17.
Want of platform in Jhikargacha Ghat Station, 19.
Water hyacinth, 8, 9.
Waterways in Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway, 13.

Goenka, Babu Badridas

Budget discussion, 64.
Dredging Rupnarain River, 15.
Grand Trunk Canal Project, 15.

Grand Trunk Canal Project, 15.

Grand Trunk Road—

Nuisances caused from the use of earth for metalling, 4.

Guha, Mr. P. N.

Appointments in the Excise Department, 175.
Chief Judge, Calcutta Small Causes Court, 12.
Hostels for Calcutta Medical College students, 174.
Registrar, Co-operative Societies, 16.

Hand Spinning Industry, 177.

Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul

Abolition of Circle Schools, 1
Budget discussion, 87.
Vital statistics of Tippera, 62

Hoque, Maulvi Sayedul

Budget discussion, 127.

Hussain, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Mazharul

Budget discussion, 51, 52.

Hussain, Maulvi Wahed

Budget discussion, 132.

Hostels for Calcutta Medical College students, 174.

Huq, Maulvi Ekramul

Budget discussion, 81.

Huq, the Hon'ble Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul

Abolition of circle schools, 176.
Budget discussion, 190, 201.
Durbar grants, 19.

Jails

Alleged dissection of Muhammadan prisoners dying in, 61.

Jhikargachha Ghat Station

Want of platforms in, 19.

Industry

Match manufacturing—in Bengal, 168.

Interview with State prisoners, 2.

Kala-azar

—in certain thanas of the 24-Parganas, 17.

Kalimpur-Godagari Line

Discontinuance of certain trains on, 2.

Khan, Maulvi Abdur Rashid

Hand-Spinning Industry, 177.
Serampore Weaving Institute, 16.
Waiting Room at Noakhali Railway Station, 16.

Kumargaon

Fumes from a factory in, 17.

Land

Acquisition of—near Belur Math, 171.

Mahendranarayan Zamindari of Burdwan, the Wards's Estate of

Bagnan River Embankment, 22.
Budget discussion, 192.
Dredging Bidyadhari River, 18.
Failure of paddy crop in Midnapore, 21.
Small Town Canal Project, 22.
Subdivisional Conference, Tamluk, 18.
Visit of ryots from Chittagong to Calcutta, 18.

Maity, Mr. Syed Md.

Budget discussion, 145.

Match manufacturing industry.

—in Bengal, 164.

Midnapore

Residential quarters of District Judge, 11.

Mitra, Babu Satyendra Chandra

Budget discussion, 155.
Erosion of Noakhali Town, 63.
Posting of a Superintendent of Agriculture to Suri, 4.

Mitra, Mr. J. M.

Deputation of Mr.—to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at British Empire Exhibition, 9.

Mitter, Mr. P. C.

Budget discussion, 36, 40, 43, 201.

Mohankhali Circle Embankment, 11.

Morelle, Dr. H. W. B.

Budget discussion, 42, 44, 46.

Mukerjea, Babu Taraknath

Fumes from a factory in Kamarhati, 17.

Mukerji, Mr. S. C.

Budget discussion, 72, 74.
Municipal taxes on arable lands within municipalities, 61.

Nandy, Maharaj Kumar Sris Chandra

Budget discussion, 140.

Naskar, Babu Hem Chandra

Kala-azar in certain thanas of the 24-Parganas, 17.
Recruitment of officers and ineligibility of persons not having their domicile within the Province, 64.

Narayangarh

Telegraph office at—(Malda), 60.

Nasker, Babu Mononohan

Budget discussion, 82, 85.

Noakhali

Erosion of—Town, 63.
Waiting Room at—Railway Station, 16.

Oath, 1, 110.

Paddy crop

Failure of—in Bogra, 3.

Patterson, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar

Budget discussion, 167.

Patuakhali Waterworks Scheme, 171.

Police,

Alleged watch by—of premises No. 9, Russa Road North, 10.

President

Budget discussion, 40, 43, 48, 51, 74, 85, 86, 119, 120, 151, 153, 155, 201, 202, 203, 221.

Death of Mr T. O. D. Dunn, 1.

Election of members of Standing Committee, 20.

Residential quarters of District Judges, Midnapore, 11.

Prisoners

Alleged dissection of Muhammadan—dying in jails, 61.

Interview with State, 2.

Publicity

Alleged preference in, 7.

Quader, Maulvi Abdul

Admission of visitors to meetings of local bodies, 177.

Budget discussion, 91.

Want of platform in Jhikargacha Ghat Station, 19.

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abdur

Budget discussion, 90, 220, 221.

Chief Judge, Calcutta Small Causes Court, 12.

Residential quarters of District Judges, Midnapore, 11.

Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb

Budget discussion, 131.

Ray, Babu Aburesh Chandra

Budget discussion, 123.

Ray, Babu Amiyaram

Defalcations in the [illegible] Department, 170.

Ray, Babu Surendra Nath

Budget discussion, 125, 127.

Residential quarters of District Judge, Midnapore, 11.

Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar

Budget discussion, 122, 147, 204, 221.

Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. K. C.

Budget discussion, 95.

Recruitment of officers and Ineligibility of persons not having their domicile within the Province, 64.

Registrar, Co-operative Societies,

Research work in cotton, 19.

Route

Silted up—from Chinsurah to Calcutta, 13.

Roy, Babu Manmatha Nath

Budget discussion, 153.

Proposed acquisition of land near Belur Math, 171.

Roy, Mr. Satcowrie Pati

Budget discussion, 97.

Roy, Dr. Bidhan Chandra

Budget discussion, 93.

Roy, Mr. Kiran Sankar,

Accommodation of State prisoners in Alipur Central Jail,

Water-hyacinth, 9.

Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan

Budget discussion, 165.

Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Satish Chan.

Chinsurah Agricultural School, 65.

Research work in cotton, 19.

Roy Chowdhuri, Babu Jogendra Nath

Budget [illegible]

[illegible] Waterworks Scheme, 171.

[illegible]

[illegible]

Alleged [illegible] in jail, 61.

Budget [illegible], 61, 119, 151.

[illegible] State prisoners, 2.

Sarkar, Maulvi Ajlal Bukh

Durbar grant, 19.

Sarker, Babu Nalini Ranjan

Budget discussion, 110.
Deputation of Mr. J. M. Mitra to England in charge of Bengal Exhibits at British Empire Exhibition, 9.
Water-hyacinth, 7, 8.

Sasmal, Mr. S. N.

Budget discussion, 206.

Satkhira-Navaran Railway

Proposed line, 13.

Schools

Abolition of Circle, 176.
Proposed abolition of the Chinsurah agricultural, 170.

Sengupta, Mr. J. M.

Accommodation of State prisoners in Alipur Central Jail, 6.
Alleged watch by police of premises No. 9, Rugga Road, North, 10.

Serampore Weaving Institute, 16.

State Prisoners

Accommodation of in Alipur Central Jail, 6.
Interview with, 2.

Stephenson, the Hon'ble Sir Hugh

Accommodation of State prisoners in Alipur Central Jail, 6.
Alleged dissection of Muhammadan prisoners dying in jails, 61.
Alleged prohibition in publicity, 7.
Alleged watch by police at premises No. 9, Rugga Road North, 10.

Stephenson, the Hon'ble Sir Hugh

Budget discussion, 211, 212, 217, 218, 219.
Confirmation in Subordinate Executive Service, 174.
Erosion of Nowkhali Town, 64.
Interview with State prisoners, 2.
Recruitment of officers and ineligibility of persons not having their domicile within the Province, 65.

Subordinate Executive Service, 174.

Suri

Posting of a superintendent of Agriculture to, 4.

Telegraph office at Nawabganj (Malda), 60.

Tippera

Vital statistics of, 62.

Trains

Discontinuance of certain on the Katihar-Godagari Line, 2.

Travers, Mr. D. L.

Budget discussion, 27.

24-Parganas

Kala-azar in certain thanas of the, 17.

Vital statistics of Tippera, 62.

Water-hyacinth, 7.

Waterways on Burdwan-Howrah Chord Railway, 13.

Waterworks

Patuakhali Scheme, 171.